

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
DRAFT RESOLUTION

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA RECONSIDERING AND GRANTING A REVISED CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL FOR APPLICATION PLN24-0256, TO ALLOW THE REPLACEMENT OF COPPER GUTTERS AND DOWNSPOUTS WITH A DIFFERENT MATERIAL AT THE “BIG WHITES,” WHICH ARE CONTRIBUTING BUILDINGS WITHIN THE NAS ALAMEDA HISTORIC DISTRICT’S RESIDENTIAL SUBDISTRICT

WHEREAS, the Base Reuse and Economic Development Department (BRED) made an application on May 16, 2024, proposing to replace the copper gutters and downspouts at the former officers housing known as the Big Whites at the former NAS Alameda, now known as Alameda Point; and

WHEREAS, the Big Whites are located at 2765 Seattle Road, 2805 Seattle Road, 2765 Newport Road, 2801 Newport Road, 2815 Newport Road, 2825 Newport Road, 2775 San Diego Road, 2805 San Diego Road, 2835 San Diego Road, 2865 San Diego Road, 2795 San Pedro Road, 2815 San Pedro Road, 2835 San Pedro Road, 2845 San Pedro Road, 2875 San Pedro Road, 2805 Pearl Harbor Road, 2825 Pearl Harbor Road, 2845 Pearl Harbor Road and 390 West Essex Drive; and

WHEREAS, the application was deemed complete on June 15, 2024; and

WHEREAS, the General Plan designation of the site is Alameda Point Main Street Neighborhood and the General Plan contains specific policies related to the request, i.e. *Preserve the character defining features of the NAS Alameda Historic District Residential Subarea. Preserve the “Big White” single family homes, and consider the preservation of the Admiral’s House for community and/or City use;* and

WHEREAS, the subject properties are located within the AP-MS Alameda Point Main Street Zoning District which incorporates by reference the procedures of the historic preservation ordinance and the *Guide to Preserving the Character of the Naval Air Station Alameda Historic District;* and

WHEREAS, the subject properties are within the Alameda Point District Historic Monument, and each of the houses are identified as contributors to the district, and the copper gutters and downspouts are identified as character defining features; and

WHEREAS, on July 18, 2024, the Historical Advisory Board held a duly noticed public hearing, reviewed the application, including exhibits and documents, and considered all testimony from interested parties and approved the request subject to conditions of approval, i.e. that the gutters remain in a patina copper material and that the downspouts be allowed to be replaced as necessary with a square galvanized steel and that the joint

between the materials be protected from galvanic corrosion; and

WHEREAS, the staff of BRED has sought bids for performing the work and has been unable to secure a contractor willing to meet the specification imposed by the Historical Advisory Board due to the highly corrosive environment in the Alameda Point neighborhood and therefore the lack of a warranty for the work, and, time is of the essence to repair and replace missing gutters and downspouts and to coordinate the work with other roof repairs, painting and other maintenance; and

WHEREAS, BRED has therefore requested a reconsideration of the Historical Advisory Board's prior approval and conditions; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board held a duly noticed public hearing on November 7, 2024 to consider the request for reconsideration.

NOW THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board finds that:

1. The project is consistent with the General Plan and Zoning Ordinance densities and use regulations; and
2. On February 4, 2024, the Final EIR (State Clearinghouse #2013012043) was certified by the City Council for the Alameda Point Project, including amendments to the General Plan and Zoning Ordinance; and
3. There are no environmental impacts peculiar to the project that were not analyzed in the Final EIR, or any such impact can be substantially mitigated by imposition of uniformly applied development policies or standards previously adopted by the City; and
4. There are no significant effects of the project that were not analyzed as significant effects in the Final EIR; and
5. There are no potentially significant off-site impacts of the proposed project and there are no cumulative impacts to which the proposed project makes a considerable contribution which were not discussed in the Final EIR; and
6. There are no previously identified significant impacts of the proposed project which, as a result of substantial new information which was not known at the time the EIR was certified, have been determined to have a more severe adverse impact than discussed in the Final EIR; and
7. Pursuant to the streamlining provisions of CEQA Guidelines Section 15183, no further environmental review is required; and

8. In particular, no impact to historic resources would occur pursuant to Section 15064.5, which outlines a detailed process for determining the significance of impacts to historical resources, and the proposal would not result in the “physical demolition, destruction, relocation, or alteration of the resource or its immediate surroundings such that the significance of an historical resource would be materially impaired” because the project follows the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* and the *Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings* in accordance with Mitigation Measure 4-D of the Alameda Point Project EIR.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board has determined pursuant to AMC section 13-21.5.b.1 that the repairs and alterations of the Historical Monument, with conditions of approval, meet the standards established by the Historical Advisory Board and the *Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties* and *Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings*, as follows:

1. Rehabilitation is defined by the Secretary’s Standards as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values. The Rehabilitation Standards acknowledge the need to alter or add to a historic building to meet continuing or new needs while retaining the building’s historic character.
2. Repair may include the limited replacement in kind or with a compatible substitute material of missing materials on a main roof, as well as those extensively deteriorated or missing components of features when there are surviving prototypes. In this case, many of the gutters and downspouts have already been replaced by the Navy or are missing and need to be replaced. The proposed replacement in kind (same profile in a compatible color) is reasonable given the situation.
3. The Big Whites were historically built to provide accommodations for high-ranking Navy officers and their families while stationed at NAS Alameda. The homes reflect the architectural styles and building practices of the WWII era and are significant for their location, configuration and layout, and architectural form and style. The gutters and downspouts on these buildings are one architectural element of a bigger whole that contributes to the overall historic character and integrity of the structures. The gutters and downspouts do not individually determine whether the building is historic; rather, they are part of the collective features that define the building’s historical significance.
4. The proposed replacement of the original copper gutters and downspouts with aluminum in a square profile and white finish would preserve the overall aesthetic appearance while deterring theft and providing a more practical, cost-effective

maintenance solution. This approach does not materially impair the Big Whites' architectural integrity or their ability to convey their historical significance.

5. The proposed replacement balances historical aesthetics with modern considerations, ensuring the buildings' exterior remains consistent with their original design while addressing ongoing maintenance and security concerns, consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board approves the proposed modifications to the exterior of the buildings and issues a Certificate of Approval subject to the following conditions:

1. This Certificate of Approval shall expire three (3) years after the date of approval (November 7, 2027) unless work has begun under valid City permits prior to the date of expiration, in which case this approval shall vest for all of the buildings to which it applies.
2. Final design may include aluminum metals and shall incorporate a white finish and square profile to closely match the other existing gutters and downspouts in the neighborhood and maintain the overall character.

NOTICE. The decision of the Historical Advisory Board shall be final unless appealed to the City Council, in writing and within ten (10) days of the decision, by Notice of Appeal stating the appellant claims that either the Board's decision is not supported by its findings or its findings are not supported by the evidence in the record.

NOTICE. No judicial proceedings subject to review pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.5 may be prosecuted more than ninety (90) days following the date of this decision plus extensions authorized by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6

* * * * *

I, the undersigned, hereby certify that the foregoing Resolution was adopted by the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda during its regular meeting of November 7, 2024, by the following vote:

AYES:
NOES:
ABSENT:

ATTEST:

Steven Buckley, Secretary
City of Alameda Historical Advisory Board