

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING  
TUESDAY- - FEBRUARY 7, 2023- -7:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 7:01 p.m. Vice Mayor Daysog led the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL - Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Herrera Spencer, Jensen, and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 4. [Note: Councilmember Herrera Spencer arrived at 7:04 p.m. The meeting was conducted via Zoom.]

Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.

AGENDA CHANGES

(23-051) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft announced there would not be a reading for the Season for nonviolence.

PROCLAMATIONS, SPECIAL ORDERS OF THE DAY AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

(23-052) Season for Nonviolence Word of the Day: Gratitude. Not heard.

(23-053) Proclamation Declaring February 2023 as Black History Month.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft read the proclamation.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

(23-054) Joel Toscano, Local 713, discussed language for labor standards.

(23-055) Joshua Altieri, Alameda Housing Authority (AHA), provided a monthly update on the Housing Authority.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Discussed Council priority setting and clarifying plans: Paul Beusterien, Alameda.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer requested the teleconference findings [paragraph no. 23-058], the CivicMakers agreement [paragraph no. 23-059] and the Central Avenue safety improvements [paragraph no. 23-060] be removed from the Consent Calendar for discussion

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved approval of the remainder of the Consent Calendar.

Vice Mayor Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Jensen: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. [Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.] [Items so enacted or adopted are indicated by an asterisk preceding the paragraph number.]

(\*23-056) Minutes of the Joint City Council and Successor Agency to the Community Improvement Commission Meeting and Regular City Council Meeting Held on January 3, 2023. Approved.

(\*23-057) Ratified bills in the amount of \$5,196,425.27.

(23-058) Recommendation to Approve Findings to Allow City Meetings to be Conducted via Teleconference Through February 28, 2023.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the matter has been an important issue for members of the public; requested clarification from staff of the process for transitioning to hybrid meetings.

The City Clerk stated staff has been running tests and scenarios; a training has been scheduled for staff members; there are many parts to the hybrid meeting process; the February 27<sup>th</sup> Planning Board meeting will be the first hybrid meeting; the first regular Council meeting in March will be conducted in the hybrid format.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether members of the public wishing to participate in-person may do so with the hybrid meeting format, to which the City Clerk responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she is looking forward to hybrid meetings; she has had the opportunity to attend and participate in public meetings in Chambers; staff is supporting the process; discussed a regional meeting hosted by the City Attorney's office and a swearing in ceremony for Alameda Police Department (APD); expressed support for the public being able to participate in-person during the public meeting process; stated that she will continue not to be supportive of the current matter and will not vote in favor; expressed concern over the public being denied meaningful participation in public meetings.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the two in-person gatherings held in Chambers were strictly in-person and did not involve hybrid components; noted doors and windows will be open for meetings with large groups; the tricky part of hybrid meetings is facilitating participation both in-person and via Zoom; the February 27<sup>th</sup> Planning Board meeting will be the first hybrid meeting to test functionality.

Councilmember Jensen moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Vice Mayor Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Jensen: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 1. [Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.]

(23-059) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a One-Year Agreement with CivicMakers, Substantially in the Form of the Attached Agreement, to Provide Strategic Planning Services and Create a Three-Year Strategic Plan, with the Option to Extend the Agreement on a Year-by-Year Basis for Up to Two Additional Years, in an Aggregate Amount Not-to-Exceed \$114,416, Including a 10% Contingency, for a Three-Year Term, Funded by the General Fund.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated an exhibit indicates the contract cost; she initially understood the cost to be \$114,000 for three years, however, \$104,000 covers through June

2023; there is an extra \$12,000 for ongoing meetings; requested clarification about the additional \$12,000 and whether the \$114,000 cost is for a three year term or if the term concludes in June 2023.

The Assistant City Manager stated the total agreement is \$114,416, which includes a 10% contingency; staff anticipates getting as far as possible in the process with the current budget through June 2023; the agreement has been written to provide extra time in the event the process ends up going beyond June 2023; if needed staff proceed past June 2023 for an amount not to exceed \$114,416.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated there will be at least one new Councilmember at the next term in two years; inquired whether the same process will occur again in two years.

The Assistant City Manager responded the process and the \$114,416 amount is dedicated to the initial strategic plan; stated staff does not anticipate the process taking long; staff anticipates the scope being completed within the next six to twelve months at most; once the strategic plan is completed, staff will have the process occur annually with a separate contract; the proposed contract is solely for the initial strategic plan scope of work.

The City Manager stated staff will perform updates; the intention is to have the strategic plan be a working document; staff expects things to change; priorities evolve and things change; the matter can be discussed on an annual basis as well as being included in the budget; she anticipates an annual priority setting retreat being held the beginning of each year so the priorities can be included in the budget process.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the agreement is \$104,000 for the first portion of the scope; Exhibit B of the attachment indicates the scope; expressed support for new Councilmembers starting the process anew; expressed concern over the Council Referral form having priorities set by former Council; stated that she was on the Council for over a year before Council revisited previously set priorities; expressed concern over having to indicate how her Council Referrals relate to priorities set by a former Council priority setting; stated that she does not believe it is appropriate for her to lock-in future Councilmembers' priorities; the title for the matter should have indicated the amount of \$104,000 covers a term through June 2023 as opposed to the \$114,000 covering a three to five year term; the agreement covers \$104,000 through June 2023; the priority setting process should start over when new Councilmembers are elected; the amount is misrepresented; the parties involved includes the equity work group; inquired who the equity work group includes.

The City Manager responded the group is an internal staff working group which just held their first meeting in January; stated staff wanted to include the group's workplan progress; staff wants to ensure equity and inclusion is included as part of the strategic planning process.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether staff anticipates coming back to Council in the future to explain more about the equity working group and how the plan fits into the strategic plan.

The City Manager responded in the affirmative; stated the equity working group should take approximately six months to work through the plan process; Council has approved the related contract with SEEDS; there is an interdepartmental group of City staff at all levels; the process and project are still being defined; staff will provide Council with an update.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the equity working group was one of the recommendations from the subcommittee that addressed reimagining Police services.

The City Manager stated staff included the equity working group in order to have Council acknowledge diversity and inclusion as part of the priority setting process; staff will be using the group as best it can to ensure the City is thinking about related issues moving forward through the priority setting process.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated subcommittee members were hand-picked by the former City Manager, not Council; the meetings were conducted behind closed doors and were not publicly noticed; sharing with the public is important; the matter appears to be a City strategic plan, not Council; Council has its own priorities; inquired whether the matter will be coming back to Council.

The City Manager responded in the affirmative; stated the matter is a Council driven process; the City-wide strategic plan will go through a robust and inclusive process; the Council will ultimately approve the plan; staff anticipates the plan moving being incorporated to the two-year budget process; the plan is ultimately approved by Council in order to be integrated into the budget.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that it is important for the Council priority process to fold into supporting the budget; expressed concern over the matter being much broader than indicated with a term extending past the terms of current Councilmembers and for the current Council making decisions that extend into terms of new Councilmembers; stated that she is also concerned over the misrepresentation of the cost associated with the contract.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the staff report and agreement clearly indicated that the facilitators will be reaching out to all Councilmembers for interviews to discover priorities that can be integrated to the strategic plan; concurred with Councilmember Herrera Spencer that the strategic planning retreats should occur early in the year after an election occurs; stated scheduling has taken a long time; the first strategic planning meeting will be held in March; consensus could not be reached to hold the meeting on a Saturday or Sunday; a new poll has been provided to find a second date for strategic planning.

Councilmember Jensen expressed support for the matter; stated it is imperative that the City have a plan with measurable outcomes and milestones to move forward in all areas of high concern; she hopes that the plan can provide guidance to staff for measurable outcomes.

Vice Mayor Daysog stated it is important for members of the public to remember that Alameda City Hall is approximately one quarter of a billion dollars in operation when the General Fund and enterprise programs are combined; the operation covers roughly 17 departments in addition to programs like the rent program and enterprise funds; the purpose of the strategic plan is to allow Council to inform the City Manager of the areas of high to low levels of focus; the process is flexible enough to allow any Councilmember to pursue their priorities as seen fit; the City needs a strategic plan; expressed support for staff bringing forth the matter; stated the City is exploring new concepts that had never been previously pursued especially along the lines of equity; the area is new and the City can learn new things; the proposed budget scope is mainly to pay for the consulting services to put together a report and plan; the plan will take roughly three years to implement; he supports the City Manager's proposal; he hopes the residents will become involved and provide input to Council on priorities.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she hopes people read the agreement statement section; the consultants will prepare a tool kit for City staff to implement community pop up events to gain input on the draft vision and strategic priorities; expressed support for the City working with CivicMakers; stated the process will be inclusive for Council, City staff and the community at-large.

Vice Mayor Daysog moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Jensen seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Jensen: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 1. [Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.]

(23-060) Resolution No. 16027, “Authorizing the City Manager to Execute a Cooperative Agreement, Substantially in the Form of the Attached Agreement, with the California Department of Transportation to Complete the Construction of the Central Avenue Safety Improvement Project.” Adopted.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed concern over new data on traffic fatalities being incomplete; shared a slide; stated the data shows reports from December 2022; years were grouped together and do not show an annual breakdown; a number of fatalities and severely injured have been reported in the past years; the highest reports of incidents have been in recent years based; the slide is published on the City’s website under Transportation; the data is not 100% accurate and is limited; Council is being asked to approve changes to Central Avenue improvements; Council should pull back and look at the numbers; the actions being taken are based on national data; the City needs to ensure that it should continue down this path; many Alamedans believe that the changes being made are increasing accidents throughout the City; she will not be supporting the matter; urged residents to review the data.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated correlation does not equal causation; changes are being seen nationwide.

The Planning, Building, and Transportation Director stated staff has been working with Caltrans on the Central Avenue project for roughly eight years; the matter before Council is a cooperative agreement with Caltrans establishing responsibility between two agencies; the Central Avenue improvement project has already been approved by Council; Council approval of the agreement allows the project to be implemented; severe accidents and fatalities have increased nationally, as well as in California and Alameda County; staff has compared trends over the last ten years in Alameda versus the County and State; Alameda is doing better on a per capita basis than the County and State; looking at the slide presented, Alameda is performing significantly better than the region and State; the actions being taken in Alameda are working; each piece of the Central Avenue project design and strategies being proposed have been shown to significantly improve safety, not just for bicyclists and pedestrians, but automobile drivers as well; staff is confident the project will make Central Avenue safer for all users.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated some of the fatalities and severe injuries have occurred on the improved streets; she disagrees with the analysis provided.

Vice Mayor Daysog moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Jensen seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Jensen: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 1. [Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.]

(\*23-061) Resolution No. 16028, “Approving Vesting Tentative Tract Map No. 8654, to Subdivide a 4.1-Acre Property with Two Lots into 14 Lots and 90 Condominium Units at 2015 Grand Street. Vesting Tentative Tract Map No. 8654 Will Also Dedicate Approximately 0.5 Acres as Public Right-of-Way for the Completion of Clement Avenue between Grand Street and Hibbard Avenue and to Widen Hibbard Avenue between Ellen Craig Drive and Clement Avenue.” Adopted.

#### CONTINUED AGENDA ITEMS

None.

#### REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

(23-062) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a First Amendment to the Winter Warming Shelter Agreement with Christ Episcopal Church to Increase the Funding Amount by \$53,385 for a Total Agreement Amount Not-to-Exceed \$123,385 in order to Increase the Warming Shelter Schedule to Seven Days per Week and Continue to Operate through April 30, 2023.

The Community Development Director gave a Power Point discussion.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she has requested a cost breakdown; inquired whether specific information is available.

The Community Development Director responded staff has maintained a budget as part of the original contract; the breakdown can be provided.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated other non-profit organizations are able to showcase how money is being spent; she would like more details to share with the public.

Expressed support for the matter being evaluated in a measurement framework; stated that he supports the matter and the facility organized processes; he is impressed at how well the community is providing aid and volunteering; the center provides a sense of community; urged people to volunteer and Council to fund the program: Paul Beusterien, Alameda.

Expressed support; stated that he is appreciative of the partnership of all involved to provide services and volunteer efforts; urged Council to support the agreement: Darin Lounds, Housing Consortium of the East Bay (HCB).

Stated the average stay is closer to 25 people; it is amazing to see people know they have a place to sleep or spend the day; expressed support for the partnership with the City; expressed support for program volunteers; stated volunteers are critically important; he would like to see longer term transitional housing in Alameda: John Brennan, Christ Episcopal Church.

Expressed support for the matter; stated providing the service is critical: Akesa Fakava, Twin Towers United Methodist Church.

Stated the need for services has grown; expressed support for the community that has been formed; stated that she is thankful for the opportunity the program has provided; urged people to come by and visit some of the program participants: Alisa Rasera-Holden, Christ Episcopal Church.

Councilmember Jensen expressed support for the partnership between City staff and Christ Episcopal Church; stated the program is tremendous and shows how the City should operate; the program is wonderful to see and is an illustration of how people can work together and how community resources with City funding and support can help local residents; there have not been complaints from neighbors, Police calls, or any issues arising since the program has been in place; she would like to see the [McKay] Wellness Center move forward as another resource that has been supported by the community; the warming shelter program can be used as an example to help provide wrap around services.

The Community Development Director concurred with Councilmember Jensen; stated that she does not believe there have been any Police calls for the center; the experience has been good.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated finding excellent providers to oversee the program operations has been important.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer expressed support for the matter; stated the church is located at 1700 Santa Clara Avenue and has a website; there are ways to donate and support the program; the website has a lot of program information including ways to volunteer; the program is using the City's General Fund; she would like the program to be as transparent as possible; it is important to continue providing due diligence and transparency with the community on how funds are being spent; it is critical for the program to be a leader in the volunteer efforts taking place.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer moved approval of approving the agreement amendment.

Stated 21 showers were provided Friday night; those who were able to use the facilities were very happy and appreciative; guests of the program are becoming friends; expressed support for community volunteers; stated the service to the community is valued: Susanne La Faver, Christ Episcopal Church.

Vice Mayor Daysog expressed support for the program.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated there are many people to thank for the program; Alameda has a wonderful faith-based community; the City, as well as churches, are putting money into the program; discussed those who have been supportive of the program before extreme weather hit; stated people have organized community volunteers; the shelter has been operating several days per week; Council only needs to approve the expenditure for the agreement in order for the program to continue; the City needs to do more; the City has done everything in order to overcome obstacles, however, there are still challenges; discussed challenges with the McKay Wellness Center; stated that she is heartened by the community.

Councilmember Jensen seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: Aye; Jensen: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. [Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.]

## CITY MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS

(23-063) The City Manager made an announcement about an event recognizing new Police staff and an upcoming Alameda Fire Department ceremony; discussed a meeting for Alameda Point owners and tenants related to a draft strategy that will come before Council in March; stated staff is working on a draft urban forest plan and a related survey has been posted online.

## ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

None.

## COUNCIL REFERRALS

None.

## COUNCIL COMMUNICATIONS

(23-064) Councilmember Herrera Spencer discussed a gun violence training event hosted by the City Attorney's Office and a Lunar New Year event held by the Toishan Association.

(23-065) Vice Mayor Daysog discussed his attending the AC Transit-City of Alameda Interagency Liaison Committee (ILC) meeting, the annual Women's Day march, a Martin Luther King Jr. event, and the Alameda-Oakland Airport Noise forum.

(23-066) Councilmember Herrera Spencer noted that she also attended a Lunar New Year parade in Oakland Chinatown.

(23-067) Councilmember Jensen discussed her attendance at the League of California Cities conference for new Councilmembers and the AC Transit ILC meeting.

(23-068) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft announced that she attended the U.S. Conference of Mayors conference, the Bohol Circle Immigrant Park opening, the Women's March, a luncheon sponsored by the East Bay Economic Development Alliance, the gun violence training hosted by the City Attorney's office, a jazz band performance by Alameda High School at Yoshi's in Oakland, and the Police Academy graduation in Oakland.

## ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 8:41 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger  
City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.