

APPROVED MINUTES
REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CITY OF ALAMEDA HISTORICAL ADVISORY BOARD
THURSDAY, NOVEMBER 7, 2019

1. CONVENE

Chair Saxby called meeting to order at 7:02 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Chair Saxby, Board Members Jones, Lau, Sanchez, and Wit.

Absent: None.

3. MINUTES

3-A 2019-7414

Draft Meeting Minutes – September 5, 2019

Board Member Wit made a motion to approve the minutes. Board Member Lau seconded the motion. The motion passed 4-0-1 (Sanchez abstained).

4. AGENDA CHANGES AND DISCUSSION

None.

5. ORAL COMMUNICATION

None.

6. WRITTEN COMMUNICATIONS

None.

7. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

7-A 2019-7409

PLN19-0334 - Certificate of Approval - 1223 Post Street - Applicant: Angie Klein. Public hearing to consider a Certificate of Approval to construct a two-story addition at the rear of an existing two-story duplex, built prior to 1942, which will require demolition of more than 30% of the structure's current value, as determined by the Building Official. The property is listed on the City's Historic Building Study List with an "H" designation. The project site is located in the R-1 (One-family Residential) Zoning District.

Linda Barrera, Planner II, gave a presentation. The staff report and attachments can be found at:

<https://alameda.legistar.com/LegislationDetail.aspx?ID=4208387&GUID=9DBE8CB8-D5D1-44E0-AFDB-212FD5C74F8C&FullText=1>

Board Member Sanchez asked if the upstairs unit was original or part of the previous addition.

Staff Member Barrera said it is not clear when the unit was added. She said the research shows that the original cottage was 1.5 stories.

Board Member Sanchez asked if the front stairs were being replaced.

Staff Member Barrera said the front stairs and stair railings would be replaced.

Chair Saxby asked for clarification regarding what work is being done to the original portion of the building.

Angie Klein, applicant, said they only plan to replace the lower stairs and the railing.

Chair Saxby asked if the original building had a brick foundation that would be updated.

Ms. Klein said that the foundation would probably wait for a future time due to budget concerns.

Board Member Sanchez asked if the chimney being removed serviced an existing fireplace.

Ms. Klein said they are removing the chimney because it is unsafe and there is no fireplace inside presently.

Board Member Lau asked why the addition would use double hung windows when the original home has single hung windows.

Ms. Klein said she believes the existing home also has double hung windows.

Board Member Jones asked whether an addition built in 1910 would meet the requirements for historic preservation, even though it is not original and not as beautiful.

Staff Member Barrera said that the age of the addition is part of the reason they are asking for a Certificate of Approval for the demolition. She said the addition is non-descript and has been altered significantly over time, which contribute to the staff recommendation to allow the new addition to move forward.

Board Member Lau asked if the siding would need to be special ordered to match the old width of the siding on the original house.

Ms. Klein said they could order specially milled siding to match if the owner preferred. She said that there would be a plane change in the wall, which would make it easier to have a slightly different siding on the addition.

Chair Saxby asked for clarification about the roof plan and whether there was a step in the roof in order to maintain a consistent eave line.

Ms. Klein responded regarding the roof plan.

Chair Saxby said that he is concerned about how the roof on the two story portion of the addition will meet with the one story roof.

There were no public speakers.

Chair Saxby liked that the proposed two-story addition is separated from the historic house. He said the roof plan needs to be worked out. He suggested further differentiating the window trim on the addition. He said the addition seems pretty massive compared to the original home.

Board Member Sanchez agreed that the addition does seem bulkier than the original. He said that its location away from the corner mitigates that issue, as well as the care given by including the single story element to separate the addition. He said overall he feels the approach is fairly good. He suggested possibly adjusting the plate height over the dining room in order to get the eaves to match up. He said that however they do it, they need to carefully address the roof plan to prevent an awkward step. He said it would be important that the brick mold be done in wood and not a clad product.

Board Member Lau said the east elevation should only have two windows in the addition to match the original structure.

Chair Saxby pointed out that the triplet window would be above the kitchen sink which would dictate a smaller size than in the original home.

Board Member Jones agreed with the comment to simplify the window frames in the new addition. She suggested a change to the roof design to help minimize the extra height of the new addition. She asked why addition had to be taller than the original home.

Ms. Klein said the modern structural requirements require thicker floors and that the owners are quite tall and do not want to have low ceilings on the second floor.

Board Member Sanchez said he would not like to see a change in the rhythm of the roof pitches.

Chair Saxby summarized the proposed conditions: correct the roof design on the corner where the dining room and kitchen come together to keep the roof plane consistent on the east elevation; simplified window trims without the brick mold for the addition. He asked for a motion to approve with those proposed conditions included.

Board Member Jones made a motion to approve with the conditions Chair Saxby described. Board Member Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed 5-0.

8. BOARD COMMUNICATIONS

None.

9. STAFF COMMUNICATIONS

Henry Dong, Planner III, said that Site A's Block 11 and Waterfront Park may come to the Board in December. He suggested the January meeting may be rescheduled or cancelled due to conflict with the New Year's holiday.

Board Member Sanchez asked for an update on 2070 Lincoln.

Staff Member Dong said that the applicant is still evaluating how to proceed.

10. ORAL COMMUNICATIONS

None.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Saxby adjourned the meeting at 7:49 p.m.