

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

1. ROLL CALL

Chair Beth Kenny: Laurie, would you start with roll call?

Laurie Kozisek: Thank you Madam Chairman. Beth Kenny?

Chair Beth Kenny: Present.

Laurie Kozisek: Jenn Barrett?

Chair Beth Kenny: She's walking in.

Laurie Kozisek: Jenn Barrett. Okay. Hi. Jennifer Roloff?

Jennifer Rolloff: Present.

Laurie Kozisek: Anto Aghapekian?

Anto Aghapekian: Present.

Laurie Kozisek: Lisa Hall is not here. Susan Deutsch?

Susan Deutsch: Present.

Laurie Kozisek: Arnold Brillinger?

Arnold Brillinger: Here.

Laurie Kozisek: And Jenny Linton.

Jenny Linton: Here.

Laurie Kozisek: And our new person is not here yet.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes, let's just read her name anyway.

Laurie Kozisek: Leslie Morrison.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you, Laurie.

Laurie Kozisek: We have a quorum.

2. MINUTES

Chair Beth Kenny: All right, let's move on to agenda item number two - approval of the minutes

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

from our May 9th meetings. Does anyone have any changes or corrections they'd like to see in the minutes from our May 9th meeting? I move that we accept the minutes as is.

Arnold Brillinger: Second.

Chair Beth Kenny: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Chair Beth Kenny: Any opposed?

3. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Chair Beth Kenny: Let's move on to agenda item three, oral communication, non-agenda public comment. Do we have any public comment for today on non-agenda items?

4. NEW BUSINESS

4-A Parking Strategy for Dockless Bikeshare

Chair Beth Kenny: Then we'll get right into new business. We have Rochelle Wheeler here to talk to us about parking strategies for the Dockless Bike Share. Thank you Rochelle.

Rochelle Wheeler: Thank you Madam Chair, and thank you to all you commissioners for having me here. I see some familiar faces and I'm excited to hear your input tonight on this bike parking strategy for the Dockless Bike Share provider. I am Rochelle Wheeler, I work in the transportation planning unit, and I'm a senior transportation coordinator for the City of Alameda. So you have a staff report and a couple of attachments in your packet, and I'm just going to start off. I don't have a PowerPoint, but I'm just going to walk through the staff report, but again, what we're looking for tonight from the commissioners is input on this bike parking strategy that we have. So I'll start off kind of high level. Dockless Bike Share, what is it? Probably you are all are familiar with what it is now, but it is basically bikes that can be taken from point to point, picked up anywhere where there's a bike, using an app, and then you can ride it to and leave it.

Rochelle Wheeler: You don't have to leave it at a dock, but you do have to leave it properly parked, which means not in the sidewalk right of way. And there are parameters and instructions for how to do that. So it's another mobility option for Alameda which we're always looking for new ways to get people around, not in single occupant vehicles; through transit, paratransit. Gig was started recently, point to point car share, biking, walking, all sorts of options, rolling, all of those things. Well, in last October, well about a year ago actually, we were approached by Dockless Bike Share providers which were starting to come into the US. And we saw this as a great new technology that was available; new emerging technology, and so we started a six month pilot program with LimeBike. I would assume you're all probably familiar with these Lime Bikes which have been in the City since they launched in October of 2017.

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

Rochelle Wheeler: And in six months, 50,000 trips were taken on the bikes. We have an average of about 300 bikes in the City at any one time that are operable. What we did, we did this as a pilot, and the reason we did that is we wanted to see how it worked in Alameda before we made it a concrete ongoing program here. And so, at the end of six months, we took the time to evaluate the program, we did that in a bunch of different ways. We talked to a lot of the stakeholders, both internally within the City, all the different staff that are interacting or interfacing with the program, public works, police, community development. We talked to stakeholders outside the City such as the East Bay Park District, AC transit, others, and then we also did a community survey. Some of you may have filled that out. We had 1500 responses within about 10 days, so a huge amount of input on the program.

Rochelle Wheeler: And what we found overall was very, very high level of support for the program. People generally thought it was a great program, definitely worth continuing; but addressing two major issues. And the two major issues that were addressed, the top one was bike parking. And 51% of respondents said that the top problem with the bikes, is the bikes being mis-parked. The second top issue was helmet use, and particularly concerns around youth helmet usage. So we heard those issues, we heard the support for the program and we brought all of that to the City Council in May. And with the recommendation that we continue having a dock-less bike share program in the City but making refinements to the program to address those top issues, and definitely the bike parking issue. And we ask Council to approve going out with a request for proposals to bring in a vendor who we would contract with for two years with the option to extend for another two years. And so the Council approved that recommendation to release that RFP and to move forward with having a dock-less bike share program after the pilot program.

Rochelle Wheeler: I'll back up for a minute. The council also did direct us to come to the Commission on Disability, which is why I'm here tonight. And to bring the bike parking strategy, which is one of the requirements of the contract that we'll have with the new provider, is having this bike parking strategy. And so, the Council wanted us to get input from this commission. So we did that RFP process in May and June, was our time frame for doing that. We received two proposals from two different vendors. We did a very thorough evaluation of those proposals. We had a team of, I think it was, about eight people reviewing those and scoring those proposals. And then we had an even larger team who we did interviews with those two providers. And your Chair, Beth, was on that interview panel. And through all of that evaluation process the top ranked provider was LimeBike, or as they're called now Lime. They go by Lime because they also provide electric scooters. So I think that's why they changed their name, I'm assuming, so they're called Lime now.

Rochelle Wheeler: This RFP, just to be clear, was only for bikes, not for scooters. This is not to permit electric scooters and in fact we have a referral from our City Council to ban electric scooters on City sidewalks and to kind of make sure that is into perpetuity. So that's something staff are working on and will be bringing, I think, in November, back to the Council. So, right now the stage that we're at, is that we are still evaluating, contracting with Lime and our acting City Manager has to approve this and that has not been done yet, so I want to be clear, we have not contracted yet with Lime, we are still in negotiations.

Rochelle Wheeler: But during that process of evaluating and making that final decision we wanted

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

to get input from this committee and see if we can work towards an agreement on a contract with Lime and then in the next couple of weeks we'll also be working with the City Manager to make sure that she is comfortable with us moving forward with this. So, what you have in your packet, I think it's the second exhibit, is LimeBike's parking strategy. And per the contract that we will have, which we attached a draft of that or an agreement to our RFP, so it was very clear what our requirements would be. We have a whole section on bike parking in that agreement, which was the first exhibit. You don't have to open up the first one, but the second one is fine.

Rochelle Wheeler: So, two of those requirements for bike parking in that agreement, with whichever provider we select, are to develop this bike parking strategy. And that strategy is supposed to have two parts: Part A is about identifying... You can see Part A, identifying appropriate parking locations. And then Part B, which I think is what we'll focus on tonight, although I'll go through this whole thing, is on enforcement strategies. So this is what we're looking for input on tonight from the commission.

Rochelle Wheeler: Before I go into what's in that strategy, I just want to say that, in addition to what the provider, what Lime would be doing, we also as a city will be setting performance goals and will be monitoring those goals and part of that will be about what percentage of bikes are properly parked. Through payments that Lime would be making, we will be using an independent contractor to do some verification of bicycles actually being parked correctly and the responsiveness to the other contract requirements. That's something that came out of our evaluation process, is wanting to have a better handle on the responsiveness to complaints, to mis-parked bikes or to bikes that are broken and need repair or things like that. So we will be also monitoring that and we will have in our agreement the option to impose penalties if performance measures are not met.

Rochelle Wheeler: So with that, I think I will go through the parking strategy unless there are any just general questions on what I've described so far. Okay, great. So, like I said Part A is about identifying appropriate bike parking locations and LimeBike has a method of doing that, looking at where people are wanting to use them and they can see, because this is all app based, they can see where people are wanting bikes and so that's where they tend to put the bikes. Through this process, they would be working with us to also, maybe, designate areas where we don't want any bikes parked.

Rochelle Wheeler: There are some, for example, some HOAs or the East Bay Regional Park District may decide they don't want any bikes in the Crown Memorial Beach area or certain parts of the Crown Memorial Beach area. So we can designate areas where no bikes would be parked as well, as well as where bikes can be parked. And obviously, on the positive side, the places that they tend to get located and the people want them are the ferry terminals. Those are the top, the Main Street ferry terminal is the top pick up and drop off location for the LimeBikes, which we were really happy to see in our evaluation because that means a lot of people are using that as a first and last mile connection to the ferry terminal and to transit.

Rochelle Wheeler: So, I think the bulk of what we'll focus on tonight is probably the next section, Part A, which is about enforcement strategies. The first one is geo-fencing and this is actually a requirement for our agreement, that they use geo-fencing in their parking strategy. And so the idea

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

behind this is that you can see on a map that would be on the app like you see in these visuals here, these screenshots. There are areas that can be designated as no parking zones, and those would show up as areas when you're picking up a bike, say, so that you can know when you drop off your bike, "Oh I can't park it on that one block" or "I can't park it in that commercial zone, so I'm going to have to be thinking about where I park it before I get to my end destination." There also can be these pop-up messages which you see on the right which can say, "Remember this is a no parking zone as well."

Jenn Barrett, Vice Chair: Sorry, is there anything that physically prevents them from parking the bike there? Like does it not lock back in or something?

Rochelle Wheeler: So we have Albert Lin here, who is the Operations Manager in our area for Lime, and I think I know the answer but I'm going to let him describe that.

Albert Lin: Yes, sure. So currently right now we do not have any sort of physical thing that will prevent them from locking it. That's something we're looking into certainly six months' time. But we're also looking into alternative ways of, maybe, imposing fines, violations, etc.

Rochelle Wheeler: And that is something that I know that Lime is doing in other areas where they really don't want these bikes. If you have people who are repeatedly mis-parking them, those can be identified easily and you can start fining them when they're putting the bikes in the wrong place or you can just delete their account and say, "You're a bad player, so we're taking you out." And we can come back to all of these. I'll just give a big overview. And the second one that they propose is gamification. So that is generally used for positive, to enforce positive behavior and create incentives for good behavior. So when you do good things like park in the right place, you get little badges or bonuses.

Rochelle Wheeler: I'm sure some of you have seen this in other social media apps. So that is something that they have said they are working out and testing and rolling out and would be using. The next thing is actual physical signage to encourage people to park in the right place. That can be a decal in the proper parking areas on the sides of the sidewalk, generally in that landscaping strip that's between the curb and the sidewalk.

Rochelle Wheeler: Also, some cities have tested out and we could work with Lime to paint boxes and maybe have some sort of signage so that then you know that that's where the bikes would get parked to be used and then at the end of your ride you would use those. And you would use these in select locations where you have maybe a really congested area and people keep mis-parking the bikes. We would not do this for every single location around the city. It's just a way to kind of create some order where you're having a lot of problems. And this would probably be used in places like Park or Webster street where we have a lot of congestion of uses and people and objects and parking meters and a-frame signs and things like that.

Rochelle Wheeler: Then there's, obviously, education. So they have said that they provide education at events and then they also can do that with in-app messaging also to remind people about proper riding, using a helmet and also proper bike parking and what the acceptable places are

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

per the City's direction on where to park. There's also, the next item is something called hub locks. This kind of, I think gets to your question earlier. So do you want to explain the hub lock idea?

Albert Lin: So currently on our electric scooters, we can have the ability to lock them through an app. And so when I mentioned to you, "Oh we don't have the current functionality," that's for our pedal bikes only that don't have any sort of e-assist or any hardware or software that we can communicate directly with. So that's essentially what this would be.

Jenn Barrett, Vice Chair: Okay.

Rochelle Wheeler: I didn't quite understand that explanation, but it's a little technical, but just to also explain like that, in order to lock the bike, you have to open up the app again. That means that, then there's I think an opportunity for you to get direct alerts or like, "No, you are not in the right place, definitely. Do not park your bike here." Whereas right now with the bikes we have now, you don't have that. You can just close the lock and walk away. You don't have to open your app again and interact with it.

Rochelle Wheeler: And then the last thing is actually something that came up, which was a great idea that came up through the interview process, which was being able to integrate with the City's SeeClickFix system, which probably many of you guys know about, where when you see a problem, a pothole, a car blocking the sidewalk, a tree limb that fell down, you can alert the City through SeeClickFix. It's online, and so the option would be to integrate Lime Bikes, reporting problems with Lime Bike with SeeClickFix so that through that system, you could report Lime Bikes being a problem, and that is helpful for people who don't have the app on their phone already for Lime Bike. You can do that if you're a Lime bike user, or even if you're not and you download the app, but I think a lot more people are familiar with SeeClickFix. That's generally where we're trying to funnel people's concerns and complaints, and then that could kind of automate that process, this relieves, I think the staff burden of responding to complaints, and I think also is probably ultimately easier for Lime as well.

Rochelle Wheeler: Those are the strategies that Lime has presented. They proposed in the proposal to have a rate of 90%, at least at minimum, a target of 90% of bikes being parked correctly on average. I think that would be per month, and these are the strategies they would use to get to that. What we're looking for you guys, and I will also be giving input on this strategy, but we're looking to the commission now to get any input on whether you think this is adequate, whether you have other concerns, whether there's more we should be doing, or things we should be doing differently.

Chair Beth Kenny: Great, thank you very much. And as Rochelle stated, I was fortunate to be part of the interview process, and it was apparent in that interview process that a ton of work had gone on before we got to the interview process. So I want to thank you for all the stuff that you've been doing to make this happen. We generally go around and ask questions, so I'm going to start with you Commissioner Brillinger.

Arnold Brillinger: Yes. Has the City proposed any equivalents for disabled people?

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

Albert Lin: It's a great question, unfortunately as of now, we do not.

Arnold Brillinger: I just want to tell the rest of the commission that cities like Oakland, Berkeley and San Francisco, are looking into various vehicles, some of them being trikes. Or for people who are disabled like below the waist, that they would be hand-powered bikes and stuff like that. Not to start anything right here in Alameda, but I think that we'll be able to get some information as they go through their selection process, and also have some good ideas on what to do here in Alameda also.

Chair Beth Kenny: Commissioner Brillinger, in the interview process, I actually sat next to the gentleman who does this sort of stuff for the City of Oakland, and he was telling me that the City of Oakland has partnered with BORP [Bay Area Outreach and Recreation Program], and that's how they're starting to think about doing the accessible Bike-Share. I think that you're right on. Anyways, I wanted to share that information with you.

Rochelle Wheeler: Also from the City's perspective, that's something that I think we would like to see going forward too, and we will continue to work with Lime or whoever the provider is on that, for Dockless Bike Share, on bringing that into the program, bringing accessible vehicles in. It reminds me too of two things, one is that, this is a pretty rapidly evolving field and technology, and so one of the things that we'll continue to do during this whole contract period is continue to monitor what the direction is of this technology, what's new, what's coming in, what's feasible, and then responding to that as we can. This would be a two-year contract, is what we've committed to with the possibility of extending it for two more years. And so, that two years really is kind of a window where we thought after two years, we might be in a very different place and we might want to do another RFP, or change things up and have different requirements and that might be to have accessible bikes.

Rochelle Wheeler: The other piece I just wanted to mention is that when we have done an RFP, and we'll have an agreement. There is no direct cost to the City for dock-less bike share. The City is not paying for this service. And in fact, LimeBike is paying the City some fees to help cover our management of it and if we have to remove bikes, they would pay for us to do that. I'm open to your other questions.

Arnold Brillinger: I think I'll pass it.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you, Commissioner Roloff.

Jennifer Roloff: I had a question and I just lost my train of thought. So I'm going to pass, but I might jump back in.

Chair Beth Kenny: Sure. Vice Chair Barrett.

Jenn Barrett, Vice Chair: I'm really excited to hear about these potential strategies. I think that'll help a lot in eliminating bike parking issues. I think the major issue is when it's parked in a sidewalk and it's no longer accessible for people who are in wheelchairs or mobility issues or just a number

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

of reasons. Have you considered at all putting language on the actual bike? So that when they're riding, it's right there like, "Do not block sidewalks" or something.

Rochelle Wheeler: Yes, I think that we have talked about the best opportunity for that is generally on the basket and that we could have something that is specific to Alameda because the bikes are manufactured the same for all of their markets, but we could attach something to the basket, I believe.

Jennifer Rolloff: Can I jump back in now? So with some of the apps that I have downloaded on my phone, I can opt in or out of, I think they call it push notifications. And so you just get periodic things, whether it's anecdotes, updates, so is there a way to almost mandate push notifications like reminder, and everybody gets a reminder once a month, once a quarter, or various reminders for certain weekends to not block or things like that? Do you do push notifications now?

Albert Lin: I don't think we do, but that seems like it's pretty simple to do with our engineering team, especially we could tailor even for Alameda itself and maybe it's a big event coming up and users that are opening up the app within a set area can get push notifications.

Jennifer Rolloff: Right. As they go to use it, it comes up.

Albert Lin: Yes.

Jennifer Rolloff: Yes. Or as they come up, they get that alert.

Albert Lin: Yes.

Chair Beth Kenny: And just to clarify, Commissioner Roloff, are you suggesting that that would be directly about education around the bike parking that would be pushed regularly to people?

Jennifer Rolloff: Yes. Or I think I'm just sort of brainstorming out loud.

Albert Lin: So yes, I think it would be good for parking, but you could expand on that for whatever. For the community.

Chair Beth Kenny: Commissioner Deutsch.

Susan Deutsch: Well, I really think you've done a really good job in exploring issues related to the bike parking because I think in driving around Alameda, I have seen a lot of bikes parked in odd places. So I think that all the suggestions have been great. I'd like to echo Arnold's idea of maybe having some bikes that older people can ride, people who are not comfortable riding on a regular bike, like a trike, or something that a disabled person could ride. That would be a great addition. And I also I'm a little bit concerned about the helmet issue.

Susan Deutsch: I think there's potential for head injuries, especially the ways I see some teenagers riding the bikes. So it would be great if we could come up with a strategy for the helmet issue. I

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

don't know. I did hear something, which I didn't have time to look into, but I heard that there's something like a collapsible helmet or some helmets that might work with not just Lime but all these city bikes everywhere where nobody's wearing helmets.

Rochelle Wheeler: Yes. We agree definitely, especially for youth, because those under 18 are required to wear a helmet.

Susan Deutsch: Yes.

Rochelle Wheeler: And so there are some strategies for that too that we've incorporated because that was the second top issue. So Lime will be required to do helmet giveaways and to give out a certain number per year. They're also setting up a program where you can actually get a helmet on request, and they'll have different locations around the City where you could get those. They'll give them away at free events. They will also be helping to fund some education to let people know about, not just helmets, but safe riding.

Susan Deutsch: Yes.

Rochelle Wheeler: And then there can be education also through the app and through websites and things like that. Yes.

Chair Beth Kenny: Commissioner Aghapekian.

Anto Aghapekian: Thanks for the presentation. The bike, it's a good program and I like it. I have a couple of questions. One of the questions, after your test period, that lasted how long?

Rochelle Wheeler: So the pilot period was six months, however, we've extended it, so it's still continuing until we get a new provider onboard, but the evaluation, the period that we evaluated was six months.

Anto Aghapekian: And during that six months did you have any kind of conflicts between bikers and pedestrians and people in wheelchairs?

Rochelle Wheeler: What we mostly heard about was bikes that were mis-parked. I don't think I heard of any collisions where people were riding and hit somebody, that a bicyclist hit a pedestrian or someone in a wheelchair. But it was more we got complaints about the bicycles blocking the sidewalks or blocking the curb ramp. So, we definitely did get complaints about that.

Anto Aghapekian: And with the popularity of these bikes increasing, we'll have more bikers in bike lanes and people use the bike lanes also in their wheelchairs. And I can see conflicts, I can see accidents happening in the future with the increase of these bike users, and I don't know what the answer is, but I'd like you to have that in the back of your mind. And my last question is, you said that there is an organization that in case a tree falls down, they'll come and clear it up.

Rochelle Wheeler: That's the City that does that.

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

Anto Aghapekian: That's the City?

Rochelle Wheeler: Yes, SeeClickFix is a way to get that request to the City or to give that complaint to the City. I don't know if you want to bring that up, that's in the bottom of this strategy. You can see it written out there. So you see it, you click like on the website. I think that's what the click means. And then fix, is the City fixes it. So if you look that up online you can find the City's website. Laurie might look it up for you right now, so you can see what that looks like.

Anto Aghapekian: Well, the question I have is, a few weeks ago on a street, on a sidewalk where it meets the street, it was not for wheelchairs, but there was a lady stuck in her wheelchair and she couldn't get back on the sidewalk, she couldn't get back on the street and we happened to be there. We helped her out and we talked and she said, she's been sitting there for almost an hour, people zipping by her. So do you think I have any chance of calling SeeClickFix and see if they can include people in wheelchairs that are stuck? Maybe Arnold has had experiences like that yourself, where stuck with your wheelchair because of the street, the sidewalk.

Arnold Brillinger: Okay, okay, can you tell us again what the problem was?

Anto Aghapekian: Oh, the problem was a person, a lady in her wheelchair was stuck between the sidewalk curb that slopes down to the street. It was not done properly, it was haphazard, no asphalt and she was stuck there. She couldn't back out and she couldn't go forward and she was sitting there and we happened to be there and we helped her out. And my question is, can we have an organization like SeeClickFix in order to make the wheelchair people, excuse me, to assist people in wheelchair that are stuck. And I was thinking that maybe with your experience in the wheelchair, you may have had occasions where you're stuck.

Arnold Brillinger: Okay, I think we're getting off the topic.

Chair Beth Kenny: Our staff person, Laurie, is actually the SeeClickFix administrator. So that's something that maybe you guys can talk about together.

Laurie Kozisek: Yes, I'm not the administrator, I use it.

Chair Beth Kenny: Oh sorry.

Laurie Kozisek: But SeeClickFix is so that we can schedule to do the maintenance a few weeks from now. If you have an immediate emergency, you call 911 if it's really bad, or you call Public Works or you call the non-emergency police or Fire number and Fire does a lot of what they call lift assist, where they come and they help somebody who's fallen down. So that would be the best thing.

Anto Aghapekian: Okay.

Rochelle Wheeler: And just quickly on your second point about the increasing popularity, I think

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

there are more people just generally biking around the City and generally as long as they're on the street, in the bike lanes, and unless they're allowed to be on the sidewalk, I think that's a good thing overall for the City. For the bike share program in this agreement, we have a maximum of 300 bikes which is what we have now that will be allowed. So basically the number of bikes that you've been seeing will continue to be the same unless the City authorizes them to increase that, because we want to get a handle on this bike parking issue. And the helmet issue and once we feel like that is going well then we can consider maybe increasing the number of bikes, but we first want to know that we're getting good compliance with bike parking now.

Anto Aghapekian: Thank you.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you. Commissioner Linton.

Jenny Linton: Thank you for coming to present. It's very interesting, it's been very interesting to watch all these bikes arrive in the City. I have a question about the ferry terminal, it's not quite about the bike program, but you said that the top use is the ferry terminal, the last mile getting from the City on other public transportation to the ferry. I'm concerned that if this is such a popular solution, what do we do about those who can't use bikes, people with blindness or other physical limitations? Is the City going to continue to look for solutions for that last mile for our whole population? Or do you think that this might limit the interest in the need because the able population has been served?

Rochelle Wheeler: I think we're always looking for transportation solutions to serve all the users to get to these hubs or the terminals. We have a very robust paratransit program in the City that can serve those populations as well, but it's interesting to think about that. And that's something we can bring back, but I don't feel like having this in place is going to decrease our efforts to provide mobility choices for all users. We always want to expand choices.

Jenny Linton: Good. And I have a question specifically about the about the LimeBike program. You talked about signage and I was wondering, are we going to put signage on our public street? It's almost a branding of a specific company in a public environment. We wouldn't allow a company take over a public park.

Rochelle Wheeler: Yes, generally, I think what cities are doing is they're just kind of having some sort of symbol with a bike and a P or something like that so that you know that that's a bike parking area or it might say dockless bike share or something like that. So yes, I'm not sure we would allow the Lime logo on the decals or the signs. Good point.

Jenny Linton: Thank you.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you. And I have a few questions for you guys. First, the 90% parking success, people parking as a goal, I would like to see that higher especially over two-year period, if you can step that up to a higher number as the contract goes on, that would be great. I would like to see some sort of commitment to getting the hub lock because it's my understanding that the only way that we can actually have people check in the app is to have the hub lock on the type of bikes

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

that we're looking at when they park. That's the time to remind them, "Park correctly." And so in the proposal, it talked about six months for electric bikes, but I don't think we're having electric bikes, we're just having the pedal bikes. And so I'd like to see a commitment towards getting that, certainly within the life of the contract.

Chair Beth Kenny: Another suggestion, gamification if you're going to do that, it would be great to see some sort of like where you enable LimeBike riders to get points for re-parking somebody else who might have misparked. And then I wanted to ask about how geo-fencing might work as far as, would it be something where we could say, in an area where we know, like at the Waters Edge Lodge, there's lots of people with mobility concerns. Could we block off that area from parking your bike or would it have to be the whole block or how specific is it? I know it can't get between the sidewalk and the grass area. And then would that be something where organizations that are providing services to people with mobility concerns could come to the City and say, "We want our area fenced-off." Or come to Lime and say, "We want our area fenced off."

Rochelle Wheeler: Why don't I answer the second part of the locations, but do you want to talk about more of the technology and how specific you can get with that?

Albert Lin: Yes, so we currently in our kind of dashboard, if you will, where we can control, visually see where everything is, where all bikes, everything are, as well as kind of establishing those geo-fences. So we basically, once we get the GPS coordinates, we just enter those in and then that will basically create however big of a parameter or however more specific, obviously, it can't be just one address.

Chair Beth Kenny: Right.

Albert Lin: But yes, it's relatively easy.

Rochelle Wheeler: And then I think that the blocking off, if it's a public area, we would want that to come through the City and we'd want to work with whoever it is. We don't want to see half the City end up getting blocked off because one person is complaining for instance. But definitely the situation you're describing could be a place where there's a heavy concentration of people coming and going with mobility issues, or visual impairments that might be a good place to block off. And so I think we would work with individuals. Then there's also private property, when they work directly with Lime to say "They're in our apartment complex, we don't want your bikes at all in here". And so Lime works with those people directly.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes, I would want it to be a need-based thing. And how likely would it be for us to be able to get the hub locks on the LimeBikes?

Albert Lin: That's a really good question. I think I'd have to talk to our product and engineering teams to see how much they can expedite that process, as right now it's just the pedal bikes alone. We'd have to outfit them with additional hardware, so that the biker could communicate with our servers to kind of establish that hub lock. So I'd have to get their take on that.

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

Rochelle Wheeler: I'd say that is a concern also that the staff has in accelerating that and having the hub locks come sooner rather than later to our City because that does feel like a really strong way to do the parking enforcement.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. And do you have any sense about how Lime go about increasing that 90% goal?

Albert Lin: 90% goal of? Oh, of properly parking.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes.

Albert Lin: I'd say, main things that come off the top my head is, number one, just the community events that we're going to contribute to, and make a presence to be there and educate as many people as possible. So that means holding as many as we can. And then also I'd say in addition to education through those events, I'd say beefing up our staff to be more kind of just patrolling. We already have a good feel of what are the kind of the problem areas where it's congested like Park Street etcetera, so kind of making them incorporate it into their daily routine, and have them patrol that on a daily basis.

Albert Lin: I mean as of now, two weeks ago, I established kind of a mid-shift patrol, that will go throughout Alameda and Oakland since they're relatively close. And that's just patrolling the hot spots and taking care of our customer service tickets or complaints that we get.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. I guess those are my recommendations for this. And thank you very much for coming and all the work that you guys have put into this.

Rochelle Wheeler: Thank you. Thank you all. These are very, very helpful suggestions and input, and we'll take this into consideration and really appreciate your time tonight.

4-B Accessible Playgrounds

Chair Beth Kenny: Now we'll move on to the next agenda item. We're going to have a presentation by Commissioner Deutsch on accessible playgrounds.

Susan Deutsch: So my son and daughter-in-law live in Marina, which is a little north of Monterey, near Salinas, and I took my grandson to the playground called Tatum's Garden in Salinas, and I was just really impressed with this playground. And I decided to do this presentation. And it's an accessible playground and it's an inclusive playground. So, I'll go into that.

Susan Deutsch: So what is an accessible playground? An accessible inclusive playground, things that are available to typically developing children, children with neurological disabilities such as autism, children who have intellectual disabilities, children who require wheelchairs or medical equipment, children with physical disabilities, social and emotional disabilities, and also to be available for families, siblings, grandparents, and other people in the community that might be also going to the playground with children.

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

Susan Deutsch: So the disabled population is 12% in our country, but if you start including people who are involved with this group of people, like their parents, their siblings, their grandparents, their friends, then one in three people are touched by a person who has a severe disability. And disability challenges are affecting individuals and their families, spend a day at the park. So, if you're a grandparent and you're in a walker, you might still want to go to the park with your grandchild. So all these things have to be considered when you're looking at what is an accessible playground.

Susan Deutsch: So an inclusive playground addresses the needs of all people, including those who have autism, intellectual disabilities, hearing impairments, visual impairments, cerebral palsy, physical disabilities, and any other impairment that somebody might have. It addresses the needs of typical children and it accommodates everyone and provides challenges at all the children's developmental level, so all children can be challenged to explore.

Susan Deutsch: The mission is that it's an important time. Childhood, it is an important time for opportunities to interact socially and strengthen the imagination. An inclusive playground provides inclusive play areas for all children, regardless of their ability. And unfortunately special needs children are often excluded from activities when facilities are not capable of accommodating these children. They're left out of play experiences that most children get exposed to. An inclusive playground has play features for both abled as well as disabled kids, and that both typical children and disabled children should be able to play together.

Susan Deutsch: So the background on Tatum's Garden, I'm not going to read all of this, because you have the handout, but two parents of a child with spina bifida went to Idaho and found this inclusive playground and saw their child start to play with her siblings. And they live in Salinas, they came back to Salinas, and they got approval from the City Council to build this playground in an abandoned parking lot. And they started raising money. Well, there was a non-profit agency in Salinas that they used to do the fund raising. And they thought there were going to be so many obstacles and this was going to take years, and they did it in a few months, they collected a million dollars from people all over Monterey County, and it was kind of amazing. And there was an incredible number of volunteers also that helped in the building process of this playground.

Susan Deutsch: The playground was built by a company called Leathers and Associates, and they've designed many playgrounds all over the United States, and they specialize in inclusive, accessible playgrounds. The playground cost \$750,000. A lot of local artists donated their time. You'll see, when I show the pictures of these murals that are in the playground. So it's a playground, but it's very artistic and it's very interesting.

Susan Deutsch: So in terms of fund raising, when people donated money, there's an area in the entry way that has bricks and you can get your name engraved on a brick for the money you donated. There are sponsors that donated money that are on a list, and a lot of those are companies all over Monterey County that donated significant amounts of money. And then parts of the playground have these picket fences and people's names are on those picket fences, and all these people have donated and their names are there, and some of them are families and some of them are

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

individuals. But it was just a real community effort, and that also really struck me as something really good that a community could come together and do something like this.

Susan Deutsch: And this is just an overview of it from up above, but it doesn't really show the whole playground. It's actually a very large playground, and there's a whole grassy area off to the side where kids can run around and kick a soccer ball. And there's an area with picnic benches and... So, there's a lot more there but it's just an overview. My husband got very excited, so I'm including some of his videos.

[Video Voiceover] Robert Deutsch: This is Tatum Gardens in Salinas, California. This is the most incredible playground for children of all ages, families, disabled, you name it. This is so unique, so interesting. It's themed to be the farm and the land and gardening and fruits and vegetables and how we eat, how food reaches our tables and all over there are themes, and all the spices and beans and herbs.

Susan Deutsch: So you could see, it's a farm theme and you could also see in that video, there were bricks, the bricks over there. Those have people's names on them, the donations that they made.

Susan Deutsch: Yes. So this is just showing the surface of this playground is a foam surface, if you fall on it, you won't get hurt. My grandson has fallen many times and he's always surprised that he's not crying. And also it's colored. So, I think that's a good thing too, that there's different colors in different parts of the playground so that you could really see the contrast on how to get from place to place.

Susan Deutsch: And this is showing the structures and there are ramps that go everywhere. So a person in a wheelchair can get on to these wooden structures. There's tunnels that kids can crawl through and this surface doesn't splinter and that's another good thing. So I'm not sure what it is, maybe it's not real wood. But that's another good thing, about how they created it. And so, here's a child in the wheelchair, using the ramp and that might be Tatum, I'm just not sure because that looks like her mother following her.

Susan Deutsch: So you could see that kids in wheelchairs can really get around on this climbing area. There's also an area where kids can just explore things cognitively and visually. So these are gears that kids can just spin and watch these gears move. It's just one example of some of the things they had, they had some other kinds of things that kids could explore cognitively and visually and sensory-wise, and this is a pretty popular place for kids to go, especially the younger ones. And so, here's another.

[Video Voiceover] Robert Deutsch: Strawberries. This area, lot of strawberries are grown. Some little houses with themes, again mostly things from the land, little houses to go in, inside the houses, interesting items. The sun, little wheels to spin.

Susan Deutsch: So there are a lot of little homes, little structures like that, that kids can go into and I think that is really important for some kids with disability. Here's another one, it's a farm stand. But there are kids that get over-stimulated at a playground. And actually, when I was there, I saw a

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

girl who clearly had a disability who was just running all over the place. Her father was constantly chasing her, she was clearly over-stimulated and I didn't want to interfere but it would have been nice if he just brought her into one of these little structures so that she could just calm down and relax, and then go out and play again.

Susan Deutsch: The other thing about these structures is that they encourage imaginative play, which is great. You see a lot of kids in that farm stand pretending to sell fruits and vegetables, and also it provides some shade, because it's a pretty sunny location, and they didn't put a lot of trees in. They provided shade in other ways. And this is one of them, and there's many of these.

Susan Deutsch: There are also these little climbing structures that are very unique and artistic, little climbing walls. There's many of them all over and this is a simple one that you just step on the bottom. And this is a swing for a disabled child. That is pretty safe, and the child can be strapped in. And then there's also regular swings right next to it.

Susan Deutsch: And this is a Braille panel, and on one side they have numbers in Braille, on the other side is the Braille alphabet. And I didn't see any visually impaired kids by this, but I took a picture because my grandson loves this. Everything is tactile and he traces the numbers and he traces the letters with his fingers, because those are raised also. So in addition to the Braille, the letters and numbers are raised. And here's another. This is another video.

Susan Deutsch: You could see the path, there's a path to help kids find their way around and see some of the structures. And this is a swing.

Susan Deutsch: Oh. My husband doesn't know what it is, he's calling it a "tadpole swing", but it's a swing that I saw some parents taking their disabled child and sitting with them on that swing. And that was a really nice. It was just a really nice interaction to watch that. These see-saws are safe. So, when I was growing up, if the top person got off the see-saw, you'd crash down. You don't on this. And then, there's a music area on the next slide, which is really cool. More swings. You could see this is a very large playground, this is really large.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, the parents have been very involved with their kids. That's a picture of that structure from another angle. It was like a big house. And this is the tractor from the other side. You were seeing that there was a slanted way to climb up. There's also a way for someone in a wheelchair to get onto that tractor from a ramp. And then there's a little ladder there, so there's many ways to get on to that tractor for any child. And here's just another mural that artists volunteer their time and painted with help from people in the community.

Susan Deutsch: Other murals, mosaics, butterflies, caterpillars, kids. I thought this was interesting because I'm an occupational therapist, I've worked in the schools. And this is like a conveyor belt that you roll boxes down, but it's a real sensory experience and kids go on that and they feel all the rollers on their back or on their stomach, and a lot of kids with disability need that sensory input. And there were a variety of items in this playground that provided that. This is one of them and my grandson didn't like it, but I think it's great. And then they have items that spin, which a lot of kids need that kind of movement. And this is lettuce, it's like a head of lettuce, that's been cut open, and

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

kids sit on it and spin. Behind it, there's another item that also spins, but this is one that you could sit in and be safer.

Susan Deutsch: So, this playground is owned by the community. They clean it once a month, they've been taken care of it. There are still donations coming in to help take care of it. When I was there, I saw a group of developmentally disabled adults going in, and they were cleaning the playground, which I thought, Wow, that's just a great opportunity for vocational training for some of those adults.

Susan Deutsch: I felt like, when I was there, that people were valued, and people with disability were valued. And you could just see it in the way that playground was built. And I'm just saying this is a worthy goal, a community based effort to build an inclusive playground. This kind of play for all kids, it's just a worthy goal to work towards, I just see it as maybe a long range plan. But I think it provides for kids cognitive development, sensory development, physical development, and social development.

Chair Beth Kenny: Great. Thank you, Commissioner Deutsch. Can we just go around?

Susan Deutsch: Yes, sure.

Chair Beth Kenny: And have comments.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, I didn't show everything in the playground because that just won't be possible.

Chair Beth Kenny: Seems like it's pretty huge.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, well, I mean, it's big enough, I mean it's small enough, that my two and a half year old grandson gets all over there. But it is a good sized playground compared to some of the ones that I've been to here.

Chair Beth Kenny: Commissioner Brillinger, yes.

Arnold Brillinger: Yes. It seems to me that Alameda has a park that was built to be inclusive of all people. Maybe we could get a little bit of it at another time?

Chair Beth Kenny: I don't have an exhaustive report on that. I think that what you may be thinking of is when we did the 25th anniversary of the ADA. We did our celebration in conjunction with the Parks and Rec Department. And they opened up a playground at that point that was their most inclusive. They are trying to include things with every new playground to make them more accessible. But I think the one that you're thinking of is the 25th anniversary ADA celebration. And so it had some of the elements in here.

Susan Deutsch: But there's no access for a child in a wheelchair to get on to a climbing structure in that playground. But the surface of that playground allows kids with wheelchairs to roll around. So it's not like bark or sand. It's a surface that allows a wheelchair to roll. But there's no accessible

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

swings, and there's no climbing structure that a kid in a wheelchair could get on to with their peers. So, that's what struck me about this. And I've worked in the Berkeley schools for so many years, and I haven't seen it there either, and there's a lot of kids in wheelchairs in that school district though. And then I've been finding out that there's a lot of playgrounds like this throughout the country. And I've been kind of looking at pictures of them and interesting.

Susan Deutsch: They are all different. This one is related to farming, because it's a farming community. But I saw other ones, pictures of other playgrounds, that had different themes. It was interesting.

Arnold Brillinger: Because like Alameda is maritime. And the whole thing with ships and things like that.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes, and the Bay.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, could be. The way they did it, they actually worked together. They had a whole committee working together. The community came up with this theme, and this committee. So I think that's a good way to do it too.

Arnold Brillinger: Thank you. Thank you Susan.

Susan Deutsch: Thank you.

Chair Beth Kenny: Commissioner Rolloff.

Jennifer Rolloff: Thanks so much for sharing that, that's fantastic. I know, I believe you're the liaison to Parks and Rec. Are you already in the work to present this to them? I think that would be really worthwhile.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, well I wanted to present it here first, and get feedback. I was on kind of a time crunch, and I didn't realize when I started that I had to get my PowerPoint to Laurie, like 10 days before this, so. But I might need to make some changes, but I do want to pursue this.

Jennifer Rolloff: Yes, I think there's so many ways to incorporate this into our community, whether it's a dedicated park, or as we start replacing antiquated pieces of parks, they get replaced with some of these. And I know Jean Sweeney Park has multiple phases of the park being rolled out, and not all of them are in stone. And I know I've seen one that has some very creative areas that are not jungle gyms typically, but they're not being built yet. This might be a time to see if any of this could be incorporated. Because I think it's important, and the impact is so positive. So, thank you.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, I also thought that the West End might be a good place, because there's a lot of land there, and they're going to be building there. So that might be another possibility where there's a good chunk of land.

Jennifer Rolloff: Yes. What's it called on Alameda Point? The new one that just broke ground?

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

Susan Deutsch: Yes.

Jennifer Rolloff: Do they have plans for their parks already? That might be another place for this discussion as well.

Susan Deutsch: Yes. I know. Yes, thank you.

Vice Chair Jenn Barrett: Thank you so much for the presentation. I think it's fantastic, and I would love to see that kind of thing in Alameda. I really like the community ownership, because they relied on the donations and help building it. I think that would be a real strength for our community if we had that as well. I think people would really have some ownership. And yes, I thought it was a really good presentation. I think it will go well with the Parks Department. So I'm excited to see where it goes.

Susan Deutsch: I hope so.

Anto Aghapekian: Same with me. It's a very nice presentation. Thank you. And I like the item that you have in there, the dollar sign, where it says that it costs \$750,000. The Parks and Rec, they look at numbers. And it's doable. And also, the emphasis that everybody uses it, not only for people. It's for everybody.

Susan Deutsch: Yes.

Anto Aghapekian: That makes life so much easier. It's not very expensive. It can be done. Thank you.

Susan Deutsch: Oh, well, it sounds expensive to me.

Jenny Linton: I want to thank you as well Susan. I would just reiterate what you both said about it being a community park aspect. I think both looking for donations from community members and the participation of the community is what drives an inclusive park. In 1990, we lived in Davis with a then four-year-old, and the community park was built. I think parents went and worked on it. It had just been opened when we arrived. But David and I were there last weekend and we had to go visit the community park, hadn't been there in 30 years, and there it was all rebuilt. But probably I don't think I saw anything all that inclusive about it. Well, it was chaos.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you. This is I know something that you've been interested in for a while.

Susan Deutsch: Yes.

Chair Beth Kenny: So I'm glad that we're here talking about it, and this is great stuff. I echo what everybody says about getting the community involvement. I think that's what can make this really special. And I have a few ideas of places or organizations that might be interested. The Alameda Special Education Parents Group is a great organization. And they have talked about wanting to

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

work with us more, and I think this would be a great time to do that. The other thing is I got an email from Amy Wooldridge, who is head of the Parks and Rec today, and she had been meeting with the people of Kiwanis, and they are looking at starting a new branch that focuses more on people with disabilities. And then wanting to see if somebody from the Commission wanted to be part of that with them. So this might be a good opportunity.

Susan Deutsch: Oh, wow. Yes, great.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. So, yes I love that. And then I think I just misheard you, and maybe it's because I'm going to so many playgrounds myself right now. Where you talked about the playground and being inclusive. Did you say it was inclusive for the caregivers as well? Or like accessible for caregivers as well?

Susan Deutsch: Yes.

Chair Beth Kenny: Because I find that is a problem I'm coming across in some of these playgrounds.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, I mean not every aspect.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes.

Susan Deutsch: I've been playing with my grandson, and he wants to play hide-and-seek with me, right, so I'm trying to crawl into these little spaces. So, no, you can't do that. You definitely, as a grandparent with a walker, or a wheelchair, or somebody with a disability could definitely go to a playground like this with their kids.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. Wonderful. And then, the other thing, that specialized swing that you showed us, is that a wheelchair swing?

Susan Deutsch: No. They didn't have a wheelchair swing, and that is something I think they should have.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes, I was at the Alameda Makers Fair this weekend, and there was a woman there who was showing some adaptive sports equipment that she had been making. She works for San Leandro, doing PE for them, and she had said that she really wanted to see a wheelchair swing in Alameda. So, I would love to see that.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, I would, too. At one point, when I first started working in the Berkeley Unified School District, there was one wheelchair swing for this one student, the parent fought for it and got it, but then the playground was redone, the student wasn't there, there was no other student in that school with a disability, with a disability that required a wheelchair, so it came down. But that was... It would be nice to have one with a wheelchair.

Chair Beth Kenny: And, my final question is how do you see the best way, going forward, towards

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

making this happen with the commission? Should we get a sub-committee on this, or?

Susan Deutsch: It would be helpful to work with other people. If people are interested, it would be great. But I do need to present to Parks and Rec. I do know that, and I guess I'll contact Amy Wooldridge and the Kiwanis Club. But I was also thinking that in order to fundraise, you need a nonprofit organization. I guess the Kiwanis is a nonprofit. And then I also thought of this, maybe that Center for Independent Living, they might have an interest. So, just finding an organization, a nonprofit organization to fundraise through would be great. But yes, working with other people is always the better. I don't know how much time people have. I don't see it as something that it is probably going to happen very quickly, so I don't want people to feel pressured. I think it's something that's going to be a process.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. My sense is, if we form a sub-committee, that a lot of it could be done over email. Would you say that's correct?

Susan Deutsch: Yes. If there are people that want to meet one-on-one, then we can set up those meetings at some point, but the initial contacts would probably be email, unless somebody from the Kiwanis wants to meet. And I don't know if the whole committee has to meet, unless that's what we decide, depending on people's time. But if they do, it's great. The more people, the better.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. With the Kiwanis situation, they're actually looking for one person to be a liaison. But in my sub-committee experience, I would say it's great to have a few people, because a lot of these meetings come up at inconvenient times, so if you can have a few different people who can go to them, it's better.

Susan Deutsch: Yes. And, I think, when we did Universal Design, it was better having a committee. It clearly worked out better. And just to even get ideas off of each other, otherwise you just feel like you're in this zone and you don't hear what other people are thinking and you can't get other people's ideas. So, having other people is a good thing.

Chair Beth Kenny: So, I would like to propose that we form a sub-committee towards getting a inclusive accessible park built here in Alameda, playground here in Alameda. Is anyone interested in joining that? I am certainly interested. Maybe a little self-interested.

Anto Aghapekian: I am too.

Chair Beth Kenny: All right.

Chair Beth Kenny: So, for now, it'll be the three of us, and we can report back to the commission on how things are going.

Susan Deutsch: Okay. And just, then, for your information, for everybody's information, there was something that I meant to put on my presentation that I didn't. So if you Google "Inclusive playground design guide", there's a whole guide about it. I can't even read the whole thing, I haven't read it all yet. I've read parts of it. But it's a huge guide about how to build inclusive playgrounds,

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

and, actually, Anto, you probably would understand some of the things that I don't understand. But yes, the architectural parts of it.

Arnold Brillinger: Thank you. I want to say Susan, I think that you've got the support of the Commission on going forward to this and making it come to fruition. I think everyone will be behind you and to help in whatever the way they can. Thank you.

Susan Deutsch: Yes. And just one other thing is that my husband really would like a playground like this in Alameda, and so at some point, he might jump in and help out because he has some contacts, like on City Council if it gets to that.

Chair Beth Kenny: He's welcome to be part of our sub-committee or be an adviser to the sub-committee.

Susan Deutsch: Yes, okay. I had to include his videos.

4-C Move November 2018 Meeting [Note: Also covered in Item 6]

Chair Beth Kenny: So we'll move on to agenda item 4C. We need to move our November 2018 meeting. I'm still trying to figure out. There's another commission that had already rescheduled their November meeting for the second Wednesday of that month before we had changed to odd months. So, do you have some proposed dates?

Laurie Kozisek: Well, it's just that the Transportation Commission meets on the fourth Wednesday of the month and they don't want to meet on Thanksgiving Eve. And so they've always traditionally gone with the second Monday or Wednesday for November and they are not willing to change that. So we could go with the first or third. I would recommend the first because the third is getting pretty close to Thanksgiving also.

Chair Beth Kenny: And it's confirmed that on November 7th, there's nobody else in City Council chambers.

Laurie Kozisek: Not that I know of at this point.

Chair Beth Kenny: Okay. So I would like to propose that we move it to November 7th which is one week earlier. It's the first Wednesday of November.

Jennifer Rolloff: I'll second that.

Chair Beth Kenny: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Chair Beth Kenny: Any opposed?

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

5. OLD BUSINESS

5-A. Commission and Board Liaison Reports

Chair Beth Kenny: Now, we'll go on to agenda item five, Commission and Board Liaison Reports. Commissioner Billinger.

Arnold Brillinger: Okay. If you were at the parade, you probably saw the shuttle go by. You probably saw me go by too because I made it all the way around. I would just want to say that we're working on doing all kinds of things to get people to ride the shuttle. Again, just like using the bikes is good for getting people out of single-person cars and the bus is also especially for older people and for those that are disabled. Right now, it's open to anybody. We're even going to have a couple of things like Gilligan's Island, there was a three-hour tour and turned into a long thing, right? Well, I came up with the idea.

Arnold Brillinger: Let's have a free hour tour. Means that it's free. You don't have to pay anything to go on it, but we're going to have Dennis from the Alameda Sun come on and we're really sorry that we can't do this for as many people as we think that will be wanting to go on this to kind of give a historical tour as we go past some of these things in Alameda. And as we know, it goes on three different tours, three different routes, one on Tuesday, one on Wednesday, one on Thursday, but we're going to also get some of the information and on 11 X 17 sheets, and have them laminated so that people can as they're going by, say, "Oh, look at there's where the peanut butter factory used to be for Skippy's."

Arnold Brillinger: Because it did start here in Alameda, and so forth. So those are just some of the things that we're getting to get people interested and aware because we realize a lot of people are working during the hours when it runs. But their older, their parents and their neighbors that are older, they need to know about it. So we're trying to get the information out to the various groups. So that's it for the shuttle. Now in Alameda, and we've had the presentation here from Victoria Williams on the Paratransit Program, where people can buy vouchers.

Arnold Brillinger: They can have these tickets, they will bring them back from a doctor's appointment or a hospital or wherever they had to go for \$2.50. Wherever it is in the county, and Alameda will pay the rest of it that way. And also, people of a certain age can get vouchers to ride regular taxis at a very much discounted price, like they get a \$5 voucher for \$1.50. And it helps them with making their budgeting work out. So, we do have those things. And I just wanted to say, besides the fact that I do go to the Oakland Commission on Disability and also Berkeley and stuff like that, they all seem to have representatives at the last meeting in Oakland where they talked about several things, one of them being the whole thing of shared bicycles and also accessible bicycles.

Arnold Brillinger: And also, how to work with Uber and Lyft in getting rides that were equipped to handle wheelchairs. And there's an SB and I don't know the number of it, but just recently I heard about it, where in the legislature in Sacramento, they're considering this where a certain amount of each ride has to be specified to work or get some vehicles that can handle wheelchairs. So that's

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

pretty important, and it might be something that we can get an overview for the next meeting and maybe see if the City Council also wants to endorse it, as are city councils like in San Francisco and Oakland are going to endorse, and in other places in California.

Arnold Brillinger: So, what I'll do is I'll send the information on what that bill is to Laurie and she can send it out to everybody, so that if you're interested you can see how it's working. And also, maybe then we can discuss endorsing it to our City Council to say, "Yes, we want to sponsor this also."

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes, get that to Laurie and we can have it on the agenda for next time if we can all review that and we will have a discussion about that. That would be great. I'd love to hear about things that are coming down the pipeline.

Arnold Brillinger: Yes.

Chair Beth Kenny: Great. Commissioner Roloff?

Jennifer Rolloff: So, let's see for School Board. I didn't get a chance to attend the meeting where they talked extensively about the merging of schools, but I will do some investigating on that. I think that puts a lot of the population that we're advocating for at risk. A lot of these services are going to fall through the cracks, so I'll follow up on that. But what I did want to talk about was, there was a committee put together that did a needs assessment for mental and emotional wellness needs. So Kirsten Zazo, do you know Kirsten? She's the Chief Student Support Officer in Alameda [Unified School District], and she presented the needs to the Board. The purpose of the needs assessment is to identify student behavioral needs, inventory existing school and community-based services and identify gaps in services.

Jennifer Rolloff: The goal is to develop recommendations, create a more coordinated and integrated behavioral health service system and make services more accessible to all students. Which I felt was very thematic with what our board is doing, with what Commission is doing with focusing on mental health needs. Essentially just to net out, she presented the findings but I think one of the takeaways was per Sean McPhetridge [Superintendent at AUSD]. Unfortunately, there's not a lot of money to address these. We can work on addressing the zero-cost solutions that they had. So one of the thoughts I had was that Kirsten or a delegate could possibly come and present her report to us. We could do a little Q&A and see how possibly us, on behalf of the City could make recommendations for supplementing some of those gaps that don't have proper funding since it is for Alameda residents as well. So if maybe we could get that on an agenda for a future date. I could even contact Kirsten.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes, if you could contact Kirsten and include Laurie and myself on the email, that would be great. And so I would love to have her on the agenda to present that report.

Jennifer Rolloff: Okay. Okay, great. Thank you. That's all I have for today.

Chair Beth Kenny: Vice-Chair Barrett.

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

Jenn Barrett, Vice Chair: Yes, I didn't have anything from the Planning Board for this particular update. And then for the businesses, I got some contacts. Thank you, Beth, for providing that. I'm going to get in touch and hopefully have it start rolling before our next meeting. And then one other thing I wanted to bring up, when you were presenting, I was thinking about beach access. My aunt, we were in Cape Cod, and she's in a wheelchair, and they had a beach buggy. Just there were two that you could just take and you just transfer them onto this beach buggy that has these huge wheels that can go on the sand. And it just was so awesome, and it allowed her to come out on the beach with us. So I think that's something else we can talk to the Parks Department about maybe adding.

Susan Deutsch: Yes. And another, I have a relative who has a house in Martha's Vineyard and what they have on their beaches is something built right over the sand that you can just push a wheel chair on to get out to the beach.

Chair Beth Kenny: And we have heard from people wanting to be able to access things like the Sand Castle Contest. So I like what you guys are thinking.

Chair Beth Kenny: Commissioner Deutsch?

Susan Deutsch: The Parks Department cancelled their meeting, which I think was last week. Oh, tomorrow? Yes, it's cancelled the meeting.

Chair Beth Kenny: Yes. Commissioner Aghapekian?

Anto Aghapekian: I have three items that I'd like to talk about. The first one is in our local newspapers, they announced all the City meeting. There's the City meeting calendars, and all the commissions are listed. Their schedule of the commission meetings are announced in the newspaper, and it comes out weekly. And I'd like us to be on this schedule so that people know when we meet and hopefully they're coming. That's one item. The other item is on Clement Avenue, you probably have heard about.

Anto Aghapekian: They're calling it the Clement Avenue Corridor. It's about a mile and a half street that's going to be converted into amenities and leisure, amenities and circulation area. The City has about \$5 million donation, not donation, but a grant from the federal government to work on this project. And the lady who is responsible for this project from the City planning department is Gayle Payne.

Anto Aghapekian: And so she is the contact person. And what happened during the Central Avenue presentation with Gayle, it was after the fact. All we were told or this commission was informed was, after the fact, this is what we're going to do. What I would like to see happen this time around is before the planning department starts planning and hiring designers to do the design, I think that we should get in touch with Gayle and I volunteer to do this. I will walk that one and a half mile to Clement Avenue and highlight all the areas that are hazards for people in wheelchairs and highlight it on a map and pass it on to her through this Commission, of course, so that they do include all the things that are necessary to make that one and a half mile promenade to be accessible for a

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

wheelchair. That's my second item.

Anto Aghapekian: The third that I have is, there was a forum composed by the League of Women Voters here in Alameda, and during that forum, there were four or five people that talked, and, Thomas, the City Planner, was also there. And they talked about the new housing state laws that I was very curious about to find out what this new laws are. And it's not code. It does not impact wheelchair. It's not code related. It's all number of housing. Each city is required, not requested. It's required by law to provide. And cities have been bucking this for about two, three years, but the state is making it very clear that if a city does not comply by providing a certain percentage of housing, per income....

Anto Aghapekian: All the details, then the state will stop all funding with that city, and that's paralyzing. That's a very serious threat. And they can do it and cities cannot do anything about it. So, cities have been approving housing projects on many fronts, as much as they can. Alameda is one of them. And the thing that is ironic is, the developers have put in a lot of money, getting their plans prepared and approved by the city, it takes sometimes years. And after they receive their approval, their permits to go ahead with the construction, they find out that the banks are refusing to give them the money, because they're creating low-cost housing or market value housing, and the banks say, "The numbers don't jive. There is no way your income is going to be able to pay your loan, so we're not going to give you any money." So, that's why some of the projects that have been approved that we know of, that's been advertised, or spoken of, written about in the papers, one of them being the brick building that used to be a factor – Del Monte.

Anto Aghapekian: I think the guy had his approval, his permit about two or three years ago and it's still vacant. Nothing is going on and I saw a sign on it that says that it's ready for lease, but I don't know what that means. So this is really not much to do with what we're all about and yet it has impact as to availability of housing. The monies to build parks, the developers have promised to create parks, but they cannot do it. It's all at a standstill. And I just wanted to share that with you.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you, Commissioner Aghapekian. Commissioner Linton?

Jenny Linton: I joined a group this year called Genesis. They are a group of community organizers in Oakland over by the eastern edge of Lake Merritt. And this year they're focusing on Disability Justice. They've created a Disability Justice League, in particular, focusing on exactly what the anthropologists from the Haas Center of Disability Studies came and spoke to us about, which is around the intersection of multiple disabilities, being a woman with disabilities, a minority with disabilities. And along with their focus on disabilities, they're looking at housing and getting young people out of jail, and these things are all related. Housing is an issue for those with disabilities.

Jenny Linton: Those without housing tend to find themselves in jail or in trouble earlier on and could or could not be disabled as well. And so they're working to organize groups, people willing to speak. We did a training this week at the Arc in San Leandro where we took a group of people from the day program and got them. Actually, my son and I both went to two different sites. Gave them a chance to talk about themselves and see who could develop the confidence to come speak to their assembly about what they need in their population, and they're called genesisca.org, and their

COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.

number is 510-882-3404 and they're meeting again on Tuesday night. And I just wanted to share that. Thank you.

Chair Beth Kenny: Great. Thank you, Commissioner Linton. So I think I misspoke a little bit about the Kiwanis Club. What it is, is they're starting a service club within the Kiwanis Club that is they're interested in getting people with disabilities to come join Kiwanis. So I think we should be in touch with them and reaching out. And I would love to be a part of that. It's called the Aktion Club and I encourage anyone who's interested to please check it out.

Anto Aghapekian: I know the person...

Chair Beth Kenny: That sounds great. So on the housing stuff that you were discussing, last night at City Council, they approved a master plan for the Marina Shores Project, which is, I believe, part of the Clement Street Corridor that you're talking about and the project would include 760 new residential developments. So by my math, that's over 220 universally designed units that should be part of this project, and that's 760 visitable units that will be part of this project, so I was pretty excited about that.

Chair Beth Kenny: But the other thing that came up at City Council last night was, they were discussing the rent control ordinance or ballot measure, rather. The current ordinance is going on the ballot, and I just wanted to let you all know, because what the ballot measure basically does is put the current ordinance in the City Charter and by putting that ordinance in the City Charter, it means that no changes can be made to that ordinance, without a public vote. So, if we decide, "Oh, we really want to push to protect disabled people from no cause evictions," or ask for extra relocation costs for people who are disabled, or extra relocation time.

Chair Beth Kenny: That would require, if this ballot measure passes, it would require a citywide vote. So it would have to go on the ballot. And honestly, for very small things, if they wanted to even change punctuation, it's my understanding that it would then have to go on a City ballot. And it made me think we should be thinking about what our disabled population faces in terms of rent, issues in rent stability, and certainly relocation if they have to move. I think there are some good issues we can be thinking and making some recommendations to the City Council regarding that. And I'd like it to be on our radar, and perhaps we can get an agenda speaker at some point to talk about that.

Chair Beth Kenny: The November ballot has a ballot measure that is asking about, "Should we put the current rent control ordinance into the City Charter?" Well, I don't think that we can address really, the ballot measure. I wanted to let you guys know what that is, but it also sparked in me that we should just kind of proceed with, whether the ballot measure goes through or not, it might be something we should be looking at, protecting the disabled population who are renters in Alameda. And what sort of recommendations, if we need to make recommendations, what kind of recommendations we can make. Those are my announcements, and I think we'll go on to staff communication.

6. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

More on 4C:

Laurie Kozisek: Thank you, Madam Chairman. I did a quick check on my phone while we were talking and found out that City Council will be meeting on November 7th. I don't know why, but they'll be meeting on a Wednesday that week. So, I would recommend that you do a vote saying you would like to meet on November 21st, because there's nobody on the City calendar for November 21st.

Chair Beth Kenny: Is City Council meeting November sixth?

Laurie Kozisek: That's a Tuesday.

Chair Beth Kenny: Right.

Laurie Kozisek: I don't know, I didn't check that. I just noticed that they are meeting on a Wednesday, for some reason.

Chair Beth Kenny: I was just thinking that on the 21st...the 22nd is Thanksgiving.

Chair Beth Kenny: So, I don't really want to do the 21st. I can recommend, I would put out there the 28th, if that's available?

Laurie Kozisek: That, I believe, is available.

Chair Beth Kenny: Okay, so that's the last Wednesday of November.

Laurie Kozisek: Which ironically is when the Transportation Commission will not be meeting, so it will be available.

Chair Beth Kenny: So, I would recommend the 28th. Do I have a second?

Anto Aghapekian: Second.

Chair Beth Kenny: All in favor?

All: Aye.

Chair Beth Kenny: Any opposed? The 28th, it is.

Laurie Kozisek: I will double check that again.

6-A Façade Response

Laurie Kozisek: And then, my other item, somehow it didn't get on there. For the facade response,

**COMMISSION ON DISABILITY
MEETING MINUTES
Wednesday July 11, 2018 6:30 p.m.**

I sent an email asking about if facade moneys could be used to make entrances more accessible, and they said, no. It's got to be used for making it look more beautiful. I'm sorry, but we might be able to find some other grants, so that we could push for ADA grants to make entrances more accessible.

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you, Laurie. I spoke with Linda Asberry, who is head of the West Alameda Business Association, and she's actually on that Facade Grants Program. She's part of the people who approve who gets the facade grants. So she might be a good person to just figure out how they got the facade grants going in the first place, and instead of facade grants, we can have accessibility grants.

Vice Chair Jenn Barrett: Yes, that's a great idea.

Chair Beth Kenny: And she is also very interested in the program that you're putting together.

Vice Chair Jenn Barrett: Great. Do you have our email?

Chair Beth Kenny: I do.

Vice Chair Jenn Barrett: Okay, that'll be great.

Chair Beth Kenny: I'll shoot that over to you.

Vice Chair Jenn Barrett: Thank you so much.

Chair Beth Kenny: Sure.

Laurie Kozisek: Okay, That's all I had.

7. ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Beth Kenny: Thank you very much. If there are no other announcements...

8. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Beth Kenny: I'd like to adjourn our meeting.