#### MINUTES OF THE REGULAR CITY COUNCIL MEETING TUESDAY- - MAY 5, 2020- -7:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 7:10 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

<u>ROLL CALL</u> - Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Knox White, Oddie, Vella, and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5. [Note: The meeting was conducted via Zoom.]

Absent: None.

#### AGENDA CHANGES

(<u>20-277</u>) Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he would like to hear the 7:01 pm special meeting before the regular meeting.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquiry about public comment on items, the City Clerk outlined the items with public comments.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of recessing the current regular meeting and to call the special meeting.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

\*\*\*

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft recessed the regular meeting at 7:15 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 7:18 p.m.

\*\*\*

# PROCLAMATIONS, SPECIAL ORDERS OF THE DAY AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

(20-278) Proclamation Declaring May 2020 as Affordable Housing Month.

# ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

The following public comments were read into the record:

(20-279) Debi Ryan, Community Action for a Sustainable Alameda (CASA), discussed letters sent related to a student Earth Week writing campaign and noted the campaign highlights.

(20-280) Jim Strehlow, Alameda, discussed his experience riding his bicycle on Encinal Avenue; stated pedestrians can behave badly; questioned when the City Council

authorized slow streets.

#### CONSENT CALENDAR

The Fourth of July parade [paragraph no. <u>20-283</u>], the Webster Street Assessment [paragraph no. <u>20-284</u>], the ordinance amending Municipal Code Chapter 30 [paragraph no. <u>20-286</u>] and the Pinball lease ordinance [paragraph no. <u>20-287</u>] were removed from the Consent Calendar for discussion.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of the remainder of the Consent Calendar.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5. [Items so enacted or adopted are indicated by an asterisk preceding the paragraph number.]

(<u>\*20-281</u>) Minutes of the Special and Regular City Council Meetings Held on April 7, 2020. Approved.

(<u>\*20-282</u>) Ratified bills in the amount of \$6,014,956.70.

(<u>20-283</u>) Recommendation to Cancel the 2020 Fourth of July Parade to Avoid Mass Gatherings Due to the COVID-19 Pandemic.

Councilmember Oddie moved approval of the staff recommendation with direction to staff to find a possible alternative later in the year at a potentially cheaper cost, which could be easily cancelled if needed.

The Recreation and Parks Director made brief comments.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the event is popular; noted there is no desire to increase the rate of COVID-19.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog stated the cancellation of a cherished event only underscores the dire situation everyone is in with COVID-19; expressed support for the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Vella stated the Recreation and Parks Director has been finding different alternatives; expressed support for a porch contest and responsible celebrations.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5. (<u>20-284</u>) Recommendation to Approve the Webster Street Business Improvement Area (BIA) Annual Assessment Report; and

(20-284A) <u>Resolution No. 15649</u>, "Intention to Levy an Annual Assessment on the Webster Street BIA for Fiscal Year 2020-21 and to Set a Public Hearing for May 19, 2020." Adopted.

Councilmember Daysog recused himself from the item.

Councilmember Vella moved approval of the staff recommendation [including adoption of the resolution].

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Absent; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4; Absent: 1.

(<u>\*20-285</u>) Recommendation to Approve the Park Street Business Improvement Area Annual Assessment Report; and

(<u>\*20-285A</u>) <u>Resolution No. 15650</u>, "Intention to Levy an Annual Assessment on the Park Street BIA for Fiscal Year 2020-21 and to Set a Public Hearing for May 19, 2020." Adopted.

(20-286) Ordinance No. 3277, "Amending Alameda Municipal Code Chapter 30 (Development Regulations) to Modify Accessory Dwelling Unit Regulations to Comply with State Law and Make Other Administrative, Technical, and Clarifying Amendments Pertaining to Appeals and Youth Centers Definition, as Recommended by the Planning Board." Finally passed.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he would continue not to support the item.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved final passage of the ordinance.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: No; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4; Noes: 1.

(20-287) Ordinance No. 3278, "Authorizing the City Manager, or Designee, to Execute a Twelve Month Amendment to the Lease with Pacific Pinball Museum, a 501(c)(3) Non Profit Organization, with the Option of Four One Year Extensions, for Building 169, Suite 101 Located at 1680 Viking Street at Alameda Point." Finally passed.

Councilmember Daysog recused himself and left the meeting.

Councilmember Vella moved final passage of the ordinance.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Absent; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4; Absent: 1.

(<u>\*20-288</u>) <u>Ordinance No. 3279</u>, "Amending the Alameda Municipal Code by Amending Section 2-19 (Commission on Disability) to Change the Number of Members to Seven and Change the Name to the Commission on Persons with Disabilities. Finally passed.

\*\*\*

(<u>20-289</u>) Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of recessing the current meeting and reconvening the 7:01 pm special meeting

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Oddie inquired whether the Special Meeting item regarding the small business grant [paragraph no. <u>20-</u>] can be combined with the Council Referral [paragraph no. <u>20-</u>] due to similarity.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for combining the items.

The City Attorney stated due to the items being on two separate meetings, he recommends not combining the items.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft recessed the meeting at 7:36 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 8:34 p.m.

\*\*\*

## REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

(20-290) Public Hearing to Consider Introduction of Ordinance Amending Alameda Municipal Code Chapter XII (Designated Parking) to Improve Procedures for Management of Public Parking on City Streets and in City Lots. Introduced; and

(<u>20-290A</u>) Recommendation to Approve a Policy for the Use of License Plate Recognition Technology for the Purpose of Parking Enforcement.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director gave a presentation.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired why the policy has the Public Works Director enforce parking; stated pricing and parking should be housed within the Transportation Department.

The Planning, Building, and Transportation Director responded the City Manager could be authorized to oversee enforcement; stated Council sets policy direction; provided an example of Council setting the parking meter pricing policy at 85%; stated the management of the parking meters and parking lots falls under the purview of the Public Works Department; changing from Public Works Director to the City Manager, or designee, would be a fair adjustment.

The City Attorney stated there is existing language in previous ordinances that designates the Public Works Director as the manager for various parking endeavors; should Council wish to make changes, the ordinance changes will need to be very clear.

Councilmember Daysog expressed support for Cesar Chavez Day being celebrated Citywide; noted the holiday is not included under Section 9.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft outlined the draft policy and read the section related to where data is stored; inquired whether the policy that governs the License Plate Reader (LPR) data for mounted patrol vehicles has a one-year retention policy; inquired the reason to make the data retention period longer.

The City Attorney responded the policy stores data for less time in all regards; stated the policy proposed 24 hours of storage for "no hit" and 2 years of storage for a "hit;" the Police Department storage is 6 months of storage with "no hit" and potentially unlimited storage with a "hit."

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the language is available, to which the City Attorney responded that he does not have the language; stated the "hit" is different for the Police Department needing to keep data for a case.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she does not recall the previous Council vote reflecting the retention schedule; outlined ongoing instances when data collected has not been destroyed; stated all other instances should have the same retention period as the Police Department LPR schedule.

Councilmember Vella stated that she recalls a conversation related to fixed LPR's; she believes Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's recollection of the retention period is correct; inquired the type of photograph technology to be used and what would be photographed; whether there is a way to crop the image to only include the license plate or back of the vehicle.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded the privacy impact analysis ensures the camera is pointed down, focusing just on the license plate.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether there would be an instance where something outside of the license plate would be captured and whether the image would be cropped in that instance.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded the parking management program does not keep any data should information return clean; stated photos can be cropped in the event the image is too broad; only photos being kept in the event a "hit" occurs would be cropped.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether there will be a mechanism in place to ensure items outside the license plate image can be limited.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded in the affirmative; stated an annual program review can include the types of photographs being kept and cleaned up.

The City Attorney stated that he has been able to obtain the Police Department LPR policy language, which says: "all LPR data downloaded to the server will be stored for a period of six months and thereafter shall be purged, unless it has become or it is reasonable to believe to become evidence in a criminal or civil action or subject to a lawful action to produce records. In such instances, the applicable data shall be downloaded from the server onto portable media and stored into evidence;" noted the policy for parking management 24 hours parallels the Police Department LPR six months and the parking management two year retention is parallel to the Police Department LPR policy of the less definite time frame.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested the language be provided to her; stated there are not many times that she disagrees with the Police Chief; noted that she remembers a one year limitation; stated that she does not remember the policy returning to Council for modification.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated the photograph cropping provision is already in the privacy impact; stated any photograph would be kept due to a "hit" or non-payment.

Councilmember Vella expressed concern about the language of the privacy impact stating: "personal identity information collected that cannot be technically obfuscated will be used only for the purpose...;" inquired about the meaning behind the language.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded that he does not know; stated that he will research the passage.

## Public Comment Read Into Record:

Discussed paid parking at Alameda Ferry parking lots being a high source of revenue; urged separation of permanent and daily parking revenue; listed two projects for funding consideration: 1) Prioritize smart city parking management system; 2) Alameda shuttle funding: Karen Bey, Alameda.

Discussed flaws in the parking proposal; stated the major overlooked flaw is with

management of non-City parking spaces; noted parking is not watched at Alameda Point businesses; urged Council to authorize the security monitoring service to report potential parking violations: Jim Strehlow, Alameda.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft outlined the Police Department LPR data retention, which states: "all ALPR data downloaded to the server will be stored for a period of 6 months and thereafter shall be purged, unless it has become or it is reasonable to believe it will become evidence in a criminal or civil action, or is subject to a lawful action to produce records, in those circumstances, the applicable data should be downloaded from the server onto portable media and booked into evidence;" stated it is reasonable to have the parking policy also be retained for six months.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated under the Police Department's current program, all data is kept for six months and deleted unless there is some reason to keep it as evidence; the parking policy proposes the data be eliminated after 24 hours if there is no reason to keep it; keeping the data for six months would extend the parking policy time.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated license plates collected, but not cited are not retained, which differs from the Police Department policy; that she does not understand why there is a need to keep data for two years to pursue someone with a parking ticket; inquired the reason parking citations need to be kept for two years.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded people need to be given time to appeal parking tickets; stated the process might be drawn out; noted a clarification can be made to the language to state: "until is resolved or two years, whichever is first;" the time can be shortened if desired.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for data collected and not cited, not being retained, and for the retention timing breakdown; inquired whether the City is proposing getting rid of parking meters and slips.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded license plate readers will be introduced first at Alameda Point due to two ferry terminal operations; unmarked, unmetered parking will be along Main Street and the Seaplane Lagoon; stated parking can be paid at a kiosk or via cellular phone; staff eventually will propose use of the parking program Citywide and with street sweeping; old meters will be replaced by payby-plate multi-space booths; outlined the potential parking policy roll-out.

Councilmember Oddie stated the item is forward-thinking; expressed support for the item and a better retention schedule other than two years.

Vice Mayor Knox White expressed support for the item and for staff working with Secure Justice on the privacy community; noted roles have changed in the City over time; expressed support for the City Manager, or his designee, to be responsible for enforcement; stated the pricing is not based on public infrastructure decision making.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the Planning, Building and Transportation Director stated staff has been working with a very good consultant; noted staff is amenable to a one year retention schedule; stated a vendor must still be selected.

Councilmember Daysog expressed support for the ordinance; stated the program improves the way residents pay parking fees; the program will fund certain transportation projects; that he is not a fan of the LPR policy; noted that he prefers the old way of assessing parking fees and tickets; stated the process is less efficient and generates less revenue, but using LPR for parking tickets runs the risk of a parking regime on steroids; expressed support for separating the policy from the ordinance; stated the ordinance is silent on the LPR aspect of the discussion.

Councilmember Vella moved approval of the staff recommendation [including introduction of the ordinance], taking into account only retaining information for one year instead of two years.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated staff believes the policy could be shortened to one year, but bureaucracy takes time.

Councilmember Vella noted the retention is based on evidentiary need; stated that she does not see how bureaucracy would require the City to send out a ticket two years after the incident.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated it would be the court case pursuing the ticket.

Councilmember Vella stated it would then be an evidentiary file.

The City Attorney stated should there be a judicial proceeding, the exiting policy would allow staff to download the image into evidentiary file and keep for the duration of the judicial proceeding, which will likely go beyond two years.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the City Attorney stated the statute of limitations requires the retention.

Councilmember Daysog requested a substitute motion to have the item bifurcate the ordinance from the policy.

Councilmember Vella moved introduction of the ordinance.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of the policy, taking into account only retaining information for one year instead of two years.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: No; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4; Noes: 1.

(20-291) Public Hearing to Consider Accepting: 1) an Annual Report on the Status of the General Plan and Housing Element, 2) an Annual Report on the Status of the Transportation Choices Plan and Associated Work Program Priorities, and 3) an Annual Report for the West Alameda Transportation Management Association (TMA). The Planning, Building and Transportation Director gave a presentation.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether Rosefield Village is allowed to replace the 80 units.

The Planning, Building and Transportation Director responded the project is an expansion of Rosefield Village; stated the City does not get credit for existing units, just new units.

#### Public Comment Read Into Record:

Expressed support for safe alternatives for Alamedans to get out of their cars and reduce greenhouse gas emissions and the active transportation plan; noted that CASA is a partner with the City outreach program for Line 19 shuttle; expressed gratitude toward City staff: Ruth Abbe, Community Action for Sustainable Alameda (CASA).

Councilmember Oddie moved approval of accepting all three items; expressed concern for public transportation.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Vice Mayor Knox White stated transit is in trouble; noted transportation is funded by sales tax, which is being lost; expressed support for the item; stated that he would like to ensure support of transportation returning, as well as supporting things the City does have control over and ensuring the transportation money is being placed in priority areas to drive decisions as there is less money moving forward than hoped.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of directing staff to bring slow streets back to Council at the next meeting as an oral report for discussion.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, the City Manager stated it will be difficult to place a report on for the next Council meeting; noted items are due for review tomorrow.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that the item can be addressed in June; noted that he had planned to bring the item as a Council Referral.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether only a discussion is being requested; noted the Brown Act causes difficulty in discussing the item without notice; stated a staff report is not needed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated waiting an additional two weeks for the topic has benefits; expressed support for more than just Council discussion; stated staff is looking at additional streets.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether he can be included in the discussion based on his residence location being within 500 feet of a discussion location.

The City Attorney responded recusal is recommended.

Councilmember Oddie recused himself and left the meeting.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he would like to have a Citywide discussion versus a discussion specific to Pacific Avenue.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested the motion be restated.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of bringing back, as soon as possible, before future streets are rolled out, a conversation about how the slow streets program is moving forward.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether it is reasonable to request the item be placed on the first meeting in June.

The City Manager responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Vella inquired whether there will be any changes or elimination of streets prior to the first meeting in June.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the item is not agendized; inquired the breadth of discussion allowed.

The City Attorney responded brief direction to staff to bring back anything the Council wishes to hear is recommended.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Absent; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4; Absent: 1.

(20-292) Recommendation to Accept 2020 Annual Report on the Climate Action and Resiliency Plan (CARP).

The Assistant City Manager gave a brief presentation.

Public Comment Read Into Record:

Discussed the significant achievements the annual report shows; urged Council to continue to prioritize efforts in mitigation and adaptation, prioritizing the hiring of the Sustainability and Resilience Manager, and keeping Alameda on the climate-safe path: Ruth Abbe, CASA.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated fewer cars on the road has yielded cleaner air and improved air quality.

Councilmember Vella moved approval of the s.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

(20-293) Recommendation to Provide Direction on Potential Measures Amending the City Charter.

Vice Mayor Knox White gave a brief presentation.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether Council is voting on providing a raise in Council pay.

Vice Mayor Knox White responded in the negative; stated the proposal will allow a future Council to vote on a raise after January 1, 2023, which is after current Councilmember finishes their current terms.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the item goes to the voters, to which Vice Mayor Knox White responded voters will set the maximum; stated the result will not go into effect until January 1, 2023.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the items are proposed ballot measures.

Vice Mayor Knox White responded in the affirmative; stated Council would be directing staff to draft ballot proposals to come back in June or July for further Council discussion and determination about whether or not to place a measure on the ballot; then, the

voters will vote to determine whether or not the Council should have the flexibility to give themselves a raise in the future; noted there has been strong support for the proposal; stated Council pay could be a limiting factor in attracting candidates who may not have the wherewithal to self-fund being a volunteer for the City.

In response to Councilmember Oddie's inquiry regarding clarifying health benefits, Vice Mayor Knox White stated there is currently no language related to health benefits; the Charter strictly states members make \$50 per meeting and does include health benefits, technology, or car allowances; previous Councilmembers have funded their family health coverage; the proposal clarifies that Councilmembers would be able to collect health benefits, but not as family coverage.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether the only people being removed from eligibility are family members of the Councilmember.

Vice Mayor Knox White responded in the affirmative; stated language can be changed; noted previous versions discussed the City Auditor and Treasurer compensation being set by Council; the proposal does not change said provision.

Councilmember Daysog provided Alameda County Council pay data from transparent California; stated there is a considerable discrepancy in the way Council is paid relative to nearby cities; noted members of the public have expressed concern about Council pay related to the COVID-19 environment; expressed support for Council discussion of the item at the current meeting; stated a decision does not need to be made, but the discussion can begin to inform the public about the direction of Council pay; the discussion is occurring in a vacuum and other Charter discussion items will be had in the coming days; each Councilmember should place the item in the context of discussions of related Charter items.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated some Council comments may also relate to the proposed Measure 2; completed the presentation.

Councilmember Daysog stated Council should consider having Councilmembers represent districts; more and more cities are being pressured by legal challenges and are turning to district elections; district elections can also be a form of campaign finance reform; noted campaigning in a district election could cost less depending on the formation of districts; stated San Leandro holds district elections, but candidates must be voted on citywide.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether the last two items will be considered.

Vice Mayor Knox White responded that he did not intend for Council to consider the items at this meeting; stated Council can decide.

Councilmember Daysog stated the direction provided at the previous Council meeting resulted in whittling down the list for discussion.

### Public Comment Read Into Record:

<u>Urged Council to postpone discussion until after shelter in place order; stated letters</u> received represent hundreds of Alameda citizens; discussed living conditions under the pandemic; noted citizens cannot engage in important issues: Janet Gibson, Alameda.

Stated that she has submitted a letter; urged Council to postpone discussion of the item until after social distancing for a discussion in an open setting: Patricia Gannon, Alameda.

Councilmember Daysog stated the data shows Council as being underpaid; a reasonable resident will come to the same conclusion; political football occurs anytime a pay increase is requested; expressed concern about other items to be discussed as an unwelcome distraction while tackling other Charter related items; expressed support for postponing the discussion until the special meetings have occurred.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the Council is not voting to amend the Charter; Council will vote on whether or not to allow the voters to amend the Charter; government still needs to move forward and function; people are adjusting and adapting to a new reality; social distancing will still need to be practiced for some time; the Governor's order list items such as the ability to participate via internet in Council meetings from home and allows comments to be heard; new ways to connect are learned and adapted; noted the United States Supreme Court has started to live-stream meetings for the first time; stated people have more time on their hands; more young people are politically active; noted there will be a presidential election in November; stated there have been more opportunities for connection; that she hopes to continue some of the new interactions; the City Prosecutor language is important for residents; City Prosecutor cases are related to quality of life; expressed support for clean-up language and for waiting to form a community task forces.

Councilmember Vella stated the shelter in place has impacted a variety of people differently.

Councilmember Daysog moved approval of hearing the remaining agenda items, with continuing the meeting until 11:45 p.m.

\*\*\*

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Councilmember Vella stated some people might have more time due to unfortunately being unemployed; expressed concern for considering an increase in Council pay, regardless of data, when many are out work; stated many have less time on their

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council May 5, 2020

hands; outlined her schedule changes due to COVID-19; stated individuals are balancing work, home and childcare and do not have the ability to pay attention or participate in Council meetings; many are unaware of Council meetings; expressed support for cleanup language related to meeting access and absences; noted some members of Council are Kaiser participants and would have to travel to another city for emergency hospital treatments potentially jeopardizing their Council seat based on Charter provisions; expressed concern about the digital divide; stated meaningful participation may not occur online; a lot of people are not online; the City's system has had glitches; Charter conversations should be published well in advance in newspapers with information on how to access meetings digitally; the meeting should be published across multiple platforms; Council needs to be thoughtful about connecting with people to ensure knowledge about meeting topics; noted the Council can move forward at any time to recommend a review of Council pay; expressed concern about the timing of the discussion; stated the conversation should occur in the future; that she agrees Council is underpaid; she has had to pay for childcare to attend meetings; stated the conversation should occur in a year or two; not providing healthcare to families seems to be discriminatory; healthcare may be the only benefit for Councilmembers; better clarification of publicized parameters needs to happen for Measure 2; Measure 2 is an important change that needs to happen, but the item needs to be better articulated to the general public; expressed support for changing the language related to remote access and absences; stated the language is outdated; expressed support for waiting until Census results are calculated to discuss district elections; stated the Census can better inform the conversation; noted that she will not be able to participate in Thursday's meeting.

Councilmember Oddie stated Councilmembers are focused on the agenda items because it is part of their job; the public is not focused on agenda items; the public is focused on health, safety, children, education, and financials; Council should pay close attention to what the public is focused on; expressed concern about the perception of Council jamming items through: stated Council is not amending the Charter, but is narrowing the focus; Council is setting up the framework of what type of Charter amendments to direct staff to bring back; Council is voting on a process or parameters for the future; expressed concern about asking the public to change something that has been around for 50 years; stated Councilmembers do not perform for the pay or healthcare, instead they perform for love of the City; noted some businesses in Alameda are going to have to close: businesses are worried about financial stress: there are valid reasons to consider increasing Council pay at a later time; expressed concern about the increase in pay causing further CalPERS and pension costs issues; stated the optics of Council asking for parameters of more money are not good; stated there are other City staff more deserving of a raise; the healthcare aspect for Council is discriminatory against women and families; there needs to be more parameters around the City Prosecutor item; expressed concern about the abuse of power related to the City Prosecutor; stated political conflicts can manifest into something bad; expressed support for Councilmember Vella's comments related to meeting access and absences; stated the cleanup language is broad; expressed support for gender neutral language; expressed concern about unintended consequences and fractionalization.

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council May 5, 2020 Vice Mayor Knox White stated it is important to recognize all items on the agenda have gone through public hearings which were well attended and informational; expressed concern about the suggestion that the topics are being held late at night in a rush; stated Council is not approving the Council pay increase for themselves; should current Councilmembers be re-elected at the same time Charter amendments pass, then, a future raise may be obtained; noted that he is neutral on the topic of healthcare; stated Council should consider the cost; there are City staff members that work more hours and do not receive healthcare.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she agrees with the comments related to healthcare; the cost for certain health premiums may be the same for one to two members; noted the option to add family members is possible; stated Council is not voting to raise their own current pay; the raise in pay will help level the playing field for future Councilmembers; Council does need to consider succession planning; noted the start times of upcoming Special Meetings; stated the last conversations will not be the last on these topics.

Councilmember Daysog proposed approval of postponing a decision on the Council pay item until the first meeting in June; stated that he needs more information from the meeting Thursday.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether Councilmember Daysog is proposing a motion, to which Councilmember Daysog responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Daysog moved approval of postponing a decision on the Council pay item until the first meeting in June; stated public testimony has been taken; noted the discussion scheduled for Thursday will get in the way of the decision.

Councilmember Vella stated Council needs to make a separate decision about when items will go on the ballot; expressed support for moving certain items forward for discussion without necessarily determining what is to be placed on the ballot and for a conversation related to political strategy of timelines for ballot consideration at a separate meeting; stated that she finds attending multiple evening meetings in one week difficult; expressed support for alternate meeting times.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the night of the two special meetings had previously been held for budget sessions; inquired whether Councilmember Vella is requesting to have further discussion related to the sequencing of putting items on the ballot.

Councilmember Vella responded in the affirmative; stated Council needs to have a thoughtful conversation around combinations, timing and what is desired for voter consideration; there could be a number of different items on a ballot; expressed concern about giving voters too much to consume on one ballot; expressed support for consideration being given to which items are placed on which ballot.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether a discussion on timing should be included on the first meeting in June or whether a special meeting would be preferred.

Councilmember Vella responded the first meeting in June if there is room on the agenda; expressed support for understanding what is being moved forward; stated that she would like Census information prior to district election discussions.

\*\*\*

(<u>20-294</u>) Councilmember Vella moved approval of providing an additional 3 minutes for Council discussion.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that an extension to October for the Census has been requested by Congresswoman Lee, but the result of the request is unknown; stated the Census data may not be known this calendar year.

Councilmember Vella expressed support for narrowing the conversation down to ensure people understand what is being considered when.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the items can be placed on the first meeting in June.

The City Manager responded that he does not know what is set for the first June meeting.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the first meeting in June is going to occur around possible changes; the second meeting in June will allow for a month to provide further direction for items to be brought back in July and allow for the community to understand what is happening with shelter-in-place.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft proposed placeholders for both June Council meetings; stated it is helpful to break up topics to not cover too much at one time and allows for discussions to finish earlier.

Councilmember Vella expressed support for a further discussion on the items that are to be brought forward, with a second discussion on timing; noted there are a number of different elections between now and 2023; expressed support for determining the elections and timelines; expressed concern about staff time needed to place five Charter items on a ballot; stated the second Council meeting in June should consider when regular elections would occur, plus the cost and details of a special election, should it be needed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated there is an advantage to having more significant items on the November election to assure a good voter turnout; inquired what would be heard at the first Council meeting in June.

Councilmember Daysog responded that he proposes Council postpone the decision until June, generally; stated by postponing the decision, no decision should occur at the current meeting regarding Council pay.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether consideration of items can be dropped; proposed elimination of considering family health care.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support.

Vice Mayor Knox White expressed support.

Councilmember Vella stated that she would like clarification made that the topic of district elections would drop until the Census results are confirmed.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated there is no proposal to move forward with district elections at this time.

Councilmember Vella stated that she would like to direct the delay of a task force until after the Census.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated both task forces are off the table; stated Measures 1 and 2 are only being considered.

Councilmember Vella stated that she would like to eliminate the family health care conversation from Measure 1; expressed support for clarifying the parameters around the City Prosecutor; noted the conversation at the meeting tomorrow can inform parameters, if needed.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated the first meeting in June should discuss which topics will move forward; the second meeting will discuss how to package the items moving forward.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of moving forward future discussion of Measure 1 without health benefits and Measure 2; recommended Councilmembers who wish to clarify the language around the City Prosecutor provide language and input to the City Attorney to have conversation in June; and bringing those back for further conversation in June along with whatever moves forward on Wednesday and Thursday.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the motion includes the addition of any other clarifying language that staff identifies, to which Vice Mayor Knox White responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he could second the motion; inquired whether Council is providing direction on Measure 2 language coming back.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he is flexible between the first and second meeting in June.

Councilmember Oddie seconded the motion, with the caveat that the Council meets back in Chambers, but the provision is not mandatory.

Councilmember Vella stated that she supports the motion.

Councilmember Vella requested clarification that the second meeting in June will also include a conversation related to the cost and timing of having various measures at off-elections.

Vice Mayor Knox White responded in the affirmative.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

(20-295) Recommendation to Provide Direction to the City Attorney to Consent, Modify or Reject Law Firm Goldfarb Lipman's Request to Waive Conflicts of Interest In Connection with Goldfarb's Legal Representation of the City of Alameda and the Housing Authority of the City of Alameda.

Vice Mayor Knox White moved approval of the staff recommendation.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: No; Vella: No; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3, Noes: 2.

## CITY MANAGER COMMUNICATIONS

(<u>20-296</u>) The City Manager encouraged everyone to complete the Census; announced Small Business Grant applications are due May 7<sup>th</sup>; stated staff is preparing a plan to resume City operations.

## ORAL COMMUNICATIONS, NON-AGENDA

None.

## COUNCIL REFERRALS

Regular Meeting Alameda City Council May 5, 2020 (<u>20-297</u>) Consider Directing Staff to Explore Creating a Tax-Exempt Special Fund to Provide Gap Resources for Local Small Business, Renters and Local Organizations Significantly Impacted by the COVID-19 State of Emergency. (Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft)

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft gave a brief presentation.

The City Manager discussed an option to partner with a foundation to create more opportunities for business grants and reaching out for donations.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated staff is working on the item and will come back to Council May 19<sup>th</sup>; inquired whether Council would consider directing staff to explore creating a tax-exempt special fund to provide gap resources for local small business.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired whether the direction had been provided at the previous Council meeting.

Councilmember Oddie moved approval of the referral.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion, which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

## COUNCIL COMMUNICATIONS

None.

## ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 11:46 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.

#### MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING TUESDAY- - MAY 5, 2020- -6:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 6:03 p.m.

<u>Roll Call</u> – Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Knox White, Oddie, Vella and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5. [Note: The meeting was held via WebEx.]

Absent: None.

The meeting was adjourned to Closed Session to consider:

(20-274) Conference with Real Property Negotiators (Pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.8) Property: <u>Building 14</u>, approximately 31,194 rentable square feet of building area, located at 1800 Ferry Point at Alameda Point; City Negotiators: Eric Levitt, City Manager, Lisa Maxwell, Assistant City Attorney, Debbie Potter, Community Development Director, and Nanette Mocanu, Assistant Community Development Director; Negotiating Parties: City of Alameda and Navigator Systems; Under Negotiation: Price and terms

(20-275) Conference with Legal Counsel – <u>Existing Litigation</u>; Case Name: Cramer v City of Oakland, et al., Court: United States District Court for the Northern District Case Number: CV19-7922

(20-276) Conference With Labor Negotiators (Government Code Section 54957.6) City Negotiators: Eric Levitt, City Manager; Gerry Beaudin, Assistant City Manager; Nancy Bronstein, Human Resources Director; and Alan Cohen, Assistant City Attorney; Employee Organizations: International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers, Local 1245 (IBEW), Electric Utility Professional Association of Alameda (EUPA), Alameda City Employees Association (ACEA), Alameda Police Officers Association Non-Sworn Unit (PANS), and Alameda Management and Confidential Employees Association (MCEA), International Association of Firefighter, Local 689 (IAFF) Alameda Fire Managers Association (AFMA), Alameda Police Officers Association (APOA) and Alameda Police Managers Association (APMA), Executive Management Employees (EXME) and Alameda Municipal Power Unrepresented Management Employees (AMPU) Under Negotiation: Salaries, Employee Benefits and Terms of Employment. Not heard.

Following the Closed Session, the meeting was reconvened and the City Clerk announced that regarding <u>Building 14</u>, staff provided information, Council provided direction and no vote was taken; and regarding <u>Existing Litigation</u>, staff provided information and Council gave direction to staff by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye; Ayes: 5.

Special Meeting Alameda City Council May 05, 2020

## Adjournment

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 6:52 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.

#### MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL TUESDAY- -MAY 5, 2020- -7:01 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 7:16 p.m.

<u>ROLL CALL</u> - Present: Councilmember Daysog, Knox White, Oddie, Vella and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5. [Note: The meeting was conducted via Zoom.]

Absent: None.

### AGENDA ITEMS

(20-298) Recommendation to Receive an Update on the \$600,000 COVID-19 Small Business Relief Grant Program to Help Mitigate Barriers to Capital for the Most Vulnerable Alameda Small Businesses and Restaurants; and Provide Direction to Staff Regarding Additional Funding or Other Program Modifications.

The Community Development Director noted the presentation for the item is with the Economic Development Manager who is unable to join the meeting due to technical difficulties; inquired whether another item may be considered prior to the current item.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded in the affirmative.

The City Manager stated the current meeting will need to be recessed.

\*\*\*

Councilmember Vella moved approval of recessing the special meeting to consider the regular agenda.

Vice Mayor Knox White seconded the motion which carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Knox White: Aye; Oddie: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 5.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft recessed the meeting at: 7:18 p.m. and reconvened at: 7:36 p.m.

The Community Development Director gave a brief presentation.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the award announcement will be made May 21<sup>st</sup>.

The Economic Development Manager responded in the affirmative; stated staff will be accepting applications through the end of the day on May 7<sup>th</sup>; grant winners will be announced May 21<sup>st</sup>.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired how the decision will be made.

The Economic Development Manager responded staff will be checking business licenses and the Business Improvement Assessments (BIA) to ensure applicants paid last year; stated if eligible, participants will be entered into a lottery; applications will be reviewed to ensure the 20% loss of income qualification threshold has been met.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft outlined a portion of the staff report; stated Council is directing staff to look into supporting the assistance of small businesses; however, the direction is not exclusive to small businesses; noted Council is also including renters.

Councilmember Oddie noted there are 470 members of the Downtown Alameda Business Association (DABA); inquired the amount for the West Alameda Business Association (WABA).

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft requested clarification that the inquiry only includes qualifying members.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he would like to understand whether the ratio is the same.

The Economic Development Manager responded the ratio is not the same; stated there are 212 WABA members on the list.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted WABA includes Target, Safeway and some of the Alameda Landing businesses that could not apply for the small business grant.

The Community Development Director stated staff has received 10 applications from Alameda Landing.

Councilmember Oddie inquired whether additional funding could be provided for the program; inquired the options available for consideration; noted should all applicants be awarded, the cost will be \$1.485 million.

The Economic Development Manager responded the City has allocated \$502,500 and \$97,500 from Alameda Point.

The City Manager stated three approaches to funding the grant program could be: 1) requesting support through a foundation or contributions to leverage the funds, 2) reviewing current budgeted expenditures that could be reduced and reallocated, and 3) allowing spending from the reserves; noted a revolving loan program is a good option but has a time restriction; stated there are ways to expand the current \$600,000 by allowing businesses to take less than the \$7,500 maximum award.

Councilmember Oddie stated that he recommends a loan program through the City to businesses; the City can loan money to the fund; should a non-profit move forward, the money can be repaid to the General Fund.

The City Manager stated staff can look into the strategy.

Councilmember Oddie stated 49 of the applicants are restaurants; noted all residents can apply for the Great Plates State project; expressed support for City restaurants benefitting from the program and putting more money into the program.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether applicants are being asked about other forms of assistance they have applied for; inquired whether applicants are solely relying on City grant funds; noted some restaurants have stayed open for take-out and delivery; inquired whether the businesses open status could be a funding consideration; stated some consideration should be given to businesses trying to keep employees on staff and serve the community; inquired whether said considerations can be factored into the process.

The Economic Development Manager responded staff is requesting applicants apply for loans, grants and other program information as part of their application; staff is not factoring whether a restaurant is open; noted there are many considerations for a restaurant to open or not open; stated applicants are being requested to certify under penalty of perjury that they plan to open after the shelter in place order; staff is factoring whether the business projects a closure within six months after reopening.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired the enforcement for such assurances.

The Economic Development Manager responded a lien could be placed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft questioned whether the process has been approved by the City Attorney's office, to which the Economic Development Manager responded in the negative.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether it is possible to weigh a restaurant considering closure or bankruptcy to ensure funds are put toward keeping businesses afloat; inquired the application contents to ensure accurate information.

The Economic Development Manager responded in the negative; stated staff is not asking whether additional businesses are owned; noted staff is asking whether or not the applicant has been in business for longer than one year.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether businesses younger than one year are ineligible.

The Economic Development Manager responded the businesses are eligible, but staff will know the age of the business.

Councilmember Vella inquired how the 20% loss will be calculated.

The Economic Development Manager responded the applicants will use the month of

February financials.

Councilmember Vella inquired whether the month prior will be used, to which the Economic Development Manager responded in the affirmative.

### Public Comment Read Into Record:

Discussed issues on the policy and implementation of the program; stated not allowing publicly traded companies is a good step at limiting large businesses; urged the allowance of sole proprietors; stated a ranking system should be developed; urged discussion to ensure a simple and safe guarded program: Ronald Mooney, Alameda.

<u>Urged Council consider raising the loss level from 20% to a higher amount to target businesses most at-risk; stated those with a 50% or higher loss are more at risk:</u> Text Message Submittal.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether a ranking system will be used.

The Economic Development Manager responded a lottery system will be used.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for finding the businesses which have been impacted most.

The Community Development Director stated there is a lottery program; the minimum criteria must be met in order for applicants to be eligible; the criteria includes a minimum loss of income of 20%; sole proprietorships with one employee are not eligible for funding; noted staff has balanced ensuring expediency as well as reaching vulnerable businesses; stated Council approved the eligibility criteria at the previous meeting.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated more is known as time goes by; noted nuances should be considered due to businesses relying on the funds to survive; the requirement to include businesses with at least one employee came from the intention of helping more people; there is no easy way to say yes to some businesses and no to others; expressed concern about the survival of small businesses; inquired whether there is more the City could do.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he is uncomfortable changing the criteria after it was approved at the previous meeting; applications close tomorrow; there is never a perfect way to move forward; \$7,500 may not save a business which has lost 50%; expressed support for working with the State program; other money sources could be explored; the program is currently over-subscribed; expressed support for discussing increasing funding by \$200,000 to \$300,000; there are options for quick funding such as gofundme.com; expressed concern about a delay in setting up a community fund; stated Council must act now; expressed support for the use of a gofundme.com campaign, and directing staff to look into the use of gofundme.com; expressed concern about the materials for the funding applications not being in multiple languages; inquired

whether a grant program can be opened for those in the three highest language categories; stated the outreach will be very useful; the grant application process does not work when applicants are submitting via Microsoft Edge; expressed support for adding language stating: "please do not use Microsoft Edge;" stated the response to the program has been tremendous.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the deadline is May 7<sup>th</sup>, to which the Community Development Director responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired how the City could work with a gofundme.com campaign; inquired whether the City should put money into WABA's gofundme.com campaign.

Vice Mayor Knox White responded in the negative; stated there is interest in starting an Alameda Business gofundme.com campaign; should the City promote the campaign, with a list of 190 possible applicants, the following businesses would be considered to receive funding after the grant fund cutoff; noted little staff time would be used; stated work and fundraising would be from the private sector.

Councilmember Vella expressed concern about changing the criteria; expressed support for changing the criteria if a second round of applications are done, prioritizing businesses that have taken a harder hit in the potential second round, and conducting a lottery; noted many financial issues for businesses are related to cash flow; expressed support for the City loaning money to the program, and pursuing public/private funds, which look at grants, non-profits and different donors; stated a gofundme.com campaign would be appropriate; she would like to consult with the City Attorney's office to further understand the legality of collecting and administering funds: expressed support for promoting the opportunity on social media and websites; noted individual gofundme.com campaigns have been successful; stated that she would like to get to businesses that may not have the same social media following as others; expressed support for looking at businesses with multiple locations in the criteria for the next round; stated there are daycare providers and preschool operators, which have multiple locations and larger staff that should remain operational; expressed support for keeping businesses operational; stated daycare and preschool are important and should be included for eligibility.

Councilmember Daysog stated the \$600,000 being invested by the City represents a substantial amount of taxpayer dollars; some entities might not survive; there is risk involved; the risk is worth taking; the times are not ordinary; Council is making a reasonable and prudent decision; expressed support for the item, and the City Attorney's office protecting Council from outstanding legal issues which may arise from the use of gofundme.com; stated the amount of responses is a good indication that business communities are struggling.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for the item, finding more funding if possible and the exploration of gofundme.com campaigns; expressed concern about payments over \$5,000; stated that he would support different criteria if there is another round of funding; the issue is cash flow; expressed support for sole proprietors.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she would like more information provided on the Great Plates program.

The City Manager stated Great Plates is another way to help restaurants; staff supports looking into the program.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted the program is for middle income seniors in need of meals.

The City Manager stated there are about four programs within the community which provide meals to seniors; expressed concern about using the program and staff resources; noted the program requires an implementation plan; expressed support for using gofundme.com; expressed concern about the lack of regulation with gofundme.com; stated that he would like to ensure those donating understand donations will be used towards the cause; foundations and municipal trust options could be funding sources as well.

Vice Mayor Knox White discussed the Meals on Wheels program; stated there is a huge need for assistance; noted a partnership with Meals on Wheels could be explored.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether staff has received sufficient direction.

The City Attorney responded in the affirmative; stated Council can provide additional direction, but is not required to do so; Council may take a vote on any specific action, but a motion is not required.

Vice Mayor Knox White inquired whether the City Manager has received direction and plans to investigate and report back at the next meeting on steps that can be taken for the Great Plates program and additional funding; expressed support for \$300,000 and supporting the public-private partnership with the City Attorney's input and the City Manager's agreement.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the City Manager is keeping a close eye on the City's finances to come back with an amount; expressed support for all three approaches provided by the City Manager.

Councilmember Vella stated Meals on Wheels and the senior meal delivery at Mastick Senior Center have increased delivery; the demand has gone up; expressed support for the programs to be run through or coordinated with an existing program or partnership; expressed concern about duplication of resources and staffing.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the Great Plates program signs up participating restaurants; the restaurants have criteria to meet from the Department of Agriculture and nutrition standards; the restaurants provide delivery with staff that has been through a background check; the City is not involved in the delivery, but would be involved with

informing qualifying seniors.

Councilmember Vella stated many people have been contacted; noted Meals on Wheels or the Mastick Senior Center may not be serving everyone; inquired whether the City can work with the list of those unable to be served.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted there is no income limit for Meals on Wheels.

The Community Development Director stated neither Meals on Wheels nor the program at Mastick Senior Center are limited by income restrictions; noted there is a 6.2% administrative fee that the City must pay for the Great Plates program; inquired whether or not the money paid toward the administrative fee could be augmented or used to grow the grant fund, and whether staff can provide an update to the Great Plates program outside of a Council Meeting.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted the administrative fee is reimbursable through Housing and Urban Development (HUD); stated that she will reach out to Congresswoman Lee's office for a proper HUD point of contact; the money is put out initially and then reimbursed.

Vice Mayor Knox White stated that he supports giving the option for the 80 selected businesses to receive less money; the option may not be taken by many businesses, but could allow the assistance of an additional 2 to 5 businesses.

Councilmember Daysog expressed support for the proposal of using loans; outlined loaning Community Development Block Grants (CDBG) funds in the 1990s; stated the City can also look into working with HUD on waivers for income restrictions to loaning CDBG funds.

Councilmember Oddie expressed support for allowing awarded businesses to take less of the grant to help additional businesses.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated it is wise to consider.

## ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 8:34 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.