

APPROVED MINUTES
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE
CITY OF ALAMEDA PLANNING BOARD
WEDNESDAY, JUNE 22, 2016

1. CONVENE

President Knox White called the meeting to order at 7:01pm

2. FLAG SALUTE

Board Member Zuppan led the flag salute.

3. ROLL CALL

Present: President Knox White, Board Members Henneberry, Köster, Sullivan, Zuppan.
Board Member Mitchell arrived at 7:05pm. Absent: Board Member Burton.

4. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

President Knox White moved Staff Communications to the beginning of the meeting.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Gretchen Lipow asked why there appeared to be no Community Facilities District in the Encinal Terminals plan to pay for public safety.

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

None

*****9. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS*****

9-A 2016-3038

Appointment of a Planning Board member to sit on Ad Hoc Committee for
Preparation of the Economic Development Strategic Plan

Staff Member Fonstein introduced the item and gave an update on the formation of the
new committee.

Board Member Zuppan volunteered and was appointed to the Ad Hoc Committee.

7. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

7-A 2016-3033

PLN16-0165 - Westmont of Harbor Bay Assisted Living. Applicant: Chris Garwood for Pacific Union Land Investors LLC. Public hearing to consider a revision to the previously approved Final Development Plan PLN15-0092 (Esplanade site) to allow construction of an approximately 105,500-square-foot, two-story senior assisted living facility on the remainder of the undeveloped portion of the property at 2900 Harbor Bay Parkway. The site is located within a CM-PD Commercial Manufacturing Planned Development Zoning District in the Harbor Bay Business Park. Pursuant to

CEQA Guidelines Section 15162, there have been no significant changes in circumstances that require revisions to the previously certified Environmental Impact Report. The proposed project is not likely to cause substantial environmental damage or substantially and avoidably injure endangered, rare, or threatened fish or wildlife or their habitat.

Staff Member Thomas introduced the item. The staff report and attachments can be found at: <https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=2751057&GUID=767B8261-4279-47BB-A0C3-8B37255A44FD&FullText=1>

Ms. Bishop, biologist with Monk & Associates, gave a report on her wildlife survey.

Chris Garwood, project applicant, spoke about why they think the site is a good spot for seniors.

Michael O'Rourke, project applicant, explained how the operation would work and the growing need for this type of facility.

Board Member Zuppan asked if a one day wildlife survey was adequate.

Ms. Bishop explained the process she used to survey the site from a distance prior to a thorough examination of the site.

Board Member Sullivan asked if May 6th was the right time to look for nesting birds.

Ms. Bishop said it was and that nesting season begins in February.

Board Member Mitchell asked for more information on the level of care for the residents and demands on emergency services.

The applicant explained that they are an assisted living facility, but do not provide more acute levels of care such as feeding tubes, open wounds, etc. He said EMS is called periodically but not often.

Board Member Henneberry asked if the zoning and licensing requirements are the same as for Cardinal Point.

Staff Member Thomas said they were, but Cardinal Point was in a manufacturing area and this area allows more uses in the commercial area.

Board Member Köster confirmed that the units do not have kitchens.

President Knox White opened the public hearing.

Audrey Lord-Hausman expressed support for the project and said there is a dire need for this type of project.

Patricia Reilly said she supports the project. She said we do not have a lot of assisted living facilities and she hopes not to leave the island when she has to move into an assisted living facility.

Carol Gottstein said the site is very far from available hospitals. She said she does not feel this type of facility meets the zoning for the site.

Ron Kamangar said the location is directly under the flight path for the airport and not suitable for this type of facility. He said burrowing owls use the site but the construction next door was the reason she did not find anything.

Patricia Gannon said the building is too big. She said the location is not appropriate for assisted living.

George Humphries said he is opposed to the project as envisioned. He said he is concerned with view corridors and wildlife habitat.

Tim Neilson said he is concerned about the ferry. He said the ferry needs the land adjacent to the ferry parking lot to continue to thrive. He suggested a downsized facility with parking for the ferry as a compromise.

Bob Osterman said Alameda has an abundance of open space and parkland. He said he supports the project and that it would generate tax revenue for the city.

Reyla Graber said, that in 2008, 1200 people signed a petition to keep the area as open space. She showed a video on the jack rabbits that live on the site.

Art Lenhardt said he supports the development. He said Alameda needs this type of facility. He said he hopes that as a senior he is at least as important as a jack rabbit.

Honora Murphy, Juelle Ann Beyer, Jon Burkhard, Rosemary Reilly, Luann Dewitt, and Diane Lichtenstein submitted video comments expressing support for the project.

Laura Ramirez Gonzalez said she does not support this project at this location. She said the wildlife has decreased greatly as the area has been developed. She said the cost of this project would be very high.

Cathy Leong said there are many animals that use the site that you won't see in one day. She said that whatever is built needs to be small enough to preserve habitat and allow people to enjoy the area.

Steven Gortler said the project is too large. He said this is a luxury retirement facility not a medical facility. He said it does not meet the zoning and the City would open itself to a lawsuit if it approved the project.

Pat Lamborn said the applicant does not have a good reputation. She said this operator should not be approved.

Daniel Reidy, Harbor Bay Business Park Association, said the design of the project is attractive and workable. He said the project would add variety to the business park.

Brock Grunt said he is in favor of the project. He said the city has a need for this type of facility. He said this is the type of place kids would want to come visit their grandparents. He said he loves nature but the rabbits are incredibly adaptable.

Larry William said he supports the project and would want to live there, soon. He said he has had difficulty finding a quality facility in the area that has space.

Bruce Myers read a letter from WETA that supports the project.

Tom Krysiak said he opposes the project because of the size, loss of views and wildlife concerns.

Joe Van Winkle said the EIR is out of date. He said the building is too big for the site.

Robert Dowd said he supports the project.

Peter Brand suggested establishing a habitat mitigation program for the developer to contribute too. He suggested the Doolittle landfill site as an ideal location for spending mitigation dollars.

Kari Thompson, Chamber of Commerce, said the project is transit friendly and has lower impacts than alternative uses. She said this land was created for development purposes and not open space.

Geoffrey Burnaford said people value wildlife more than humans. He said he supports the project.

Irene Dieter said everyone supports assisted living. She asked if the developer considered a smaller footprint and adding a story. She asked if they could include an affordability requirement.

Dorothy Freeman said the facility is the right idea in the wrong location. She said the location is too isolated and would not offer a variety of services for residents and their families.

Kevin Hester said the site was zoned for development, not open space. He says the proposal eliminates much of the asphalt in the previous plans and will be aesthetically pleasing.

President Knox White closed the public hearing.

President Knox White asked how the airport noise is addressed.

Staff Member Thomas said the project was reviewed and approved by the airport land use commission.

President Knox White asked when the property was planned. He asked what discretion they have over the plan.

Staff Member Thomas said the development plans date back to 1979. He said they updated the areas of the EIR that have changed. He said the City has discretion to deny the use and keep the office use for the site.

Board Member Henneberry asked what would have to happen to make the site remain open space.

Staff Member Thomas said the City would have to buy the property or use eminent domain to purchase the land for public use. He said you would have to also pay for programming and maintaining the park.

Staff Attorney Brown said the City also has a vested contractual relationship and the owner has a right to develop the property.

Board Member Zuppan said she met with the developer as well as community members on both sides of the issue. She said she supports assisted living but has concerns about this site. She said she is concerned with site coverage, lack of use flexibility from limited parking, job types and tax base, and view corridors. She said the class of job is completely different from this use compared to office use. She said she would like a view corridor in the middle if the project goes forward. She said the project could be smaller. She says a smaller footprint would allow landscaped space to be converted to parking if the use changed in the future. She said she is not ready to approve the project tonight.

Board Member Henneberry said he supports Board Member Zuppan's comments. He said he liked the comment to increase the height to reduce the footprint. He said some of the issues could be addressed through design review. He said he is in favor of the use and thinks it could work at the site.

Board Member Mitchell said he met twice with the developer. He said we need assisted living in this community. He said he is concerned with the scale and scope compared to the previously approved use. He said he is torn. He said he would like to send it back, reduce the footprint, and increase the view corridors.

Board Member Köster said he is concerned with the loss of the view corridors. He said the use is good and the parking and traffic impacts are less with this project. He suggested a more compact design and maybe to increase the height.

Board Member Sullivan said she supports assisted living in Alameda. She said the scale of this building is too large. She said she is concerned with safety and that she thinks the location is not appropriate for this facility. She said she is concerned with the quality of jobs the project would bring in.

President Knox White said he would like to see the shuttle and WETA bike parking contributions spelled out in anything that is approved. He said we need all types of jobs. He said there is still a large amount of land available for commercial development in the Harbor Bay Business Park. He said this is a good transitional use from the office park to the residential neighborhoods.

Board Member Henneberry made a motion to approve the resolution allowing the assisted living use for the site and to continue working with staff on the footprint and size of the facility. Board Member Köster seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-1 (Sullivan).

The resolution can be found at: https://alamedaca.gov/sites/default/files/document-files/department-files/Planning/2016_planning_board_resos_june-july_2016_reduced.pdf

President Knox White announced a five minute recess.

Board Member Henneberry made a motion to continue the meeting past 11pm in order to hear Item 7-C and continue item 7-B to a future meeting. Board Member Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion passed 6-0.

7-B 2016-3034

Public Hearing to Introduce an Ordinance Amending Chapter 30 of the Alameda Municipal Code (Zoning Ordinance) to Remove Barriers and Add Incentives for Second Units. The proposed amendments regarding Second Units are Statutorily Exempt pursuant to Section 15282(h), for the adoption of ordinances implementing AB 1866 - Second Unit Law (Government Code Section 65852.2).

*****CONTINUED*****

7-C 2016-3035

Planning Board Study Session: Encinal Terminals Master Plan Sub Area
Land Uses and Building Heights.

Staff Member Thomas introduced the item. The staff report and attachments can be found at <https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=2751059&GUID=C9C81E47-5EBA-477A-9C1E-B9699781F621&FullText=1>

Mike O'Hara, Tim Lewis Communities, gave a presentation on the site and their thoughts on trading off between building heights and the amount of open space.

Board Member Zuppan asked if the increased open space would require additional units to pay for those benefits.

Staff Member Thomas said that they should not make that assumption and just provide input on how they would like the site organized and what their thoughts are on the height question.

President Knox White opened the public hearing.

Dorothy Freeman said less open space is better than a 250 foot skyscraper. She said it would set a precedent that all future developers would try and follow. She said there is abundant open space near the site.

Alison Greene said that you can't separate the land swap considerations from the height discussions. She said she does not want to lose sight of the benefits earned from the Del Monte process.

Karen Bey said we should use Alameda Point as a model for the Northern Waterfront. She said she is okay with the heights. She said it is important to make sure we get benefits from the site. She said she would like restaurants to be a permitted use, not a conditional one.

Wesley Bexton said they have seen a dramatic reduction in their views from the Lennar development. He said effects on landscapes and wind should be considered.

Brian McGuire said the site is remote and having some tall buildings out toward the edge of the site makes sense. He said high story units can earn a premium and pay for public amenities. He said there is too much emphasis on space for cars along Alaska Basin and they should be moved to the other side of the buildings.

Anita Longoria said she wants to keep the buildings shorter.

President Knox White closed the public hearing.

Board Member Sullivan said a 25 story building is too big and out of context. She said she would prefer to see smaller buildings.

Board Member Köster said he was intrigued by the idea of the taller building with more open space. He said he agrees with the idea of increasing heights as they go toward the water. He said he would like to see Entrance Rd extended and a view corridor preserved. He said the 250 foot height limit is probably too tall for Alameda.

Board Member Zuppan said she has a problem with the idea of a 250 foot building trying to fit into the neighborhood. She said she would like to see the heights lower on the Fortmann Marina side to prevent shadow impacts on the boats. She said she was concerned that the road layout would create hard wind corridors. She said she is supportive of having the taller buildings out towards the end as long as they are set back far enough. She said she would lean towards lower buildings with less open space.

Board Member Mitchell said he did not think a 250 foot building is in character for Alameda. He said he could support stepping the heights up as they go out on the project. He said putting the large road between the buildings and the boardwalk would be a lost opportunity.

Board Member Henneberry said the 250 foot tower is probably a non-starter. He said he was otherwise in favor of shrinking the building footprints to get more open space.

President Knox White said he would like to see some bike infrastructure in the plan the next time the project comes forward. He said he does not see a 250 foot building getting approved. He said he is concerned with connecting the project with the neighborhood. He said there are too many roads on the site and would not like to see townhomes because they conflict with the City's transportation and universal design goals..

8. MINUTES

8-A 2016-3036

Draft Meeting Minutes - March 28, 2016

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to approve the minutes. Board Member Sullivan seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0 (Henneberry recused, not in attendance).

9. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS

Moved to beginning of meeting

10. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

None

11. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS

None

12. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

None

13. ADJOURNMENT

President Knox White adjourned the meeting at 11:34pm.