

From: theresemhall@aol.com
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Nov 6 Council Meeting Agenda Item 10-C
Date: Wednesday, November 6, 2024 6:19:56 PM

Dear Alameda Mayor and City Council,

I am in utter disbelief about what has been perpetrated against Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer with no evidence other than hearsay and speculation from reporters and social media. In spite of lack of evidence, Councilmember Vella and Mayor Ashcraft, both attorneys, decided to proceed with the 'Court of Public Opinion' and try Miss Spencer on the basis of a 911 caller who described a woman as intoxicated on a street in Long Beach CA.

What is important here is that the filing of the Resolution to Admonish Councilwoman Spencer occurred PRIOR TO and not SUBSEQUENT TO the release of webcam video evidence furnished by Long Beach police to the City of Alameda showing Miss Spencer clearly in need of medical attention. Something is terribly wrong and we the public are left to question whether she received proper medical attention for the condition responders found her in given the initial bias from the 911 dispatch.

Councilmember Spencer has no recollection of events as she states in her public response and believes she was the victim of a crime which is corroborated by her medical treatment at a local ER where a concussion was diagnosed and a Suspicious Injury Report was filed by the attending medical team.

There has been no evidence offered such as a a field sobriety test, a police arrest report, etc. on which to base this claim for public admonishment. The timing of all of this and the rush to so called justice seems targeted and with specific political purpose during this election period. It smacks of partisan politics and suggests election interference.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer has been harassed and badgered her entire career by her opponents. I continue to believe however, that our elected officials hold themselves to a higher standard and that we Alamedans will not deprive Councilmember Spencer her right to maintain her innocence until proven guilty otherwise we have become judge, jury and executioner.

Please reconsider and repeal the Adoption of Resolution to Admonish City Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer. Not only is it reckless and premature, it exposes the City of Alameda to potential legal action.

Thank you,

Therese Hall

From: [MARGARET HALL](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezy Ashcraft](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Manager Manager](#); [Yibin Shen](#); [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10c response
Date: Wednesday, November 6, 2024 6:06:18 PM

Hello Mayor and Council Members,

I'm writing to weigh in on Agenda Item 10c brought by Ms. Ashcraft and Ms. Vella regarding the admonishment of Trish Herrera Spencer.

I believe a grave rush to judgment has happened, for there isn't a scintilla of factual evidence, such as a blood alcohol level test result.

The Long Beach Police arrived at the scene with an inherent bias toward 'intoxication' leveled by a caller. Trish's first words when the Police arrived and roused her were "I'm scared".

One of the Officers realized this was more than alcohol when he reported to EMS when they arrived that "she seems very altered, we're not sure what's going on with her". Another Officer asked Trish "did anyone offer you anything?"

I believe with all my heart that Trish was maliciously roofied. I suspect the 911 caller may have been complicit as his story changed from what he told the bouncer and what he said in the 911 call. My sister and I took her to the ER 30 hours after this incident occurred because she was still disoriented and confused.

The Trish I know is always raring to go to a event, trivia, local music. She is also the most approachable, hard working, get the facts before she votes Councilmember, I have seen. She is not beholden to big-money donors and always goes the extra mile for all Alamedans.

Trish has been continuously attacked on multiple fronts for years. But this election has shown an escalated level of hate including the blatant, fabricated headline that Trish was ARRESTED for being black out drunk in Long Beach. After that was determined to be a lie, within a week after her experience, someone came onto my front lawn and laid a printed out article of the Long Beach occurrence and an empty wine bottle underneath my Trish sign. Apparently this was done all over town. Do I need to mention the numerous attack mailers? This level of slander made me feel scared by our toxic levels of politics in Alameda. The political timing of this public admonishment before the election and without merit is clearly just another attack, the damage has been done, please put it to rest tonight without an admonishment. Please, Tony and Tracey - take the high ground.

Thank you,
Margaret Hall

From: [Tony Devencenzi](#)
To: [City Clerk](#); [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Malia Vella](#)
Cc: [Tony Daysog](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Jennifer Ott](#); [Lara Weisiger](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10-C, November 6, 2024, City Council Agenda
Date: Wednesday, November 6, 2024 9:55:28 AM

Members of the Alameda City Council-

We are appalled and ashamed at our Mayor and Council Member Vella's action to 'consider a resolution to admonish City Council member Trish Herrera Spencer for behavior exhibited on October 18 2024, in Long Beach California while attending the League of California Cities Annual Conference'.

Since when is one judged and found guilty when no charges of any kind have been filed?

Isn't this an horrific example of the pot calling the kettle black; to coin a very old phrase?

Remember back to the time in 2018 when Councilmember Vella and then Councilman Oddie pressured and threatened the job of Alameda City Manager, Jill Keimach, to hire fire chief, Domenick Weaver, (their choice...past President of the Firefighter's union) instead of her preferred choice, Salinas Fire Chief, Edmond Rodriquez, thus costing the City of Alameda \$945,000.

Was there any admonishment there? No, there was not.

This referral needs to be withdrawn.

Sincerely,

Cathy Jefferson
Tony Devencenzi

From: [Brandon Sheirich](#)
To: [Lara Weisiger](#)
Cc: [Jennifer Nguyen](#)
Subject: FW: [EXTERNAL] Statement in Support of Item 10-C 2024-4500
Date: Wednesday, November 6, 2024 9:22:51 AM
Attachments: [image001.png](#)

From: Ryan LaLonde <rlalonde3@yahoo.com>
Sent: Thursday, October 31, 2024 5:56 PM
To: Manager Manager <MANAGER@alamedaca.gov>; Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft <MEzzyAshcraft@alamedaca.gov>; Malia Vella <MVella@alamedaca.gov>; Tony Daysog <TDaysog@alamedaca.gov>; Tracy Jensen <tjensen@alamedaca.gov>; Trish Spencer <tspencer@alamedaca.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Statement in Support of Item 10-C 2024-4500

Letter about...Item 10-C - Consider Adoption of Resolution to Admonish City Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer for Behavior which Violates City Council Code of Conduct Section 3(b)

Dear Council and City Manager

I am writing this letter in response to the Council's censure of Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer. I have to say that I am not big on pulling personal lives into the public sphere of elected office. As an elected official myself, I hope that my family and private life are off limits when it comes to the duties of my elected office.

As I understand it, Ms. Spencer was on official city business when this incident occurred – and while dealing with addiction should be private – it seems she made choices that spilled it into the “elected realm”.

As confirmed by Long Beach police, Mercury News and other media outlets – Trish was intoxicated. In doing so it put the city at risk for her care and lawsuits. That is concerning.

But what is making me write this letter is that I believe Trish is not owning the mistake and made false statements in her official statement as distributed by the city. The Mercury News article on October 31st shows many of her statements to not be true.

I am so concerned about the statement in the body cam footage where Ms. Spencer tells a Long Beach officer that she will get Chief Joshi to fire him. This statement opens the question of how many times has the city or our police force covered up other events like his in our own town. While I am only speculating – it does raise the question for investigation.

Personally, I know the signs of a person with a drinking problem, my grandfather died from his addiction and would lie to just get another drink. He unfortunately surrounded himself with people who enabled his drinking. I hope that members of the city staff that are close and friendly with Trish are encouraging her to seek treatment. I have friends on other city councils who were at the conference and reported back that Ms. Spencer was drunk at the Latino Caucus function that night and I am sure there are many other witnesses.

Unfortunately, Trish's private issues have spilled into the public/elected sphere and need to be addressed. As your resolution shows there was a breakdown in decorum that needs to be addressed.
Resident

I know this is not easy to call out a colleague – but an example of how we want our leadership to act needs to be set. The outright denial of facts by Ms. Spencer is troublesome and the misleading statements must be addressed as well.

Ryan LaLonde

Alameda Resident

From: [diane appelbaum](#)
To: [City Clerk](#)
Cc: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] correspondence RE Trish Herrera Spencer
Date: Tuesday, November 5, 2024 4:58:11 PM

Dear Lara,

Please include this in the correspondence for the 11/6 City Council meeting item 10 (B?) re the admonishment of Trish Herrera Spencer.

When I learned of the Trish Herrera Spencer incident in Long Beach a few weeks ago (and all the reports which spoke of her state of intoxication), I felt a certain amount of sympathy for the humiliation she must have felt, and the publicity which followed. But more importantly, I felt concern for her health and well-being. I have had experience with a family member who "had a drinking problem," (severe, but undiagnosed), and I know how hard it is for both the drinker and the friends/family to confront the problem, even after repeated incidents. I don't know the details of exactly what happened in Long Beach (and apparently neither does Ms Spencer Herrera). But it seems that the most important thing now is her health. If there is an alcohol problem, my hope is that she looks inward and finds the kind of support and help needed to confront the problem.

I don't agree with those who have written in to claim that members of City Council acted unfairly by admonishing her. As friends and supporters, I would think that they, too, would focus more on her health, rather than just blaming City Council for being 'unfair.' It was City Council's responsibility to address the incident, since she was representing Alameda in Long Beach. That doesn't mean that City Council members are dispassionate.

Sincerely,
Diane, Alameda resident

From: [Donna Fletcher](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Malia Vella](#)
Cc: [Lara Weisiger](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Jennifer Ott](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Admonishment of Councilmember Spencer (Agenda Item 10-C)
Date: Tuesday, November 5, 2024 10:07:33 AM

Dear Mayor Ashcraft and Councilmember Vella,

I am disheartened that you are considering a resolution to publicly admonish Councilmember Spencer at tomorrow night's council meeting.

The City Council Code of Conduct states that "Honesty and respect for the dignity of each individual should be reflected in every word and action taken by members." I expect this level of behavior to also guide how Councilmember Spencer's colleagues respond to her regarding what is known about the incident that took place in Long Beach.

Is it necessary to, essentially, take Councilmember Spencer into the town square and reprimand her publicly-- at a time when she is still recovering from her injuries and at a point where all of the facts surrounding the incident in Long Beach have not been established?

As colleagues who work very diligently together to serve Alamedans, I would hope you would take a more compassionate and measured approach to Councilmember Spencer, in keeping with the "respect for the dignity of each individual" in the Code of Conduct.

**Have you spoken to Councilmember Spencer in person and shared your sincere concerns for her welfare?*

**Have you let her know you are supporting her in whatever way you can help her?*

**Can you care about your colleague in a way that lifts her up and inspires those watching you?*

Please withdraw Resolution 10C, and rather, consider how you can support your colleague in a way that strengthens your ability to work together *honestly and respectfully for Alamedans*. Thank you for considering!

Gratefully,
Donna Fletcher
112 Centre Court
Alameda

From: [Jay](#)
To: [Lara Weisiger](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Comments regarding Item 10C on 11/524 CC Agenda
Date: Monday, November 4, 2024 9:49:54 PM
Attachments: [Comments regarding Item 10C.docx](#)

Madam Clerk,

I would appreciate it if you would include the attached file in the Item 10C updated Correspondence file.

Thank you.

Jay Garfinkle

November 4, 2024

Members of the Alameda City Council

I am disappointed and disgusted by the arguably unethical behavior on the part of two union-financed members of the City Council who apparently believe that our legal system requires that individuals are to be presumed guilty until proven innocent.

It is apparent to me that their referral was prompted by their desire to impede Councilwoman Herrera-Spencer's bid for reelection.

In addition, the fact that the referral was made at a time when the only available "information" related to the incident in Long Beach was being dumped on social media platforms by trolls who have been posting demeaning misinformation about Ms. Herrera-Spencer over the past several years.

Speaking as a former trauma surgeon, I will share the observations I made as I reviewed the bodycam videos that became available a few days **after** the referral had been submitted.

Councilwoman Herrera-Spencer appeared dazed and confused, and it would not be unreasonable to make an inexpert shoot-from-the-hip assumption that intoxication was the culprit. This is probably the first thing that most people would conclude absent clinical or personal experience with other potential etiologies for these findings.

Evidently, the 911 caller suggested intoxication as the cause, so other possibilities such as head trauma were probably not even considered by the police and EMTs. And it would have been easier, especially for the police, to accept intoxication as the explanation rather than having to initiate an investigation for a possible mugger.

In addition to the confusion and disorientation we should note that she had several bruises which were more likely to have resulted from a physical altercation than from a simple fall given the distribution of the bruises. Also, consider that had she been so intoxicated that it had led to her falling and sustaining the widely distributed bruises, her speech would have been significantly slurred, which it was not.

I am not suggesting that the only possible cause for Ms. Herrera-Spencer's condition as seen on the body cam videos would have been head trauma. Rather, I believe head trauma would have been a more likely, or at least as likely, explanation than intoxication.

Regardless of the explanation for Ms. Herrera-Spencer's emergency medical condition, it is patently clear that the referral was submitted **in advance of receipt of relevant information** from a reliable and unbiased source. And in view of this I believe that the

public can only conclude that the referral was made in an attempt by members of the City Council to manipulate the outcome of a legitimate election.

The perpetrators, of course, would insist that they were only trying to Make Alameda Great Again.

Jay Garfinkle, MD, FACS

From: [Trish Spencer](#)
To: [City Clerk](#)
Subject: Fwd: I support Trish
Date: Monday, November 4, 2024 6:26:22 PM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: Bob Taylor <bobtaylor100@gmail.com>

Date: Nov 4, 2024 4:00 PM

Subject: [EXTERNAL] I support Trish

To: Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft <MEzzyAshcraft@alamedaca.gov>, Tony Daysog <TDaysog@alamedaca.gov>, Trish Spencer <tspencer@alamedaca.gov>, Malia Vella <MVella@alamedaca.gov>, Tracy Jensen <tjensen@alamedaca.gov>

Cc:

Trish

When I have contacted the Council about my concerns, you have always replied and offered helpful resources. I can't say the same for the Mayor or Council Person Vella.

The city needs you as a responsive voice for the residents of Alameda. A voice who shows she cares about our city and local issues.

Thanks for your service.

Mayor Ashcroft and Council Person Vella, get back to work.

From: [Conchita Perales](#)
To: [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#)
Cc: [Manager Manager](#); [Yibin Shen](#); [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10-C, November 6, 2024, City Council Agenda
Date: Monday, November 4, 2024 1:46:40 PM

Mayor Ashcraft and Council Member Vella should be ashamed of themselves for filling a referral at Item 10-C of the Nov. 6 Council agenda seeking to “Consider a resolution to admonish City Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer...” without any proof or evidence. It should be withdrawn, and an apology made to Ms. Spencer.

To quote an admired Alameda writer: Mrs. Ashcraft and Mrs. Vella’s “tactics are eerily appropriate in the era of Donald Trump, where insults and vengeance rule the day.” It is truly inappropriate and sickening to “see our local politicians sink to that level.”

Shame on you Asscraft and Vella, I hope that you reap what you sow...

- Conchita Perales

From: [Doug Biggs](#)
To: [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10-c
Date: Monday, November 4, 2024 11:31:55 AM

I am writing in regards to item 10-c, consideration of a resolution admonishing Councilmember Spencer for her behavior while on a city funded excursion. The resolution is warranted, not just for her public intoxication, but also for her continued denial and obfuscation of the event.

But the larger issue for me is how do we as a community stop enabling her substance abuse. In the last week there have been dozens of posts on local social media recounting previous events at which Spencer has been intoxicated while representing the city or her office. I, on three occasions have witnessed Spencer highly intoxicated at either a city sponsored event or a fundraiser, and the last two times saw her drive off in her vehicle, after consuming almost 1 bottle of wine, and arguing with the bartender to try and take any open bottles they had with her. I made a grave mistake in not calling the police, and now wish I had, as an earlier intervention might have spared us this latest episode. I would ask that we stop treating her as the "harmless town drunk" and recognize her behavior as what it really is, a danger to herself, and to the community and vow to not tolerate this behavior when we encounter it in the future.

From: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#)
To: [Lara Weisiger](#)
Cc: [Yibin Shen](#); [Jennifer Ott](#)
Subject: Fwd: [EXTERNAL] concerns regarding Councilwoman Trish Spencer
Date: Monday, November 4, 2024 10:33:01 AM

Hi Lara,

Could you please include this email in correspondence re my council referral? Thanks.

Marilyn

Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft
Mayor, City of Alameda
[510-747-4745](tel:510-747-4745)

Begin forwarded message:

From: Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft <MEzzyAshcraft@alamedaca.gov>
Date: November 1, 2024 at 6:30:46 PM EDT
To: Jennifer Ott <jott@alamedaca.gov>, Yibin Shen <yshen@alamedaca.gov>, Malia Vella <MVella@alamedaca.gov>
Subject: Fwd: [EXTERNAL] concerns regarding Councilwoman Trish Spencer

Good Afternoon All,

Forwarding fyi. I will respond to Dr. Spence.

Marilyn

Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft
Mayor, City of Alameda
[510-747-4745](tel:510-747-4745)

Begin forwarded message:

From: Megan Spence <volleymeg@yahoo.com>
Date: November 1, 2024 at 3:22:36 PM PDT
To: Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft <MEzzyAshcraft@alamedaca.gov>
Subject: [EXTERNAL] concerns regarding Councilwoman Trish Spencer

Hello Mayor Ashcraft,

My name is Megan Spence. I am a resident of Alameda and also a

local CA licensed psychologist. I am writing to voice my concerns regarding the recent choices Councilwoman Trish Herrera Spencer made while on a city funded trip. I recently viewed the video footage from the police cameras, and was horrified to see Ms. Spencer's mental condition. It is clear she is quite unwell and in need of support. As a former evaluator in the ER, had I seen Ms. Spencer in this state I would have professionally recommended intensive treatment for a substance use disorder.

I am wondering what the city's response to this behavior will be? Do citizens have a right to call for the removal from the City Council if she is re-elected?

Thank you for your time,
Dr. Megan Spence

From: [Gig Codiga](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Lara Weisiger](#)
Cc: [ACT](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10-C, 11/6/2024 City Council Agenda - Outrageous Rush to Judgement - No Facts
Date: Sunday, November 3, 2024 1:28:30 PM

To the Honorable Mayor and City Council Members

First I would point everyone to ACT's letter to the City Council which clearly indicates that this agenda item is "...an outrageous rush to judgement...".

The first WHEREAS, implies, without complete detail and no official conclusion as to what happened in Long Beach, which is simply a good Samaritan passerby [Thank you btw] found an unconscious woman and called it in, not knowing her condition.

Trish was found injured, after hours, with a concussion, bruises and lost jewelry. Is there no compassion?, instead, there is a rush to condemn, by the Mayor and Council Member Vella, both attorneys. Note: that the City Council failed to admonish (Vella) and former Council Member Oddie even with the Grand Jury determining they DID violate the City Charter Section 3(b)). Mayor Ashcroft voted not to admonish these. Is this a political move? Is the damage done just for bringing this up?

For Trish, there is no evidence presented by officers/EMT on site that concluded that she was intoxicated.

I wish Trish well. And will continue to support her as the best for diversity in decision making and for Alamedans, even though we don't always align.

Best Regards
Be Well

Gig Codiga
650-922-0554

Proverbs 15:1 A soft answer turns away wrath, but a harsh word stirs up anger.

This message contains information which may be confidential and privileged. Unless you are the addressee (or authorized to receive for the addressee), you may not use, copy or disclose to anyone the message or any information contained in the message.

From: [mary anderson](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Manager Manager](#); [Yibin Shen](#); [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Agenda 10, Nov. 6
Date: Sunday, November 3, 2024 6:21:54 AM

I am very concerned by the totally false accusations against Councilwoman Trish Herrera Spencer.

All the supporting evidence clearly shows that she had been injured in an attack.

All of you, especially lawyers, should recognize this.

I believe this accusation is **purely political**.

Dismiss this charge immediately.

Mary Anderson

Alameda resident

From: [Nancy Gordon](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Manager Manager](#); [Yibin Shen](#); [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] 11/1 Nancy Gordon sends comments to Council/Clerk regarding meeting of occurrence with Trish Spencer
Date: Friday, November 1, 2024 5:13:13 PM

11/1/24

To Alameda council members and Alameda City Clerk,

I'd just like to go on record as someone who found your "rush to judgment" about what happened with Trish Spencer to be a VERY premature judgment.

At prior City Council meetings I have witnessed a distinct disregard for Trish Spencer (except never by Tony), and this does not resonate as fair treatment of one of your Council members.

Please refrain from commenting on situations until you have ALL the facts.

Sincerely,
Nancy Gordon, Alamedan since 1973

From: [Dorothy Freeman](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tracy Jensen](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Lara Weisiger](#); [Manager Manager](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] City Council Meeting November 6, 2024 Agenda Item 10C
Date: Friday, November 1, 2024 1:25:42 PM

Regarding City Council Meeting November 6, 2024 Agenda Item 10C

Dear Mayor Ashcraft, Vice Mayor Daysog, Councilmembers Vella, Jensen, and Spencer;

The Council referral to consider adoption of resolution to admonish City Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer was a rush to judgment. This referral was added to the agenda before any true facts were known and many are still in question. I believe Mayor Ashcraft and Councilmember Vella reacted to the public outcry created by those who wish to discredit Councilmember Spencer and the referral should be removed.

Councilmember Spencer was asked to attend a gathering in the evening after the Long Beach conference had ended. It is known that Ms. Spencer did have at least one drink while on personal time at a social setting. Exactly what happened after that is up to a lot of interpretation. Ms. Spencer was found in a condition indicating she needed help after a 911 call from a concerned person (cp) who thought she could be intoxicated.

It is a fact that at the time Ms. Spencer was found by Long Beach Police and EMTs she had suffered a concussion, other abrasions to her face and bruises to her arms. The police camera videos are disturbing but are consistent with actions that could be caused by a concussion and not necessarily from being intoxicated. Speculation is that she fell and hit her head but that does not account for the other bruises on her arms.

The public outcry that has taken place on social media and with local news groups is a travesty that has escalated far beyond what actually has happened. The Long Beach Police department has never confirmed to a proven fact that Ms. Spencer was inebriated to a point that would have caused the confusion that is shown in the police body cameras. Ms. Spencer was transported to a San Diego hospital where she received medical attention. Ms. Spencer was then able to return to Alameda on Friday and went to a local hospital emergency room early Saturday morning. The local hospital confirmed that Ms. Spencer did have a concussion and the totality of her injuries indicated a crime may have been committed against her.

I believe that if this incident had happened at a time when Ms. Spencer was not running for public office she would have received the compassion she deserves and been allowed to recover from the medical injuries she has experienced. Instead, some members of the City Council who are themselves attorneys have allowed social media posts to influence their judgement instead of looking at the facts of the case.

Respectfully,

Dorothy Freeman

cc: City Clerk and City Manager

From: [Edward Sing](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#)
Cc: [Manager Manager](#); [Yibin Shen](#); [City Clerk](#); alamedacitizenstaskforce@gmail.com
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Fw: Item 10-C, November 6, 2024, City Council Agenda
Date: Friday, November 1, 2024 10:21:33 AM

Alameda City Council:

I fully agree with and support the comments of the Alameda Citizens Task Force, below, which are critical of Item 10.c of your November 6, 2024 agenda. This item should be removed from the agenda.

I especially find the introduction of Item 10.c hypocritical as several members of the Council were not censured when, ***after extensive fact finding*** by the Alameda County Grand Jury, Council members Oddie and Vella were found to have violated the City Charter but the City Council, which included both Ashcraft and Vella, failed to censure them. But now they seek to admonish Ms. Spencer for alleged after-hours conduct ***before any responsible body has fully investigated the incident.***

Respectfully,

Ed Sing
Alameda Resident 27 Years

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **ACT** <alamedacitizenstaskforce@gmail.com>
Date: Wed, Oct 30, 2024 at 9:34 AM
Subject: Item 10-C, November 6, 2024, City Council Agenda
To: <mezzyashcraft@alamedaca.gov>, <tdaysog@alamedaca.gov>, <mvella@alamedaca.gov>, <tspencer@alamedaca.gov>, <tjensen@alamedaca.gov>
Cc: <manager@alamedaca.gov>, <yshen@alamedacityattorney.org>, <clerk@alamedaca.gov>

ACT

Alameda Citizens Task Force

Vigilance, Truth, Civility

Mayor Ashcraft and Council Member Vella have filed a Referral at Item 10-C of the Nov. 6 Council agenda seeking to “Consider a resolution to admonish City Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer for behavior exhibited on October 18, 2024, in Long Beach, California while attending the League of California Cities Annual Conference when Long Beach Police and fire personnel responded to reports of an intoxicated woman at a downtown intersection at 12:12 a.m. and that woman was determined to be Councilmember Hererra Spencer ...”.

The Ashcraft-Vella referral is an outrageous rush to judgement. The fact that both are lawyers and should know better compounds their error. Vella teaches a college course in legal ethics but ignores her own teachings when politically expedient. ***It is ironic that when Council Members Oddie and Vella, after extensive fact finding by the Alameda County Grand Jury, were found to have violated the City Charter, City Council which included both Ashcraft and Vella failed to censure them, while now they seek to admonish Ms. Spencer for alleged after-hours conduct and before any responsible body fully investigated the incident.***

This referral is a blatant political act and deliberately misleads the public to believe that Ms. Spencer was found drunk on the street, omitting any mention of the fact that she suffered severe injuries including a concussion and the loss of personal effects. The only mention of intoxication was from the person who found her and reported to the police that she appeared intoxicated. **What this person did not know was that Ms. Spencer was concussed.** When the police and EMS arrived, they treated her as a medical emergency and transported her to a local ER for treatment of her injuries with abrasions on both sides of both arms and the top and side of her head. **No evidence whatsoever has been presented that any of the first responders or hospital staff concluded that she was intoxicated.**

Ms. Spencer has no memory of whatever led to her injuries and limited recollection of what happened in the ER. However, she eventually realized that her necklace and another personal effect were missing. After returning home to Alameda she sought follow-up care at a local ER. The attending physician advised her that the nature of her injuries raised a suspicion that they were the result of a criminal assault, and that the ER was required by law to report their suspicion to the police. Ms. Spencer's public statement reciting the above can be read at <https://alamedapost.com/news/trish-herrera-spencer-responds-long-beach-incident/>

Councilmember Spencer suffered injuries from an unknown cause significant enough to require two visits to emergency rooms. This Ashcraft-Vella referral lacks any evidentiary basis. It should be withdrawn, and an apology made to Ms. Spencer.

Sincerely,

Alameda Citizens Task Force Board of Directors

From: [Patricia Baer](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Malia Vella](#); [City Clerk](#)
Cc: [Tony Daysog](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10-C
Date: Thursday, October 31, 2024 3:58:53 PM

Council members Ashcraft and Vella,

I don't understand your censuring Trish Spencer. Do you have inside information from the Long Beach police or emergency services that hasn't reached the general public yet? Your admonishment of her right before the election appears to be more than just a coincidence.

Patsy Baer

From: [Trish Spencer](#)
To: [City Clerk](#)
Subject: Fwd: Rush to Judgment
Date: Wednesday, October 30, 2024 10:30:14 PM

----- Forwarded message -----

From: PatMarty Butensky <patmarty60@gmail.com>

Date: Oct 30, 2024 6:18 PM

Subject: [EXTERNAL] Rush to Judgment

To: Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft <MEzzyAshcraft@alamedaca.gov>, Tony Daysog <TDaysog@alamedaca.gov>, Malia Vella <MVella@alamedaca.gov>, Trish Spencer <tspencer@alamedaca.gov>, Tracy Jensen <tjensen@alamedaca.gov>

Cc:

To: City Council

We're writing to urge the Council to withdraw its move towards censoring Trish Spencer before any legitimate evidence of any wrongdoing has been established.

We fully support the letter that was sent to you by ACT earlier today.
Marty & Pat Butensky

From: [Marie Kane](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Tracy Jensen](#)
Cc: [City Clerk](#); [Nielsen Property Managers, Inc.](#); yshen@alamedacityattorney.org
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Legally Wise?
Date: Wednesday, October 30, 2024 10:48:01 AM

Mayor and City Council,

Are you exposing the city to legal liability by your resolution to admonish Councilmember Trish Hererra Spencer before the true and complete facts of the situation are determined? It seems very unwise to me. Are you acting politically? Why are you exposing our Alameda citizens to the costs of a potential lawsuit? Item 10C on the November 6th agenda seems political and not responsible on your part.

Why were Councilmembers Vella and Oddie not admonished by the then City Council (which included both current members Ashcraft and Vella) after a finding by the Alameda County Grand Jury that they had violated the City Charter? Your behavior seems politically motivated.

Marie Kane
510-410-6058

Sent from my iPhone

From: [ACT](#)
To: [Marilyn Ezzy Ashcraft](#); [Tony Daysog](#); [Malia Vella](#); [Trish Spencer](#); [Tracy Jensen](#)
Cc: [Manager Manager](#); [Yibin Shen](#); [City Clerk](#)
Subject: [EXTERNAL] Item 10-C, November 6, 2024, City Council Agenda
Date: Wednesday, October 30, 2024 9:35:17 AM

ACT

Alameda Citizens Task Force

Vigilance, Truth, Civility

Mayor Ashcraft and Council Member Vella have filed a Referral at Item 10-C of the Nov. 6 Council agenda seeking to “Consider a resolution to admonish City Councilmember Trish Herrera Spencer for behavior exhibited on October 18, 2024, in Long Beach, California while attending the League of California Cities Annual Conference when Long Beach Police and fire personnel responded to reports of an intoxicated woman at a downtown intersection at 12:12 a.m. and that woman was determined to be Councilmember Hererra Spencer ...”.

The Ashcraft-Vella referral is an outrageous rush to judgement. The fact that both are lawyers and should know better compounds their error. Vella teaches a college course in legal ethics but ignores her own teachings when politically expedient. ***It is ironic that when Council Members Oddie and Vella, after extensive fact finding by the Alameda County Grand Jury, were found to have violated the City Charter, City Council which included both Ashcraft and Vella failed to censure them, while now they seek to admonish Ms. Spencer for alleged after-hours conduct and before any responsible body fully investigated the incident.***

This referral is a blatant political act and deliberately misleads the public to believe that Ms. Spencer was found drunk on the street, omitting any mention of the fact that she suffered severe injuries including a concussion and the loss of personal effects. The only mention of intoxication was from the person who found her and reported to the police that she appeared intoxicated. ***What this person did not know was that Ms. Spencer was concussed.*** When the police and EMS arrived, they treated her as a medical emergency and transported her to a local ER for treatment of her injuries with abrasions on both sides of both arms and the top and side of her head. ***No evidence whatsoever has been presented that any of the first responders or hospital staff concluded that she was intoxicated.***

Ms. Spencer has no memory of whatever led to her injuries and limited recollection of what happened in the ER. However, she eventually realized that her necklace and another personal effect were missing. After returning home to Alameda she sought

follow-up care at a local ER. The attending physician advised her that the nature of her injuries raised a suspicion that they were the result of a criminal assault, and that the ER was required by law to report their suspicion to the police. Ms. Spencer's public statement reciting the above can be read at <https://alamedapost.com/news/trish-herrera-spencer-responds-long-beach-incident/>

Councilmember Spencer suffered injuries from an unknown cause significant enough to require two visits to emergency rooms. This Ashcraft-Vella referral lacks any evidentiary basis. It should be withdrawn, and an apology made to Ms. Spencer.

Sincerely,

Alameda Citizens Task Force Board of Directors