MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING TUESDAY- -MARCH 4, 2025- -5:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 5:00 p.m.

Roll Call – Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Boller, Jensen, Pryor and Mayor Ezzy

Ashcraft – 5. [Note: Councilmember Daysog arrived at 5:07 p.m.

and after the recess, arrived at 8:46 p.m.]

Absent: None.

Consent Calendar

Councilmember Boller moved approval of the Consent Calendar.

Councilmember Jensen seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote -4. [Absent: Councilmember Daysog -1.] [Items so enacted or adopted are indicated by an asterisk preceding the paragraph number.]

(*25-114) Recommendation to Approve Jennifer Ott, City Manager, Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Director, Tim Haines, General Manager - AMP, Nafisah Ali, Senior Human Resources Analyst, Noelle White, Senior Human Resources Analyst, and Doug McManaway, Assistant City Attorney, as Labor Negotiators with the Alameda City Employees Association (ACEA), Alameda Police Management Association (APMA), Alameda Police Officers Association (APOA), Alameda Police Officers Association - Non-Sworn (PANS), Electric Utility Professionals Association (EUPA), International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers (IBEW), and Management and Confidential Employees Association (MCEA) for the City of Alameda. Accepted.

The meeting was adjourned to Closed Session to consider:

(25-115) Conference with <u>Labor</u> Negotiators (Government Code Section 54957.6) City Negotiators: Jennifer Ott, City Manager, Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Director, and Doug McManaway, Deputy City Attorney; Employee Organizations: Alameda City Employees Association (ACEA), Alameda Police Management Association (APMA), Alameda Police Officers Association (APOA, Alameda Police Officers Association - Non-Sworn (PANS), Electric Utility Professionals Association (EUPA) International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers (IBEW), and Management and Confidential Employees Association (MCEA); Under Negotiation: Salaries, Employee Benefits and Terms of Employment

(<u>25-116</u>) Conference with Legal Counsel – <u>Potential Litigation</u>; Potential Initiation of Litigation Pursuant to Government Code Section 554956.9, Subsection (d)(4); Number of Cases: One (As Plaintiff - City Initiating Legal Action); Potential Defendant: Port of Oakland

(<u>25-117</u>) Public Employee <u>Performance Evaluations</u> Pursuant to Government Code § 54957; Positions Evaluated: City Attorney - Yibin Shen and City Manager - Jennifer Ott

Following the Closed Session, the meeting was reconvened and the City Clerk announced that regarding <u>Labor</u>, staff provided information, and the City Council asked questions and provided direction with no vote taken; regarding <u>Performance Evaluations</u>, the City Council conducted the City Attorney performance review and provided direction to staff by the following voice votes: Vote 1: unanimous voice vote – 5, Vote 2: unanimous voice vote – 5, Vote 3: unanimous voice vote – 5.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft called a recess at 7:04 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 8:42 p.m.

Following the Closed Session, the meeting was reconvened and the City Clerk announced that regarding <u>Potential Litigation</u>, staff provided information and Council provided direction with no vote taken.

Adjournment

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 9:07 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING TUESDAY- -MARCH 4, 2025- -7:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 7:14 p.m. Councilmember Daysog led the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL - Present: Councilmembers Boller, Daysog, Jensen, Pryor, and

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5.

Absent: None.

AGENDA CHANGES

None.

PROCLAMATIONS, SPECIAL ORDERS OF THE DAY AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

(25-118) Proclamation Declaring March 2025 as American Red Cross Month.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

(25-119) Brian Kennedy, Alameda, discussed the 14th Amendment.

(<u>25-120</u>) Jeff Fuller, Alameda, expressed concern about the care he received when he went to the Alameda Hospital for a medical emergency; suggested the hospital close.

(<u>25-121</u>) Gabriel Duncan, Alameda Native History Project, thanked the City and Recreation Department for the acorns project; stated the first acorn processing will be on Sunday.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Stated everyone deserves to have a museum that shares the rich history of all those involved in making the City what it is today; suggested the City review the feasibility of having a City museum at City Hall West: Gabriel Duncan, Alameda Native History Project.

Councilmember Daysog recused himself from the Island City Landscaping and Lighting District 84-2 resolution [paragraph no. <u>25-131</u>].

Councilmember Pryor moved approval of the Consent Calendar.

Councilmember Boller seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote - 5. [Items so enacted or adopted are indicated by an asterisk preceding the paragraph number.]

(*25-122) Minutes of the Special and Regular City Council Meetings Held on February 4, 2025 and the Special City Council Meeting Held on February 8, 2025. Approved.

(*<u>25-123</u>) Ratified bills in the amount of \$7,280,214.62.

(*25-124) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Service Provider Agreement with The Pivotal Group Consultant, Inc. to Complete a Five-Year Strategic Plan for

the Library for a Total Agreement Compensation Not-to-Exceed \$123,600. Accepted.

- (*25-125) Recommendation to Authorize Updates to the Existing Alameda Police Department Policy Manual to Conform to Best Practices and to Ratify Policies that Have Been Updated Pursuant to Legal Updates, Significant Liability Issues, and Imminent Safety. Accepted.
- (*25-126) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute an Amendment to the Agreement with the Alameda Food Bank for Tenant Acquisition and Use of Community Development Block Grant (CDBG) Funding. Accepted.
- (*25-127) Recommendation to Authorize Continued Action to Address Declaration of Unsafe Building and Notice to Vacate, Case Number X24-0470, for the City-Owned Building Located at Building 114, 2450 Saratoga Street, Alameda, California. Accepted.
- (*25-128) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Construction Agreement with McKim Corporation for the Grand Street Safety Improvements and Pavement Rehabilitation Project, P.W. No. 04-24-13 in an Amount Not-to-Exceed \$1,330,065, including Contingency; and to Reject a Non-Responsive Bid from Rapid Grading Services. Accepted.
- (*<u>25-129</u>) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute and Modify All Documents Deemed Necessary and Appropriate to Submit an Application for the CalHome Program to the California Department of Housing and Community Development;
- (*25-129 A) Resolution No. 16249, "Authorizing the City Manager to Apply for, Accept, and Appropriate CalHome Program Grant Funds. Accepted." Adopted; and
- (*25-129 B) Recommendation to Award a Grant Agreement to Rebuilding Together East Bay Network in an Amount Not-to-Exceed \$1,250,000 to Administer CalHome Grant Eligible Activities, and Authorize the City Manager to Move Funds between CalHome and Community Development Block Grant Funds as Necessary to Meet Expenditure Deadlines for Eligible Expenses. Accepted.
- (*25-130) Resolution No. 16250, "Amending the Fiscal Year (FY) 2024-25 Budget." Adopted;
- (*25-130 A) Resolution No. 16251, "Approving Workforce Changes for FY 2024-25." Adopted; and
- (*25-130 B) Recommendation to Reaffirm and Adopt a Revised City of Alameda Purchasing Policy. Accepted.
- (<u>25-131</u>) Resolution No. 16252, "Appointing an Engineer-of-Work and an Attorney-of-Record for Island City Landscaping and Lighting District 84-2 (Various Locations Throughout the City)." Adopted.
- Note: Since Councilmember Daysog recused himself, the item carried by the following vote: Ayes: Councilmembers Boller, Jensen, Pryor and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft 4. [Absent: Councilmember Daysog 1.]
- (*25-132) Resolution No. 16253, "Appointing an Engineer-of-Record and Attorney-of-Record for Marina Cove Maintenance Assessment District 01-1 (Marina Cove)." Adopted.

CONTINUED AGENDA ITEMS

None.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

(<u>25-133</u>) Recommendation to Implement an Automated Red Light Enforcement Pilot Program at the Two Intersections of Park Street and Otis Drive and Webster Street and Atlantic Avenue.

(25-134) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated an additional 5 minutes are needed for the presentation.

Councilmember Jensen moved approval of allowing 5 more minutes.

Vice Mayor Pryor seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote - 5.

The Police Lieutenant gave a Power Point presentation.

Councilmember Daysog inquired whether there is data specific to the two intersections; stated the baseline should be known prior to implementation.

The Police Lieutenant responded staff has traffic count data; stated the projection of how many violations is based on historical knowledge.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he was referring to collision data; inquired whether there is data about when Police are called that deal with accidents in the specific areas, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative; stated since 2020, there have been 65 total collisions at Park Street and Otis Drive, 33% of which were potentially sign or signal related; at Webster Street and Atlantic Avenue, there were 21 collisions since 2020.

Councilmember Daysog inquired whether the data is over a four-year period, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Boller inquired whether the assumption for revenue neutrality considers the deterrent effect.

The Police Lieutenant responded there is a big spike at initial implementation since people do not realize there is a new camera; stated once people figure it out, the numbers start to dip before finally stabilizing.

Councilmember Boller inquired how the efficacy would be measured moving forward; inquired whether the volume of redlight violations would be a metric used to measure effectiveness.

The Police Lieutenant responded traffic counts remain the same and violation amounts going down would be a good indication that people are obeying the law; stated there is enough room between revenue neutrality and the expected number of violations; the numbers can afford to go down quite a bit and the program will still remain solvent.

Councilmember Boller stated that he understands, data will be erased after six months; inquired how data will be stored and what it could be used for during the period it is retained.

The Police Lieutenant responded the vendor houses the data in a cloud-based server; stated the Alameda Police Department (APD) is the only entity that has access to the data; APD can set granular access to the user level; he will be the person in charge of the program; he will have access to the data in order to complete audits; data may be accessed for use as evidence of crime in certain cases; data will be run on a needs base with supervisory or commander level approval.

Councilmember Boller stated possible bias could be a concern for folks; inquired whether the technology has a benefit in terms of reducing human bias, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative; stated the technology will take pictures of the cars first and the people afterwards; it is indiscriminate in how it applies the law; it is the only type of automated enforcement allowed in California and has been in use for over 20 years.

Councilmember Boller inquired whether residential surveys were conducted seeking people's preferences, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the negative.

Councilmember Boller inquired whether staff could consider doing so, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Vice Mayor Pryor inquired whether the 35 projected violations per day are per intersection, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Vice Mayor Pryor inquired the typical cost for a redlight violation.

The Police Lieutenant responded that he does not have the exact number, however, it is approximately \$500.

Vice Mayor Pryor stated that this is an issue of equity to her; the fine can have a big impact on someone who works paycheck to paycheck.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether the pictures taken by the cameras may be used for other traffic violations.

The Police Lieutenant responded only redlight related violations are approved for automated enforcement.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether it would capture drivers making right-hand turns running the light, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether insurance companies would have access to camera footage.

The Police Lieutenant responded if the insurance company acquired a court order, or something similar, APD would obey the court order.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether redlight violation camera data can be requested and obtained through the Public Records Act (PRA).

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council March 4, 2025 The City Attorney responded staff must look at every PRA request on a case by case basis; stated the City would be compelled to release summary information, such as the total number of citations issued and how many were affirmed and dismissed; he does not anticipate having to disclose information, since APD does not do so in any other criminal prosecution; any release would occur on a case-by-case basis.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether the footage captured could be released to an insurance company regarding a personal injury issue between two individuals, for example.

The City Attorney responded generally, staff would not release the footage in response to a PRA request; stated if there is civil litigation, however, it could be released as part of a civil discovery order.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether redlight violation cameras have been around for 20 years, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether APD has looked at other Bay Area cities that use redlight violation cameras, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired what cities in Alameda County use the technology.

The Police Lieutenant responded Fremont operates the oldest and most successful of the programs; stated Newark and Tracy have the cameras as well.

Councilmember Jensen stated San Leandro uses the technology as well.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether APD has looked at the use policies in other departments, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired if Council adopts the proposal, would APD look to other cities to help inform a policy.

The Police Lieutenant responded it would most likely be a hybrid of APD's stance on sharing and releasing information under the Automated License Plate Readers (ALPR) policy.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the policy would return to Council, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired, assuming this moves forward, will there be public education components to raise awareness before the use of the redlight violation cameras commence, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative; stated there will be many public notices as well as a 30-day grace period after implementation, which is required by the Vehicle Code.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she understood the cameras would only capture the license plate data; inquired whether the cameras will also capture the driver, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the affirmative; stated it is to prevent the registered owner from coming to court and stating they were not the driver.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether there is any reason APD would need an image of occupants in the car beyond the driver, to which the Police Lieutenant responded in the negative; stated the cameras are designed to be focused as narrowly as possible on the driver's seat.

Councilmember Daysog stated the equity point raised is important; inquired if the process allows for payment plans and whether the City can waive payments or deal with concerns raised by individuals.

The Police Lieutenant responded that he does not have a definitive answer; stated citations go through the Alameda County court system.

The Police Captain stated the typical redlight fine in California is about \$490; the County court system sets fines.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether citations are sent to the registered owner of the cars and whether the driver's license and registered owner would be matched.

The Police Lieutenant responded if a driver cannot be identified, the citation is sent to the registered owner of the vehicle; stated efforts are made to match the driver of the vehicle to a driver's license; the registered owner can nominate the driver of the vehicle if it was not them.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired if a car is stolen and the auto thief is caught on camera, could the registered owner go to court and provide evidence of the vehicle being stolen.

The Police Lieutenant responded if APD knows the vehicle was stolen when the violation is reviewed, it can be excused before it goes to court; stated if a Police report is provided to the court showing the vehicle was stolen, it may be dismissed.

Expressed support for the recommendation; stated something must be done to change the behavior of drivers; urged Council to support the item; stated many prefer automated enforcement versus manual enforcement; regarding equity, there are many low-income and underserved residents in Alameda who do not drive, rely on safe transit corridors and deserve safe access: Denyse Trepanier, BikeWalk Alameda.

Vice Mayor Pryor stated that she would appreciate sliding scale or traffic school options; Vision Zero is a big priority for her; paying a \$500 ticket will not be a big deal for some; she would like to know how it could be enforced and not become a big financial burden for some.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated when someone runs a redlight, there is a risk of injuring, or in extreme cases, killing someone; the high traffic fine is meant to be a disincentive; education and information will be provided to residents before installation, as well as a 30-day grace period after installation; she constantly receives news regarding collisions; everyone should slow down, regardless of income.

Vice Mayor Pryor stated the goal is to get everyone to slow down and drive safely.

Councilmember Daysog stated this is a remarkable use of technology to pursue safety; regarding the issue of equity, he would love to see whether vendors are flexible enough to have payment plans; expressed support for the recommendation.

Councilmember Boller stated traffic safety is high on residents' priority list; there is data to support the notion that injury collisions can be reduced through this; the interest in protecting public safety and avoiding collisions outweighs concerns regarding equity and privacy; judges have some discretion; there is a possibility of traffic school and a needs-base analysis; the fines are high for a reason; staff should move forward with presenting a more particularized policy recommendation to Council.

The Police Lieutenant stated traffic school, amongst other things, are a possibility; any existing payment plans the County may have will apply to these citations.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the possibility of going to traffic school would be for those who have committed their first violation.

The Police Lieutenant responded typically, it is based on a license total point-count; stated if someone has a certain number of points on their license, they may not be eligible for traffic school.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether Vice Mayor Pryor's concern is related to redlight violation camera technology or all traffic violation citations.

Vice Mayor Pryor responded when thinking about 35 violations per day, she assumed it would be a hit to about 50% of the people receiving the fines; stated she likes the idea of payment plans.

Councilmember Jensen stated traffic violations can be inequitable; in the future, perhaps Council could discuss fines overall and how fines can be more equitable; Alameda has expanded ALPR use and has adopted drone technology in recent years; inquired whether APD feels such technology is effective in ensuring the safety of Alamedans and reducing violations and how comfortable Officers are with the tools.

The Police Chief responded anytime APD can leverage technology, it is a force multiplier; stated ALPRs and in-car cameras have been very successful in reducing the amount of time and research Officers have had to do; technology helps APD be much more efficient.

Councilmember Jensen inquired whether efficiency and public safety are improved with technology, to which the Police Chief responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Jensen expressed support for the recommendation; stated data shows intersection collisions are more dangerous than other type of collisions; she looks forward to implementation of the cameras.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired assuming the item passes, what would be a reasonable amount of time to look at the data and see whether the cameras are making a difference.

The Police Lieutenant responded one year will provide better data; stated if Council would prefer the date return in six months, staff will do so.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated although she understands the comments made regarding equity, nobody has died due to an expired registration; speeding, and running redlights, however are a

much higher risk to the public; expressed support for the recommendation; discussed an Alameda County Transportation Commission (ACTC) retreat discussion about ending the speed camera pilot program and allowing all cities to implement the technology.

Councilmember Jensen moved approval of the recommendation and having APD return in a year with information regarding the efficacy of the technology.

Councilmember Boller seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote - 5.

CITY MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS

(25-135) The City Manager stated APD honored the memory of Officer Robert J. Davey Jr.; during the next few weeks, APD is hosting the first Community Beat meetings of the year; encouraged folks to attend; stated residents can find their beat and the meeting schedule on the City's website; Alameda Restaurant Week will be kicking off with a party at Faction Brewing on March 13th; stated the Alameda Community Band is performing a free concert at Mastick Senior Center on March 14th.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

(<u>25-136</u>) Gerald Bryant, Alameda, stated civility and politeness has gone down; discussed racism and discrimination in the City.

COUNCIL REFERRALS

None.

COUNCIL COMMUNICATIONS

(<u>25-137</u>) Mayor's Nominations for the Commission on Persons with Disabilities and Golf Commission. Not heard.

(<u>25-138</u>) Councilmember Jensen thanked the City Manager and APD for recognizing Officer Robert J. Davey Jr.; stated that she attended the 100 Club of Alameda County and the Naval League crab feed; stated the Healthy Homes Committee meeting was cancelled but looks forward to attending the next one.

(<u>25-139</u>) Vice Mayor Pryor announced that she attended an event where Minority Leader Hakeem Jeffries spoke and the Bohol Circle Community event; stated that she spoke at a Chamber of Commerce Event for Alameda Women Leaders.

(25-140) Councilmember Boller stated that he attended the 100 Club of Alameda County dinner.

(<u>25-141</u>) Councilmember Daysog stated that he attended the City Council/School Board subcommittee meeting alongside Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft.

(25-142) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft announced that she attended the City Council/School Board subcommittee meeting, an AC Transit Liaison meeting, a League of California Cities Board Meeting, the Bohol Circle event, an event at Yoshi's where the Alameda High School Jazz Band performed, a Metropolitan Transportation Commission meeting, and the League of California

Cities East Bay Division legislators dinner; stated that she also spoke to the Rotary Club.

(<u>25-143</u>) Councilmember Jensen noted the Encinal Jets girls are playing in a Division 3 Playoff game tonight.

<u>ADJOURNMENT</u>

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 8:42 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.