Draft Objective Design Review Standards 2/10/2020

INTRODUCTION

PURPOSE

The Objective Design Review Standards serve as minimum architectural and site design requirements intended primarily for multi-family residential development, mixed-use development where at least two-thirds of the square footage is designated for residential use, and transitional or supportive housing.

The Objective Design Review Standards supplement the development standards of the Zoning Ordinance and further the goals, policies, and actions of the Alameda General Plan, which encourages high quality design and the quality of life that an enhanced built environment fosters.

APPLICABILITY

The Objective Design Review Standards apply to housing development projects, such as:

- Buildings that contain residential units;
- Groups of attached townhomes (row houses), regardless of whether multiple townhomes occupy the same lot or each townhome occupies a separate lot; and
- Mixed-use buildings that include at least two-thirds of the square footage designated for residential use; and
- Transitional housing or supportive housing.

The application of the Objective Design Review Standards is further determined by the design review procedures that a project is subject to.

Objective (Checklist) Design Review

Where California law requires that the design of a project be reviewed only against objective standards, the Objective Design Review Standards will serve as the criteria for design review.

If a project does not meet one or more of the Objective Design Review Standards, and the applicant wishes to propose an alternative design, the applicant can elect to go through the discretionary design review process. In such case, the project will be reviewed for conformance with the Citywide Design Review Manual and any other design guidelines that apply to the site. In such a case, design review may only be approved if the findings for design review of Section 30-37.5, Findings, of the Alameda Municipal Code (AMC) are made.

Discretionary Design Review

If a project is subject to design review and is not required by State law to be reviewed only against objective standards, it is subject to discretionary design review, which is described in Section 30-36, Design Review Procedure, of the AMC. In such case, the project will be reviewed for conformance with the Citywide Design Review Manual and any other design guidelines that apply to the site. The project may only be approved if the findings for design review of Section 30-37.5, Findings, of the AMC are made.

Exhibit 1 Item 7-A, February 10, 2020 Planning Board Meeting In such case, these Objective Design Review Standards can serve as a reference to communicate the City's priorities for site and building design and thereby provide direction to developers and designers. Even if a project meets all of the Objective Design Review Standards, further work may be needed to meet the criteria for approval of discretionary design review.

RELATIONSHIP TO OTHER REGULATIONS

All development must comply with the standards of Alameda Municipal Code Chapter XXX, Development Regulations (the Zoning Ordinance). Therefore, projects subject to these Objective Design Review Standards must also comply with the development standards of the Zoning Ordinance.

DOCUMENT ORGANIZATION

This document is organized into seven topic areas related to site and architectural design. Each section includes a statement of design principles, followed by specific standards related to the principle. The principles are provided for orientation and reference only; they are not criteria for design review. By contrast, the standards are requirements that must be met.

DESIGN PRINCIPLES AND STANDARDS

1. SITE DESIGN

Principles

Vehicle access and parking do not dominate street frontages. Instead, vehicle access and parking are subordinate in location and appearance to other site elements such as buildings, pedestrian facilities, landscaping, and yards.

Children's play areas are designed with adequate facilities and protection. Project sites are designed to provide visibility into children's play areas.

					Project Compl		
Stan	Idar	'ds		Yes	No	N/A	
1A.			tes/Barriers. Public and private streets into new developments shall gated or otherwise closed off to vehicles.				
1 B .	Pa	rkir	ng Location.				
	1.	be loc pu	<i>rface Parking and Carports.</i> Surface parking areas and carports must located behind or to the side of residential buildings. They may not be cated between the front façade of any building and a public street. For rposes of this regulation, the front façade shall mean the elevation that ces the front yard as defined by the Alameda Municipal Code.				
	2.	Ga	irages.				
		a.	Parking Entry Location. If a project site fronts on two or more streets, vehicle entries to parking garages shall be located on a secondary street. (See criteria for determining primary and secondary streets at the end of this document.)				
		b.	<i>Street-facing Garages.</i> Any garage door facing and visible from a primary street shall meet the following standards:				

				Proje	ect Con	nplies
Stand	lards			Yes	No	N/A
		i.	Width. Garage doors shall not occupy more than 50% of the width of any building façade. This limitation does not apply to detached garages located in the rear half of a lot.			
		ii.	Recess. Garage doors shall be recessed at least six inches from the surrounding wall surface.			
	c.		<i>ar and Side Garages</i> . Garage doors located on side or rear façades all be no more than two cars' width, or a maximum of 18 feet.			
(-	en's	Children's Play Areas. If open space on a project site includes play areas, such areas shall be designed to meet the following			
	-		<i>ment.</i> Play areas shall include equipment for children under the five.			
			<i>tion.</i> Play areas shall be protected from any adjacent streets or g lots with a fence or other barrier at least four feet in height.			
	are		<i>ity.</i> Any dwelling unit abutting the open space containing the play all include at least one window located to overlook the open space			
2			<i>ties for Adults.</i> Benches or picnic tables shall be provided for who are supervising children.			
	Corr	espor	nding existing design guidelines and policies on parking location and acc	ess:		
	•	No	rthern Waterfront General Plan Amendment Policy 10.6.v;			
	• Citywide Design Review Manual policies on auto access in 2.2.A Commercial Block, 2.2.B Workplace Commercial, 2.2.C Parking Structure, 2.2.E Stacked Flats, 2.2.F Multiplex, 2.2.G Rowhouse, and 2.2.H Courtyard Housing;					

• Guide to Residential Design, New Construction, Garages.

2. BUILDING MASS AND ARTICULATION

Principles

Avoid buildings with a bulky or monolithic appearance. Provide façade articulation or significant architectural details in order to create visual interest.

To create articulation, building facades can be varied in depth through a pattern of offsets, recesses, or projections. Façade articulation elements should be in proportion to building mass and appropriate to the building's architectural style. In addition, the spacing and organization of façade elements should have a clearly identifiable rhythm or composition. Create buildings that are well proportioned, elegant, cohesive, and harmonious with their surroundings.

Multi-story buildings should have a clear bottom, middle, and top.

Incorporate features that generate interest at the pedestrian level. Avoid blank walls and dull facades that create an uninviting pedestrian environment.

Stan	dar	ds	Proje Yes	ect Com No	plies N/A		
2A.	Façade Articulation . All building facades that face or will be visible from a public street shall be articulated by including features to meet at least one of the following standards :			Projects must meet one or more of the following:			
	1.	At least 25% of the area of the façade is offset (through recesses or projections) at a depth of at least two feet from the remainder of the façade.					
	2.	For every 50 horizontal feet of wall, facades include at least one projection or recess at least four feet in depth, or two projections or recesses at least two feet in depth. If located on a building with two or more stories, the articulated elements must be greater than one story in height.					
	3.	For every 50 feet of horizontal building wall, there is a vertical feature such as a pilaster at least 12 inches in both width and depth and extending the full height of the building.					
	4.	Windows are recessed at least four inches from surrounding exterior wall surfaces, measured from window frame to finished exterior wall.					
	5.	The ground level of the building is distinguished from upper levels through a material such as stone, concrete masonry, or other material that is distinct from the remainder of the façade, along with a change in plane at least one inch in depth at the transition between the two materials.					
	6.	The top floor of the building is distinguished from lower levels by a change in façade materials, along with a change in plane at least one inch in depth at the transition between the two materials.					
	7.	The building includes a horizontal design feature such as a water table, belt course, or bellyband, applied to the transition between the ground floor and upper floors.					
	8.	Cornices or similar moldings and caps are provided at the top of building facades.					
2B.	Limitation on Blank Walls. Any wall that faces a public street, public sidewalk, public pedestrian walkway, or publicly accessible outdoor space shall include at least one of the following features . No wall may run in a continuous plane of more than 20 feet on the ground floor without providing at least one of the features.				r		
	1.	A transparent window or door that provides views into building interiors, or into window displays at least five feet deep.					
	2.	Decorative features and artwork, including but not limited to decorative ironwork and grilles, decorative panels, mosaics, or relief sculptures.					
	3.	A permanent vertical trellis with climbing plants or plant materials.					
2C.		Icony Transparency. Balcony railings shall exhibit at least 30% nsparency. Solid walls along balconies are not permitted.					

Corresponding existing design guidelines and policies on building mass and articulation:

- Alameda Point Town and Waterfront Precise Plan, guidelines on bulk, massing, and façade and entry design;
- Citywide Design Review Manual guidelines on building articulation in 2.2.A Commercial Block, 2.2.B Workplace Commercial, 2.2.E Stacked Flats, 2.2.F Multiplex, 2.2.G Rowhouse, 2.2.H Courtyard Housing, and 4.2.3 Building Articulation.

3. BUILDING ORIENTATION AND ENTRIES

Principles

Orient buildings to face public streets and open space in order to create a sense of interaction between residential uses and the public realm.

Include prominent building entries that contribute to visual interest and are welcoming and pedestrian friendly. Facilitate pedestrian access to buildings by providing direct connections to primary entrances.

Avoid visually unappealing "motel-style" balcony entrances.

Ctor	ر م ام		Proje Yes	ct Con No	nplies N/A	
Stan			res	INO	N/A	
3A.	Main Entry Orientation.					
	1.	If a project site fronts on one public street, the main entry of any building on the site shall face the public street.				
	2.	If a project site fronts on two or more public streets, the main entry shall be oriented to:	Projec one of follow	meet		
		a. Face the corner; or				
		b. Face a primary street. (<i>See the criteria for determining primary streets at the end of this document.</i>)				
	3.	In courtyard-style developments in which residential buildings are located in the interior of a block, entries may face interior courtyards, walkways, and paseos. However, those buildings or portions of buildings adjacent to the public street shall have a primary entry facing the street.				
	4.	In the case of a mixed-use building with ground-floor commercial space, the primary entry to the commercial space must face the public street. The entries to residential units are not required to face the street and instead may be located on a side or rear façade.				
3B.		destrian Access. Direct pedestrian access shall be provided between the blic sidewalk and a primary building entry.				
3C.	Entry Configuration, Area, and Cover . Building entries shall be configured according to one of the following options :			Project must meet one of the following:		
	1.	Shared entrances (serving multiple units) located at the ground floor of the building that have a roofed projection or recess with a minimum depth of five feet and a minimum area of 60 square feet.				

		Proje	ct Con	nplies
Standards			No	N/A
2.	Individual entrances (serving individual ground-floor units) located at the ground floor of the building that have a roofed projection or recess with a minimum depth of at least five feet and a minimum area of 25 feet.			
3.	Individual entrances to individual upper-floor units only if such entrances are not on street-facing facades or visible from public streets.			

Corresponding existing design guidelines and policies on building mass and articulation:

- Alameda Point Town and Waterfront Precise Plan, guidelines on bulk, massing, and façade and entry design;
- Citywide Design Review Manual guidelines on building articulation in 2.2.A Commercial Block, 2.2.B Workplace Commercial, 2.2.E Stacked Flats, 2.2.F Multiplex, 2.2.G Rowhouse, 2.2.H Courtyard Housing, and 4.2.3 Building Articulation.

4. ARCHITECTURAL DETAILS AND MATERIALS

Principles

Incorporate architectural details in order to create visual interest and avoid flat or monolithiclooking facades.

Create shadow lines around windows.

Provide exterior materials that enhance architectural character and quality.

Standards

4A. Equivalent Facade Treatment. Buildings shall carry the same theme on all elevations. For the purpose of this standard, a theme includes primary (non-accent) materials and colors.

4B. Siding Materials.

- 1. *Prohibited Materials*. The following shall not be used as siding materials:
 - a. Vinyl (plastic) siding.
 - b. Horizontal aluminum siding.
 - c. T-11 vertical wood siding.
- 2. Specific Requirements for Certain Materials.
 - a. *Exposed Wood*. If exposed wood is used, it shall be painted, stained, or treated and maintained to prevent noticeable weathering
 - b. *Thin Brick Veneers*. Thin brick veneers, where used, shall be selected to give the appearance of full brick. Wrap-around pieces shall be used at window recesses and building corners.
 - c. *Fiber Cement and Other Synthetic Siding*. Synthetic siding shall have smooth textures. Simulated wood grain textures shall not be used.

 Project Complies

 Yes
 No
 N/A

 Image: Complex state
 Image: Complex state

Checking "yes" indicates that prohibited							
material not used.							
•							
	_	_	_				

Stan	dar	ds	Proje Yes	ct Con No	nplies N/A
4C.	slat	of Materials. For sloped roofs, materials may consist of shingles, tiles, e, or standing-seam metal. For flat roofs, roofing materials are not ited.			
4D.	Wi	ndow Details.			
	1.	 Window Recess. Windows must be recessed at least two inches from the surrounding wall, measured from the face of the finished exterior wall to the window frame. (<i>Note: Placeholder for graphic.</i>) a. <i>Exception.</i> Windows that occur on a section of wall that is recessed at least one foot from the remainder of the building façade need not be recessed from the wall on which they are located. 			
	2.	<i>Divided Lites/Muntins</i> . Divided-lite windows, where utilized, may consist of true/full divided lites or simulated divided lites, in accord with the following standards:			
		a. Muntins or grids shall project at least three-eighths (3/8) of an inch from the glass surface.			
		b. Muntins or grids shall be used on both the exterior and interior of the glass.			
		c. For simulated divided lites, spacers shall be used between panes.			
		d. Sandwich muntins, where muntin material is located between two panes of glass, but not on the exterior or interior of the window, are prohibited.			
		e. Roll-on or tape muntins are prohibited.			

Corresponding existing design guidelines and policies on building mass and articulation:

- Alameda Point Town and Waterfront Precise Plan, guidelines on bulk, massing, and façade and entry design;
- Citywide Design Review Manual guidelines on building articulation in 2.2.A Commercial Block, 2.2.B Workplace Commercial, 2.2.E Stacked Flats, 2.2.F Multiplex, 2.2.G Rowhouse, 2.2.H Courtyard Housing, and 4.2.3 Building Articulation.

Yes

No

Projects must meet

standard in at least

two of these three areas: roof form,

exterior materials.

and architectural details.

 \square

 \square

 \square

 \square

N/A

5. NEIGHBORHOOD CONTEXT

Principles

New residential development should be compatible with the prevailing architectural character of adjacent traditional Alameda neighborhoods. New buildings should reflect the architectural context by incorporating forms and features from existing buildings in the immediate area.

Standards

- **5A. Applicability and Context Buildings.** The standards of this section apply if a project site is located on the same block face as or across the street from one or more lots with existing residential buildings. Any existing residential buildings constructed prior to 1942 shall constitute the "context buildings" for the purposes of meeting these standards. The standards do not apply if there are no residential buildings constructed prior to 1942.
- **5B.** Context Standards (Incorporating Aspects of Context Buildings). New buildings must incorporate forms and features of the context building(s) in at least two of the three following aspects: roof form; exterior materials; and architectural details. In order to meet the standards, an applicant may select any context building or buildings.
 - 1. **Roof Form**. In order to meet the roof form standard, a project shall exhibit the same roof form as a context building. Qualifying roof forms are gable, hip, mansard, gambrel, flat, shed, or bonnet.
 - 2. Exterior Materials. In order to meet the exterior materials standard, a project must incorporate either **one or two of the following exterior materials** found on a pre-1942 context building. (A project may include other cladding materials not listed below but it will not be considered to create a materials context for purposes of meeting this standard.)
 - a. Wood siding;
 - b. Board and batten siding, including plywood, if minimum 1" x 2" wood battens are used at minimum 8" intervals;
 - c. Wood shingles;
 - d. Stucco;
 - e. Brick;
 - f. Stone;
 - g. Cement fiber or similar synthetic siding that is smooth-surfaced (without imitation raised wood grain), but excluding vinyl and aluminum siding; and
 - h. "Half timber," consisting of individual pieces of dimensioned lumber surrounded by stucco.

Page 8

Standar	'ds		Yes	No	N/A
3.	Architectural Details. In order to meet the architectural details standard, a project shall incorporate at least one of the following architectural details or features found on a context building:				
	a.	Window and corner trim with the same trim depth as the context building.			
	b.	Roof eaves/overhangs 18 inches or more deep.			
	c.	Exposed rafter tails.			
	d.	Roof brackets.			
	e.	Attached trellises.			
	f.	Bay windows.			
	g.	Curved parapets.			
	h.	Other architectural features and details found on a context building.			

6. EQUIPMENT SCREENING

Principles

Minimize visual clutter by locating mechanical and electrical equipment away from public view, coordinating and integrating such equipment into the design of buildings, or screening it with materials that match building exteriors.

Standards

Standards			Yes	No	N/A
6A.	Equipment Screening . All exterior mechanical and electrical equipment shall be screened or incorporated into the design of buildings according to the following standards.				
	1.	Ground-floor mechanical equipment shall be screened with landscaping or with screening materials that match the exterior materials, textures, and colors of the building(s) on the site.			
	2.	Window-mounted air conditioning units shall not be visible on the primary building façade.			

Corresponding existing design guidelines and policies on screening:

Citywide Design Review Manual 4.2.12, Mechanical Equipment and Screening. •

7. GROUND-FLOOR COMMERCIAL USES IN MIXED-USE DEVELOPMENT

Principles

Create pedestrian interest, orientation, and access at the ground floor of mixed-use buildings.

Standards

In addition to meeting the Objective Design Review Standards for multi-family dwellings, mixed-use buildings with ground-floor commercial uses shall meet the following standards.

			Projec	t Com	plies
			Yes	No	N/A
7A.		round-floor Height . The ground floor shall be at least 14 feet in height, easured from floor to ceiling.			
7 B .		try Area and Cover . Pedestrian entries to ground-floor and upper-floor mmercial uses shall meet all of the following standards:			
	1.	Entrances shall be recessed in a vestibule two to five feet in depth.			
	2.	Entrances shall be covered by a roof, portico, or other architectural projection that provides weather protection.			
	3.	The floor of exterior entry vestibules shall be paved with tile, stone, or other hard-surface material distinct from the adjacent sidewalk. This standard may also be met by scoring concrete and using integrated color.			
7C.	Tr	ansparency.			
	1.	<i>Ground-floor Façade.</i> Exterior walls facing a street shall include windows, doors, or other openings for at least 75 percent of the building wall area located between two and eight feet above the level of the sidewalk. No wall may run in a continuous plane for more than 10 feet without an opening. Openings fulfilling this requirement shall have transparent glazing (not tinted glass, or reflective film or coating) and shall provide views into window displays at least five feet deep or into sales areas, lobbies, work areas, or similar active commercial spaces.			
	2.	<i>Entry Doors.</i> At least 50% of the area of entry doors to commercial spaces shall consist of transparent glazing.			
	3.	<i>Entry Bays.</i> At least 80% of the surface of each storefront bay shall consist of display windows, doors, transom windows, and other openings with transparent glazing.			
7D.	Ve	ertical Articulation.			
	1.	must be distinguished from upper floors by incorporating one or more of	5		
		a. Storefront windows on the ground floor and smaller windows on upper floors.			
		b. A material distinct from the remainder of the façade, along with a change in plane of at least one inch from the wall surface of the remainder of the building.			

				Project Complie		
				Yes	No	N/A
		c.	A horizontal design feature such as a water table, belt course, or bellyband applied to the transition between the ground floor and upper floors.			
	2.		<i>of Treatment.</i> The tops of buildings shall be articulated by orporating a cornice, parapet, or eave.			
7E.	Bu	lkhe	eads/Storefront Base Treatment.			
	1.					t of the
		a.	Bulkheads at least 18 inches in height and no more than 24 inches in height, measured from the adjacent sidewalk.			
		b.	A base treatment (bottom frame element) at least four inches in height if such treatment is exhibited by other storefronts on the same block.			
	2.	Bu	lkhead Materials.			
		a.	<i>Allowed Materials</i> . Allowed materials for bulkheads include glazed tile, polished marble, granite or other stone slabs, wood panels and pressed brick.			
		b.	<i>Prohibited Materials.</i> The following materials are not allowed for bulkheads: stucco; wood shingles and board-and-batten siding; rustic materials such as rough-sawn wood, rough stone, or common brick; recessed metal panels; and synthetic materials such as vinyl or cultured stone.			
		c.	Requirements for Certain Materials. For tile, stone, or brick bulkheads:			
			i. The storefront windows shall be set at or within one inch of the face of the bulkhead; or			
			ii. The bulkhead materials shall be incorporated into the sill detailing.			

Corresponding existing design policies and guidelines:

- Citywide Design Review Manual 2.2.A, Commercial Block, 2.2.B, Workplace Commercial, 3.2.A Storefront, 3.2.C Formal Entry, 4.2.4, Materials, 4.2.6 Windows, and 4.2.8 Building Entries.
- Webster Street Design Manual, Façade Composition guidelines 1.6 and 1.7; Articulate Corner Locations guideline 1.9; Entry guidelines 6.4 and 6.5; Window guidelines 6.8, 6.9, 6.11, 6.13, Bulkheads guidelines 6.15, 6.17, 6.18.
- Alameda Point Town and Waterfront Precise Plan, Building Design, Fenestration and Transparency.

RULES OF INTERPRETATION

Criteria for Determining Primary Streets

Where a project site fronts on two or more streets, the following criteria shall be used to determine which streets are primary for the purpose of these Objective Design Review Standards.

- 1. A primary street is:
 - a. Any street identified as a Primary Pedestrian Street in Figures 20 to 22 in the City of Alameda Pedestrian Plan (2009), or subsequent update thereto; or
 - b. Any street identified as a Transit Priority Street in the Transportation Element of the General Plan.
- 2. If no street fronting the site is a Primary Pedestrian Street or Transit Priority Street, the street with the highest classification in the Transportation Element of the General Plan, as shown on the Street Types Diagram, shall be considered the primary street.
- 3. If all fronting streets are of equal classification in the Transportation Element, the project applicant may determine which street serves as the primary street.