



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING  
OF THE  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA  
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 11, 2017**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m. by Board Vice President Marguerite Malloy.

**2. ROLL CALL:**

**PRESENT:** Vice President Marguerite Malloy, Members John Nolan, Jan Brandt, Troy Hosmer

**ABSENT:** President Dean Batchelor

**STAFF PRESENT:** Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director and Executive Secretary to the Board  
Chris Low, Senior Human Resources Analyst  
Robin Young, Senior Human Resources Analyst  
Monica Alvarez-Selles, Human Resources Analyst II  
Sabina Netto, Human Resources Analyst II  
Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Analyst I  
Alan Cohen, Assistant City Attorney II  
Captain Don Owyang, Alameda Police Department

**3. MINUTES:**

**3-A Approval of Minutes of the Regular meeting of October 5, 2016.**

Vice President Malloy noted correction to the vote count for motions to approve Sections 4-A-i, 4-A-ii, 4-A-iii on page four (4), section 4-A-iv with the exception of the Energy Resource Analyst, Substation Technician and Crime Prevention specialist, and section 5-A, 5-B, 5-C, 5-D, 5-E and 5F, votes were incorrectly listed as 3-0 and should be corrected to 4-0.

Vice President Malloy asked for clarification on page four of the October 5, 2016 minutes,

under Section 4-A-iv, she suggested a correction to be made to correct her statement as, "...wanted to understand *the reason* for the new specification."

Vice President Malloy asked for clarification on page four of the October 5, 2016 minutes, under Section 5-F, she suggested a correction to be made to correct her statement as, "...their place which can happen if you open a *new exam*."

**Member Nolan moved that the October 5, 2016 Minutes be approved with correction. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt which was passed by a 4-0 vote.**

#### 4. **CONSENT CALENDAR:**

#### **4-A. SUMMARY REPORT FOR EXAMINATION ELIGIBLE LISTS AND CLASSIFICATIONS FOR JANUARY 11, 2017**

<b>4-A-i. ELIGIBLE LIST ESTABLISHED</b> (September 1, 2016 – November 30, 2016)	<b>DATE ESTABLISHED</b>	<b>EXAM NO.</b>
Customer Service Representative	09/19/2016	2016-50
Financial Services Manager	09/29/2016	2016-43
Administrative Technician II	10/10/2016	2016-46
Firefighter (continuation of 2014-34)	10/17/2016	2016-61
Maintenance Worker I (designated from 2016-19)	10/18/2016	2016-60
Accountant I	11/15/2016	2016-44
Accountant II	11/21/2016	2016-45
Associate Civil Engineer	11/21/2016	2016-40
Fire Captain	11/22/2016	2016-34
Custodian	11/28/2016	2016-53
Police Officer		
Anderson, Dominic	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Batta, Rame	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Crawford, Bradley	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
De Claro, Neil	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Hassan, Abraham	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Jericoff, Michael	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Knight, Emily	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Ringle-Baker, Nicholas	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Sklar, Jacob	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Vierra, Jacob	10/19/2016	2016-26PTc
Prado, Noel	10/19/2016	2016-28c
Reinhardt, Alan	10/19/2016	2016-28c
Schanen, Ryan	10/26/2016	2016-26PTc
Johnston, Brenden	10/26/2016	2016-26PTc
McQuade, Mason	10/26/2016	2016-29PTc
Montalvo, Kayla	10/26/2016	2016-26PTc
Rivera, Roland	10/26/2016	2016-28c
Callahan, Garrett	10/26/2016	2016-28c
Nguyen, Lai	10/26/2016	2016-28c
Arana, Daniel	10/26/2016	2016-28c

Ang, Andrew  
 Orduno, Ryan

10/26/2016  
 10/26/2016

2016-28c  
 2016-30PTc

#### **4-A-ii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXTENDED**

#### **DATE ESTABLISHED**

#### **EXAM NO.**

Redevelopment Project Manager	10/20/2015	2015-12
Division Chief	10/23/2015	2015-16PR
Human Resources Manager	11/02/2015	2015-70
City Engineer	03/03/2016	2016-02
Librarian	04/05/2016	2016-09
Fire/Building Code Compliance Officer	05/31/2016	2016-16

#### **4-A-iii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXPIRED/ CANCELLED/EXHAUSTED**

#### **DATE ESTABLISHED**

#### **EXAM NO.**

Paralegal	03/04/2015	2015-03
Assistant General Manager – Engineering & Operations	07/21/2015	2015-23
Public Works Manager II	08/05/2015	2015-34
Utility Geographic Information Systems Analyst	08/20/2015	2015-26
Deputy City Clerk	09/02/2015	2015-54
Traffic Signal Maintenance Technician	10/13/2015	2015-60
Administrative Technician II	10/21/2015	2015-67
Senior Clerk	11/03/2015	2015-72
Public Relations Officer	11/10/2015	2015-37
Permit Technician	11/24/2015	2015-82
Electrical Distribution Technician	02/24/2016	2015-79
Administrative Technician II	03/02/2016	2015-81a
Management Analyst	03/17/2016	2016-17
Park Maintenance Foreperson	03/28/2016	2016-07
Utility Construction Compliance Specialist	04/28/2016	2016-01
Combination Building Inspector	05/03/2016	2016-15
Public Safety IT Systems Coordinator	05/31/2016	2016-20

#### **4-A-iv. LIST OF SPECIFICATIONS**

##### **Existing Classification Specification Revision:**

- Engineering Manager
- Substation Technician

##### **New Classification Specifications:**

- Crime Prevention Technician

**Member Brandt moved to approve Consent Calendar items 4-A-i, 4-A-ii, and 4-A-iii. Motion was seconded by Member Nolan which was passed by a 4-0 vote.**

Vice President Malloy requested to pull item 4-A-iv for further discussion. Vice President Malloy first asked for comments or questions on Classification Specification Revisions for Engineering Manager and Substation Technician. Member Nolan stated that he had questions regarding the Engineering Manager. Member Nolan requested clarification on

the specification including whether the classification was for Manager or Supervisor and

the number of people currently in the classification. Senior Human Resources Analyst, Chris Low responded that the classification is being revised and retitled from Engineering Supervisor to Engineering Manager and that there is only one position in the classification. Human Resources Director Bronstein added that the position is currently vacant. Member Nolan expressed confusion as to the numerous mentions of supervising in the specification for a manager. Member Nolan believed the emphasis should be on the management rather than the supervision duties of the position. Human Resources Director Bronstein suggested altering the specification to place emphasis on managing rather than supervising.

Vice President Malloy interjected attempting to clarify Member Nolan's question asking the number of reports to the Engineering Manager position and to which classification the reports would belong and whether the Engineering Manager would be solely responsible for the evaluation of those reports. Senior Human Resources Analyst, Chris Low clarified that reports to the Engineering Manager will be differing levels of professionals, including electrical engineering staff, as well as, paraprofessional computer drafters and that performance evaluations will be split between the Engineering Manager and most likely the Senior Electrical Engineer.

Vice President Malloy and Member Nolan agreed that management includes supervision. Vice President Malloy emphasized the importance of understanding the primary function of the position; whether it be management of process, procedures, and functions or whether it be supervision of people, from the specification and that the specification was not clear in this respect. Chris Low clarified that the Engineering Manager's primary function is managing the electrical engineering function and that its secondary function is supervision.

Member Nolan also asked for clarification on the requirements for the Engineering Manager specification. Member Nolan asked for clarification whether requirements other than registration as a professional engineer, such as certificates, would be required. Senior Human Resources Analyst Chris Low responded that the primary requirement for the classification is registration as a professional engineer, however, other requirements may be desired at the time of recruitment but that none were now required also clarifying that this revised specification will result in a recruitment not a reclassification as the position is currently vacant. Vice President Malloy suggested the re-examination of the use of the term supervise in the specification, as well as, the addition of "or management" after "supervisory capacity" under employment standards, in order to open it up recruitment for those applicants with more varied experience. With the suggested changes the board approved the Engineering Manager revision and did not need to see further revisions.

Vice President Malloy asked for comments or questions on Substation Technician Specification. Member Brandt called attention to a correction from the October 5, 2016 meeting minutes that had not been incorporated into the specification revision. Human

Resources Director Bronstein apologized and both she and Chris Low stated that the changes will be incorporated. The Substation Technician specification was approved with the proposed amendment.

Vice President Malloy then began a discussion of the Crime Prevention Technician specification expressing her appreciation for Robin Young's work putting together the e-mail describing the questions posed by the Civil Service Board at the October 5, 2016 meeting. Vice President Malloy found the e-mail very responsive to the Board's especially in allowing the department to respond to the Board's specific questions. Member Brandt also expressed her appreciation for the e-mail addressing the Board's questions and had no further concern or comment. Member Nolan, though finding the email helpful, asked for clarification regarding education and experience requirements as described in the specification.

Member Nolan noted that of the four agencies surveyed in conjunction with creating the Crime Prevention Specification, only one required education beyond a high school diploma. Member Nolan was concerned that the additional experience required by the new Crime Prevention Technician specification would deter otherwise excellent candidates from applying. Vice President Malloy responded to Member Nolan's concern stating that applicants are generally not deterred from applying for lack of required or desired education or experience and that from her experience she did not believe that applicants would be deterred from applying if they believed they were capable of doing the job regardless of the requirements.

Senior Human Resources Analyst Robin Young added that, from a testing perspective, additional education, experience or certificates deemed desirable but not required are useful in screening and identifying the best qualified candidates from recruitments that receive large numbers of applicants. Robin Young went on to explain that a two year degree, if in a subject related to criminal justice or crime prevention or something specific to the nature of the job, would be a reasonable way to screen applicants. Member Nolan asked if colleges offer two year degrees in crime prevention as opposed to just police officer courses and whether a certificate is available in crime prevention. Senior Human Resources Analyst Robin Young explained that there is a certificate available through a professional association but was not aware of a certificate through college course work. She further emphasized that lack of two years of college course work or lack of the certificate would not exclude applicants.

**Member Brandt moved to approve Consent Calendar item 4-A-iv with the recommended amendments and changes. Motion was seconded by Member Nolan which was passed by a 4-0 vote.**

5. **REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

**5-A. Activity Report – Period of September 1, 2016 through November 30, 2016**

**FULL-TIME HIRES**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
09/06/16	AMP	Facilities Maintenance Worker
09/13/16	AMP	Utilities Database Analyst
09/18/16	Fire	Firefighter Assigned to Civil Service Position from Safer
10/03/16	Fire	Firefighter (Safer) X 3
10/03/16	Human Resources	Administrative Technician II
10/03/16	Community Development	Administrative Technician I
10/16/16	Police	Police Officer
10/17/16	AMP	Customer Service Representative
10/17/16	Information Technology	IT Services Coordinator
10/17/16	Finance	Intermediate Clerk
10/24/16	Police	Maintenance Worker I
11/14/16	Public Works	Intermediate Clerk

**PROMOTIONS**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
09/18/16	Fire	Apparatus Operator
09/18/16	Fire	Administrative Technician III
09/18/16	Police	Police Lieutenant
09/29/16	Public Works	Project Manager I
10/02/16	Police	Police Sergeant
10/03/16	Public Works	Public Works Supervisor

**RETIREMENTS**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
10/13/16	Police	Administrative Technician II
10/13/16	Police	Police Records Supervisor

**SEPARATIONS**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
09/01/16	Recreation & Parks	Custodian
09/03/16	AMP	General Manager
09/08/16	Human Resources	Administrative Technician II
09/18/16	AMP	Engineering Supervisor
10/14/16	AMP	Utility Construction Compliance Specialist
11/07/16	Police	Police Officer
11/15/16	Police	Police Officer

**5-B. Informational Report, October 13, 2016, Regarding Designation of Eligible List – Maintenance Worker II, 2016-19 for Maintenance Worker I vacancy, PW.2510.006**

Member Nolan questioned the reason for the designation of the Maintenance Worker II eligible list expressing a concern that the designation process was not being used for “cherry picking.” Human Resources Director Bronstein responded to this concern and informed the board that the designation was due to the existence of a Maintenance Worker II eligible list and a lack of a Maintenance Worker I list. The board was satisfied with the explanation provided.

**5-C. Informational Reports,**

**December 21, 2016, Acknowledgement of Administrative Assignment – Patrick Corder**

**December 21, 2016, Acknowledgement of Administrative Assignment – Armondo Baldizan**

Member Nolan requested clarification on 5-C, how those in an administrative assignment are paid for their Holidays. Senior Human Resources Analyst Robin Young explained that as a fire fighter in a suppression assignment, fighting fires, are eligible for holiday-in-lieu pay which is a percentage of their base pay and every bi-weekly pay period. However, when a firefighter is moved into an administrative assignment they no longer receive the holiday-in-lieu pay and instead are awarded a prorated amount of the holidays remaining in the year. Human Resources Director Bronstein further explained that firefighters in an administrative assignment receive the holiday hours to use to take the holiday off.

**6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA (PUBLIC COMMENTS)**

(Any person may address the Civil Service Board in regard to any matter over which the Civil Service Board has jurisdiction or of which it may take cognizance that is not on the agenda).

**7. CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF)**

HR Director Bronstein informed the board of the birth of Nafisah Ali’s third child and introduced two new Human Resources Analysts, Sabina Netto and Jessica Romeo who were unable to attend the October 5, 2016 meeting due to a training.

**8. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING**

The next Civil Service Board meeting was confirmed for April 5, 2017 at 5:00 PM.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting was adjourned at 5:25p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to be 'Nancy Bronstein', written over a horizontal line.

Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director  
and  
Executive Secretary to the Civil Service Board