



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING  
OF THE  
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA  
WEDNESDAY, April 4, 2018**

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 5:06 p.m. by President Dean Batchelor.

**2. ROLL CALL:**

**PRESENT:** President Dean Batchelor, Vice President Marguerite Malloy, Members Jan Brandt, John Nolan, Human Resources Director and Executive Secretary of the Civil Service Board, Nancy Bronstein

**ABSENT:** Member Troy Hosmer

**STAFF PRESENT:** Robin Young, Senior Human Resources Analyst  
Sabina Netto, Human Resources Analyst II  
Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Analyst I  
Steven Woo, Human Resources Analyst I  
Nafisah Ali, Administrative Technician II

**3. MINUTES:**

**Approval of Minutes of the Regular meeting of January 3, 2018.**

**President Batchelor moved to accept the January 3, 2018 Minutes. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt which was passed by a 3-0 vote (Batchelor – Abstained).**

**4. CONSENT CALENDAR:**

**4-A. SUMMARY REPORT FOR EXAMINATION ELIGIBLE LISTS AND  
CLASSIFICATIONS FOR OCTOBER 18, 2017**

<b>4-A-i. ELIGIBLE LIST ESTABLISHED</b>	<b>DATE ESTABLISHED</b>	<b>EXAM NO.</b>
<b>(December 1, 2017 – February 28, 2018)</b>		

Apprentice Electrical Maintenance Technician	12/04/2017	2017-7790-02
Apprentice Lineworker	01/17/2018	2017-7785-02
Assistant General Manager-Engineering & Operations	01/11/2018	2017-7060-01 (02)
City Engineer	01/31/2018	2017-3180-01
Deputy Public Works Director	12/04/2017	2017-2601-01
Division Chief	12/04/2017	2017-4550-01
Electrical Maintenance Technician	12/11/2017	2017-7770-01
Engineering Manager	12/15/2017	2017-7200-01
Fleet Mechanic	02/13/2018	2017-2360-01
Library Technician	12/18/2017	2017-3515-01
Management Analyst (Community Development Analyst)	01/29/2018	2017-1420-02
Park Maintenance Supervisor	02/15/2018	2018-5144-01
Permit Technician II	02/28/2018	2018-3270-01
Police Records Supervisor	12/01/2017	2017-4065-01
Public Works Coordinator	01/08/2018	2017-2605-01
Senior Building Code Compliance Officer	01/29/2018	2017-3246-01
Senior Librarian	01/02/2018	2017-3540-01
System Operator Trainee	02/09/2018	2017-7761-01

Police Officer

Aquilar, Erick	01/18/2018	2017-4057-02
Bardosh, Mark	01/11/2018	2017-4040-01
Beza, Benjamin	01/18/2018	2017-4040-01
Bhardwaj, Rajiv	01/11/2018	2017-4057-02
Buchanan, Tyrone	12/21/2017	2017-4040-01
Caughey, Dylan	12/21/2017	2017-4057-02
Conn, Jacob	12/21/2017	2017-4057-02
Drexler, Nic	02/08/2018	2017-4057-02
Hagemann, Matthew	01/24/2018	2017-4057-02
Hansen III, Robert	01/11/2018	2017-4057-02
Hawks-Garcia, Steven	12/21/2017	2017-4040-01
Jensen, Jarred Michal	12/21/2017	2017-4057-02
Jimenez, Luis	02/26/2018	2017-4040-01
Kim, Peter	02/26/2018	2017-4040-01
Lambert, Patrick	02/26/2018	2017-4040-01
Licari, Joseph	01/11/2018	2017-4057-02
Lomanto, Dylan	12/21/2017	2017-4057-02
Maurer, Nika	12/18/2017	2017-4057-02
McKinley, Eric	01/11/2018	2017-4057-02
Nelson, Brian	02/08/2018	2017-4057-02
Ortega, Juan	01/18/2018	2017-4057-02
Overton, Stefan	12/18/2017	2017-4057-02
Pacht, William	12/18/2017	2017-4057-02
Poppe, Mason	01/24/2018	2017-4057-02
Powell, Caroline	12/18/2017	2017-4057-02
Reeves, Alicia	02/26/2018	2017-4057-02
Ruby, Anika	01/24/2018	2017-4057-02
Saengsourith, Mory	01/18/2018	2017-4040-01
Sequiera, Michelle	01/24/2018	2017-4057-02
Singh, Manpreet	02/08/2018	2017-4057-02
Smith, Eric	12/21/2017	2017-4057-02
Smith, Jonathan	12/05/2017	2017-4057-02
Stanton, Randall	02/08/2018	2017-4057-02

Tran, Raina-pham	12/18/2017	2017-4057-02
Troy, Courtney	01/18/2018	2017-4057-02
Vasquez, Rafael	02/08/2018	2017-4057-02
Venikov, Joseph	01/18/2018	2017-4040-01
Witt, Maurice,	01/24/2018	2017-4057-02
Brown, Austin	02/26/2018	2017-4057-02
Yi, Jonathan	02/26/2018	2017-4040-01

#### **4-A-ii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXTENDED**

#### **DATE ESTABLISHED**

#### **EXAM NO**

Accounting Technician	01/23/2017	2016-62
Assistant General Manager – ERP	09/19/2017	2017-7056-01
Energy Resources Analyst	12/27/2017	2016-49
Fire Apparatus Operator	07/07/2016	2015-21PR
Gardener	06/28/2017	2017-21
Human Resources Analyst I	06/28/2017	2017-22
Intermediate Clerk	07/14/2016	2016-22
Police Lieutenant	08/29/2016	2016-33PR
Program Specialist II - Clean Water Program	01/23/2017	2016-52
Public Works Supervisor – Sewers & Stormwater	08/30/2017	2017-2650-01

#### **4-A-iii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXPIRED/ CANCELLED/EXHAUSTED**

#### **DATE ESTABLISHED**

#### **EXAM NO**

Administrative Technician I	01/04/2016	2015-89
Animal Control Officer	02/16/2017	2017-02
Assistant City Attorney II - Land	08/16/2017	2017-26
Assistant City Attorney II – Rent	12/05/2016	2016-54
Construction Inspection & Survey Supervisor	11/16/2017	2017-3080-01
Crime Prevention Technician	06/29/2017	2017-20
Electrical Maintenance Technician	12/11/2017	2017-7770-01
Police Sergeant	01/19/2016	2015-71PR
Public Safety Dispatcher – Lateral/Graduate/Attendee	03/06/2017	2017-03
Public Works Coordinator	01/08/2018	2017-2605-01
Senior Librarian	01/02/2018	2017-3540-01

#### **4-A-iv. LIST OF SPECIFICATIONS**

##### **Existing Classification Specification Revision:**

- None

##### **New Classification Specifications:**

- Fire Information and Billing Systems Specialist

**Vice President Malloy moved to approve Consent Calendar items 4-A-i, 4-A-ii, and 4-A-iii. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt, which was passed by a 4-0 vote.** Item under section 4-A-iv was pulled for further discussion. Vice President Malloy asked if anyone has filled this position before. Senior Analyst Young answered that this classification resulted per the request from the Fire Department to conduct a class study of a current incumbent who may have been working outside the scope of their job. The

study was conducted by an outside consultant and they concluded there was not a classification within the City that covers the work being performed. The current incumbent would be reclassified to the new classification. Vice President Malloy preferred to change "conduct audits" listed under example of duties #3 because it implies they are auditing themselves. Senior Analyst Young clarified that most of the data that is being audited are entered by those out in the field such as Paramedics. It was agreed to change the term that will clarify what the incumbent will actually be doing.

Member Brandt asked how "enthusiastic" listed under abilities, will be defined. Senior Analyst Young responded that perhaps a more appropriate word would be "positive" and will update the specifications to reflect the change. Member Brandt asked how years of work experience will equate to the two years of college coursework. Senior Analyst Young answered that subject matter experts will help review if the applicant has the technology experience to succeed in the position. The experience and education is written to capture those who may not have the education but have worked in the industry to gain the qualifications.

President Batchelor asked if the current incumbent travels to the other fire stations. Senior Analyst Young answered the incumbent resides in Fire Station 1 which is the administrative building with occasional travel to other stations. President Batchelor asked how the employee would get around if the job description requires potential after-hour response but a valid driver's license is only required at the time of appointment. Senior Analyst Young answered that there are options such as Uber or taxi cab and that the requirement is the ability to get to another location and not necessarily being able to drive a vehicle.

**Vice President Malloy moved to accept the specifications listed on item 4-A-iv with the recommended changes. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt, which was passed by a 4-0 vote.**

## **5. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

### **5-A. Activity Report – Period of September 1, 2017 through November 30, 2017**

#### **FULL-TIME HIRES**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
12/05/17	Public Works	Maintenance Worker I
12/19/17	Public Works	Maintenance Worker I
12/20/17	Public Works	Maintenance Worker I
1/02/18	AMP	Executive Assistant
1/08/18	AMP	Utility Energy Analyst
1/08/18	Public Works	Assistant Engineer
1/08/18	AMP	Assistant General Manager- Energy Resources Planning
1/08/18	AMP	Electrical Maintenance Technician
1/08/18	Finance	Accountant I

1/08/18	Public Works	Construction Inspector
1/16/18	AMP	Apprentice Electrical Maintenance Technician
1/16/18	Information Technology	Information Technology Systems Analyst
1/22/18	Library	Library Technician
1/29/18	Base Reuse	Senior Transportation Coordinator
1/29/18	AMP	Electrical Maintenance Technician
2/05/18	AMP	Assistant General Manager – Engineering & Operations
2/05/18	Library	Library Technician
2/12/18	Police	Police Officer
2/12/18	Police	Police Officer
2/12/18	Police	Police Officer
2/20/18	Library	Librarian

### **CERTIFIED TO CIVIL SERVICE (FROM COMMUNITY PARAMEDICINE)**

2/18/18	Fire	Division Chief
---------	------	----------------

### **PROMOTIONS**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
12/10/17	Fire	Fire Captain
12/11/17	Police	Management Analyst
12/11/17	AMP	Senior Energy Resources Analyst
12/24/17	Public Works	Construction Inspection & Survey Supervisor
12/24/17	Fire	Fire Apparatus Operator
12/24/17	Public Works	Deputy Public Works Director
1/08/18	Base Reuse	Senior Transportation Coordinator
1/21/18	Police	Police Sergeant
1/22/18	Library	Senior Librarian
1/22/18	Public Works	Public Works Coordinator
2/05/18	AMP	Engineering Manager
2/18/18	Fire	Division Chief
2/18/18	Fire	Fire Captain

### **VOLUNTARY DEMOTION**

1/8/18	Police	Intermediate Clerk
--------	--------	--------------------

### **RETIREMENTS**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
12/15/17	AMP	Senior Utility Accountant
12/18/18	Fire	Fire Apparatus Operator
12/21/17	Fire	Division Chief
12/28/17	Library	Senior Librarian
12/28/17	Library	Library Technician

12/28/17	Fire	Fire Captain
12/30/17	AMP	Journey Lineworker
1/19/18	Library	Library Technician
2/01/18	Community Development	Administrative Services Coordinator

### **SEPARATIONS**

<b>DATE</b>	<b>DEPARTMENT</b>	<b>JOB CLASSIFICATION</b>
1/03/18	Police	Police Officer
1/25/18	Police	Police Officer
2/01/18	Public Works	City Engineer

**5-B. Informational Report, February 20, 2018, Regarding Application to Temporarily Vacate Civil Service Position:**  
- Christopher Marks

**5-C. Informational Report, February 20, 2018, Regarding Application to Return to Civil Service Position:**  
- Allyn Richterman

Vice President Malloy asked if the employees listed under section 5-B and 5-C are switching assignments. Senior HR Analyst Young answered that the movement of the employees is the result of a Division Chief retiring. The employee in the grant funded Division Chief position is moving into the Civil Service position and the other employee is being promoted into the grant funded Division Chief position. HR Director Bronstein added that employees are notified that those in grant funded positions depend on the availability of the grant. She added that the Civil Service process is still followed for grant funded positions. If the grant goes away, the employee has bumping rights to their previous position and a subsequent domino effect for the other employees.

**President Batchelor moved to accept 5A, 5B and 5C. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt, which was passed by a 4-0 vote.**

## **6. GENERAL DISCUSSION OF CIVIL SERVICE RULES**

### **6-A. Edits to Civil Service Rules**

HR Director Bronstein stated that HR went through the rules and tried to capture the changes mentioned in the previous meeting along with noting new changes and questions. She brought up the option of scheduling separate meetings specifically to discuss the Civil Service Rules. The Civil Service members agreed to see how far they will get during tonight's meeting and set extra meeting dates to discuss the Civil Service rules further possibly in May and June before the July Civil Service meeting. HR will follow up and send out possible dates and times.

It was agreed to start reviewing the document by skipping the definitions section until

they reach the end of the review to avoid going back and forth in updating the definitions.

Article I Section 2 – HR Director suggested adding another line to catch all identified protected class since the law changes continuously. Vice President Malloy suggested adding “....All statutorily protected statuses...” to capture various changes.

Vice President Malloy asked if the Civil Service Rules cover the concept of out-of-class pay. Senior HR Analyst Young responded that it is covered in most of the Memorandums of Understanding (MOU). Vice President Malloy suggested adding language in a section within Article VIII or IX referencing out-of-class pay to refer to the MOU especially for non-represented employees. HR Director Bronstein noted that the City has an administrative rule that allows for acting pay for non-represented employees. It was agreed as they review the document, they can find an appropriate section. Member Nolan asked if the term “y-rate” is still being used. HR Director Bronstein answered that term is no longer being used and all forms have been updated to say Acting and Additional Duties pay and would like to update the language in the MOUs as well.

Article V Section 4 – Member Brandt asked if the promotional opportunities are for those who have been with the City or have been in the job for six (6) or more months. Vice President Malloy mentioned that if someone on probation is promoted and does not pass probation, they may not get bumping rights because they did not pass probation in their previous position and something to look at while updating the language. President Batchelor added that there are organizations where once an employee passes probation the first time there are no more probationary periods but that may require union negotiations. It was agreed to keep the language as it is for now. Member Nolan asked if Fire and Police have longer probations. HR Director Bronstein confirmed two (2) years for Police Officers and eighteen (18) months for Firefighters.

Article VI – Vice President Malloy stated people may not know that reasonable accommodations are available throughout the exam process and whether it should be added within the Civil Service Rules even though it is mentioned on the job bulletin. It is agreed to add language that speaks to accommodations somewhere in the document.

Article VI Section 1 – Vice President Malloy suggested not to have an exhaustive list that would disqualify an applicant in case of future changes. President Batchelor asked in section (g) regarding submitting an application within the prescribed time limit, may contradict with Article VI Section 3, where the HR Director may allow applicants to amend their application. HR Director Bronstein stated that she prefers the statement to be broad so she may review the circumstance of the requested amendment and decide whether to grant it or not. Vice President Malloy asked whether enough time is given between allowing for an appeal process for applicants who were disqualified and step two of the exam process. HR Director Bronstein answered that typically there are two (2) weeks, if not more time until the next step and that notifications are sent via email or by mail if there is no email provided. There is a seven day appeal window after the

examination is over. Vice President Malloy asked if there should be a number of days given to applicants who were disqualified so they have a timeline on when to respond. HR Analyst Netto stated that those who are disqualified at the minimum or best qualification review receives a generic notice that they have not been selected to move forward. The notice does not specifically state that the applicant did not meet minimum qualifications. Vice President Malloy asks how the applicants know that they can appeal the decision that they are not moving forward since the notice does not state that they do not meet the qualifications. HR Director Bronstein responds that the letter leaves it open for applicants to call. Vice President Malloy suggest perhaps send two different notices, one for those not moving forward due to the strength of the applicants, and another for those being disqualified, which then allows applicants to appeal the decision. HR Analyst Netto added that by offering a window of time for appeals, it may delay the exam process. HR Director Bronstein believes there may be a compromise by adding language to the notices.

Article VI Section 4 – HR Director Bronstein explained that items listed under (f) through (i) were crossed out and moved into a different section due to changes in laws where these examination components cannot be completed until after the contingent job offer has been made. President Batchelor asked for clarification if item (d) is similar to the practical exam such as an agilities test that has been crossed out in item (f). HR Analyst Romeo answered that this item is a performance exam such as a writing test and not testing for physical ability. HR Director Bronstein said language can be added describing a practical exam component. It was agreed to keep item (f) listed in this section.

Article VI Section 8 – Vice President Malloy stated the second sentence is general regarding results are “given”. It was suggested to revise to results are “provided to the candidate” and that the appeal must be filed seven (7) days from the date of the document.

Article VII Section I – Member Brandt wanted clarification on what a “regular” employee means listed in item (e). It was agreed to return to this section after discussing how to define the term “regular”.

Article VII Section II – Member Brandt mentioned that there is the term “permanent employee” used verses “regular employee”. It was agreed there will be consistency once it is agreed which term to use and define under the definitions section. Vice President Malloy suggested changing the word “belonged” at the end of the first sentence. It was agreed it will be reviewed and updated.

HR Director Bronstein addressed Member Nolan’s question regarding how candidates are notified before and after departmental interviews. She described that candidates are notified of their standing on the eligible list and the Civil Service Rules have been updated to reflect that candidates are notified within two (2) weeks. The notice to the candidate states that the department may or may not contact them for the next step. Those who did not pass the exam receive a notice stating that their score was not high



enough to qualify them to be on the eligible list. HR Director Bronstein did note that they can work with the department to find out a time frame for when they will contact candidates so that can be added to the notices. She added that supervisors are being trained on the new system (Neogov) so that they can notify candidates. Vice President Malloy suggested HR to update the status of the position so if a candidate checks online they can see that the position has been filled. It was agreed to check Neogov to see if there is the ability to make this update and perhaps auditing the status to make sure supervisors are notifying applicants.

HR Director Bronstein described that even though a certain amount of names are given to the department, the department can chose to only interview the top few names, but in rank order. President Batchelor added that in the past if for example five (5) names are certified to the department, then you have to interview all five (5). HR Director Bronstein responded that may have been an internal rule but not a Civil Service requirement. President Batchelor added why a department would not interview all of candidates to determine the best applicant. It was agreed to revisit this topic if they want to discuss it further.

7. **ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA (PUBLIC COMMENT)**

No comment from the public.

8. **CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF)**

No communication from staff.

9. **CONFIRMATION OF NEXT CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING**

The July meeting was confirmed for Wednesday, July 11, 2018 at 5:00 PM. HR will provide dates in May or June for a special meeting to discuss the Civil Service rules.

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

Meeting was adjourned at 6:19 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director  
and  
Executive Secretary to the Civil Service Board