

To: Honorable President and
Members of the Planning Board

From: Henry Dong, Planner III

Date: May 28, 2019

Re: Public Hearing to consider the final architectural elevations, landscape plan, lighting plan, and parking plan for Design Review No. PLN18-0381 for an approximately 113,000-square-foot five-story hotel with 172 guest rooms and an approximately 7,000-square-foot restaurant with coffee shop, located approximately 400-feet northwest of the corner of Harbor Bay Parkway and Bay Edge Road. The property is located within the C-M-PD, Commercial Manufacturing – Planned Development zoning district. The Harbor Bay Isle Environmental Impact Report was prepared for the development of the Harbor Bay Business Park Planned Development.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Staff requests that the Planning Board hold a public hearing to consider the final architectural elevations, landscape plan, lighting plan, and parking plan for Design Review No. PLN18-0381 for a five-story hotel and a two-story restaurant with a café at 2900 Harbor Bay Parkway (Exhibit 1: Plans). Staff is recommending conditional approval of the final designs. The recommended conditions are designed to implement additional changes to the project consistent with neighborhood requests. The draft resolution and conditions are included in Exhibit 2.

BACKGROUND

The proposed hotel and restaurant is located on the vacant 5.5 acre portion of the Esplanade development site within the Harbor Bay Business Park. The site is approximately 400 feet west of the corner of Harbor Bay Parkway and Bay Edge Road and immediately east of the Harbor Bay Ferry Terminal. A lagoon and residential neighborhood border the site to the north, and the property fronts onto Shoreline Park and the San Francisco Bay to the south. The property is zoned Commercial Manufacturing (CM) with a Planned Development (PD) overlay, and designated as Business Park by the General Plan. The hotel includes approximately 172 rooms, dining room with a lounge, meeting room, swimming pool, outdoor patio areas, and approximately 100 parking spaces for daily use by the Harbor Bay Ferry commuters.

On February 25, 2008, the Planning Board approved the original Esplanade Development Plan (PLN07-0061) to allow the construction of ten office buildings totaling 109,000 square feet on the 9.22 acre Esplanade site. In 2012, the first of the ten buildings was completed for the Stacy & Witbeck Company. On May 26, 2015, the Planning Board approved Development Plan Amendment and Design Review No. PLN15-0092 to allow the construction of a 22,868-square-foot office building in lieu of two 10,400-square-foot office buildings originally approved in 2008.

On August 28, 2018, Harbor Bay Hospitality, LLC (the “applicant”) submitted an application for a Development Plan Amendment and Design Review to allow the construction of the proposed hotel and restaurant/cafe on the remaining 5.5 acres of the Esplanade site immediately adjacent to the Ferry Terminal parking lot in lieu of the remaining seven (7) approved office buildings.

On October 8, 2018, the Planning Board held a study session to review the proposed hotel development. The Board provided staff and the applicant with direction on the architecture, development plan and parking for the project.

On December 10, 2018, the Planning Board held a public hearing to review Development Plan and Design Review Application No. PLN18-0381 for the new hotel and restaurant. The Board determined the project is in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), and approved the hotel and restaurant (Planning Board Resolution No. PB-18-23) with conditions of approval that the applicant return to the Board with final architectural elevations, landscape plan, lighting plan, parking plan, and public art.

On December 18, 2018, Brian Tremper filed an appeal of the Planning Board decision. On December 19, 2019, Laborers International Union of North America, Local Union 304 filed a separate appeal of the Planning Board decision.

On February 5, 2019, the City Council held a public hearing on the two appeals and upheld the December 10, 2018 Planning Board decision. The Council asked the Planning Board to consider increasing the building setback from Shoreline Park by an additional 10 to 15-feet.

On February 8, 2019, the Bay Conservation and Development Commission Board of Commissioners determined that the project was consistent with existing BCDC approvals for the site and that the Planning Board's approved setback for the building provided maximum feasible public access for the project.

On February 16, 2019 and May 11, 2019, staff and the applicant held a community meetings with the Harbor Bay residents to discuss the building setback, elevations and landscape plan. The Harbor Bay residents discussed the proposed changes and provided feedback to staff and the applicant. The feedback provided by the neighboring home owners was taken into consideration as the applicant revised the final design.

Since the May 11, 2019 community meeting, the applicant has been working to revise the final architectural elevations, landscape plan, lighting plan and parking plan. The final plans are included as Exhibit 1.

DISCUSSION

Setback from Bay Trail: The City Council requested that staff and the Planning Board reconsider the setback of the building from the Bay Trail and consider the potential benefits and impacts of increasing the setback by 10 or 15 feet.

The Planning Board approved the hotel with a 35 foot setback from the park, which provides a setback of approximately 75 feet to the water's edge. The approved setback is consistent with the Esplanade Development Plan, which established a consistent 35 foot building line setback from the south property line along Shoreline Park for all buildings between Harbor Bay Parkway and the Ferry Terminal parking lot.

Staff is recommending that the Planning Board maintain the existing setback as approved on December 10, 2018 and as shown on the attached plans in Exhibit 1 for the following reasons:

- Moving the building further back would increase the apparent height of the building for the residents living on McDonnell Road facing the hotel. These neighbors have consistently voiced their desire to reduce the height of the building. As described below, the landscape plan has been enhanced to better screen the hotel from view from these homes. Moving the hotel closer to the neighbors would undermine the effectiveness of the landscape screening and increase the apparent height of the building from the neighborhood.

- Moving the building further back would not significantly improve the quality of the Bay Trail experience. With the existing setback, the building is already 75 feet back from the water's edge. The Bay Conservation and Development Commission (BCDC) staff and Board of Commissioners reviewed the hotel proposal in February 2019 and determined that the setback was appropriate, was consistent with BCDC waterfront guidelines and standards, and provided maximum feasible public access. The existing site plan exceeds the BCDC standard of 1:1 (building height to building setback from water).

For these reasons, staff is recommending that the Planning Board maintain the previously approved location of the building.

Staff is also not recommending a change in the building footprint to create an "L" shaped floor plan, as suggested by one speaker at the neighborhood meeting and as shown below. An "L" shape floor plan will bring a major portion of the building much closer to the neighbors and significantly increase the apparent height of the building for those neighbors. Staff will present the "L" shaped configuration to the Planning Board at the meeting.

Landscape, Lighting, & Parking Plan: The applicant has made a number of changes to the landscaping, lighting and parking plan to better screen the building from view from the adjacent neighborhood and minimize lighting and aesthetics effects on the nearby residential properties. Those changes include:

- Removing eight parking stalls to provide space for large tree plantings in the parking lot between the building and the neighbors.
- Adding additional trees and landscaping along the lagoon pathway to help screen the hotel from the nearby residents.
- Providing a three-foot tall berm along the south side of the parking lot to screen vehicle headlights from the Shoreline Park.
- The applicant has also provided dark skies perspectives of the hotel lighting at night to show direct lighting from the project will stay on site.

To clarify and ensure maximum protection for the neighborhood, staff is proposing conditions of approval that:

Lighting:

- Minimize the use of fixtures on poles and maximize the use of low level bollard lighting to the extent possible within the requirements of the UBC.
- Include automatic dimmers to reduce the need for lighting though out the night when few people are using the parking lot, and the lighting plan shall include warm light fixtures.
- Require that all project lighting is downward facing and dark skies compliant.

Landscaping:

- Require evergreen hedges along the northern edge of the parking lot to screen the residents from vehicle headlights.
- Require a landscaped berm on the southern edge of the landscape plan to screen bay trail users from car headlights.
- Require evergreen trees along the lagoon and in the parking lot to provide a visual screen for the neighbors all year long.

- Provide proof of a landscape maintenance agreement that includes regular maintenance of the property and landscaping on the north side of the road and along the lagoon.
- Place the trash enclosures within the middle of the parking lot, instead of along the northern property line near the neighbors.
- Place trash receptacles along all pathways.

Architecture: The applicant made a number of improvements to the architectural design of the building. The major changes include:

- Removal of the large floating frames from the building exterior
- Replacement of fin windows to box windows which allow for a 4-inch recess and shadow line at each window.
- Increasing the window sizes to 8 feet by 8 feet.
- Adding a new brick façade with a metal canopies along the ground floor elevation.
- Improved articulation on the south elevation by recessing the tower wall and adding metal awning sunshades above all of the windows.
- Recessing the upper floors back from the ground floor on the neighborhood facing elevation and addition of a railing detail along the front of the building.

In response to comments provided by the community on May 11th, the applicant:

- Revised the floor plans to create an additional projections and better articulation on the northeast building facades facing the neighborhood,
- Added metal awning on the projecting bays of the northeast elevation facing the neighborhood to provide additional articulation and visual interest.
- Refined the materials and colors to create a more coherent color scheme that uses changes in color consistently with changes in building plane.

To further improve the design, staff is recommending conditions of approval that:

- Provide an additional row of clear story windows above the canopies on the first floor.
- Relocate the main building signage from the roof line and reposition it at the second or third floor, or relocated to the side elevation.
- Add a second column of windows on both side elevations.
- Provide Construction details for the awning sunshades, ground floor canopy, balcony railings, windows, lighting fixtures shall be subject to Planning Director review and approval prior to issuance of Building Permits.

Public Art: Staff is recommending a condition of approval that the applicant fulfill the requirements of the Public Art Commission.

CONCLUSION

Staff is recommending the Planning Board approve the final architectural elevations, landscape plan, lighting plan, and parking plan subject to the conditions of approval in the draft resolution, which are designed to supplement the conditions of approval in Planning Board Resolution No. PB-18-23.

Public Notice and Comments

Property owners and residents within 300 feet of the project's boundaries were notified of the public hearing and given the opportunity to review and comment on the proposal. Copies of all emails and letters received will be forwarded to the Planning Board and provided for the Board at the public hearing.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

On December 10, 2018, the Planning Board made the necessary findings to determine that no further environmental review was necessary under the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) for the project. The City Council held a de novo public hearing on February 5, 2019 to consider an appeal of Planning Board decision to approve Resolution PB-18-23, which includes the Planning Board's CEQA findings regarding the project, and after considering all of the information on the record and hearing from the appellants, upheld Planning Board Resolution No. PB-18-23. The proposed revisions to the architectural plans, landscape plans, lighting plans, and parking plans do not create any new environmental impacts or increase the severity of any impacts previously disclosed that were not previously considered in the December 10, 2018 resolution. No further environmental review is required.

RECOMMENDATION

Hold a public hearing and approve the draft resolution for approval of the final architectural elevations, landscape plan, parking plan, and lighting plan (Exhibit 2) for the new Marriott Hotel at 2900 Harbor Bay Parkway.

Respectfully submitted,

Henry Dong, Planner III

Exhibits:

1. Project Plans
2. Draft Resolution of Approval