

**CITY OF ALAMEDA  
HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD  
DRAFT RESOLUTION**

A RESOLUTION OF THE HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA APPROVING CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL, PLN16-0115, FOR THE EXTERIOR MODIFICATIONS TO 651 W. TOWER AVENUE (BUILDING 91), WHICH IS A CONTRIBUTING STRUCTURE WITHIN THE NAVAL AIR STATION ALAMEDA HISTORIC DISTRICT.

WHEREAS, srmERNST Partners, LLC made applications on March 1, 2016 to modify the exterior of a contributing structure within the Naval Air Station Alameda Historic District (NAS Alameda Historic District); and

WHEREAS, application was complete on April 27, 2016; and

WHEREAS, the General Plan designation for 651 West Tower Avenue is Alameda Point Civic Core; and

WHEREAS, the Zoning Ordinance classification 651 West Tower Avenue is Alameda Point, Adaptive Reuse; and

WHEREAS, the proposed project consists of 651 West Tower Avenue (Building 91), which is a contributing structure within the NAS Alameda Historic District; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board held a public hearing on May 5, 2016 for this application, and examined pertinent maps, drawings and documents; and

WHEREAS, the Historical Advisory Board shall determine whether to issue a certificate of approval, with or without conditions of approval, based on whether plans and specifications meet the standards established by the Historical Advisory Board and the Secretary of Interior's standards for rehabilitation and guidelines for rehabilitating historic buildings pursuant to Section 13-21.5(b) of the Alameda Code;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED, that the Historical Advisory Board approves the Certificate of Approval request for 651 West Tower Avenue based on the following findings with respect to the project's consistency with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.**

Buildings 91 & 9 were historically used as machine shops and warehousing for airplane engines by the Navy. The proposed use of the building is for food and beverage manufacturing, which continues the heavy industrial use of the buildings.

**2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships.**

The project does not propose removing distinctive materials from the structures. The project does propose removing portions of the existing industrial sash windows on Building 9, but the dimension and size of section of windows being removed follow the pattern and rhythm of grid of industrial sash windows.

**3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.**

The added features include a new row of windows on Building 9, new shade structures on both buildings, and a new exterior silos on the east side of Building 91. The new windows are a smaller size that does not compete with the existing windows, because they follow the same horizontal rhythm of large hanger-like doors and windows below. The new proposed shade structures feature a modern architectural design that is complementary to the existing structure. The new exterior silos will be functional and serve future tenants, and also feature a modern architectural design that is complementary to the existing structure.

**4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.**

The project will remove a shade structures on the north sides of both Building 9 and Building 91. Both of these elements were not original to the building, and the *Guide to Preserving the Character of the Naval Air Station (Preservation Guide)* and *Cultural Landscape Report for Naval Air Station Alameda (CLR)* did not find that they had acquired their own historic significance in their own right. All other character-defining features of the buildings will be retained and rehabilitated.

**5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.**

The *Preservation Guide* and *CLR* found that Building 9's distinctive features were its hanger-like form and doors, and stucco finish. The project will not alter the hanger-like form and will continue to utilize the stucco finish of Building 9. The project will replace three (3) of the six (6) sliding hanger doors with roll up doors fitted into the existing industrial sash window framework. These changes are needed for the modern day use of the building, and do not result in a substantial loss of character defining features.

The *Preservation Guide* and *CLR* also found that Building 91's distinctive feature was its wooden industrial sash windows. The project will preserve these windows.

- 6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.**

The project will remove the current opaque film coverings over the windows in Building 9 that provide shade and weather protection, and will install new translucent film coverings for these windows to preserve the existing industrial sash windows.

- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.**

The project will be conditioned to utilize the gentlest chemical or physical treatments as a first response to maintenance issues.

- 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resource must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.**

The NAS Historic District was built over landfill created in the early 1900's, and previous historic studies found no evidence of significant archeological resources.

- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.**

The new features include new window and door openings, new awnings on the south elevations, and new shade structures on the north side of both Buildings 9 and 91. The shade structures and awnings are differentiated from the old but still compatible with the rest of the existing building. The project does not require the removal of distinctive features. The new window and door openings on both Building 9 and Building 91 follow the spacing and rhythm of the existing window and door openings.

- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.**

The proposed shade structures and awnings on both Building 9 and Building 91 are designed so that they can be removed from the project without an adverse impact to the existing historic building forms.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the Alameda Point Project was adequately considered under the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA"), and by Resolution No. 14891 the City Council of the City of Alameda certified the Final Alameda Point Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) (State Clearinghouse No. 201312043) California

Public Resources Code Section 21000 et seq. and adopted written findings and a Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program ("MMRP") on February 4, 2014, for the Alameda Point Project, the architectural design is consistent with the General Plan, Zoning Ordinance, and Design Review Manual and there are no environmental impacts peculiar to 651 and 707 West Tower Avenue that were not analyzed in the FEIR; and there are no potentially significant off-site impacts of the proposed improvements at 651 and 707 West Tower Avenue project, and there are no cumulative impacts to which the proposed improvements at 651 and 707 West Tower Avenue makes a considerable contribution which were not discussed in the FEIR; and there are no previously identified significant impacts of the proposed 651 and 707 West Tower Avenue project which, as a result of substantial new information which was not known at the time the EIR was certified, have been determined to have a more severe adverse impact than discussed in the FEIR.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Historical Advisory Board of the City of Alameda hereby grants Certificates of Approval, PLN6-0115 and PLN16-0116 with the following conditions of approval, which shall be placed on the first page of the building permit plan set under a heading titled "City Of Alameda Historical Advisory Board Conditions of Approval":

1. This Certificate of Approval shall terminate three (3) years from May 5, 2016, unless actual demolition under a valid permit has begun. This approval may be extended administratively by the Secretary to the Historical Advisory Board upon submittal of an application and required fees.
2. Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.
3. The plans submitted for the Building Permit shall be in substantial compliance with plans prepared by FME Architecture and Design on file in the office of the City of Alameda Planning Division, subject to the conditions specified in this resolution.
4. This Certificate of Approval shall not become effective until such as the Zoning Administrator approves the Design Review and Conditional Use Permit Application for the subject applications, and upon such time, the construction of the plans shall be subject to all conditions of approved imposed by the Zoning Administrator.
5. The exterior paint colors shall be in compliance with plans prepared by FME Architecture and Design on file in the office of the City of Alameda Community Development Department. Any changes to exterior paint colors shall be reviewed and approved by the Community Development Director to ensure compliance with the adopted Paint Guidelines for Existing Buildings in the NAS Alameda Historic District.
6. Indemnification: The applicant, or its successors in interest, shall defend (with counsel reasonably acceptable to the City), indemnify, and hold harmless the City of Alameda and their respective agents, officers, and employees from any

claim, action, or proceeding against the City of Alameda and their respective agents, officers or employees to attack, set aside, void or annul, any approval or related decision to this project. This indemnification shall include, but is not limited to, all damages, costs, expenses, attorney fees or expert witness fees arising out of or in connection with the project. The City shall promptly notify the applicant of any claim, action or proceeding and the City shall cooperate in such defense. The City may elect, in its sole discretion, to participate in the defense of said claim, action, or proceeding.

NOTICE. No judicial proceedings subject to review pursuant to California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.5 may be prosecuted more than ninety (90) days following the date of this decision plus extensions authorized by California Code of Civil Procedure Section 1094.6

NOTICE. The decision of the Secretary of the Historical Advisory Board shall be final unless appealed to the Historical Advisory Board within ten (10) days of this decision, by filing a Notice of Appeal with the City of Alameda Community Development Department stating the appellant claims that the decision is not supported by the findings or the findings are not supported by the evidence in the record, and paying the required fee.

NOTICE. The conditions of project approval set forth herein include certain fees and other exactions. Pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (d) (1), these Conditions constitute written notice of a statement of the amount of such fees, and a description of the dedications, reservations and exactions. The applicant is hereby further notified that the 90-day appeal period, in which the applicant may protest these fees and other exactions, pursuant to Government Code Section 66020 (a) has begun. If the applicant fails to file a protest within this 90-day period complying with all requirements of Section 66020, the applicant will be legally barred from later challenging such fees or exactions.

\*\*\*\*\*