

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD

RESOLUTION HAB-XX-X

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA REGARDING APPLICATION PLN25-0114, REMOVING THE PROPERTY FROM THE HISTORICAL BUILDING STUDY LIST AND GRANTING A CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL FOR THE DEMOLITION OF A PRE-1942 BUILDING LOCATED AT 1711 ARBOR STREET

WHEREAS, applicant Jason Phoen made an application on February 21, 2025, proposing the demolition of the existing uninhabitable structure located at 1711 Arbor Street to facilitate redevelopment with a two-story residential building; and

WHEREAS, the application was deemed complete on April 24, 2025; and

WHEREAS, the General Plan designation of the site is Medium-Density Residential; and

WHEREAS, the parcel is located within the R-4 Residential Zoning District; and

WHEREAS, the subject property is not a Historic Monument; and

WHEREAS, the subject property was constructed prior to 1942 and is listed as an “H” on the Alameda Historical Building Study List, which designation did not indicate eligibility for inclusion on the State or National register; and

WHEREAS, on July 10, 2025, the 2025 Historic Resource Evaluation and Condition Assessment Memorandum was published by Garavaglia surveying the current condition of the subject property and providing historical evaluation, and the Memorandum was thereafter submitted to the City; and

WHEREAS, on September 4, 2025, the Board held a duly noticed public hearing and reviewed and considered the application, after deliberation determined that insufficient information was provided to make the required findings, and therefore the item was continued to the following meeting to allow the applicant to prepare the requested information; and

WHEREAS, on October 2, 2025, the Board held a duly noticed public hearing and reviewed and considered the application, including the staff report, exhibits, and other relevant documents including additional historical evaluation and community testimony in writing and during the hearing.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board finds the project is categorically exempt under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and no additional environmental review is necessary pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15301(I)(1) – Existing Facilities – Demolition and removal of individual small structures listed in 15301(I), October 2, 2025

including one single-family residence, and on a separate and independent basis, pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 – In-Fill Development Project consistent with the applicable general plan designation and zoning regulations. Pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15064.5 (a)(2), the Historical Advisory Board determines that the preponderance of the evidence demonstrates that the subject property lacks or has lost sufficient historical character and integrity to be considered a historical resource. Further, the subject property will be removed from the local study list as a result of the lack of historic character and loss of historic integrity. Accordingly, no exceptions to the exemptions apply.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that 1711 Arbor Street is hereby removed from the City’s Historical Building Study List.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board has made the following findings on the subject Certificate of Approval request:

- 1. The structure to be demolished does not embody distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, nor does it represent the work of an important creative individual.**

The building at 1711 Arbor Street originally featured distinctive elements of both Queen Anne cottage and vernacular Italianate styles. However, those elements have little to no remaining integrity due to the substantially altered condition of the building and lack of architectural cohesion. While many of the alterations to the original building took place prior to the 1979 survey, further damage has resulted in the loss of additional features including the front porch since the survey. The builder is Charles A. Mitchell, who has no known association with any designated historical monuments, and is not identified as a builder of merit in the updated historical evaluation. Overall, the building lacks representation of any distinctive characteristics of potential architectural significance.

- 2. There are no events associated with this property that make a significant contribution to the history or cultural heritage of local or regional history.**

The property was developed in the late 1880s as an individual building and no significant events are associated with the property nor are there significant contributions to the history. The historical evaluation does acknowledge that the building could potentially be tied to some kind of Portuguese Historic District, however goes on to state that this building does not have any individual significance to display a connection to that or any other cultural heritage of Alameda associated with this individual property.

- 3. The property is not associated with persons important to local, state, or national history.**

Staff was unable to find any records that define the property as containing historical and cultural merit in association with the lives of important individuals. Two potentially

meritorious people or groups were in significant association with the subject property. The first, the original builder and first resident, is Charles A. Mitchell, who is not eligible as a historically significant person. The other is longtime residents between roughly 1925 and 1975, the Miranda family. While the historic evaluation does identify the Miranda family as having represented a part of the larger Portuguese diaspora, their significance, if any, would be tied to that broader community in general, and not tied specifically to the house. Other residents had been identified, but none of which were primarily associated with the building in such a way that the person's productive life could be tied to the building. Therefore, no person could be identified in association with the subject property after researching the residents going back to the original owner/builder. No persons of importance to local, state, or national history are identified in the historical evaluation.

4. The property does not yield any information important in prehistory or history.

While the property was developed in the late 1800s, it is not likely to yield more information about prehistory or history of the local community than what is already known.

5. The project no longer meets the criteria for a Historical Monument or has become a detriment to the community and the condition making it a detriment cannot readily be cured.

The subject property has not been designated a Historical Monument, and a Certificate of Approval is required for demolition under Alameda Municipal Code Section 13-21.7(a), by virtue of it having been constructed prior to 1942. The determination that the building does not meet the criteria for a Historical Monument is consistent with the Secretary of Interior standards insofar as the building has lost most of its integrity due to modifications over time and the dilapidation of the structure. The extant building is a detriment to the community because the dilapidation has made it structurally unsound and visually displeasing. The damage is structurally significant enough that the building has been determined inhabitable and has remained vacant in recent years. The majority of the public-facing façade has been damaged, and the structural deficits cannot be readily cured through restoration. Demolition is necessary to remedy the existing conditions.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board hereby issues a Certificate of Approval for the proposed demolition at 1711 Arbor Street, subject to the following conditions:

- (1) Unless demolition has begun under valid City permits, this Certificate of Approval shall expire on the later of: (a) three (3) years after the effective date of this approval (i.e. October 2, 2028); or, (b) if appealed in accordance with AMC Ch. 30-25 or another applicable provision of law, three (3) years from the date of the final decision on such appeal.
- (2) The demolition permit authorized by this Certificate of Approval shall not be issued until the City first approves the Design Review for the proposed replacement building, which shall include considerations recommended by the Historical Advisory Board and public

comment in the Design Review process.

- (3) INDEMNIFICATION. To the maximum extent permitted by law, the applicant (or its successor in interest) shall defend (with counsel acceptable to the City), indemnify, and hold harmless the City of Alameda, its City Council, City Planning Board, officials, employees, agents and volunteers (collectively, "Indemnitees") from and against any and all claims, actions, or proceedings against Indemnitees to attack, set aside, void or annul an approval by Indemnitees relating to this project. This indemnification shall include, but is not limited to, all damages, losses, and expenses (including, without limitation, legal costs and attorney's fees) that may be awarded to the prevailing party arising out of or in connection with an approval by the Indemnitees relating to this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and the City shall cooperate in the defense. The City may elect, in its sole discretion, to participate in the defense of said claim, action, or proceeding and the applicant (or its successor in interest) shall reimburse the City for its reasonable legal costs and attorneys' fees.

NOTICE. The decision of the Historical Advisory Board shall be final unless appealed to the City Council, in writing and within ten (10) days of the decision, by Notice of Appeal stating the appellant claims that either the Board's decision is not supported by its findings or its findings are not supported by the evidence in the record.

NOTICE. No judicial proceedings subject to review pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.5 may be prosecuted more than ninety (90) days following the date of this decision plus extensions authorized by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6

NOTICE. The conditions of project approval set forth herein include certain fees and other exactions. Pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (d) (1), these Conditions constitute written notice of a statement of the amount of such fees, and a description of the dedications, reservations and exactions. The applicant is hereby further notified that the 90-day appeal period, in which the applicant may protest these fees and other exactions, pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (a) has begun. If the applicant fails to file a protest within this 90-day period complying with all requirements of Section 66020, the applicant will be legally barred from later challenging such fees or exactions.

* * * * *

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was duly and regularly adopted and passed by the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda during the Regular Meeting of the Historical Advisory Board on the 2nd day of October, 2025 by the following vote:

AYES:

NOES:

ABSENT:

ABSTAIN:

ATTEST:

Steven Buckley, Secretary

City of Alameda Historical Advisory Board