

2447 Santa Clara Ave., #302, Alameda CA 94501 Phone: (510) 523-1392 - Fax: (510) 523-2372 www.DowntownAlameda.com



2017 Board of Directors

Officers

Donna Layburn President

Steve Busse Vice President

Ron Mooney Treasurer

**Deb Knowles** Secretary

Members at Large

**Julie Baron** 

**Kyle Conner** 

Cindy Kahl

Jennifer Serr

**Committee Chairs** 

Rich Krinks
City & Economic
Relations

**TBD** Promotions

**TBD** Membership

Kate Pryor Maintenance & Improvements

Staff

Janet Magleby
Executive Director

**Danielle Brown**Office Administration

April 26, 2017

Allen Tai
Planning Services Manager
Alameda Historical Advisory Board
City of Alameda
2263 Santa Clara Ave, Room 190
Alameda, CA 94501

RE: Cholita Linda Restaurant, 1337-1339 Park Street

Dear Allen,

Allow me to introduce myself, my name is Janet Magleby and I'm the new Executive Director of the Downtown Alameda Business Association and I'm writing on behalf of Cholita Linda Restaurant.

We are thrilled that an exciting new business like Cholita Linda, also operating from another historical building in the Temescal area, is coming to Alameda and look forward to the economic growth for the downtown district and the city of Alameda as well as the excitement it will bring to the street! The Downtown Alameda Business Association is in support of Cholita Linda's proposed architectural design change request for the exterior of the building facing Park Street.

All the very best,

Janet Magleby

Executive Director

Downtown Alameda Association janet@downtownalameda.com



May 3, 2017

## By Electronic Transmission

City of Alameda Historical Advisory Board 2263 Santa Clara Avenue Alameda, CA. 94501

Re: Proposed modifications to 1337-9 Park Street

Dear Boardmembers:

The Alameda Architectural Preservation Society (AAPS) has the following comments on this project:

- 1. Park Street National Register District. The Park Street Historic District is included in the National Register of Historic Places and, along with the Alameda Point District, is one of only two National Register districts in Alameda. The 1981 National Register District Nomination Form is attached for the HAB's information, along with a pre-1981 photo of the subject building probably dating from the city's 1978–79 historical and architectural survey.
- 2. Retain and rehabilitate 1339 Park Street storefront, if possible. Contrary to a statement in the staff report, the storefront at 1339 Park Street appears original, or at least early, characterized by such distinctive early 20th century features as Verde marble bulkheads, with windows held in place by extruded bronze-plated steel molded stops around the perimeter with butted glass angled corners. There is also an existing early, if not original, wood entry door with single glass panel below a transom with a leaded glass window. See attached photos. All of these elements should be considered character-defining features for historic preservation purposes and subject to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Although portions of the marble bulkheads near the entry door have been replaced with a very similar looking flagstone material, this is likely an old attempt to repair broken marble and should not be assumed to indicate that the marble or other elements of the storefront are recent. Note that the storefront below the transom area looks the same in the pre-1981 photo as it does today.

The 1339 Park Street storefront should therefore be preserved, if possible, which would normally be required under the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. Staff tells us that replacement of the 1339 storefront is primarily triggered by a code-required second exit, to be provided by the 1337 entry, that requires a minimum separation from the 1339 entry door, since the space has no sprinklers. (See also the draft HAB resolution.) To provide this minimum separation, the 1339 storefront must be reconfigured as shown on the plans.

P.O. Box 1677 • Alameda, CA 94501 • 510-479-6489 • www.alameda-preservation.org

However the building is eligible for the California Historical Building Code (CHBC), which allows alternatives to "regular" code to preserve historic features, such as the 1339 Park Street storefront. A written determination should therefore be obtained from City of Alameda Building Official Greg McFann confirming that the reduced separation resulting from retaining the existing 1339 storefront is not available using the CHBC.

- 3. **Retain and rehabilitate Alameda Avenue storefront, if possible.** The Alameda Avenue storefront retains several early, if not original, elements, such as a polychrome tile floor and paneled ceiling in the recessed entry (see Comments 6 and 7 below); entry door transom and possibly the door itself (which is concealed behind the security door); checkerboard tile bulkhead; and at least fragments of the historic storefront window system. The configuration of the new storefront is very similar, if not the same, as the existing storefront. Rehabilitation rather than replacement of the existing storefront should therefore be considered.
- 4. **Revise resolution findings.** Since the 1339 Park Street and Alameda Avenue storefronts appear to be early, if not original, and are therefore character-defining features, the HAB resolution findings for Secretary of the Interior Standards 2, 4 and 6 need to be modified to reflect this. Among other things: Finding 2 incorrectly states that "the project does not propose removing character defining features from the existing building"; Finding 4 incorrectly states that "two of the existing storefronts have been modified overtime"... (which two is not specified) and "... do not contain any character defining features that must be maintained"; and Finding 6 inappropriately states that none of the storefronts "retain the original windows and bulkheads of the building". The staff report and resolution seem to erroneously assume that architectural features must be "original" to be character-defining, without regard to "changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right" as set forth in Standard 4.
- 5. Modify proposed storefront windows to be more consistent with the historic windows. Assuming that the historic storefronts at 1339 Park Street and on Alameda Avenue cannot be preserved and rehabilitated, it is good that the renovation proposes new Verde marble bulkheads at both the 1339 storefront and the previously altered 1337 storefront, as well as providing a polychrome tile bulkhead on the Alameda Avenue storefront that is intended to match the existing historic tile bulkheads along Alameda Avenue. The proposed storefront window system comes closer in appearance to the existing historic system at 1339 then most modern storefront systems, with glazing recessed about 1/2 inch from the face of the stiles and rails (the historic system is recessed about 1/8"), but the following modifications should be considered to bring the proposed system into closer conformity with the historic system:
  - a. Provide butted glass at the angled corners rather than the relatively wide 3 1/8" stiles proposed for each glass sheet; and
  - b. Move the surface plane of the windows forward in order to rest on top of the marble and tile bulkheads, (like the existing windows) and omit the 2 1/8" thick sill along the base of the windows (the historic windows had no sill) or at least reduce the sill thickness.
- 6. **Retain/provide paneled ceilings at recessed entries.** The Alameda Avenue storefront recessed entry has a paneled wood ceiling. See attached photo. This type of ceiling may also exist at the 1339 Park Street storefront behind the existing recently installed ceiling. The renovated storefronts should include similar ceilings, which provide significant pedestrian interest.

- 7. Retain/provide polychrome tile floors at recessed entries. The Alameda Avenue recessed entry has a polychrome tile floor. See attached photo. The entry floor at 1339 Park Street is covered with a carpet-like material, so we could not easily determine whether it has a similar floor, although such a floor is highly characteristic of early 20th century storefronts and is likely to have existed. They renovated storefronts should include similar floors, which, like the vestibule ceilings, provide significant pedestrian interest.
- 8. Revised proposed entry doors to relate better to historic doors. The proposed aluminum entry doors have narrower stiles and rails than the existing historic door at 1339 Park Street. The stile and rail widths of the new doors should be increased so that their widths are similar to those of the historic door. The historic door should be retained, if possible, using the CHBC if necessary.
- 9. The historic leaded glass transom window over the 1339 Park Street entry door should be retained.
- 10. Transom windows. It is good that new transom windows are being proposed over the Park Street storefronts. The staff report states that new transom windows will also be provided over the Alameda Avenue storefront, but this is not shown on the plans. The provision of transom windows, if any, over the Alameda Avenue storefront therefore needs to be clarified. Such provision would be highly desirable. Staff advises that the original transom windows are covered over. The condition of the original transom windows should be assessed and the windows preserved rather than replaced, if possible. Staff tells us that the applicant is willing to consider this. If replaced, the new windows should visually match the historic windows.

Thank you for the opportunity to comment. Please contact me at 510-523-0411 or <u>cbuckleyaicp@att.net</u> if you would like to discuss these comments.

Sincerely,

Christopher Buckley, Chair Preservation Action Committee Alameda Architectural Preservation Society

- Attachments: (1) 1981 National Register Nomination Form
  - (2) Pre-1981 Photo
  - (3) Current photos of various storefront elements

cc: Debbie Potter, Andrew Thomas, Allen Tai, Henry Dong, Nancy McPeak and Erin Garcia (By electronic transmission)

Greg McFann, City of Alameda Building Official (By electronic transmission)

William H. Craig, Architect (By electronic transmission)

Downtown Alameda Business Association (By electronic transmission)

AAPS Board and Preservation Action Committee (By electronic transmission)

MONKEY BAR

MOI

etoliavi us on le. @ Excomiscike pars.com & follow us... @shopmonke pars

KIDS • FOR Y











