



**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING
OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE BOARD OF THE CITY OF ALAMEDA
WEDNESDAY, October 18, 2017**

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 5:04 p.m. by Board President Batchelor.

2. ROLL CALL:

PRESENT: President Dean Batchelor, Vice President Marguerite Malloy, Members Jan Brandt, Troy Hosmer, John Nolan, Human Resources Director and Executive Secretary of the Civil Service Board, Nancy Bronstein

STAFF PRESENT: Chris Low, Senior Human Resources Analyst
Robin Young, Senior Human Resources Analyst
Sabina Netto, Human Resources Analyst II
Jessica Romeo, Human Resources Analyst I
Steven Woo, Human Resources Analyst I
Nafisah Ali, Administrative Technician II
Alan Cohen, Assistant City Attorney II

3. MINUTES:

Approval of Minutes of the Regular meeting of July 12, 2017.

Vice President moved to accept the July 12, 2017 Minutes. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt which was passed by a 3-0 vote. (Batchelor and Nolan – abstained)

4. CONSENT CALENDAR:

4-A. SUMMARY REPORT FOR EXAMINATION ELIGIBLE LISTS AND CLASSIFICATIONS FOR OCTOBER 18, 2017

4-A-i. ELIGIBLE LIST ESTABLISHED

(June 1, 2017 – August 31, 2017)

DATE ESTABLISHED

EXAM NO.

Assistant City Attorney II – Land Use	08/16/2017	2017-26
Accounting Technician	01/23/2017	2017-19
Administrative Services Coordinator – AMP	05/11/2017	2017-15
Combination Building Inspector	08/31/2017	2017-3245-01
Crime Prevention Technician	06/29/2017	2017-20
Electrical Distribution Technician	07/13/2017	2017-34
Gardener	06/28/2017	2017-21
Human Resources Analyst I	06/28/2017	2017-22
Public Works Supervisor – Sewers & Stormwater	08/30/2017	2017-2650-01
Utility Information Systems Billing Technician	06/26/2017	2017-29

Police Officer

Robles, Steven	06/07/2017	2016-55
Rodriguez, Devin	06/07/2017	2016-55
Williams, Jeremiah	06/07/2017	2016-55
Cook, Jacob	06/07/2017	2016-55
Young, Brandon	06/07/2017	2016-55
Esteban, Steven	06/07/2017	2016-55
Ganuelas, Jeth	06/07/2017	2016-55
Rodrigues, Eric	06/19/2017	2016-57
Chamberlain, Matthew	06/19/2017	2016-57
Gatke, James	06/19/2017	2016-57
Sabou, Vannack	07/12/2017	2016-55
Silva, Brandon	07/12/2017	2016-55
Molina, Jeremy	07/15/2017	2016-56
Garvey, Thomas	07/15/2017	2016-57
Kenerly, Lorenzo,	07/15/2017	2016-57
Chesney, Cody	07/15/2017	2016-57
Abdoulmawla, Noor-Aldean	07/19/2017	2016-55
McCoy, Shawn	07/19/2017	2016-55
Schneider, Michael	07/19/2017	2016-55
Montalvan, Milagros	07/19/2017	2016-55
Akin, Christopher	07/19/2017	2016-55
Cisneros, Augustin	07/19/2017	2016-55
Hernandez, David	07/26/2017	2016-55
Slim, Nizar	07/26/2017	2016-55
Hahn, John	07/26/2017	2016-55
Geddes, Joshua	07/26/2017	2016-55
Trotman, Robert	07/26/2017	2016-55
Sicard, Jacqueline	07/26/2017	2016-55
Shah, Sayed	07/26/2017	2016-55
Walsh, Corwin	08/09/2017	2016-55
Kahue, Mark	08/09/2017	2016-55
Arcadia-Sanchez, Cesar	08/09/2017	2016-57
Gonzalez, Marina	08/17/2017	2016-55
Abdeljabbar, Mohammad	08/17/2017	2016-55
Gonzalez, Christian	08/17/2017	2016-55
Wan, Christina	08/17/2017	2016-55
Bailey, Anil	08/17/2017	2016-55
Peter, Christian	08/24/2017	2016-55
Guerra, Francisco	08/24/2017	2016-55

Howard, Stanley	08/24/2017	2016-55
Southwell, Beau	08/24/2017	2017-4040-02
Diaz-Smitherman, Julian	08/29/2017	2017-4057-02
Abby, Jermaine	08/29/2017	2017-4040-02

4-A-ii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXTENDED

DATE ESTABLISHED

EXAM NO.

Accounting Technician	01/23/2017	2016-62
Animal Control Officer	02/16/2017	2017-02
Assistant City Attorney II	12/05/2016	2016-54
Energy Resources Analyst	12/27/2016	2016-49
Fire Apparatus Operator	07/07/2016	2015-21PR
Intermediate Clerk	07/14/2016	2016-22
Police Lieutenant	08/29/2016	2016-33PR
Police Sergeant	01/19/2017	2015-71PR
Program Specialist II – Clean Water	01/23/2017	2016-52

4-A-iii. ELIGIBLE LIST EXPIRED/ CANCELLED/EXHAUSTED

DATE ESTABLISHED

EXAM NO.

Accountant I (Designated from 2016-45)	05/22/2017	2017-23
Administrative Technician III	08/22/2016	2016-41PR
Electrical Distribution Technician	04/17/2017	2017-12
Fire/Building Code Compliance Officer	05/31/2016	2016-16
Firefighter	10/17/2016	2016-61
Maintenance Worker I (Designated from 2016-19)	10/18/2016	2016-60
Maintenance Worker II	06/14/2016	2016-19
Maintenance Worker II (Designated from 2016-65)	07/24/2017	2017-36
Permit Technician II	02/28/2017	2017-09PR
Planner II	07/05/2016	2016-23PR
Public Works Maintenance Foreperson	04/06/2017	2016-65
Utility Construction Compliance Specialist	03/30/2017	2017-11PR

4-A-iv. LIST OF SPECIFICATIONS

Existing Classification Specification Revision:

- Permit Technician III
- Plans Examiner

New Classification Specifications:

- Senior Transportation Coordinator

Member Brandt moved to approve Consent Calendar items 4-A-i, 4-A-ii, and 4-A-iii. Motion was seconded by Vice President Malloy, which was passed by a 5-0 vote.

Items under section 4-A-iv were pulled for further discussion. Vice President Malloy asked why the need for a driver's license was removed from the Permit Technician III specification. Senior HR Analyst Robin Young answered that Permit Technician IIIs are not required to drive to perform their duties. Member Nolan inquired as to the time frame

allowed to acquire the Permit Technician Certificate. Senior HR Analyst Young answered it is a minimum requirement. President Batchelor asked how the incumbent will perform "example of duties" #3, enforcing zoning regulations if the certification as a Zoning Inspector requirement is being removed. Senior HR Analyst Young answered that the department has indicated that a combination of experience and education will provide them with the knowledge skills to perform the job. She also did a survey on neighboring agencies and none of them required zoning certifications. HR Director Bronstein also noted that the zoning certification did not test for what permit technicians are currently doing and Senior HR Analyst Young stated the department also indicated that the certification is not useful or applied on the job and it is more of a barrier to keep it as a requirement. President Batchelor expressed concern that zoning questions may not be answered in the future because it is not part of the job duties, but Senior HR Analyst Young stated that the years of experience is what is providing them with the knowledge to answer zoning questions.

Member Brandt expressed appreciation regarding addressing the general language of obtaining a driver's license on job specifications and especially liked the language on the Plans Examiner specification. HR Director Bronstein mentioned that it has been discussed that as job descriptions are looked at, the driver's license language will be updated.

President Batchelor asked that since the Plans Examiner will now be providing lead direction should it be at a higher level. Senior HR Analyst Young answered that from talking with the department, the Plans Examiner always served as a lead when the position was filled. The position has been vacant for a while and the Building Official feels it is best for the organization to hire a more experienced Plans Examiner that will provide lead direction to the Permit Technicians. President Batchelor asked if requiring one year of lead direction to Permit Technicians creates a problem filling the position. Senior HR Analyst Young answered that from reviewing other agencies it is not uncommon to see this requirement. With regards to advancement opportunities, the candidate would have gained that experience as a Permit Technician III. Vice President Malloy asked if there are more Plans Examiner specifications in the series. Senior HR Analyst Young answered that this is a standalone position. Vice President Malloy asked if increasing the experience to five years is supported by the market and will not be a problem. Senior HR Analyst Young confirmed she does not see this as a problem.

President Batchelor asked if the Plans Examiner is expected to provide lead direction to the department, should the incumbent be expected to possess the Building Plans Examiner certificate prior to starting the position instead of obtaining it within one year of appointment. Senior HR Analyst Young mentioned she did not bring this up to the department and presumes that the department wants to maintain the standard to obtain the certificate within one year and the only update is the agency title providing the certificate. This will also provide some flexibility if the market is tough to hire a candidate and allow them to receive the certification within the one year probationary period.

Vice President Malloy asked about which classifications are above and below the Senior

Transportation Coordinator series. HR Director Bronstein answered that currently there is only the Transportation Coordinator and the reason for adding the Senior Transportation Coordinator is because in the Base Reuse Department there is about \$42 million in grants and the work that is being done and needs to be done are at a higher level and complexity. She added that there was a study done by an outside agency on the current position to see if the work being done warrants creating a higher level. The lower level position will remain to allow advancement and flexibility to fill in the future if the complexity of work is completed, but the work being done today is at a senior level. Vice President Malloy asked how many positions will this fill and HR Director Bronstein confirmed that there will be two (2) positions. Member Nolan asked if the ferries are involved as part of the improvement project. HR Director Bronstein was not sure how much of these positions will work on the ferry system however her understanding is that one position will focus on biking and walking and the other will focus on roads. Member Nolan asked what will happen once the grants go away. HR Director Bronstein answered that turnover will be considered or reducing the level of work.

Vice President Malloy moved to accept the specifications list on item 4-A-iv. Motion was seconded by Member Brandt, which was passed by a 5-0 vote.

5. **REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS**

5-A. Activity Report – Period of June 1, 2017 through August 31, 2017

FULL-TIME HIRES

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
6/05/17	AMP	Customer Service Representative
6/05/17	AMP	Utility Information Systems Billing Specialist
6/12/17	Fire	Firefighter (x5)
6/27/17	AMP	Administrative Services Coordinator – AMP
7/03/17	Police	Police Officer (x3)
7/10/17	Finance	Account Clerk
7/18/17	AMP	Utility Information Systems Billing Technician
7/24/17	Finance	Accountant I
7/24/17	Recreation & Parks	Gardener
8/07/17	AMP	Utility Project Manager
8/07/17	Police	Public Safety Dispatcher
8/14/17	Recreation & Parks	Gardener
8/28/17	Human Resources	Human Resources Analyst I

PROMOTIONS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
6/26/17	Public Works	Maintenance Worker II
7/24/17	Public Works	Public Works Maintenance Foreperson
8/21/17	Community Development	Planner II

RETIREMENTS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
6/24/17	Recreation & Parks	Park Maintenance Worker (x2)
6/29/17	AMP	Utility Info. Sys. Billing Technician
6/30/17	Public Works	Construction Inspector
7/22/17	AMP	Assistant General Manager – Energy Resources Planning
7/29/17	Police	Police Officer
8/10/17	AMP	Utility Energy Analyst

SEPARATIONS

DATE	DEPARTMENT	JOB CLASSIFICATION
6/08/17	City Attorney	Assistant City Attorney II
6/08/17	Public Works	Maintenance Worker II
6/15/17	Finance	Accountant II
6/21/17	AMP	Executive Assistant – AMP
6/26/17	Fire	Firefighter
6/27/17	Fire	Firefighter
6/28/17	Fire	Firefighter
8/03/17	Finance	Senior Account Clerk
8/17/17	Public Works	Maintenance Worker I

5-B. Informational Report, June 20, 2017, Regarding the Designation of Eligible List – Utility Information Systems Billing Specialist, 2017-13 for Utility Information Systems Billing Technician vacancy, AP.7311.001

5-C. Informational Report, June 27, 2017, Regarding the Designation of Eligible List – Utility Project Manager, 2017-07 for Electrical Distribution Technician vacancy, AP.7250.001

5-D. Informational Report, July 19,, 2017, Regarding the Designation of Eligible List – Public Works Maintenance Foreperson 2016-65 for Maintenance Worker II vacancies.

Under section 5-D Member Nolan was impressed that someone was found from the Public Works Maintenance Foreperson eligible list to fill the Maintenance Worker II vacancies due to the change in salary. Senior HR Analyst Young noted that two (2) candidates were hired from that eligible list but not sure if the candidates accepted a higher or lower salary compared to their current employer. Member Nolan asked if there are any positions in between the PW Maintenance Foreperson and the Maintenance Worker II. Senior HR Analyst Young answered there is not. Member Nolan expressed concern that Maintenance Worker I employees may not have had the opportunity to take the promotional exam but Senior HR Analyst Young said they did take this into consideration and noted that recent vacancies were at the Maintenance Worker I level. Member Nolan asked how many positions are in each classification (MWI, MWII and Maintenance Foreperson). Senior HR Analyst Young made an educated guess of about four (4) employees in

the Maintenance Foreperson position, and approximately ten (10) total between the MWI, and MWII.

5-E. Recommendation to Revise the City's Civil Service Rules on How Candidates shall be Scored, Ranked and Certified on the City's Eligibility Lists to Eliminate the Need to Break Ties in Final Scores

Member Nolan asked clarification on the recommended Civil Service Rule change and how it will be applied. HR Director Bronstein explained that currently if two applicants receive the same score, one of the ways to break the tie is by how soon their application was received. This may leave the other candidate ranked for example number six on the eligible list and potentially not certified to the department if only the top five names are to be certified depending on the classification and number of vacancies. The rule change would remove the need to break ties and certify the top five ranks instead of five names. HR Director Bronstein continued with an example with the Firefighter recruitment where there was a tie within a tie which lead to examining further into another component to break the tie. Member Nolan asked if this happens frequently and HR Director Bronstein answered that it does happen often. Senior HR Analyst Young added that the only reason a tie break is required is because the language in the Civil Service Rules where you have to certify names not rank.

Member Nolan asked if there is a rule of the list. HR Director Bronstein answered there is no rule of the list however Senior HR Analyst Young did add there are certain classifications that have licensing requirements such as the Civil Engineer, therefore the full list will be certified. HR Analyst II Sabina Netto also explained for Police Officers, everyone that passes the test will be placed on the list and the department is required to contact every person that is referred. Member Nolan asked how long people stay on that list. HR Analyst II Netto explained those who do not pass background will receive a non-select letter and their names will be removed from the list. HR Director Bronstein also stated that eventually the recruitment will be closed and opened again so that names are not sitting on the list for a long period of time but also lists can be extended up to 18 months.

Member Nolan wanted clarification on the Civil Service Rules Section 1e of Article VII. HR Director Bronstein explained that this section refers to Police in that they are hired initially as part-time recruit then moved into a full-time classification without having to go through a recruitment because we are paying to train them. Vice President Malloy noted that to further discuss this section of the Civil Service Rules it would need to be on the agenda for the next meeting, which the was agreed by Member Nolan and HR Director Bronstein.

Assistant City Attorney II Alan Cohen recommend that if the changes are adopted, to update the Civil Service Rule revised date on the cover with October 18, 2017 date.

Member Brandt moved to accept the changes to the Civil Service Rules. Motion was seconded by Member Hosmer, which was passed by a 4-0 vote. (Malloy –

abstained)

6. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA (PUBLIC COMMENTS)

(Any person may address the Civil Service Board in regard to any matter over which the Civil Service Board has jurisdiction or of which it may take cognizance that is not on the agenda).

7. CIVIL SERVICE BOARD COMMUNICATIONS (COMMUNICATIONS FROM STAFF)

HR Director Bronstein introduced the new HR Analyst I Steven Woo. HR Director Bronstein also mentioned she would like to address the sentence that is missing in the Civil Service Rules Article VIII Section 3. She would like to clean up the language and bring it back to the Board in the next CSB meeting.

8. CONFIRMATION OF NEXT CIVIL SERVICE BOARD MEETING

The January meeting was confirmed for Wednesday, January 3, 2018 at 5:00 PM.

9. ADJOURNMENT

Meeting was adjourned at 5:36 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,



Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director
and
Executive Secretary to the Civil Service Board