

APPROVED MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF ALAMEDA PLANNING BOARD
MONDAY, OCTOBER 22, 2018

1. CONVENE

President Mitchell convened the meeting at 7:00pm

2. FLAG SALUTE

Board Member Teague led the flag salute.

3. ROLL CALL

Present: President Mitchell, Board Members Cavanaugh, Curtis, Rothenberg, Saheba, Sullivan, Teague.

4. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

New board member, Rothenberg, introduced herself and shared some background on her experience as an architect.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

None

6. CONSENT CALENDAR

None

7. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

7-A 2018-6092

PLN17-0600 - 1051 Harbor Bay Parkway - Design Review, Planned Development Amendment, and General Plan Amendment - Applicant: Arris Studio Architects for Shriji Hospitality, Inc. The Planning Board will hold a public hearing to consider Design Review and Development Plan Amendment to allow a 211-room five-story hotel located at the corner of Harbor Bay Parkway and Ron Cowan Parkway. The proposed project includes a General Plan Text Amendment to clarify the floor area ratio requirements of the Harbor Bay Business Park. The property is located within the C-M-PD, Commercial Manufacturing - Planned Development zoning district.

Staff Member Dong introduced the item and gave a presentation. The staff report and attachments can be found at:

<https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3700304&GUID=F023AD00-A54F-4ED5-B818-5B5ED2ACD4E0&FullText=1> .

He said they are asking for the board to now only hold the hearing, give feedback, and continue the item to the November 13th meeting. He said they received late communication from the Port of Oakland that impacts the project.

Board Member Saheba asked what the FAR is for the site.

Staff Member Dong said there is no FAR limit for most of the business park, including this site.

Staff Member Thomas explained the development agreement that vested the FAR guidelines for the project site which preceded changes to the City's General Plan. He said this project has a 0.8 FAR as proposed.

Board Member Curtis asked how guests would access the parking, saying that it looked quite removed from the building entrances.

Staff Member Dong said there are pathways that connect and that he would let the architect explain further in their presentation.

Board Member Teague said the height diagrams were confusing. He said he would like to see the source material explaining the FAR issues and Council guidance.

Vijay Patel, applicant, and the project architect gave a presentation on their proposed project.

Board Member Teague asked how people get to parking lots A-E.

Project architect showed on the diagrams how vehicles will circulate.

Board Member Teague asked if there were any windows large enough to worry about bird safe rules.

Project architect said most of the windows are 6' x 8' with some large windows at the ground floor.

Board Member Saheba asked for and received several clarifications about the parking and vehicular circulation. He to see more details on how the site would be lit.

Board Member Rothenberg asked about sustainable goals and construction type for the project.

Project architect said they will have rooftop solar and will use wood construction over concrete podium, and may be modular construction.

Board Member Cavanaugh asked for more information regarding the height limits.

Staff Member Thomas said that the development agreement allows 100' buildings, but the FAA overlay would be what determines heights for the site.

Board Member Sullivan asked how many employees would be at the facility at any time.

The traffic consultant said the parking demand was calculated from other hotels which captures employees and guest parking together. He said they used suburban hotels as a guideline.

Board Member Sullivan asked about safety for women parking in the satellite lots.

The traffic consultant said it would be more difficult to ensure because of all the downlighting guidelines, but that there should not often be a need to park too far from the building.

Board Member Sullivan asked why the building was so dark.

Mr. Patel said they used the latest Hilton Garden Inn designs and used some cues from the business park.

Board Member Sullivan gave feedback on the tree selections.

Board Member Curtis said his concerns are the access and lighting for the parking lots. He said there should be adequate lighting for people to feel safe.

President Mitchell asked what environmental conservation measures are in place for the building.

The project architect reiterated their intention to have rooftop solar and said they may not have gotten far enough along to think about grey water or other ideas.

President Mitchell said that Alameda would soon have access to recycled water and we should be prepared to take advantage.

President Mitchell opened the public hearing.

Ty Hudson, Unite Here, said they support the project. He said the developer has taken a responsible and collaborative approach towards their future hotel workers.

President Mitchell closed the public hearing.

Board Member Curtis said he is mostly concerned with the safety of the parking and with possible noise levels.

Board Member Saheba said the site is a highly visible gateway. He said the corner has a lot left to be desired. He said the design is not contributing to the gateway sight. He said the design feels busy and unsettling. He said there are many blank facades and that it feels like it would be dated the day it opens. He said he would not support it as designed.

Board Member Teague said his issue is with the General Plan change. He said he would like to see that issue separated out as its own item with supporting staff report before moving forward. He said he is in favor of a hotel at the site. He said he would be interested in seeing a parking ratio that matches the other hotels in the area. He said he supports Board Member Sullivan's feedback on the landscaping. He said he would not be in favor of moving forward until the FAR issue is resolved.

Board Member Sullivan suggested they notify the storage facility next door before construction starts.

Board Member Cavanaugh said he would like to see something built here. He said he is concerned about the design and how it would be experienced as you approach from Ron Cowan Parkway.

Board Member Rothenberg said she agreed with most of the design comments. She said the use is appropriate but revisiting the economic plan might help them be able to solve the design problems.

President Mitchell said he agreed with others about the design assessment. He suggested the applicant study the Site A designs to see what has been successful with the board in the past. He asked whether a subcommittee with the architects would be helpful.

Staff Member Thomas said they could set up an ad hoc subcommittee to work with the applicant on the design.

Board Member Teague made a motion to continue the item to the next meeting. Board Member Curtis seconded the motion.

Staff Member Thomas said they would come back with a gameplan on how to proceed, possibly with a staff report on the General Plan amendment first. He said they can re-notice the project if and when the design is revised.

Board Member Teague said he would like to have the General Plan amendment re-noticed as well.

The motion passed 7-0.

7-B 2018-6090

Board Elections

President Mitchell said he spoke with Board Member Sullivan and that they both are interested in being president. He said there has been a lot of turnover recently on the Planning Board and he thinks he could provide some continuity. He said he would not be offended by whatever the board decides.

Board Member Curtis said that President Mitchell has done an excellent job but that the board should maintain the custom of giving each member a chance to rotate through the chair position. **He nominated Board Member Sullivan to be President. President Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.**

Board Member Teague said he appreciated the civility of the board over the last year and that President Mitchell has done an excellent job. **He nominated Board Member Curtis to serve as Vice President. Board Member Sullivan seconded the motion. The motion passed 7-0.**

8. MINUTES

8-A 2018-6087

Draft Meeting Minutes - May 29, 2018

Board Member Teague made a motion to continue the minutes because they were not included in the hard packet. President Mitchell seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0-2 (Saheba and Rothenberg abstained.)

8-B 2018-6088

Draft Meeting Minutes - June 25, 2018

Board Member Teague said that on page 4 of 8 said that he had several other points he would like to see reflected in the minutes.

President Mitchell corrected a typo regarding the meeting start time.

Board Member Teague made a motion to approve the minutes as amended. Board Member Sullivan seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0-2 (Saheba and Rothenberg abstained.)

8-C 2018-6089

Draft Meeting Minutes - September 10, 2018

Board Member Sullivan corrected her comment under 7-B.

Board Member Sullivan made a motion to approve. Board Member Teague seconded the motion. The motion passed 6-1 (Rothenberg abstained.)

9. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS

9-A 2018-6091

Community Development Department Recent Actions and Decisions

The staff report can be found at:

<https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3700303&GUID=CA2CCFBA-1620-46CD-AE5C-1B3872989EAF&FullText=1>

Board Member Teague asked for more information about the demolished garage on 1421 San Antonio.

Staff Member Dong said the applicant demolished the garage without permits because it was falling down and threatening an oak tree.

Board Member Teague said he wants to make sure that we are not encouraging people to demolish historically significant structures by easily granting retroactive permits.

9-B 2018-6093

Future Public Meetings and Upcoming Community Development Department Projects

The schedule can be found at:

<https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=3700305&GUID=7C95CD6C-4822-47DC-A146-FC42B2D36AF6>

Board Member Teague said that a joint HAB/Planning Board meeting limits opportunity for public comment.

Staff Member Thomas said he would discuss the logistics with the chairs and decide which way to go.

10. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

None

11. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS

Staff Member Thomas introduced a resolution honoring David Burton for his service on the Planning Board.

President Mitchell read the resolution.

Mr. Burton expressed his appreciation to staff. He listed some major projects and efforts that happened during his tenure. He urged the board to build the city that we want, not the city that we have.

Board members expressed their appreciation to Mr. Burton.

12. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

Board Member Sullivan thanked the board for their vote of confidence and said she had big shoes to fill.

13. ADJOURNMENT

President Mitchell adjourned the meeting at 8:52pm.