

CITY OF ALAMEDA
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
DRAFT RESOLUTION

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA GRANTING CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL, PLN13-0059, TO RESTORE AND MODIFY THE DEL MONTE WAREHOUSE HISTORIC MONUMENT

WHEREAS, applicant TL Partners I, LP made an application on behalf of Tim Lewis Communities on March 3, 2014, proposing to restore the entire brick exterior walls, build a vertical addition above, and setback from, the existing walls and convert the former Del Monte Warehouse into approximately 308 townhouses and condominiums and approximately 9,162 square feet of retail space; and

WHEREAS, the application was deemed complete on April 15, 2014; and

WHEREAS, the General Plan designation of the site is Mixed Use; and

WHEREAS, the parcel is located within the Mixed Use/Planned Development Zoning District; and

WHEREAS, the subject property is listed on City's Historical Preservation Inventory as a City Monument, which distinguishes this property for its architectural significance; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board shall determine whether to issue a certificate of approval, with or without conditions of approval, based on whether plans and specifications meet the standards established by the Historical Advisory Board and the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation and guidelines for rehabilitating historic buildings pursuant to Section 13-21.5(b) of the Alameda Municipal Code, and

WHEREAS, an Initial Study/Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration was prepared for the project pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA); and

WHEREAS, the Initial Study/Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration determined that proposed project would result in new or substantially more severe significant impacts, new information, or changes in circumstances that were not identified for the Del Monte Site in the GPA EIR; however the new impacts are reduced to less than significant levels with new or revised mitigations; and

WHEREAS, on June 5, 2014, the Board reviewed the application, including exhibits and documents, and has made the following findings with respect to the project's consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

1. **A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.** The conversion from industrial to residential use would not

significantly change the distinctive materials and features of the brick warehouse building. A conversion to residential use is not inherently harmful to industrial buildings. Industrial buildings are adaptable structures often characterized by incremental alterations to accommodate evolving industrial technology or new uses. Many brick industrial buildings in the Bay Area have historic additions made of corrugated steel or other lightweight materials because brick is a comparatively expensive and permanent building material. There are many local examples of brick industrial buildings that have been successfully converted to residential and/or commercial use, particularly in Richmond, Oakland, and in San Francisco's South End, Potrero Hill, and the Mission District neighborhoods. Many have either one or two-story additions that are sometimes visible from public property rights-of-way.

2. **The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.** The proposed project preserves the original architectural features of the building that make it historically significant because the brick exterior walls and a majority of the structure will be renovated and preserved in a manner that is compatible with the original design. The proposed project would make a limited number of changes to the brick exterior of the Del Monte Warehouse, including replacing non-historic metal doors with storefronts and glazing systems and creating approximately 50 new openings for the residential and commercial units. New steel and wood railings would be added to the loading docks to create private patios along the north and south façades. Otherwise, the exterior of the building would be retained and preserved to maintain its historic industrial character. The modifications to the first floor level, including the creation of new window and storefront openings, as well as the wood and metal railings on the loading docks, are relatively small-scale and easily reversible changes that would not disrupt the historic industrial character of the building.

The only character-defining features that would be impacted by the project include approximately 43 percent of the interior framing and less than 15 percent of the exterior brick work. Very little of the concrete loading docks would be removed.

3. **Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.** The project will utilize materials that are compatible and appropriate with the building's period of construction. The proposed project would not add any conjectural features or elements from other historical properties that would create a false sense of historical development.
4. **Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.** No changes have occurred to the property over time that have acquired their own historic significance. None of the post-1927 alterations to the Del Monte Warehouse, including the metal overhead doors, the Storage and Labeling Shed, the solar collectors, or the low

concrete wall south of the building, have acquired significance in their own right. Their removal would not impair the integrity or the significance of the property.

5. **Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.** The project will preserve all distinctive features and finishes of the original construction. The proposed project would retain and preserve the exterior brick walls of the historic Del Monte Warehouse. The interior brick fire walls that separate the four bays would also be retained and preserved. The project would retain and repair the existing steel industrial windows and most of the structural and roof framing in bays 1 and 4. Approximately 43 percent of the rest of the framing and roof structure, mostly concentrated in bays 2 and 3, would be removed to construct the addition. Though the removal of interior framing is not optimal from the perspective of the Rehabilitation Standards, it is necessary in order to make the project feasible and to complete the necessary seismic work. The removal of this fabric is in part mitigated by the retention and restoration of the majority of the brick exterior and because the affected areas of the internal framing are not visible from outside the building.
6. **Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.** New materials and windows will complement the appearance of the original building. The most important features of the building (the exterior brick walls) appear to be in good condition. Most of the timber framing in the interior appears to be in fair condition; there are, however, some sections that have been sandblasted and other sections requiring cleaning and seismic retrofitting, including a few columns that have twisted in place. The steel industrial windows on the exterior of the building, as well as the monitor roof, appear to require moderate-to-extensive repairs. The steel sashes themselves would be retained and repaired. Where the deterioration is too severe to be repaired, the steel sashes would be replaced using a metal counterpart that matches the original design, material, color, and molding profile. If any brickwork is damaged beyond repair, the replacement brick would match the original color and texture.
7. **Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.** No chemical treatments or other methods that can cause damage to historic materials will be used. The exterior of the Del Monte Warehouse would need to be cleaned as part of the proposed project. No overly harsh or abrasive methods, such as sandblasting, would be used because such treatments can damage the exterior glazing of the brick, causing the softer interior to crumble. Instead, the brick would be pressure-washed using the lowest effective water pressure. If detergents are needed to clean accumulated soot and biological growth, gentle cleaning products, such as trisodium phosphates (TSP), would be used. Graffiti would be removed using the gentlest effective means possible, such as walnut shell

blasting. Peeling paint would be removed with hand sanding, chemical strippers, or heat guns.

8. **Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.** The presence of potential archaeological resources on the project site is unlikely. However, if archeological resources are discovered, standard mitigation measures typically required by the City of Alameda would assure compliance with Rehabilitation Standard 8.
9. **New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.** The new work will not destroy significant historic fabric of the building, and new materials will be compatible with the original construction. Any deteriorated historic material will be repaired/restored to its original condition. The following four areas of guidance in regard to rooftop additions are taken from the Preservation Brief 14: “New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings.”

Setbacks: Preservation Brief 14 stipulates that vertical additions should be set back at least one structural bay from the exterior walls of a building. In the case of the proposed project, the addition would be set back 60’ (approximately three bays) from the north and south façades and 250’ (approximately 12.5 bays) from the east and west façades. The addition would occupy less than 33 percent of the overall floorplate.

Compatibility: Preservation Brief 14 requires that a vertical addition be distinguished from the historic building. The proposed modern addition would be differentiated from the original structure by a pair of symmetrical blocks punctuated by a repetitive grid of rectangular window openings – much like the historic warehouse. It would also have a flat roof with low parapets. The addition would be clad in contemporary materials, including metal and stucco in contrast to the brick exterior of the historic structure.

Massing: Preservation Brief 14 calls for a vertical addition to be simple and unobtrusive and smaller than the historic building. In addition to having a much smaller footprint than the historic building, the proposed addition is designed to look even smaller by being broken up into an alternating arrangement of projecting volumes and landscaped interior courtyards. By doing this, the addition recedes in areas, giving it the appearance of several smaller pavilions instead of a single large volume.

Height: Preservation Brief 14 says that a rooftop addition should not be more than one story in height. Though the addition rises only one story above the existing

monitor roof, it rises approximately one-and-a-half stories above the remainder of the building. However, because the addition is set back 60 feet from the south and north façades and 250' from the east and west façades, it is minimally visible from most vantage points.

10. **New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.** The proposed work would not impair the integrity of the historic property because none of the character-defining features of the resource will be significantly altered by the project. The addition and related new construction could be removed with some difficulty, including re-engineering portions of the historic building's structure that would bear on the new podium. If removed, the historic Del Monte Warehouse, including its two-story, gable-roofed massing, its brick exterior walls, and its ornamental detailing, would appear largely as it does today.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board approves the subject Certificate of Approval request for 1501 Buena Vista Avenue subject to the following conditions:

- (1) This Certificate of Approval shall expire three (3) years after the date of approval or by June 5, 2017, unless actual construction has begun under valid City permits or the applicant applies for and is granted an extension by the City Planner prior to the date of expiration.
- (2) The plans submitted for the Building Permit shall be in substantial compliance with plans prepared by BAR Architects, dated ____, 2014, which are on file in the office of the City of Alameda Planning Division, subject to the conditions specified in this resolution.
- (3) Prior to issuance of permits for demolition of any interior features of the building, the applicant shall have the interior features documented through large format (4X5 inch negatives or greater) black and white photographs. The completed package of photographs shall be archived at the City of Alameda Public Library.
- (4) All exterior lighting fixtures shall be low intensity, directed downward and shielded to minimize offsite glare.
- (5) The applicant shall implement all the conditions contained in the Memorandum from VerPlanck Preservation Consulting dated February 24, 2014; and
- (6) This Certificate of Approval shall not become effective until such time as the Planning Board and City Council approve the Initial Study/Subsequent Mitigated Negative Declaration and the Del Monte Master Plan; and
- (7) HOLD HARMLESS. The applicant shall defend (with counsel reasonably acceptable to the City), indemnify, and hold harmless the City of Alameda, the Alameda City Historical Advisory Board and their respective agents, officers, and employees from any claim, action, or proceeding (including legal costs and attorney's fees) against the City of Alameda, Alameda City Historical Advisory Board and their respective agents, officers or employees to attack, set aside, void,

or annul an approval by the City of Alameda, the Historical Advisory Board, Alameda City Planning Board, or City Council relating to this project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and the City shall cooperate in such defense. The City may elect, in its sole discretion, to participate in the defense of said claim, action, or proceeding.

NOTICE. The decision of the Historical Advisory Board shall be final unless appealed to the City Council, in writing and within ten (10) days of the decision, by Notice of Appeal stating the appellant claims that either the Board's decision is not supported by its findings or its findings are not supported by the evidence in the record.

NOTICE. No judicial proceedings subject to review pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.5 may be prosecuted more than ninety (90) days following the date of this decision plus extensions authorized by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6

NOTICE. The conditions of project approval set forth herein include certain fees and other exactions. Pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (d) (1), these Conditions constitute written notice of a statement of the amount of such fees, and a description of the dedications, reservations and exactions. The applicant is hereby further notified that the 90-day appeal period, in which the applicant may protest these fees and other exactions, pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (a) has begun. If the applicant fails to file a protest within this 90-day period complying with all requirements of Section 66020, the applicant will be legally barred from later challenging such fees or exactions.

* * * * *

G:\PLANNING\HAB\3-Reports & Resolutions\2014\06-05-2014\1510 Buena Vista - PLN14-0059 Exhibit 1 Draft Reso.doc