MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING TUESDAY- -FEBRUARY 18, 2020- -5:30 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 5:30 p.m.

<u>Roll Call</u> – Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Knox White, Oddie, Vella and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5.

[Note: Councilmember Vella arrived at 5:41 p.m.]

Absent: None.

Consent Calendar

(<u>20-076</u>) Recommendation to Approve Eric Levitt, City Manager, Gerry Beaudin, Assistant City Manager, Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director, and Alan Cohen, Assistant City Attorney, as Labor Negotiators for the City of Alameda. Accepted.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote -4. [Absent: Councilmember Vella -1.]

Public Comment

<u>Stated that he submitted a letter; discussed conflict of interests and campaign</u> <u>contributions</u>: Jay Garfinkle, Alameda.

The meeting was adjourned to Closed Session to consider:

(20-077) Conference with Labor Negotiators (Government Code section 54957.6); City Negotiators: Eric Levitt, City Manager; Gerry Beaudin, Assistant City Manager; Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director; and Alan Cohen, Assistant City Attorney; Employee Organizations: International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 1245 (IBEW), Electric Utility Professional Association of Alameda (EUPA), Alameda City Employees Association (ACEA), Alameda Police Officers Association Non-Sworn Unit (PANS), and Alameda Management and Confidential Employees Association (MCEA), International Association of Firefighter, Local 689 (IAFF) Alameda Fire Managers Association (AFMA), Alameda Police Officers Association (APOA) and Alameda Police Managers Association (APMA), Executive Management Employees (EXME) and Alameda Municipal Power Unrepresented Management Employees (AMPU); Under Negotiation: Salaries, Employee Benefits and Terms of Employment

(20-078) Conference with Legal Counsel – <u>Existing Litigation</u> (Pursuant to Government Code § 54956.9); Case Name: Boatworks v City of Alameda, et al.; Court: Superior

Court of the State of California, County of Alameda; Case Numbers: RG16823346, RG16841240, RG19041531

(20-079) Conference with Legal Counsel – Liability Claim (Pursuant to Government Code § 54956.95); Claimant: Grand Edibles, Inc.; Agency Claimed Against: City of Alameda

Following the Closed Session, the meeting was reconvened and the City Clerk announced that regarding Labor and Existing Litigation, staff provided information to Council and direction was provided to staff with no vote taken; regarding the Claim, staff provided information; this matter involves a claim filed by Grand Edibles, Inc., against the City of Alameda alleging that the City breached its obligations as landlord under a lease for 300 Island Drive in the City of Alameda: Grand Edibles contents that beginning in June of 2018, the City allowed the adjacent lessee and operator of the Chuck Corica Golf Complex, Greenway Golf Associates, Inc., to reconstruct the north golf course in a manner that interfered with Grand Edibles business and forced it to close; the City has tendered Grand Edibles' claim to Greenway and maintains that at all times it acted in accordance with all of its obligations as landlord; nonetheless, in order to avoid the expense and uncertainty of litigation, by the following voice vote: Ayes: Councilmembers Daysog, Knox White, Vella and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 4, Abstention: Councilmember Oddie – 1, the City Council authorizes the City Attorney to settle this matter with Grand Edibles by paying Grand Edibles an amount not to exceed \$100,000, less a \$50,000 reimbursement payment which Greenway will provide to the City within five days of Grand Edibles March 31, 2020 lease termination date; an amount not to exceed \$69,000 for monthly rent due from Grand Edibles for the months of February and March 2020, as well as all unpaid delinguent rent, late fees and interest from March 1, 2019 through January 31, 2020 shall also be waived.

<u>Adjournment</u>

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 6:49 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING TUESDAY- - FEBRUARY 18, 2020- -7:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 7:02 p.m. Councilmember Daysog led the Pledge of Allegiance.

(20-080) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft made comments in memory of Sarah Lorraine Giles and urged drivers to be mindful.

<u>ROLL CALL</u> - Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Knox White, Oddie, Vella, and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5.

Absent: None.

AGENDA CHANGES

(20-081) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft suggested hearing the Code Enforcement program [paragraph no. 20-100] and ordinance [paragraph no. 20-101] together.

Councilmember Oddie moved approval of combining the items.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion.

Under discussion the City Attorney stated combining the items works for him.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by unanimous voice vote -5.

PROCLAMATIONS, SPECIAL ORDERS OF THE DAY AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

(20-082) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft presented certificates of appreciation to Officers Frank Petersen, Russel Wise and Craig Vreeland and Detective Jeffrey Park for a water rescue.

(20-083) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft did a reading for the Season for Non-Violence: Gentleness.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

None.

CONSENT CALENDAR

Vice Mayor Knox White and Councilmember Vella stated that they would be voting no on final passage of the Sunshine Ordinance amendments [paragraph no. <u>20-097</u>].

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft announced the agreement with Centro Legal [paragraph no. 20-

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council February 18, 2020 089] was removed from the Consent Calendar for discussion.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of the remainder of the Consent Calendar.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote – 5. [Items so enacted or adopted are indicated by an asterisk preceding the paragraph number.]

(*20-084) Minutes of the Special and Regular City Council Meetings Held on January 21, 2020. Approved.

(*20-085) Ratified bills in the amount of \$5,113,227.50.

(*20-086) Recommendation to Accept the Quarterly Sales Tax Report for the Reporting Period Ending September 30, 2019 (Funds Collected During the Period April 1 to June 30, 2019). Accepted.

(*20-087) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager, or Designee, to Execute a Third Amendment with Cultivate LLC to Increase Compensation by \$75,000, for a Total Aggregate Compensation Not to Exceed \$145,500, to Continue Providing Technical Planning Support to the City of Alameda General Plan Update. Accepted.

(*20-088) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute an Amendment to Agreement with Ghirardelli Associates to Increase the Compensation by an Amount Not to Exceed \$192,232, for a Total Contract Amount of \$645,136, for Construction Management Services for the Seaplane Lagoon Ferry Terminal Project at Alameda Point. Accepted.

(20-089) Recommendation to: 1) Authorize the City Manager to Execute an Amendment to the Service Provider Agreement with Centro Legal de la Raza to Revise the Scope of Services, with No Change to the Compensation, for Legal Services to Lower-Income Tenant Households in Alameda; and 2) Accept Centro Legal de la Raza's Annual Report Concerning Free Legal Services for Low Income Tenants in Alameda.

The Community Development Director gave a brief presentation.

Expressed support for the contract changes: Cheri Johansen, Alameda Progressives.

<u>Stated calls have increased since just cause protections were adopted; the services will help tenants</u>: Catherine Pauling, Alameda Renters Coalition.

Stated the legal assistance is needed to implement the changes in the law; expressed support for Centro Legal de la Raza; stated settlements occur when renters have a lawyer; urged approval: Lana Rishina, Alameda.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she supports having an agreement with Centro Legal

de la Raza, but has concerns with some of the amendments; Centro Legal said it did not serve as many people as it wanted to in the first year, yet is asking to decrease the number of people served while being paid the same amount; expressed concern about Centro Legal not having any Asian language translators and wanting to use phone translators, which is unacceptable; stated that she is also concerned about the clinic locations and hours; Centro Legal should be in Alameda once a week at a set location, which can rotate; only offering the services on weekday mornings is troublesome because many people cannot take time off of work; outreach should inform people about Alameda locations; the contract amount seems steep for only phone consultations; she wants the legal representation to be effective; unless there are modifications, she cannot support approval of the contact.

Councilmember Daysog inquired how the service provider ensures it is pursuing legal cases only after examining the perspective of both the renter and small landlord; whether the service provider guards against situations where they are not getting the full picture from a client; what internal policies and procedures are in place to ensure Centro Legal gets the full picture.

The Community Development Director responded Centro Legal's first approach is to talk to both the landlord and tenant to try to negotiate a resolution and not have the issue end up in court; stated Centro Legal has not initiated litigation against an Alameda landlord; working to negotiate solutions without going to court has been effective; there is a fact finding process and Centro Legal speaks to both the landlord and the tenant.

Councilmember Daysog inquired whether Centro Legal has written letters to landlords on behalf of tenants, to which the Community Development Director responded in the affirmative.

Monique Berlanga, Centro Legal de la Raza, stated the questions are all things Centro Legal has been examining internally.

Councilmember Daysog inquired whether internal policies or procedures institutionalize the fact finding phase; stated that he is aware of some small landlords who received a letter which presumed the landlord was wrong without the landlord being interviewing or facts being gathered.

Ms. Berlanga stated different levels of service are provided; outlined various services offered, including entering into legal representation; stated facts are investigated before entering into litigation or extended services.

Councilmember Daysog stated internal policies and procedures should include indicating when it is not a legal situation; when a landlord gets a letter, they need to understand when something will be fixed in the courts; he has heard landlords felt their perspective was not taken into account; small landlords might have difficulty waging a legal case.

Ms. Berlanga stated Centro Legal prides itself on intervening early before a situation gets to the point of eviction, which is why lowering the number of eviction cases and increasing tenant education and outreach efforts is being proposed; at clinics, tenants want help interpreting leases or help deescalating issues; the focus is more collaborative efforts, but Centro Legal has duties to clients to enforce their rights and help provide notice; Centro Legal is very careful to investigate all of the facts before entering into a full legal representation.

Councilmember Vella stated that she hears the concerns about translation; finding a balance between informational sessions versus one on one client time is difficult; questioned whether appointments could be scheduled in Alameda to meet needs with phone interpreters.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, Councilmember Vella discussed scheduling appointments; stated people often do not want to drop in because they are concerned about having to wait; when scheduling, language preference can be addressed; inquired what Centro Legal does for other contracts.

Ms. Berlanga responded Centro Legal administers contacts for other jurisdictions which are similarly evolving; stated pilot programs are started to determine the community's needs and modifications are made; appointments are a great idea; a weekly drop in clinic may not be a good use of resources; an appointment based system works well given timelines; a three day notice might not allow tenants to wait for the next drop in clinic; often, individual appointments are made or advice is given over the phone; unlawful detainers have a five day response time; for face to face meetings with tenants, volunteer or hired interpreters could be present, but if not, the language line could be used; further stated Centro Legal is open to talking to each Councilmember about ideas, groups to reach out to and locations, and is happy to spend as much time on the Island as works for tenants.

Councilmember Vella stated Alameda has a tenants group; working with the tenant group is important; some drop in hours should be scheduled and coordinated with the tenant group or the Housing Authority; inquired whether materials are available in the known languages spoken in Alameda, such as Mandarin and Cantonese.

Ms. Berlanga responded the budget modification requested increased funding to contract for translation of outreach materials.

Councilmember Vella stated that she is very supportive of Centro Legal sending letters representing people who might not have a voice; letters are sometimes necessary and bring people to the table.

Councilmember Oddie stated legal services are governed by the Business and Professions Code; by nature and law, attorneys are not the finder of facts; a dispute in facts does not mean landlords are right; Centro Legal's job is to represent and advocate for tenants if there is a dispute that might end up in court; inquired whether Centro Legal's job is to advocate for tenants.

Ms. Berlanga responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Oddie stated 62 people were served; 14% were Asian Pacific Islander (API); inquired whether the languages spoken are known, to which Ms. Berlanga responded that she does not have the specific numbers.

Councilmember Oddie stated Alameda's language breakdown is Chinese, Filipino, Vietnamese and he thinks Korean is next; there is not a tremendous number of languages; it bothers him that one in seven clients may not speak the language; as the Mayor pointed out, Alameda is getting less for the same amount of money and will have the pay an additional amount for translation; Centro Legal should work with the City on the matter; if coming every week is not feasible, there has to be a middle option.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the City could help make connections with the Alameda community, such as Alice Lai-Bitker, who is very tied into the API community; there are many others, too; stated there might have been more renters in need who did not know about the service if materials were not available in their languages.

Councilmember Oddie stated there are a number of resources with translators that do not charge through the roof.

Ms. Berlanga concurred; stated that she does not think there has been a problem with the service provision of providing services in other languages; she is concerned communities might not know about the availability of the services; she hopes the City can help with connections; Centro Legal has many partner agencies to help with translation of materials and wants to focus efforts in a culturally responsive way.

Councilmember Oddie requested Ms. Berlanga address whether issues raised by the Mayor can be resolved.

Ms. Berlanga stated regarding the decrease in deliverables, the initial proposal was based the maximum number of eviction cases one attorney with a paralegal could represent; 40 is the maximum responsible case load for an eviction defense attorney; the pilot has shown eviction defense is not the primary need in Alameda; the primary need is consultation services, including clarification about the law and educating people of their rights; the proposal is to increase said efforts and focus on outreach, tenant education and consultation services, as opposed to having an arbitrary number of eviction defense cases; Centro Legal wants to prevent evictions and provide the whole spectrum of services, including Emergency Financial Assistance (EFA); Centro Legal does not view the changes as offering fewer services and is viewing it as modifying existing services to meet community needs; the focus could be on eviction defense only, but Centro Legal believes a broader range of services is the best way to combat displacement.

Councilmember Oddie stated the two items the Mayor raised were the language availability and having to pay for said service and the hours not being convenient; Alameda also has a growing population of people who speak Arabic languages.

Ms. Berlanga stated although the language line is not a perfect solution, Centro Legal's most recent bill was for 15 different languages; recent case law requires courts to provide interpreters during court proceedings; in person interpretation is expensive, but is important; Centro Legal has partnerships with other organizations, which can be drawn upon if Centro Legal wants to do a presentation in another language; any connections the City can provide would be appreciated.

Katy Guimond, Centro Legal de la Raza, provided the figures on the people served: one person indicated Cantonese, one person indicated Tagalog, the rest were English, French and Spanish; a few did not report a language.

Councilmember Oddie stated the City should not be billed extra if translation was only for two clients.

Ms. Berlanga stated Centro Legal is not billing extra and simply ensuring translation is part of the contract.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated Council has not even agreed to what will be approved as far as funding for next year; requested Ms. Berlanga wrap up quickly.

Ms. Berlanga stated Centro Legal is open to suggestions or ideas in terms of clinics and hours; she thinks an appointment based system would be really great; an initial intake can be done via phone with an appointment setup in Alameda based on what works for the tenant; Centro Legal provides evening clinics.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the evening clinics are in Oakland.

Ms. Berlanga responded in the affirmative; stated Alameda tenants have been coming to the clinics.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated even if Alameda tenants have been to the clinics; the tenants who did not attend cannot be counted.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the goal was 125 connections last year; the goal is dropping to 75; inquired whether Centro Legal actually spoke to 62 people and whether his general understanding is correct, to which Ms. Berlanga responded in the affirmative.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the budget proposes to do more outreach with less money for legal representation; inquired whether Centro Legal assumes services will be provided to a greater number of people. Ms. Berlanga responded in the affirmative; stated there will be more touches; Centro Legal thinks the impact will be greater.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he agrees about the language issue and wants to know how it will be handled and clarified; questioned if there is enough money for outreach and if the amount should be increased to reach other communities; he would like on site meetings in Alameda.

Councilmember Vella stated there should be a way to partner with surrounding organizations, which are based in Oakland and active in Alameda, such as Filipino Advocates for Justice and Asian Health Services; perhaps a know your rights event could be co-sponsored with said groups with breakouts in various languages; resources should be pooled to be more effective; she would also love to see events cosponsored with the Alameda Renters Coalition; resources should be pooled amongst non-profits; she would like to see a such a plan.

The Community Development Director stated Supervisor Wilma Chan's office wants to do a know your rights event; she referred them to Centro Legal to combine forces; the Housing Authority is also working with Centro Legal on a forum; said events are being done as outreach under the enhanced outreach budget; summarized the key points raised tonight regarding interpreters and not paying extra for the language line; stated Cento Legal currently meets with tenants in person with a translator on the phone; the Council would like to see a model with an interpreter physically present at the in person appointment.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she has softened on an interpreter; an interpreter should be found if a tenant requests someone in person; she cannot agree to add to the budget to provide more services, outreach and translation; the budget has all that is needed; less legal representation and more education is being done, which is non-attorney time; the contract is plenty rich in terms of compensation, especially for touching fewer clients.

The Community Development Director stated additional compensation is not being requested; the recommendation is a revised work scope using the existing budget.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the Community Development Director stated the point that was being made in the Annual Report was less about translation and more about the cultural competency; Centro Legal doing a deeper dive around cultural competency would require additional funding, but additional funding was not requested; cultural competency differs from translation services; more robust outreach will involve reaching out to Alice Lai-Bitker and other connections in the community, but will not require additional funding.

(20-090) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested a maximum of three additional minutes.

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council February 18, 2020 Councilmember Daysog moved approval of giving Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft an additional three minutes.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote – 5.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is stunned an organization as well regarded and competent as Centro Legal did not know that working in Alameda would involve speaking with non-English speaking Asian clients; there have been great suggestions to improve the cultural competency from Councilmembers, such as partnering; more robust outreach should be done within the same funding envelope; if she is going to vote for the proposal she needs to see more time spent in Alameda; tenants already struggle and work two to three jobs to pay rent and should not have to take time to go to Oakland.

Councilmember Daysog stated the services should be in Alameda; that he would like more information about how Centro Legal can guard against situations where it is not getting the full picture; information should be gathered from small landlords before reaching the point of legal representation; he wants a process and internal procedures in place to ensure getting the full picture before a matter becomes a legal issue.

Councilmember Oddie inquired what Council wants to modify in the agreement; stated should a check in be required in 90 days to ensure implementation.

The City Attorney responded the Council can make modifications, but the other side would have to agree to sign the modified agreement.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he is not comfortable waiting a year.

The Community Development Director stated the work scope can be amended to have one on one appointments in Alameda, drop in clinics more than once a month, and know your right events with a six month check in with Council; translation of materials is already contemplated in the scope of work.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she wants to see more robust outreach to non-English speaking communities.

Councilmember Vella stated a rent registry is being done and will have information which can be utilized; the City should also be getting out the word about Centro Legal's services in different languages and people should be notified Centro provides services in the different languages.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated said suggestion should be within the scope of the outreach and marketing budget; the EFA is \$25,000 next year and \$30,000 the following year; last year, Alameda tenants received \$47,462 in EFA grants; inquired why the amount is being reduced; stated that she would feel more comfortable holding back some of the \$166,666 for the City to decide; City authorization is needed; inquired why \$25,000 is being requested and if the need is decreasing.

The Community Development Director responded the funding was not in Centro Legal's budget last year; stated it came from the County.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated it looks like the City will be taking over and questioned why less is being allocated.

The Community Development Director stated tenants were able to access County money last November through May; the County contract is still in place; the amount is an augmentation; if the County contract is not renewed in May, there would be \$30,000 for the following year; the report back to Council can include what the County does with the contract in May and address whether or not there will be a reduction.

Councilmember Oddie moved approval of the staff recommendation, with direction for staff to come back in four months, hearing all of the concerns that were raised, seeing if there can be some agreement or modifications Council could consider to amend the agreement based on further research and negotiation, if needed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested explanation.

Councilmember Oddie stated rather than changing anything today, staff would return in four months with different ways to amend the agreement to alleviate concerns at no additional costs.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the amendment would be based on Council comments.

Councilmember Oddie responded in the affirmative; stated the contract would move forward and not lapse; he does not like the idea of amending the agreement from the dais, but would be open to firm amendments that Council thinks Centro Legal would accept.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Vice Mayor Knox White stated a staff report returning in four months would only include two months of data; the report should return in September; time should be given to allow issues to be addressed; he supports the motion, but there should be clarity about what will be reported back; he believes it would include in person language interpretation, how meetings are going, how outreach is happening and if outreach has been successful.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether Vice Mayor Knox White is making a substitute motion.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired whether Councilmember Oddie is willing to accept amendment to the motion.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he would prefer before the end of July; it should not take that much time to report out on outreach efforts and figuring out languages; data on case numbers will not be available; data is not needed on specific points raised around meeting in Alameda and interpretation services.

Councilmember Vella proposed amending the motion to provide an off agenda report to Council in four months and the matter return on agenda in September.

Councilmember Oddie agreed to amend the motion.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following voice vote: Ayes: Councilmembers Knox White, Oddie, Vella and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft - 4. Abstention: Councilmember Daysog - 1.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft called a recess at 8:19 p.m. and reconvened at 8:30 p.m.

(<u>20-091</u>) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated staff has requested the Code Enforcement program [paragraph no. <u>20-100</u>] and ordinance be addressed separately [paragraph no. <u>20-101</u>].

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of hearing the items separately.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote – 4. [Absent: Councilmember Vella – 1.]

(*20-092) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Three-Year Agreement with Precision Emprise, LLC, dba Precision Concrete Cutting, for Sidewalk Trip Hazard Removal in an Amount Not to Exceed \$825,000. Accepted.

(*<u>20-093</u>) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Approve a Two-Step Procurement Process for Integrated Waste Franchise by First Entering into Sole Source Negotiations with Alameda County Industries. Accepted.

(*20-094) <u>Resolution No. 15631</u>, "Appointing an Engineer-of-Work and an Attorney-of-Record for Island City Landscaping and Lighting District 84-2 (Various Locations Throughout the City)." Adopted. [345-20]

(*20-095) <u>Resolution No. 15632</u>, "Appointing an Engineer-of-Work and an Attorney-of-Record for Maintenance Assessment District 01-1 (Marina Cove)." Adopted.

(*20-096) Ordinance No. 3260, "Approving a Lease and Authorizing the City Manager or Designee to Execute Documents Necessary to Implement the Terms of a One-Year Lease With Four One-Year Extension Options, Each Subject to Reasonable Discretionary Approval of the City Manager, with Shelter In Peace, Inc., a California Non-Profit Corporation, for 2815 San Diego Road Located at Alameda Point to Operate Transitional Housing for Refugees." Finally passed.

(20-097) Ordinance No. 3261, "Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by Amending Various Provisions of Article VIII (Sunshine Ordinance) of Chapter II (Administration), including Provisions Related to Public Access to Public Meetings and Public Records, and Sunshine Ordinance Enforcement, Including Recommendations to Eliminate the "Null and Void" or "Order to Cure" Remedies and Replace Such Remedies With the Authority for the Open Government Commission to Issue Recommendations to Cure and Correct." Finally passed.

Note: Final passage of the ordinance carried by the following voice vote: Ayes: Councilmembers Daysog, Oddie and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 3. Noes: Vice Mayor Knox White and Councilmember Vella – 2.

(*20-098) Ordinance No. 3262, "Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by: (1) Adding New Section 23-9 (Personal Wireless Service Facilities in the Public Right-Of-Way); and (2) Amending Section 2-59.3 (Limitation and Power to Make Contracts) to Exempt Master License Agreements for Use of Public Assets for Personal Wireless Service Facility Installation." Finally passed.

REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

(20-099) Recommendation to Authorize the City Manager to Execute a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with the East Bay Regional Park District (EBRPD) Related to the Northwest Territories Regional Shoreline at Alameda Point, and to Approve the Finding that the Northwest Territories Regional Park Disposition is Exempt from the Surplus Lands Act, as Amended, as the Property is Proposed to be Leased to Another Local Agency (EBRPD) for the Agency's Use and Because It is Located on Public Trust Lands.

The Community Development Director and Recreation and Parks Director gave a Power Point presentation.

Councilmember Vella returned at 8:34 p.m. during the presentation.

Expressed support for moving forward; suggested a workshop be held before a year passes; stated the public should be apprised; when agreement was not reached on proceeding with a wildlife refuge, there was no input from the public or the City; discussed work being done by the Navy: Richard Bangert, Alameda.

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council February 18, 2020 Stated that she spends time on the water around the Northwest Territories; paddlers would like to provide input; suggested having a landing spot for stand up paddleboards and kayaks; thought should be given to cleaning up garbage along the shoreline, making a space for nature, wildlife and boat management: Mary Spicer, Alameda.

<u>Submitted information; discussed sea level rise; proposed returning the area to</u> <u>wetlands; requested her proposal be conveyed to EBRPD</u>: Aimee Barnes, Alameda.

Stated the Sierra Club endorses the MOU; urged approval: Pat Lamborn, Alameda.

Stated the MOU has been a long time coming; urged approval: Irene Dieter, Alameda.

Councilmember Vella stated that she supports the staff recommendation.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated he enthusiastically supports the recommendation; Ms. Barnes proposal will not be heard tonight, but looks like a great plan.

Councilmember Daysog stated the project will be beautiful; he likes the idea of paddle board parking; discussed progress at Alameda Point.

Councilmember Oddie moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Oddie requested there be a check in if snags occur; stated that he shared a concern about rodenticides with the City Manager; the project will be amazing; he is thankful the project is moving forward.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is enthusiastic about the project; discussed an annual Navy tour and the Veterans Administration (VA) project; stated the MOU should not be amended; rodenticides can be addressed as part of the lease negotiations.

Councilmember Oddie stated if rodenticides are used, the wildlife could eat the dead rodents.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested restrooms be addressed; stated the lease should specify whether the VA or EBRPD will build the restroom facilities.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by unanimous voice vote -5.

(20-100) Recommendation to Review the Planning and Building Code Enforcement Program in Response to the City Council's November 19, 2019 Referral, and Provide Direction on Potential Future Changes to the Existing Enforcement Program.

The Building Official gave a Power Point presentation.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the current staff is similar to other cities; inquired about adding a position.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded every city does it differently; stated the position would be a working supervisor, which would increase the City's ratio relative to other cities.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated Code Enforcement Officers also do other things; inquired how much time is spent on Code Enforcement.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded that he does not have the information; stated full time Public Works employees job duties include enforcement in the public right of way; the question is how to include the employees in the program when they report to other supervisors for other job duties.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether comparisons were done with other cities with consolidated Code Enforcement units.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded most are organized similar to Alameda, with Planning and Building enforcing Building Codes and Public Works enforcing right of way violations; stated some organize around quality of life; some Council priorities are not life safety.

Councilmember Vella discussed Berkeley's program; stated Emeryville might do a ballot measure for a Code Enforcement officer; Oakland is also amending its program; inquired whether making changes is a trend.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded that he did not see a trend; stated every city seems to be struggling with new kinds of issues, such as marijuana and rent control.

Councilmember Vella stated there are health and safety issues outside the detailed Building Codes; inquired where smoking, mold, lead, night sky, AirBnB, minimum wage, or straw issues fall within the priority list; stated the Council has adopted ordinances in response to environmental, health and safety, and accessibility concerns; inquired whether Council needs to give more direction about the issues.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded a lot of the laws were not around in 1999; stated the priorities should be reviewed and updated; Police is primarily dealing with smoking in public; staff is going to improve coordination internally, which does not require Council direction; Planning relies on other departments; Police handles nighttime complaints, such as noise violations.

The Building Official stated lead abatement is a heath safety issue tied to the Building Code; the City has been very successful with lead abatement.

The Code Compliance Officer stated the Department considers lead and mold very serious issues; discussed treating water intrusion to address mold; stated life safety issues are addressed immediately.

Councilmember Vella stated the potential budget includes a car; inquired whether other tools and new technology is needed for inspections and whether training is needed.

The Building Official responded the City has the tools; stated if the City is not trained, the County services are used; the budget line item includes a car, office and computer.

Councilmember Daysog stated the City seems to be good at dealing with the built environment; new areas not related to the built environment require enforcement; structures underneath the overpass near Webster Street are a Code Enforcement issue, as well as social and health related, and require working with social workers.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated Constitution Way overpass encampment enforcement issues are tricky; the property belongs to Caltrans; the Police Department cannot do enforcement; the Highway Patrol is Caltrans' enforcement arm; the City is working across jurisdictions on the matter.

<u>Stated renters are bringing forward habitability issues; education is needed once the program is clarified; discussed noise and mold issues</u>: Catherine Pauling, Alameda.

Noted residents need the services of Centro Legal de la Raza; urged approval: Arminda Graca, Alameda.

In response to Councilmember Oddie's inquiry about what staff wants, the Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated Council directed staff to make adjustments; staff reviewed the program; the City Manager's recommendation is to add another person to the Department, which could be brought back as part of the midyear budget; staff wants to ensure prioritization is being done correctly; consolidating under one department will be tricky.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he agrees an extra person is needed; he likes the proposed idea; discussed maintaining rentals.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he is not convinced another position is needed; he does not want the City to be going after landlords; data has to speak for itself and is not there right now; he is willing to listen if there is a broader case to increase staff, but he has a problem if it is just to go after smaller landlords.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated choosing who to go after based on who they are is problematic; he represents everybody; he is a small landlord; if his building is not up to Code, he should be fined; a position was requested a few weeks ago; this is the second request; the midyear budget is coming up; there are still budget issues, such as

homelessness and transportation, which he would like addressed before committing to new staffing; discussed a case of nine complaints being filed before anything was done about a noise issue; stated that he would be comfortable discussing the request as part of the midyear budget; issues raised by Councilmember Vella are not on the list, but impact livability and should be addressed; suggested the priorities come back; stated that he would like more data and summary data; discussed the City's new Attorney prosecution unit; suggested monthly reports be provided.

Councilmember Vella stated that her referral was due to a number of complaints across the board; Code Enforcement has been very focused on the Building Code; there are a lot more mixed use areas in development; suggested using notifications to prevent issues and bringing back how to deal with mixed use areas; expressed support for steps taken since the referral and greater coordination; stated a consolidated unit could help with coordination; there will be a transition period; evolution is needed from just enforcement of the Building Code; other regulations are on the books, including the Climate Action Plan; a process should be in place; there should be a single phone line people can call for Code Enforcement issues; there should be a Council conversation about the priorities; the City needs a matrix of the general categories with who will be responding and the timeline for response; there should be tracking that includes the number of complaints against a property owner; she would like to know the plan since the City has a prosecution unit in house; she does not see it as a tenant/landlord issue; it is broader and encompasses climate action, cannabis dispensaries and the Americans with Disability Act (ADA); a non-Police Code Enforcement unit is needed; a proposal should include options for an alternate work week to have evening or weekend hours; she has concerns about using SeeClickFix and hopes there is another way to track and report complaints; the new position should be discussed in the context of other budget priorities.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for consolidating Code Enforcement under one department; stated the City should create user friend systems; residents should be able to call one number; expressed support for discussing the financial resources as part of the midyear budget; people do not get permits if fees are too high; a portion of the rent control fees is being used to fund part of the prosecution unit in the City Attorney's office; imposing steeper fees is a disincentive for landlords to improve properties; the issue can be discussed as part of the budget; times change and priorities need to be changed; she might not have graffiti as a medium priority over garbage and litter, which is a low priority; the health and safety of the community needs to be protected; noise is a health and safety issue, which should be discussed; requested vacant commercial buildings be addressed; discussed examples of vacant buildings on Webster Street; stated that she would be inclined to consider the consolidated model; discussed the rental stock; inquired the best steps to send the issue back to staff.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated staff should continue to enforce Codes and start working on report that focuses on the types of cases and how cases are being handled; there could be two steps; the first would be a report on priorities and how staff is operating and integrating the new types of complaints; the report would help inform mid-cycle budget discussions and continue the review of coordination and consolidation.

The City Manager concurred with the Planning, Building and Transportation Director's suggestion; stated that he also has some ideas, which could be sent to Council off agenda prior to the mid-cycle budget.

Councilmember Vella noted moving outside the realm of Building Code and folding in other Council priorities might require additional training.

The Building Official stated the City's noise ordinance needs to be rewritten, is almost impossible to prove and should be reviewed along with the other changes.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director noted a next door tenants in a building do not even apply since the ordinance relies on the property line.

Councilmember Oddie stated State law requires landlords to provide a habitable premises; discussed one of the complaints; stated small property owners should not get a pass; the changes are not being done to go after any particular group; Council is trying to make sure everyone in Alameda lives in a safe building.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated a detailed list should not be made for re-prioritizing, rather it should be high level concepts.

Councilmember Daysog stated his point is the data in the staff report shows there is not an abundance of Code Enforcement issues; a regime oriented towards the issue is suddenly being created when there is not data; the City seems to have the capacity to deal with problem properties; he questions increasing capacity and whether the City will go overboard looking for problems.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired whether staff would be coming back with the noise ordinance as well, to which staff responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Vella stated any needed ordinance amendments should return.

(<u>20-101</u>) Introduction of Ordinance Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by Amending Section 1-7 (Administrative Citations) of Chapter I (General) Concerning Code Enforcement and Administrative Citations. Introduced.

The City Attorney gave a brief presentation.

Councilmember Vella moved introduction of the ordinance.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he appreciates the advanced

deposit hardship waiver for those who are fined; inquired whether there are hardship provisions after a citation is issued so that compounding does not become an issue.

The City Attorney stated the advance deposit waiver allows someone with a low income to seek a waiver from having to deposit the fine; when someone files an appeal, nothing accrues if there is a waiver.

In response to Vice Mayor Knox White's further inquiry, the City Attorney stated late fees only accrue after a long period of nonpayment.

Vice Mayor Knox White discussed parking ticket nonpayment; stated that he would like to approve the ordinance tonight; inquired whether something could be brought back to address the issue.

The City Attorney stated the Council could give staff direction to review the issue.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired whether the motion could be amended to add the direction, to which Councilmember Vella responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated staff direction is sufficient; there has been a motion and second, with staff direction from the Vice Mayor.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by unanimous voice vote -5.

(20-102) Introduction of Ordinance Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by Adding Section 5-31 to Establish Procedures for Expediting Permit Processing for Electric Vehicle Charging Stations. Introduced.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director gave a brief presentation.

Councilmember Oddie moved introduction of the ordinance.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote -5.

(20-103) Public Hearing to Consider Introduction of Ordinance Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by Amending: (1) Article I (Uniform Codes Relating to Building, Housing and Technical Codes) of Chapter XIII (Building and Housing) to Adopt the 2019 Edition of the California Building Code, the 2019 Edition of the California Residential Code, the 2019 Edition of the California Historical Building Code, the 2019 Edition of the California Electrical Code, the 2019 Edition of the Plumbing Code, the 2019 Edition of the California Mechanical Code, the 2019 Edition of the California Energy Code, the 2019 Edition of the California Green Building Standards Code; and (2) Amending Section 15-1 of Chapter XV (Fire Prevention) to Adopt the 2019 Edition of the California Fire Code with Alameda Local Amendments. Introduced.

The Building Official gave a brief presentation.

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council February 18, 2020 Councilmember Vella moved introduction of the ordinance.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Oddie inquired whether the California Green Building Code includes a movement towards buying clean construction materials.

The Building Official responded the Green Building Code does address said matter, as well as carpet glues and construction debris; stated the State improves the Code every three years.

On the call for the question the motion carried by unanimous voice vote -5.

(20-104) Recommendation to Approve the Legislative Agenda for the City of Alameda.

The Public Information Officer gave a brief presentation.

Stated the agenda is inadequate; urged the agenda include safety for pedestrians and bicyclists as its own item; expressed concern over vague language: Pat Potter, Bike Walk Alameda.

Suggested adding an item to address safety to support legislative efforts that enable local governments to improve road safety, such as changes to the 85% rule, use of set speed limits, changes to the stop sign warranting process to prioritize safety, and removal of the speed enforcement camera ban: Cyndy Johnsen, Bike Walk Alameda.

Councilmember Daysog expressed support for Ms. Johnsen's comments; stated the range of current accidents suggests these recommendations be implemented at minimum; Alameda has a fiduciary responsibility to the municipal power company; expressed concern about being put at risk for taking over utility assets; stated running a municipal utility is difficult; discussed stranded assets; leaders should think clearly about what they are doing; for not having the legislative staff member spend time on municipal utility work.

Vice Mayor Knox White expressed support for Assembly Bill (AB) 1839 and not having the City lobbyist work on utility or Pacific Gas and Electric (PG&E) issues; expressed concern about the criminal justice reform measure; stated that he would like the issue brought back with information on what is being proposed; stated Senate Bill (SB) 50 should be supported; housing is a regional issue; expressed support for moving forward with housing needs and removing supporting building the Seaplane Lagoon Ferry Terminal since the Terminal is already being built; stated ferry items should be moved under Transportation, not under Base Reuse; expressed support for an increase in local control of guns and firearms under Public Safety; stated community paramedicine seems to be listed twice; the Broadway/Posey Tube project should be removed until a presentation can be made later in the Spring; funding for biking is shown as a duplicate under Transportation; expressed support for adding anything which removes 85% for speed setting and allowing local jurisdictions to set limits, speed enforcement, efforts to allow vehicle miles traveled, building safety projects around schools, greater local control for Transportation Network Companies (TNC) and automated vehicle deployment; stated baseline safety information is not being provided related to how TNCs are operated; expressed support for requiring technological solutions to eliminate the use of phones, texting and calls in moving vehicles, adoption of the design guidelines for standards for low speed streets, a reform for warrants at stop signs in order to build safer intersections, and State changes in requirements that slow down safety projects; stated California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) reform needs to happen.

Councilmember Vella expressed support for AB1839; stated Council should be part of the conversation around the new SB50; not including SB50 is a disservice to the people of Alameda; that she opposes the repeal of Proposition 47; there is a prison problem in California; a federal mandate requires reduction of the prison population; the process should not be cut short; something needs to be done about PG&E; she is not in support of the San Jose initiative as proposed; expressed concern for over-politicizing utilities such as PG&E; stated the City uses PG&E systems; expressed concern about impacts to Alameda from PG&E; expressed support for other changes to oversight, the Webster/Posey/Broadway project, having the West End Crossing shown as its own bullet point, and more lobbying and support of better regulation of TNCs.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for Vice Mayor Knox White's comments related to traffic safety; stated all Councilmembers have the priority of keeping intersections safe; expressed support for the bicycle pedestrian bridge, the Broadway/Jackson project, listing guns under public health, community paramedicine, opposing cash bail reform initiatives, and supporting the Green New Deal; stated that he is not supportive of the Cooper Initiative, Proposition 57, or Proposition 47; expressed support for an iteration of SB50; stated there is not much that is known about PG&E or the impacts of service to Alamedans; the technology to block calls while driving exists and enforcement should be discussed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated there is reason to discuss PG&E; the power shutoffs have been onerous; local control over housing issues has to be addressed; more can be done in Alameda about housing issues; expressed support for the League of California Cities' priorities related to housing and homelessness, the City meeting and exceeding the priorities, and SB50; noted the Oakland/Alameda access project is a regional project that should continue to move forward; expressed support for the bicycle pedestrian bridge linking Alameda and Oakland together; stated the Seaplane Lagoon Ferry Terminal should not be removed from the list, but should be edited to support promotion of use; expressed support for regulating short term rentals such as AirBnBs and Vacation Rental By Owners (VRBO) by limiting the number of permits and for putting more money into addressing the population coming out of prisons. Councilmember Daysog stated that he supports the local traffic matters raised by residents; he does not support San Jose's lead with PG&E; he supports local control with SB50 and the Broadway/Jackson interchange project.

The City Manager stated staff has received a variety of direction; noted there is consensus related to traffic safety; stated staff can compile direction and bring the item back on the Consent Calendar March 3 or a motion can be made to enact the requested changes.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for bringing the item back March 3.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for bringing the item back March 3, with a redlined version.

The City Manager stated the PG&E item showed a difference in opinion, as well as Proposition 47, and Oakland/Alameda Access project.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he is willing to take the item off.

Vice Mayor Knox White expressed support for Councilmember Vella's framing of issues.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for cash bail elimination.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated providing an informational sheet on the PG&E would be helpful.

Councilmember Vella stated that she is not supportive of the Liccardo version.

(20-105) Introduction of Ordinance Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by Revising Section 2-59.3 (Limitation and Power to Make Contracts) of Article IV (Contracts) of Chapter II (Administration), Authorizing the City Manager and the City Attorney to Settle Liability Claims up to \$75,000 Unless Otherwise Limited by Law and to Settle Liability Claims Involving Payments by Excess Liability Coverage. Introduced.

Councilmember Daysog expressed support for an annual cumulative cap; inquired whether item that costs less than \$75,000 can be fast tracked.

Councilmember Daysog moved introduction of the ordinance, with a cap of five times \$75,000.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion.

Under discussion, the City Manager suggested a specific amount be set.

Councilmember Daysog amended the motion to be \$300,000.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion.

The City Attorney stated Council may want to consider the exemption of worker's compensation cases.

Councilmember Daysog expressed support for the exemptions.

The City Attorney stated another exemption to consider are cases where insurance carriers already pierce the excess insurance layer, indicating a settlement; discussed a loss of coverage scenario.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested clarification.

Councilmember Vella expressed support for a Council update; stated a call for review may be implemented if necessary; noted a cap on the amounts might prove difficult.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for a Council update when settlements are made.

The City Attorney stated an annual report is made public; a report to Council is amenable.

Councilmember Daysog stated that information is always good to have.

(<u>20-106</u>) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated a motion is needed to consider the remaining item, the referral [paragraph no. <u>20-108</u>].

Councilmember Vella moved approval of hearing the referral.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote – 5.

In response to Councilmember Daysog, the City Attorney stated approval of the item will cause less closed session items.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he appreciates an annual report; a threshold of \$25,000 should yield an alert of settlement and allow for action to be taken if necessary.

The City Attorney stated within 5 days, updates will be provided for any amount in excess of \$25,000.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for the annual report becoming a quarterly report; stated many Councilmembers have expressed concern about a subset of claims.

Councilmember Vella stated the authority to not hear the items in closed session was not previously available; \$25,000 is a low amount; expressed concern for Councilmembers intervening with personnel matters and violating the Charter; expressed support Council be informed about settlements, but not the dollar amount.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he is convinced no cap amount is needed.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he is in support; withdrew his motion.

Councilmember Vella moved introduction of the ordinance as drafted, with direction that Council be informed within a week of a settlement, with updates at the mid-year and annual budget.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by unanimous voice vote – 5.

CITY MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS

(<u>20-107</u>) The City Manager made an announcement regarding a planned signal outage and a new text 9-1-1 program.

ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

None.

COUNCIL REFERRALS

(20-108) Consider Modifications to the Art in City Hall Program. (Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft)

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft made brief comments regarding the referral.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether the request should go through the Public Art Commission (PAC), to which Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded in the negative.

The Public Information Officer stated in its pilot stage, the program was presented to the PAC for feedback; final approval came to Council.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether censorship should be considered.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded criteria must be followed.

The Public Information Officer stated there can be no violence, nudity, or hate speech.

Councilmember Oddie expressed concern about content based regulations.

The Public Information Officer stated a call for proposals was issued; roughly 40

applicants have been screened; a public meeting was held and a lottery conducted to select artists for the 2020 calendar year.

Councilmember Oddie expressed concern for violations of the First Amendment.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the request is to change the venue to City Hall West.

Councilmember Oddie moved approved of the item.

Councilmember Vella expressed concern about content based regulation of speech; stated issues should be addressed; expressed support for feedback from the PAC for the 2021 calendar year.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she would prefer the art chosen for the third floor to be moved to City Hall West this year.

Councilmember Vella stated the lottery has already been conducted; expressed concern about changing the venue without advising the artists of the process.

The Public Information Officer stated when the lottery is conducted, the artists may specify a desired floor; an agreement has been executed with the artists.

Councilmember Vella inquired how far out the selections have been made, to which the Public Information Officer responded through the 2020 calendar year.

Councilmember Vella expressed support for enacting the change in 2021.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated many people are confused when traversing the third floor; that she would like the third floor to be user friendly; recommended the second floor be used instead of the third floor; noted there are concerns related to artwork depicting hate groups or symbolism.

Councilmember Vella noted artists should not be slighted with an alternate location.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the West End of Alameda is being slighted without art; the West End should have an opportunity to display art; it would be nice to give the West End the same opportunity.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he is unclear of the Council direction; stated deciding what is allowed on City Hall walls feels outside of policy and problematic; City Hall West does not have many visitors; questioned how many artists would elect to display art at City Hall West due to lack of exposure; expressed support for a fair process for those to display art at the West End and for art being displayed at City Hall.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she is concerned about the public as well.

The City Manager stated the decision is before Council due to the item previously being brought to Council.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired whether direction can be provided to refer concerns and have staff return.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's concerns about the work environment, Councilmember Vella stated any Human Resource issues, such as a hostile work environment claim, should have a process; expressed concern about artists; stated any changes should be implemented with notice.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated staff should provide input.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the boundaries for the program are fine; questioned whether the decision can be left with staff as opposed to bringing the item back to Council.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of the program, the operational characteristics of the piece, so that staff can implement an Art in City Hall, including City Hall West, as they see fit.

The Public Information Officer inquired whether there is direction about the upcoming exhibit in April.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated staff can look into the upcoming exhibit.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the PAC can look into the matter as well.

The City Manager stated staff is not making decisions based on the art itself.

The Public Information Officer stated the April exhibits will move forward as planned if the item is brought to the PAC.

Vice Mayor Knox White expressed support for keeping the art in the original place indicated.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the third floor is not the best place for art.

Councilmember Vella stated any change in venue should be enacted in 2021 to keep commitments.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the artists can be contacted, to which the City Manager responded in the affirmative.

The Public Information Officer stated an e-mail can be sent to the artist's interested parties list.

COUNCIL COMMUNICATIONS

(<u>20-109</u>) Councilmember Oddie announced that he is on the League of California Cities Environmental Quality Policy Committee.

(20-110) Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft made an announcement regarding Association of Bay Area Government and Metropolitan Transportation Commission meetings and the Alameda Mayors Conference.

(<u>20-111</u>) Vice Mayor Knox White announced the Charter subcommittee would bring issues in March and April; he and Councilmember Oddie are holding a Town Hall on transportation safety.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 11:32 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.