



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA
WEDNESDAY, JULY 6, 2022**

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:01 p.m. by President, Marguerite Malloy.

2. **ROLL CALL:**

PRESENT: President Marguerite Malloy, Vice President Troy Hosmer, Member Bob Barde, Human Resources Director and Executive Secretary of the Civil Service Board, Nancy Bronstein

ABSENT: Member, Donna Hom

STAFF PRESENT:

Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Manager
Chris Low, Senior Human Resources Analyst
Noelle White, Human Resources Analyst I
Chad Barr, Administrative Technician II
Celena Chen, Assistant City Attorney II
Allen Tai, City Planner

3. **CONSENT CALENDAR:**

**MINUTES OF THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING OF OCTOBER 6, 2021
MINUTES OF THE CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING OF APRIL 6, 2022**

**President Malloy moved to open comments to public. No comment from public.
Board could not vote on October minutes due to lack of quorum.**

**Vice President Hosmer moved to accept consent calendar. Seconded by President Malloy.
Passed by 3-0 roll call vote.**

4. **REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS:**

4-A. SUMMARY REPORT OF EXAMINATION ELIGIBLE LISTS AND CLASSIFICATIONS FOR JULY 6, 2022

4-A-i. ELIGIBLE LIST ESTABLISHED **DATE ESTABLISHED** **EXAM NO.**
(March 1, 2022 – May 31, 2022)

Administrative Services Coordinator	05/26/2022	2022-1430-01
Apprentice Lineworker	04/25/2022	2022-7785-01
Base Reuse Manager	05/22/2022	2022-1728-01
Combination Building Inspector I	03/17/2022	2022-3244-01
Construction Inspector	05/17/2022	2022-3070-01
Customer Services Supervisor	03/30/2022	2022-7570-01
Engineering Manager	05/04/2022	2022-7200-01
Fire Apparatus Operator - Promotional	04/18/2022	2022-4505-01
Fire Captain – Promotional	03/25/2022	2022-4520-01
Maintenance Worker II	05/03/2022	2022-2520-01
Permit Technician III – Promotional	03/07/2022	2022-3274-01
Police Records Specialist	04/18/2022	2022-4069-01
Police Sergeant – Promotional	03/10/2022	2022-4030-01
Pump Station Maintenance Technician	03/03/2022	2022-2570-01
Senior Utility Accountant	05/09/2022	2022-7425-01
Street Light Maintenance Technician	03/29/2022	2022-7789-02
Support Services Manager	03/08/2022	2022-7105-01
Telephone Operator-Receptionist	04/04/2022	2022-1500-01

4-A-ii. CONTINUOUS ELIGIBLE LISTS **DATE FIRST ESTABLISHED** **EXAM NO.**

Police Officer – Academy Graduate	02/17/2021	2021-4040-01
Police Officer – Lateral	01/07/2021	2020-4040-01
Police Officer – Recruit	02/25/2021	2021-4057-01
Public Safety Dispatcher	05/18/2021	2021-4074-01

4-A-iii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXTENDED **DATE ESTABLISHED** **EXAM NO.**

Administrative Technician II	03/16/2021	2021-1465-01
Library Technician	09/29/2021	2021-3515-01
Supervising Civil Engineer	09/01/2021	2021-3175-01
Utility Energy Analyst	09/16/2020	2020-7630-01

4-A-iv. ELIGIBLE LIST EXPIRED **DATE ESTABLISHED** **EXAM NO.**
CANCELLED/EXHAUSTED

Account Clerk	02/11/2020	2019-1610-01
Accountant II	11/03/2021	2021-1680-01
Administrative Technician III – Promotional	09/07/2021	2021-1460-02
Assistant City Attorney I	10/26/2021	2021-1015-02
Construction Inspector	09/07/2021	2021-3070-01
Deputy Public Works Director (City Engineer)	05/24/2021	2021-2601-01
Distribution Engineer	08/25/2021	2021-7260-01
Electrical Equipment Superintendent	12/23/2020	2020-7711-01
Electrical Maintenance Technician	10/28/2021	2021-7770-01
Engineering Manager	05/04/2022	2022-7200-01
Executive Assistant – Promotional	09/01/2022	2021-1560-01

Financial Services Manager	04/28/2021	2021-1695-01
Firefighter	12/14/2020	2020-4500-02
Firefighter (Paramedic)	10/22/2021	2021-4500-02
Librarian	04/26/2021	2021-3530-01
Maintenance Worker II	04/27/2021	2021-2520-01
Park Maintenance Foreperson – Promotional	03/18/2021	2021-5230-01
Permit Technician III – Promotional	03/07/2022	2022-3274-01
Police Officer – Pre-Graduate Academy Attendee	03/29/2021	2021-4040-02
Police Sergeant	04/22/2020	2020-4030-01
Public Safety Dispatcher	05/13/2021	2021-4074-01
Public Works Maintenance Foreperson – Electrical/ Pump Station	04/27/2021	2021-2555-01
Public Works Maintenance Foreperson – Sewer/Storm	04/28/2021	2021-2555-02
Recreation Assistant	03/20/2020	2020-5114-01
Senior Librarian	10/30/2020	2020-3540-01
Street Light Maintenance Technician	03/29/2022	2022-7789-02
Transportation Engineer	10/18/2021	2021-3145-01
Utility Analyst	09/14/2021	2021-7310-01

4-B. ACTIVITY REPORT – PERIOD OF MARCH 1, 2022 THROUGH MAY 31, 2022.

FULL-TIME HIRES

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
03/01/22	Information Technology	IT Systems Analyst
03/01/22	Police	Police Officer x 2
03/14/22	AMP	Electrical Engineering Aide
03/15/22	AMP	Senior Communications Specialist
03/16/22	Public Works	Public Works Maintenance Foreperson
03/21/22	Public Works	Traffic Signal/Pump Station Maintenance Technician
03/27/22	AMP	Support Services Manager
04/04/22	Finance	Finance Director
04/04/22	Recreation & Park	Gardener x 2
04/18/22	Community Development	Development Manager
04/18/22	Planning, Building & Transportation	Combination Building Inspector I
05/02/22	AMP	Energy Resources Analyst
05/02/22	Police	Police Officer x 6
05/09/22	Finance	Administrative Technician III
05/16/22	Public Works	Lead Parking Technician
05/16/22	Public Works	Parking Technician
05/23/22	Finance	Intermediate Clerk

RECERTIFICATION

04/11/22	Recreation & Park	Gardener
----------	-------------------	----------

PROMOTIONS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
03/27/22	Planning, Building & Transportation	Permit Technician III

03/28/22	Finance	Account Clerk
04/04/22	Public Works	Street Light Maintenance Technician
04/17/22	AMP	Customer Services Supervisor
05/23/22	Public Works	Maintenance Worker II

RETIREMENTS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
03/03/22	Recreation & Park	Recreation Manager
03/12/22	Police	Police Sergeant
05/05/22	Planning, Building & Transportation	Assistant Planning, Building, & Transportation Director

SEPARATIONS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
03/15/22	Recreation & Park	Gardener
03/28/22	AMP	Customer Services Supervisor
03/30/22	Finance	Administrative Technician II
04/02/22	Library	Library Technician
04/23/22	Fire	Firefighter
04/28/22	Public Works	Management Analyst
05/02/22	City Manager's Office	City Manager
05/17/22	City Manager's Office	Assistant City Manager

Member Barde inquired if items 4A & 4B were revealing anything to Human Resources regarding ratio of gender and diversity. Director Bronstein responded that staff review recruitments and classifications for improvement in the number of applicants applying.

Director Bronstein shared the City's collaboration with Seed Collaborative to work on diversity, equity, inclusion, and belonging. The City has a desire to have a diverse and inclusive workforce and Seed Collaborative has been brought into assist. This work is in the beginning stages interviewing existing employees, and next will interview focus groups representing different groups within the City. The goal is to find what works and what doesn't. Data and demographic info, including recruitment history has been provided to Seed Collaborative. The goal is to have a plan in 18 months.

Director Bronstein asked the Board if they would like the Seed's team to visit and give a presentation. Director Bronstein stated \$ 275,000 was authorized by City to do this work.

Vice President Hosmer asked for a general snapshot of the project and President Malloy asked for Director Bronstein to share the demographic information, having requested the information previously for 2019 through 2021. Director Bronstein provided a snapshot of City workforce.

Member Barde commented that it seems that the majority of the diversity in the City is coming from office staff, not sworn officers. Director Bronstein shared the new Police and Fire Chiefs have been working to improve diversity. Director Bronstein shared that it has become more difficult to hire firefighters in general and apologized for not bringing the data to the meeting, but reiterated that efforts are being made by both Police and Fire.

4-C. LIST OF SPECIFICATIONS

Existing Classification Specification Revision:

- Customer Service Representative
- Customer Services Supervisor
- Housing Specialist II
- Planner I
- Planner II
- Planner III
- Senior Communications Specialist
- Senior Utility Accountant
- Street Light Maintenance Technician

Classification review began with President Malloy questioning the changes to the Customer Service Representative (CSR) specification and stating her concern that though it sounds like an entry level classification the spec was not reading that way. Analyst Low shared that this is a very responsible position from AMP's perspective. It is a front line position with a significant amount of interaction, fielding all types of communications with customers. Director Bronstein shared that this classification is one where communication is a necessity, the goal in updating the specification was to remove duties that are not needed and to update technology based duties and skills.

President Malloy reiterated that the specification seemed like an entry level classification and asked if further changes could include possession of a GED instead of just a high school diploma and updating the phrasing around customer service principals and marketing concepts to better reflect the skills actually necessary for the position. Additionally, changes to phrases like "heavy telephone use" to be more descriptive, for example would someone with years of experience in a call center qualify?

President Malloy stated the language in other specs was friendlier towards attracting applicants and continued that because the CSR is an entry level classification, she asked that the spec be revised and resubmitted. Director Bronstein responded that the President's suggestions help HR open the net to a wider applicant pool. President Malloy commented that equity work is appreciated when attempted but it fails when candidates get to the interview and do not understand the socially constructed standards. Equity work is more than opening the net to get more applicants, it is also changing the structure of the system so more people benefit.

Member Barde stated that is a good observation. President Malloy said we should focus on changing the system rather than training and the system in this case includes the job specifications. Member Barde asked Director Bronstein how to make that change in the process. Director Bronstein said this review is part of the process, but we recognize the need to do this work and we are having equity consultants come in to look at testing and questions.

Next President Malloy moved on to the Customer Services Supervisor (CSS) specification and asked if the educational requirement of "supplemental coursework" was meant to be school, seminars, or training classes. Analyst Low responded that the intention is course work at school or internal training from existing qualified employees. Director Bronstein asked President Malloy

if HR should clarify and bring the specification back for review. President Malloy affirmed the desire to move away from the phrase “course work” and accept clarify the additional training and experience language.

President Malloy then went on to question whether 2 years in a utility setting was necessary for the CSS position and Analyst Low said upon reflection qualification could be removed. President Malloy proposed that with the changes discussed for the CSS; removal and clarification of “course work” and the removal of the requirement of 2 years in a utility setting; the classification could be approved and it would not be necessary to bring the classification back for review but then questioned whether 5 years of experience was really necessary.

The Board moved on to review the specification for Housing Specialist II, President Malloy suggested using the phrase “accredited college or bachelor’s degree” consistently throughout all spec and asked if the requirement was even necessary for this position. She further inquired if the employees currently in the role meet the requirement, and whether experience be substituted for education.

Analyst White replied that the requirement was included at the request of the hiring manager and that this position is one that is being transferred from the City of Alameda Housing Authority and we are not aware of the background of the current incumbents. The intent of including the degree requirement was to assist in performing the duties, but substituting experience seems a suitable change. President Malloy indicated her belief that someone who has lived in this situation would be successful in the role and a bachelor’s degree would limit that opportunity. Director Bronstein wondered if there was a different way to approach the requirement adding that the hiring manager may have been looking for succession planning, but that can happen after the hire.

President Malloy stated that including the degree requirement keeps the current system in place which may deny people opportunities. Vice President Hosmer shared the thought that Coast Guard Island housing is another demographic that may be affected depending on their experience. There are enlisted people who may have experience due to running enlisted housing facilities. Member Barde noted in many ways this is like the CSR position, requiring ability to empathize with the public. Member Barde further he inquired how a recruitment could ascertain personal attitudes.

Next discussed was the Planner I specification; President Malloy again referenced the accredited college vs. bachelor’s degree requirement and asked if what the criteria is for an accredited college. City Planner Tai responded there is an accreditation program in the planning industry and planners take exams and get certifications so the field does require professional training and/or a degree.

President Malloy asked if the City only considers candidates who have planning experience or would a related field for entry level work be sufficient, clarifying that her question related to the requirement of a four year degree. City Planner Tai responded that an employee in the Planner I classification needs basic knowledge of planning and zoning and that a four year degree provides this knowledge. President Malloy responded that a four year degree does not guarantee that knowledge and asked if a school lacks accreditation, would a graduate be considered. Director Bronstein responded the City started using the word accredited to weed out diploma mills.

City Planner Tai acknowledged that the word may not be necessary. Director Bronstein suggested removal of “accredited” from all class specification and asked if that would allow the discussion to proceed to next classification. President Malloy responded in the affirmative.

City Planner Tai asked Director Bronstein about the driver’s license requirement Director Bronstein responded an applicant would not be disqualified if they were able to get to job locations as needed. President Malloy asked if the City checks for a satisfactory driving record at the time of employment; Director Bronstein stated only in merited situations, such as where the employee would be driving children.

Next the Board reviewed the Senior Communications Specialist specification. President Malloy recommended a move away from general broad concepts and be more specific with bullet points on what specific knowledge and skills are necessary for the candidates. President Malloy further questioned the requirement of a “Bachelor’s degree or higher” requirement, asking if it was consistent with other similar classes and stating she was not confident that it is required to perform the job, asking if experience could substitute for education.

Director Bronstein replied that this is an AMP position so we should confirm with them and but she has seen where up to two years of experience has substituted for education. Director Bronstein went on to state that this position is responsible for outreach and marketing and a degree may actually be useful, but AMP will need to be consulted and asked Analyst Low to provide further information.

Analyst Low explained that this position is responsible for external and internal communication, including notifying and updating the public of power shut-offs, upcoming education programs, and energy efficiency initiatives. This position is also responsible for 90% of community outreach events, including planning and format. As a result requirement of the degree is needed to find someone knowledgeable in planning and marketing, with knowledge of best practices to meet the communications needs of the audience.

President Malloy responded that a degree in business or communications will not necessarily give an applicant the skills Analyst Low described. President Malloy described that it is likely this role will use prior communications as a basis for future communications and would not necessarily require information learned while obtaining a degree; she went on to question whether the necessary skills could be obtained with a two year degree or other experience. Again questioning whether a four year degree is really necessary to the position. Director Bronstein agreed that “higher” education may not be necessary but posed a revision to include other degrees and language that two years of experience may be substituted for the education requirement; stating that the applicant may not end up in the final pool but they would not be automatically screened out.

After further discussion Director Bronstein added that “related field” is often used when a degree is required and to open the requirement. Indicating that degrees had previously shown evidence of an ability to write and to follow-through but that was not necessarily how they are looked at now; though the ability to write well is important the degree itself may not be critical. President Malloy agreed with Director Bronstein that the degree is about having someone review and critique your work, but if the City is looking for someone who can write well, and has had their

work reviewed and critiqued for multiple years, that's a different qualification than just having a degree.

Director Bronstein agreed and recommended that this is something that can be looked at globally. President Malloy agreed and recommend that staff look at the job description and remove general sweeping concepts, and instead drill down into exactly what is needed for the position. Director Bronstein recommended that staff work on the specification, take it back to the department. President Malloy agreed.

Member Barde shared that there is a fine balance between attracting top talent and providing a competitive opportunity to candidates. President Malloy agreed and shared her thoughts on attracting talent and expanding the definition of what it means to attract "great" candidates. Vice President Hosmer asked the qualifications and experience of the person currently or formerly in the position, and how that experience translated to job performance?

Analyst Low shared that the employee currently filling the position came from another public agency where they were an emergency operations communications manager. They have been with the City for three months and so far they are doing well. Vice President Hosmer asked if the employee is on a temporary status and Director Bronstein noted that she is a full time employee on a one year probation and there is not currently a reason to believe they will not complete probation and become permanent. Director Bronstein stated that this has not been a difficult to recruit for position.

President Malloy then moved on to discussion of the Utility Billing Specialist and Senior Utility Accountant specification, raising similar concerns over the education requirement; stating that there are a wide range of tasks and specialties within accounting. President Malloy stated her desire that the job specification be more focused on the experience and knowledge actually required for the position rather than simply requiring three years of general accounting, unless general accounting is all that is needed for the position. Director Bronstein explained that the specification does not specify specific accounting areas of practice because AMP is small and the Senior Utility Accountant may touch all aspects of accounting, explaining that even within the City's finance department, accountants move around, and as a result the City is focused on candidates having the general accounting background. President Malloy agreed that it made sense to leave it general.

President Malloy recommended voting on the approval of the class specifications for the Housing Specialist, Communication Specialist, Utility Billing Specialist, and senior Utility Accountant, however, Vice President Hosmer requested discussion of the Streetlight Maintenance Tech specification and President Malloy asked for a summary of the changes to the specification. Director Bronstein shared the attachment with changes going over the highlights, noting the specific system the City uses will be trained for on the job. Director Bronstein shared the education requirement of a high school diploma and recommended that we also accept a GED or equivalent.

President Malloy agreed and asked if the only way to gain the necessary experience for this job is two years of experience working with street lights. Director Bronstein stated staff would need to check with the department but that it is a very specific skill set with safety implications and was not sure if experience working with other equipment would provide the necessary skill set.

Member Barde suggested that we adjust the experience to be more general stating that we could ask for “experience being responsible and sufficient to operate, maintain and repair electrical and street light equipment.” Director Bronstein recommended checking with the department before adjusting the job description. Reiterating that this is highly technical electrical work that would require the right training and could be very dangerous without it. President Malloy agreed that a background in electricity is desirable but questioned whether or not direct experience with street lights was absolutely necessary, suggesting that experience with other lighting systems may be sufficient. Director Bronstein agreed and suggested that lighting and electric experience might be synonymous, but also reiterated the importance of proper training as this can be a dangerous job adding that sound system/stage lighting might not be sufficient.

President Malloy agreed that the technical background is desirable, but reiterated that street light specific experience is very narrow and can exclude a lot of applicants. Recommending that we look at other appropriate related experience as well. Director Bronstein agreed that street light experience is preferable, but it’s the electric background that’s necessary. President Malloy agreed, saying she was surprised that there were no certification requirements. Director Bronstein asked if staff should consult the department and bring the specification back for review. President Malloy said she would like to hear from the department if street light specific experience was required. She would be okay with the department making the call to open it up or keep it narrow.

Director Bronstein agreed stating that if the department agreed, staff would amend the description to ask for general electrical equipment experience, but if they wanted to keep it as street light experience only, then someone from the department would come to the next meeting to explain.

President Malloy listed the classification that staff were directed to change and bring back for approval, these classifications include: Customer Service Representative, Housing Specialist II, Senior Communications Specialist, and Street Light Maintenance Technician.

President Malloy moved to approve items 4-E, excepting those classifications listed to revise and return. Seconded by Vice President Hosmer, passed by a 3-0 roll call vote.

5. **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA (PUBLIC COMMENT)**

No comment from public.

6. **CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS AND REQUESTS FROM THE BOARD)**

President Malloy requested a vacancy report from the City, stating that many agencies have vacancies, and she was curious about vacancy rates in Alameda.

President Malloy also asked that at the October meeting, each Human Resources staff member bring back a provision of all Civil Service Rules that may be problematic or cumbersome, so that they could be reviewed. Emphasizing that she would like to hear from each member of staff.

Director Bronstein were working on with a consultant on this very thing and that we may not be fully ready at the next meeting to present our findings.

Member Barde asked if we could have the consultant come to the next meeting.

Director Bronstein said she would invite them and/or try to set up a time.

President Malloy stated that she did not want a presentation, but just that they be available for questions.

7. **CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF)**

Director Bronstein asked if the board would like to hear the presentation on eligibility lists, to which the Board replied they would review the slides and ask any questions at the next meeting.

Director Bronstein shared stats requested by the board last meeting. Stating that we bring in 33% percent of new hires at step1, 11% percent at step 2, about 20% each at steps 3 and 4, and 12% at step 5. Stating that those that come in at higher steps usually come with years of directly relatable experience, and it wouldn't make sense to start them lower.

8. **CONFIRMATION OF NEXT CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING**

The next meeting was confirmed for October 5, 2022.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting adjourned at 6:37 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Director
and
Executive Secretary to the Civil Service Board