

APPROVED MINUTES  
SPECIAL MEETING OF THE  
CITY OF ALAMEDA PLANNING BOARD  
MONDAY, JULY 17, 2017

1. CONVENE

President Koster convened the meeting at 7:02pm

2. FLAG SALUTE

Board Member Sullivan led the flag salute.

3. ROLL CALL

Present: President Köster, Board Members Curtis, Mitchell, Sullivan. Absent: Board Member Burton.

4. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

President Köster said the board elections may be moved to the end of the meeting, pending Board Member Burton's arrival.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

**\*None\***

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

**\*None\***

7. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

**7-A 2017-4568**

Encinal Terminals Environmental Impact Report, Draft Master Plan, General Plan Amendment and Development Agreement. Applicant: North Waterfront Cove, LLC. Public Hearing to consider the Master Plan, Density Bonus application, General Plan Amendment, and Development Agreement for the redevelopment of the Encinal Terminals property located at 1521 Buena Vista Avenue. (APN 72-0382-001, -002, and 72-0383-03)The properties are zoned MX (Mixed Use) and MF (Multifamily Residential). A Focused Supplemental Environmental Impact Report has been prepared for the project pursuant to California Environmental Quality Act

Staff Member Thomas gave a presentation on the staff recommendation. The staff report and attachments can be found at:

<https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3099766&GUID=7C55F667-E01A-4538-A431-6F2D68F32FBB&FullText=1>

Board Member Sullivan asked if BCDC would still require the perimeter to be open space if no Tidelands swap were executed.

Staff Member Thomas said we would be likely to get a 15-20 foot shoreline path, but not 7 acres with 100 feet of open space around the water.

Board Member Sullivan asked who would be responsible for dredging a new marina at the site.

Staff Member Thomas said that would be an issue to be dealt with when the marina lease is set up. He said the site does not presently have much need for dredging.

Board Member Zuppan asked for clarification on which documents governs various open space and public access requirements if there is a conflict.

Staff Member Thomas said they tried to minimize overlap of issues and eliminate conflicts between documents.

Board Member Zuppan asked if the money that might have been available for a water shuttle has been allocated for acquiring the Pennzoil property, and if so, what the thinking was for that.

Staff Member Thomas explained the transit funding sources and plans the project will provide. He said the General Plan identifies the Pennzoil parcel as the priority in order to complete Clement Ave and move the truck route.

Board Member Curtis asked how we can approve a development agreement without the phasing set.

Staff Member Thomas said there is no financial risk to the City. He said they cannot start building until they get a phasing plan approved. He said there is a detailed phasing plan, but they preserved flexibility in case the state requires a different phasing plan.

Board Member Knox White asked what the benefit is of going above the 60 foot height limit in the General Plan.

Staff Member Thomas said they did not want every building to look the same. He said you could get 589 units within the 60 foot height limit, but every building would be 5-6 story squares and not step down toward the water.

Board Member Knox White asked about a section in the plan that seems to allow the developer to go higher than the limit if they have more or less commercial space. He did not understand why they would need to go higher if they put in less commercial.

Staff Member Thomas said that they might have situations that all parties want to approve a building that does not exactly meet the master plan and wanted to be able to have the planning board approve that without requiring a master plan amendment.

Mike O'Hara, Tim Lewis Communities, gave a presentation on the master plan.

Board Member Knox White asked if the road along the promenade that connects with Clement would allow private vehicles to pass through.

Mr. O'Hara said they plan to limit through access to emergency vehicles only.

Board Member Sullivan asked where marina users would park.

Mr. O'Hara said there would be a loading zone and parking would be in the structures of the buildings.

President Köster asked what s the current condition of the piers.

Mr. O'Hara said there is a timber portion of the wharf that would be removed and the rest of the piles will be rehabilitated for mixed use.

Board Member Mitchell asked if the quantity of electric vehicle parking at each location is defined.

Mr. O'Hara said that those details would be left for the design review phase.

Board Member Zuppan asked if "purple pipe" for water recapture is included in the plan.

Mr. O'Hara said there are a number of ways to achieve different LEED certifications and they are supportive but did not prescribe what elements would be included.

Board Member Zuppan asked how they could evaluate the tradeoff of a tall building with more open space if the design review does not happen until the last phase.

Mr. O'Hara said that each design review application would be accompanied by a report on how all the other phases are progressing and how they are falling within the unit ranges.

President Köster asked if the traffic light would still be required at Entrance Rd. and Buena Vista.

Mr. O'Hara said that once the truck route on Clement is complete, the Buena Vista and Entrance Road intersection would not require a traffic signal.

President Köster asked if there would be a vehicular drop off area for the water taxi.

Mr. O'Hara said they would need to look at that as the detailed plans progress.

President Köster opened the public hearing.

Cristin Sullivan expressed concern about safety for residents during construction. She expressed concern over being able to support all the retail development. She said she supports adding housing in Alameda to address affordability.

Dorothy Freeman read a news quote cautioning against setting the precedent of allowing very tall buildings. She said tall buildings belong in Oakland. She said the residential mix was too high and wanted more commercial space and fewer units.

Rachele Trigueros, Bay Area Council, said they endorse the project because of the housing crisis. She said the state is not building the number of units required to keep up with job growth.

Kari Thompson, Chamber of Commerce, urged the board to support the project.

Michael McDonough, Chamber of Commerce, said this project will lead to the beautification of the northern waterfront. He said he was excited to see the project happen.

Beth Kenny, Chair of the Commission on Disability Issues, expressed concern about the visitability and universal design requirements are not consistent with the ordinance the board recently recommended. She asked the board to not approve the universal design section of the plan.

Christopher Buckley asked that the 60 foot height limit be maintained. He said a 160 foot height limit would open a Pandora's Box in Alameda. He asked for clarification on how many areas might be allowed to have tall buildings.

Ken Levins said he did not see any facilities for liveaboards. He said the tall building could take away his view of Oakland. He said Clement is not a well-designed truck route. He said he did not see any spaces for vehicles with trailers that might use the marina.

Meredith Levins said there are no red curbs on her street which is supposed to be a fire lane which makes it impossible for emergency vehicles to pass and for them to exit their driveway. She asked that the city put in accountability in the plan for things like parking and enforcement.

Eric Embry said adding 589 units on top of Del Monte might be more than the neighborhood can handle. He said Clement does not make sense as a truck route. He

said Marina Shores did not help with the housing crisis. He suggested waiting to see how Del Monte goes before moving forward with this plan.

John Platt said Del Monte fits Alameda but a 14 story building does not fit. He said the traffic on Sherman is already bad before any units are built. He said the quality of life on the island is going down.

Lisa said they purchased a home in Alameda because of the small town feel. She said it takes 30 minutes to get off and on the island. She said there will be too many people and not enough parking. She asked why the truck route would be on a waterfront street. She said there is no solution to traffic, school overcrowding, hospitals, and animal shelters.

Bill Smith said he is excited about the project. He said there will be growing pains, but not having housing is real misery, not just inconvenience. He said he likes the 14 story building.

Laura Thomas, Renewed Hope, thanked the board for their hard work. She said they support the project. She said they would like to see a higher percentage of affordable units in such a large project.

Teresa Ruiz said they are excited to see these underutilized sites move forward. She said we can solve transportation problems with incentives but cannot solve the housing problem without building more housing. She encouraged higher bedroom count units to support families that need housing.

Karen Bey said there is a lot to like about the project, including the 14 story tower. She said it is an appropriate place to build. She wanted to make sure the ferry is very important to make sure is funded.

Alan Pryor said trucks and traffic have been a big part of our history. He said we need places for people to live that are affordable.

Angela Hockabout, Alameda Home Team, said we need every unit to help address the housing shortage. She said the discomfort from traffic and tall buildings is nothing compared to the suffering of folks without stable housing. She said opposing new housing for aesthetic reason is oppressive. She urged approval of the project.

President Köster closed the public hearing.

Board Member Knox White asked who approves the density bonus.

Staff Member Thomas said the density bonus is embedded in the master plan.

Board Member Knox White said the application is not included and asked if they can discuss the merits of the project without the density bonus application.

Staff Member Thomas said the requirement is to show that the 491 unit base project is feasible for the density bonus, but they are not asking for any waivers like some projects have.

Board Member Knox White asked for clarification about the project's universal design requirements.

Staff Member Thomas said that 80% of the project would be visitable. The 20% that are townhomes would not meet that standard. He said the draft ordinance on universal design requires 100% visitability, but allows for developers to apply for waivers for townhomes.

Board Member Sullivan asked what data we have to show the impacts of TDM on the "substantial and unavoidable" traffic impacts.

Staff Member Thomas said we can't build a new bridge and we can't say no to new housing. He said we have to be more efficient with our transportation space. He said we are working on increasing transit services.

Board Member Mitchell said that 589 units, when compared with the size of the city, is a modest amount. He said he likes the revitalized Park St., even though it is hard to park there. He said he likes the flexibility in the plan, the access to the water, additional affordable housing, down payment assistance, and public art funds. He said he appreciates the mixed use of the site and is okay with the building heights in the plan. He said he would like to move forward tonight.

Board Member Curtis said we might consider that 589 units is too many for the site. He said he is against the 90 foot height level. He said the parking is inadequate. He said he cannot vote for the project.

Board Member Sullivan said she is opposed to the project as designed. She said the project is jam packed with units. She said she is disappointed in the universal design elements of the plan. She said she does not support the 90 foot tower. She said traffic and parking are issues and we should not build this many units.

Board Member Zuppan said she thinks we are striking a good balance because people on both sides are unhappy with parts of the project. She said we should make sure there is access for vehicles with boat trailers. She said we should limit the number of compact parking spaces on the site. She said she liked the suggestion of making sure we have more two and three bedroom units. She said we should make sure that pets are allowed in these buildings. She said she would like the potential height waiver to only apply to the

one corner of the site. She said we need to require energy and water conservation in the project. She said rentals and affordable units are the most likely ones to require universal design elements and some of these items should be required up front. She said the reduced cost transit passes should be available to more residents. She said she would like the landscaping to be part of design review. She said she agreed with the speakers who said Clement is a bad place for a truck route. She said the line 19 is at double the expected ridership and still parking problems, which means there is something wrong with our transportation models. She said we should have flexibility for residents to leave their cars someplace safe so they can use transit. She suggested making the parking stalls tall enough to allow stacked parking. She suggested tying the ferry dock to something more concrete to make sure that transportation infrastructure is built earlier in the project.

Board Member Knox White said he is not inclined to approve a 14 story building at this time. He said the exception to the height limit should only apply to sub-area F, increases the planned commercial square feet, and is architecturally exceptional. He said the design review exception needs to have some benefit to the community beyond just a nice tower. He said we should include construction updates and schedules be released every six months. He said we should require liveaboard facilities to be addressed in design review. He said he agreed with Board Member Zuppan about the universal design review issues. He said he would like to see the language of the draft universal design ordinance included in the agreement. He said he would like to have the density bonus application included when the plan goes to council. He said there are dozens of empty parking spaces around Littlejohn Park every night. He said we can build to support cars or build to support bikes and transit.

President Köster said we are in housing crisis mode and these units are badly needed. He said he likes that the units in this development would be smaller and inherently more affordable. He said he would like to see the project meet the universal design elements.

Staff Member Thomas said a potential recommendation would be to approve the master plan with the following additional recommendations to council and staff: eliminate 4b and expand the height limit exception to only apply to site F if the design is exceptional and there is an increase in the amount of commercial; six month construction plans noticed to the public; the density bonus application be included with the proposal that goes to the city council; the master plan include design review for boat trailer access, liveaboard facilities, limits on compact spaces, landscaping for open space and private will come to design review; include a distribution of larger bedroom units; provisions to allow pets; meet the standards of the draft universal design ordinance and allow waiver applications during design review if necessary; allow households to purchase more transit passes if needed; encourage council to examine the phasing requirements for the water shuttle as well as drop off access for the water shuttle.

Staff Member Thomas addressed the two members who stated their opposition to the plan. He said the city legally cannot say there are too many units. He said if there are other items that they had issue with in the plan that they could try and address with amendments they could raise them now.

Board Member Curtis said staff is saying that the state says if you can stuff that many units on the site there is nothing you can do. He said there are other mitigating concerns that he owes the public. He said the parking is an issue and accommodating the weekend visitors will be a problem. He said the Pasta Pelican is going broke because of their parking problems. He said the design can be improved and there is not enough parking, and that is the basis for his vote.

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to extend the meeting to 11:15pm. Board Member Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion passed 6-0.

Board Member Knox White asked if they would be able to hear other items given that they did not make a motion at 10:30pm.

Staff Attorney Penick said they would not be able to hear additional items tonight.

Board Member Zuppan asked how hard it would be to come back after the first phase to add parking.

Staff Member Thomas said they could amend the plan, or they could include a condition that allows changes at the design review phase if certain conditions are met.

Board Member Zuppan said she would like to include that flexibility in the plan.

Board Member Mitchell and President Köster said they would be supportive of the amendment.

Board Member Knox White said if we want to define what the problem is to trigger such a clause, he could be supportive. *He described a parking occupancy study that could give the board or the developer to amend the parking levels of future phases.*

**Board Member Knox White made a motion to approve the staff recommendation with the changes listed (above, in italics, underlined) by Staff Member Thomas plus the parking occupancy study that could trigger a review of parking requirements. Board Member Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-2 (Curtis, Sullivan).**

<skip to item 8. Minutes>



## **7-B Board Elections**

Board Member Knox White nominated Board Mitchell to serve as President. Board Member Curtis seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

Board Member Curtis nominated Board Member Sullivan to be Vice President. Board Member Zuppan seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

## **7-C 2017-4572**

Zoning Amendment - Affordable Housing. Applicant: City of Alameda. The Planning Board will hold a Public Hearing to consider zoning amendments related to Affordable Housing. The project is categorically exempt from further review under the California Environmental Quality Act pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15332 In-Fill Development Projects. Staff is requesting this item be continued to July 24, 2017

**\*continued\***

## **8. MINUTES 2017-4564**

Draft Meeting Minutes - May 8, 2017

Board Member Sullivan made a motion to approve the minutes. Board Member Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

## **2017-4565**

Draft Meeting Minutes - May 22, 2017

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to approve the minutes. Board Member Curtis seconded the motion.

Board Member Curtis asked to add (on page 4 of 9) "Curtis said he would vote for the revised plan as long as staff forwarded his recommendation for informational purposes that a bond could be put up to secure the development of phase 3." He said the information was not included in the presentation to City Council.

Board Member Zuppan moved to amend the motion to include the amendment. Board Member Curtis seconded the amendment. The motion passed 6-0-1 (Sullivan abstained).

Board Member Zuppan made a motion to extend the meeting to 11:30pm. Board Member Curtis seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.

**<return to item 7-B>**

## **9. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS 9-A 2017-4566**

Approved Minutes  
July 17, 2017  
Planning Board Meeting

Zoning Administrator and Design Review Recent Actions and Decisions  
Staff Member Thomas gave a report (unintelligible).

10. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

**\*None\***

11. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS

**11-A 2017-4567**

Subcommittee for Alameda Marina

**\*None\***

Board Member Knox White thanked President Köster for his service as President and said a potential goodbye to the board and staff.

Board Member Zuppan said it was a pleasure to serve on the board.

All board members thanked the outgoing board members.

12. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

**\*None\***

13. ADJOURNMENT

President Köster adjourned the meeting at 11:17pm.