

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL CITY COUNCIL MEETING
SATURDAY- -MAY 8, 2021- -3:00 P.M.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft convened the meeting at 3:09 p.m. Councilmember Daysog led the Pledge of Allegiance.

ROLL CALL - Present: Councilmembers Daysog, Herrera Spencer, Knox White, Vella, and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft – 5. [Note: The meeting was conducted via Zoom]

Absent: None.

COUNCIL REFERRAL

(21-323) Consider Directing the City Manager to Take Immediate Action Related to Alameda Police Department (APD) Response to 911 Calls by Dispatchers and Police Officers, Require Non-Police Response to Certain 911 Calls, Prepare a Compendium of All Mental Health Resources Currently Available to APD, Revise APD Use of Force Policies and Establish Protocols for Requesting Non-Police Response, Backup, and/or Interventions, Create a Mental Health-Oriented Response Model, Initiate a Public Education Campaign to Provide Easily Accessible Alternatives to Calling 911, and Work with City Council to Create a Civilian Police Oversight Board. (Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft and Vice Mayor Vella)

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft and Vice Mayor Vella gave a presentation.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether this is the meeting Vice Mayor tweeted about: calling for an emergency City Council meeting so action can be taken in response to the death of Mario Gonzalez.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded the meeting that she and the Vice Mayor called is for the purpose stated in the Council Referral.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated it sounds like it is not that meeting; she would like clarification that it is not the intent of the meeting; she would also like clarification about the Council giving direction on March 16th; there were an array of motions, which were unanimously supported; her understanding is that said direction would be coming back to Council; she thinks Council has already given direction on many, if not all, of the points in the Referral; she would like to know if Councilmembers are now opposing the motions that were made on March 16th; questioned what new items required holding this meeting and how the list differs from the direction Council already gave to staff.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she believes Council can accelerate and supplement some of the Subcommittee recommendations; she has been working with organizations, such as Alameda County Behavioral Health Services, and reaching out to other Mayors and has learned about things that Alameda would be able to use, which is why it is important to have a compendium of all the resources; others do not have a 24 hours a day, 7 days a week (24/7) response, which is a shortcoming; the City of Berkeley has its own Health

Department with a Mental Health Division and sends mental health calls to John George Pavilion and overdoses to Alta Bates Hospital; it is important to see what resources are out there and how cities might partner to provide services; she could discuss the White Bridge Clinic; the Crisis Assistance Helping Out On The Streets (CAHOOTS) model should be accelerated, as well as immediate training for Dispatchers and Officers related to the compendium.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she believes Council already gave direction on the issues, especially the CAHOOTS model; inquired whether the Mayor and Vice Mayor have a proposal for other areas the City Manager and staff are currently working on that will be on the upcoming agenda; inquired whether the direction is for staff to stop working on said items and dedicate more time to other areas being proposed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated Council will be hearing from the City Manager as part of the discussion.

In response to Councilmember Daysog's inquiry about the nine minute Council speaking rule, the City Clerk stated the Council Meeting Rules of Order have an exception; nine minutes does not apply to a meeting with a single item with no other business being addressed, such as this meeting; however, the presentation and public comments are still timed.

Councilmember Knox White inquired whether the City Manager could provide an update on the work being done.

The City Manager stated staff has been looking at models such as CAHOOTS, Community Paramedicine and a couple of different alternatives, as well as crisis services through the County; different resources are being reviewed; one issue is 24/7 response, which is not currently available; one model or a combination of models is being reviewed; the use of force policy is being reviewed; the incoming Police Chief also forwarded information on advisory and oversight committees.

Discussed Police allowing an armed man to terrorize a gathering of mostly black protesters, killing Mario Gonzales, and requests for unarmed mental health first responders; stated over 10,000 people signed a petition; echoed the demands of the Gonzales family; urged Council to adopt a program like Mobile Assistance Community Responders of Oakland (MACRO); discussed a reduction in Police services and funding; Jenice Anderson, Alameda.

Stated the Council knows what to do and has the Steering Committee recommendations, a petition, a list of demands and the suggestions from today; Council should set aside petty issues and come through for Mario Gonzales, as well as other Black and Brown people who have died in Police custody; Alameda is not different or special; a man did not need to die; Cheryl Taylor, Steering Committee.

Stated Mental Health (MH) First is a non-Police response to decriminalize mental health crises; what happened to Mario Gonzales is a direct result of systematic hostility; she is in solidarity with the family; a community response model autonomous from Police is needed;

more Police training has been proven not to work; discussed CAHOOTS; urged consulting with Black and Brown local organizers and not working with the Oakland Mayor: Rebecca Ruiz, MH First.

Thanked the Mayor and Council for prioritizing the meeting; stated it is time to take action; she supports the demands of Mario Gonzales's family; 50% of 911 calls are for non-criminal matters; outlined actions Council should take: Debra Mendoza, Unbundling Police Services Subcommittee.

Stated people demanded change last year; the City needs an immediately implementable program supported by those most impacted; MH First and MACRO can happen now; the Officers and civilian should be fired; discussed funding; urged Council to support the demands of Mario Gonzales's family and to take action now: Alexia Arocha, Alameda.

Discussed public input and the public process to evaluate public safety; urged Council to take immediate action to unbundle health calls, not to spend more money on Police training and to use Police funds for mental health programs: Erin Fraser, Unbundling Police Services Subcommittee.

Discussed Lexipol policy use and adoption; outlined handcuffing and restraint policies that should be implemented; expressed support for Charter reform and a commission with real teeth; urged Council to work quickly: Zac Bowling, Alameda.

Discussed youth being criminalized by Police and Mario Gonzales's brother; expressed support for the family's demands, creation of a City and community model and not collaborating with Oakland Mayor or having Crisis Intervention Team (CIT) training or CAHOOTS: Barni Qaasim, Communities United for Restorative Youth Justice.

Expressed support for the family's demands; outlined suggestions for a mental health program: Evelyn Canal.

Discussed previous demands, not keeping commitments and coming along together; urged Council to lead, meet the demands of Mario Gonzales's family and create a mental health response housed outside of the Police Department: Grover Wehman-Brown, Alameda.

Discussed adoption of Subcommittee recommendations; urged Council to do the right thing and put teeth behind recommendations: Heather Reed, Systemic and Community Racism Subcommittee.

Stated Police in Alameda are operating to keep Black and Brown people in their place; no amount of Police reform will work; Police killed Mario because they could not control him and should all be fired; Police funds should be reallocated to mental health professionals: Marilyn Rothman, Alameda.

Stated where a city puts its funds is where it gets results; discussed services; urged resources go to things that lift up children and provide a hand up; stated any solution must put the community first and value the experiences of people impacted by Police; urged review of restraint policies: Jennifer Rakowski, Alameda.

Discussed an incident when she called the Police; stated a single 24 hour number is needed for calls that do not need a Police response; urged Council to implement the items in the Referral: Jennifer Taggart, Alameda.

Outlined a letter submitted by the Alameda Justice Alliance (AJA); urged funds be shifted from Police to social services: Laura Thomas, AJA.

Discussed American Civil Liberties Union (ACLU) People Power meetings in 2017 and systemic racism; urged Officers be fired and Council adopt and fund the Subcommittee recommendations: Amos White, Alameda.

Stated that he supports the demands of Mario Gonzales's family and swift implementation of the Subcommittee recommendations, including an oversight board and unbundling services; something must change; fundamental rights should not be subject to a democratic vote: Josh Geyer, Alameda.

Discussed Mario Gonzales's death; urged Council to approve the Referral and Subcommittee recommendations; stated the damage the Police Department is inflicting on community members must end; the community demands justice be served for Mario Gonzales and the Officers be brought to justice: Kristen Welch, Alameda.

Expressed his outrage; demanded the Officers be charged and the family demands be supported; outlined the Alameda County Pool of Consumer Champions (POCC) and State bills: Austin Tam, POCC.

Stated 1,532 neighbors signed a petition demanding APD funding be diverted for mental health responders; Mario Gonzales's tragic death has made it obvious the Police Department is not equipped to handle people in different mental states; urged funding for mental health responders and related community services: Ashley Lorden, Alameda.

Stated what happened to Mario Gonzales was unfathomably appalling; he supports the family's demands; urged Council to vote yes on all aspects of the Referral: Kevin McCarty, Alameda.

Stated Transform Alameda is pushing for justice for Mario Gonzales and his family; one of the Officers attends her church and is known as a gentle, kind person; the example shows the City cannot train its way out of Police violence and harm; a system of safe policing is not possible; the only way to prevent further deaths is by reducing contact between Black and Brown communities and the Police; urged the creation of a non-Police crisis response be prioritized: Carly Stadum-Liang, Transform Alameda.

Discussed Police Department systemic problems; stated everyone bears responsibility; stated the investigation should look at the entire Department, not just the specific Officers: Ben Calica, Alameda.

Stated the City needs to swiftly shift responsibilities for responding to non-criminal matters, especially mental health calls; discussed the need for community oversight; stated project

management is needed to move the City where it needs to be; discussed the Brown vs. Board of Education case; urged actions be with all deliberate speed: Jonathan Soglin, Unbundling Police Services Subcommittee.

Echoed the demands of the Gonzales family; discussed liability; stated policing is about control and violence, not safety; Council is upholding Alameda's racist legacy; urged APD be defunded in the upcoming budget process: Is Sullivan, Alameda.

Echoed the demands of Mario Gonzales's family; urged a program similar to MACRO be implemented and Alameda Police be defunded in the upcoming budget cycle; stated Black and Brown people do not feel safe in Alameda: Jam C.

Stated the City needs a non-Police response to mental health crises calls; encouraged working to implement something similar to MACRO; expressed concern about the Police labor agreement: Lorin Salem, Alameda.

Outlined steps that should be taken: meet the demands of Mario Gonzales's family, immediately implement community oversight of the Police Department, start a community directed comprehensive policy and practices review and create a non-Police response for all non-criminal matters, especially mental health, intoxication and homelessness calls; suggested hiring an outside consultant; discussed funding: Beth Kenny, Alameda.

Urged funds be reallocated to mental health services; expressed concern about having to call a number different than 911: Sharon Golden, Alameda.

Stated the killing of Mario Gonzales was horrific; discussed 911 calls and the job of Police Officers; urged defunding of APD and funding of services that will help all people: Brandon Svec, Alameda.

Stated that her first lessons in racism came from growing up in Alameda; urged the demands of Mario Gonzales's family be met; stated training will not eliminate racism; urged following the solutions proposed by Black, Indigenous and People of Color (BIPOC) community members: Claire Valderama-Wallace.

Stated Mario Gonzales might have lived if Alameda's Police violence emergency, which has been endured for decades, had been treated as an emergency; discussed being complicit; urged using Police Department funding; discussed racism in Alameda: Savanna Cheer, Alameda.

Urged mental health and similar incident responses be separate from the Police Department; encouraged the responses be within the 911 system; stated Dispatch and Computer-Aided Dispatch (CAD) could be removed from the Police Department, which has been done in other cities: Lucy Gigli, Alameda.

Stated that she is saddened and outraged; the demands from the community and Mario Gonzales's family are echoed in a letter she submitted along with 40 other Alameda moms; questioned what is the hold up: Meredith Hoskin, Alameda.

Inquired about Police reform proposed by the former Police Chief and why the Mali Watkins report has not been made public: Marilyn Grabina.

Stated Alameda and its Police are not different or special; asked Council to immediately hear and act upon the demands of Mario Gonzales's family and the Subcommittee recommendations; urged Council to stop resisting change: Melodye Montgomery, Alameda.

Implored Council to take action today; stated Mario died because the City delayed action; echoed the family's demands; urged focusing on MACRO; stated that she supports the demands of 11,000 petition signatories: Laura Cutrona, Alameda.

Discussed her mental health nursing experience in San Francisco 10 years ago; stated everyone should be outraged; recommended mental health professional work in tandem with the Alameda Police and a separate organization, such as the Geriatric Assessment and Treatment Program; suggested the mental health treatment program be named after Mario Gonzales: Jeanne Lahaie.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft called a recess at 4:46 p.m. and reconvened the meeting at 5:04 p.m.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft discussed the CAHOOTS program; stated that she wants whatever is done in Alameda to be done in partnership with the community; she and Vice Mayor Vella met with Cat Brooks from the Anti Police Terror Program (APTP); she is grateful for the resources; discussed the Subcommittees; stated that she is hoping to hit the accelerator harder; discussed a SF Gate article quote.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she hopes the Council will act with all deliberate speed; today is geared at coming up with a concrete timeline for implementation of very clear changes to protocols and practices; she would like Council to discuss each recommendation; discussed non-armed responses to mental health calls; inquired whether the City can transition; what is needed to do so; what can currently be used 24/7; how many calls are there; how can community be built to ensure that there are alternatives for folks in crisis; what is required to have trained mental health professionals; how are non-Police responses dispatched; how does the City go about implementation with deliberate speed; what is the timeline for a ballot initiative; what could be established now to review policies and give oversight; stated that she wants Council to go through the items and staff to provide input; discussed County Health and dispatching.

The City Manager stated a non-Police response can be done; 24/7 response needs to be addressed; the Community Paramedicine program could be expanded; a combination could be done similar to MACRO; staff needs Council direction on which model would work best short and long term; staff is working on ways to move forward; he has been in discussion with the County about its programs.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the City Manager stated there are proposed City models versus accessing County services.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired about community based response, to which the City Manager responded community based response would be similar to CAHOOTS or the Mental Health First program.

Councilmember Daysog discussed how an implementation timeline related to personnel would be helpful; expressed support for project management and something actionable; stated Council direction should request the City Manager to review different mental health models and a work plan, including models less than 24/7 versus 24/7; planning project management work would be useful for him.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated on March 16th, Council gave direction to the City Manager to look into different models; discussed the Community Paramedicine program; inquired whether mental health calls are already being addressed by Fire; stated perhaps better coordination is needed between the Police and Community Paramedicine; Alameda Hospital could be part of the solution; the City has a good foundation; the City meets with the Hospital; she suggested adding Alameda Family Services to the meetings; something seamless could happen.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted Alameda Health Services (AHS) is picking up one year of costs for the Community Paramedic; discussed a conversation with AHS Chief Executive Officer.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether mental health services calls are sent to the Fire Department and whether there is coordination with the Police Department; requested an explanation of what is currently done.

The Interim Fire Chief responded the vast majority of calls are 911 calls, which are received by Police Dispatch; stated Dispatch assess whether it is a Police or Fire call; Fire calls are transferred to the Fire Dispatch center, which dispatches all calls across the County; mental health crisis calls historically go to the Police Department; non-violent calls could go to the Fire Department; Fire often goes on the calls in the event the person needs transport to a facility; currently, a lot of people are transported to the John George County facility; the Police Department calls the Fire Department for transport to John George when someone is on a 5150 hold; if it is medical emergency, the Fire Department transports to the closest, most appropriate hospital; the Fire Department is currently in the second position on a call for service for a mental health crisis; he has had conversations with the Police Chief and City Manager about moving the Fire Department into the first position; provided a recent example; stated there is a possibility to dispatch non-violent calls to the Fire Department; if the situation is unstable, the Police Department might have to be called; in many cases, patients can be handled by the Fire Department; the Community Paramedic does not work 24/7, 365 days a year, but ambulances and on duty personnel are available around the clock, including on duty managers and supervisors.

In response Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry regarding mental health training, the Interim Fire Chief stated there is continuing education, which is mostly about medications and reactions; Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) and Paramedics learn mental health in school; specialty education on mental health crisis issues has been offered by Alameda County Emergency Medical Services (EMS); it is a 90 hour de-escalation and crisis intervention program.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the Interim Fire Chief outlined the Alameda County Community Assessment Treatment and Transport Team (CATT), which sends a Clinician and an EMT to respond to calls; stated it is on a very limited basis due to not having staffing at this time; discussed transports; stated in preliminary conversations, County EMS has offered to allow the Fire Department latitude in transporting calls to alternative destinations, rather than the emergency room.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer requested clarification whether non-violent calls could go to Fire first, which is already happening in some situations; stated doing so could be a short-term, immediate change.

The Interim Fire Chief stated the calls appropriately go to Police Dispatch that has the proper equipment to follow calls; discussed Dispatch operations; stated non-violent calls could go to Fire.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she does not have a problem switching non-violent calls for service to Fire first if there is a mechanism in place; stated that all 5150 calls do not need to go to John George; inquired whether there is a way to work with civilian or community based response models; how it could be integrated; are there alternative destinations other than a hospital or John George, such as a day center.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she would like the City Manager to respond since he has been surveying options; she is interested in working with people who are currently trained and working in the mental health field; Firefighters getting 90 hours training is admirable; however, there is something to be said for someone already well versed in responding; calls could involve the homeless, which involves connecting to existing resources; requested the City Manager to share what he has learned about other transport options.

The City Manager stated the County has the mobile crisis teams; the question is whether Council wants community based, agency paramedicine or some combination; the models are being evaluated; answers can be provided if Council prefers one model; options can be brought back.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she wants whatever can provide the most coverage; she does not want gaps in coverage; when calls come in, she does not want to send the Police because there is no one else to call; she has not researched the best model; it may be cobbling a couple of different systems together.

Councilmember Knox White acknowledged the loss of Mario Gonzales; stated condolences are not enough; with a couple of tweaks on a few items, he will be ready to support the seven items in the Referral; Councilmember Daysog's comments started down the path he was also thinking about; as the policy body, Council should ask the City Manager to come back with recommendations; as Councilmember Herrera Spencer said direction has been to start looking at the matter; he was heartened that the City Manager already had meetings on the books and was working on the issue the day following Mario Gonzales's death; he does not have a strong belief whether it needs to be a community or staff based organization; for longevity, having things within the organization tends to ensure it stays;

outcomes and the types of tools should be identified; there is a place for well-trained Paramedics and Firefighters, but mental health professionals will be needed as well; rather than choosing a specific model, he would like to consider giving direction to remove as many calls from the Police Department as fast as possible, without having to come back to Council and using any resources available, such as CATT or the Fire Department; the administrative change should be made if Council gives policy direction; direction should be given to bring a pilot project back within eight weeks; it will probably sound a lot like what Councilmember Herrera Spencer said using the community based Paramedicine program; it needs to be built out with roles identified and include costs and needed resources; he will support anything that has a remotely reasonable cost; the City is in this position because cuts have been made; the longer term conversation can start once the pilot is up and running; everyone is saying get something going now; by the end of the year once the pilot is going, a decision can be made about where to go from there; a motion should give direction about what can be done now without asking, just telling Council what is being done; staff should return in eight weeks or faster if possible; staff has been meeting with the County since last summer; some of the things on the table are exciting and would make the City a Nation leading program well beyond MACRO; he does not know what it would look like to have mental health first and bring in community response.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft expressed support for identifying outcomes; inquired whether Councilmember Knox White would like the matter to return by the end of the Fiscal Year.

Councilmember Knox White responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Daysog stated the features that he is looking for in a mental health model are 24/7 and he prefers in-house staff credentialed in mental health issues; he is looking for models that fit said bill and could be transferred to fit Alameda; crises can occur late at night and early morning, so 24/7 is needed.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she agrees with some of what has been said; she believes Council gave direction to the City Manager on March 16th; she looks forward to hearing the City Manager's recommendations; she does not support having the City Manager implement something before returning to Council; she would support continuing the meeting to a date certain; she is not sure if it can be within a couple of days or if the City Manager needs more time to come up with a recommendation; discussed the Community Paramedicine program; stated the program could be expanded and the City would have control; she looks forward to hearing more from the City Manager and Fire Department; the City gets mental health calls all of the time; more training may be required; she wants to hear from staff about what is needed; Highland Hospital is part of AHS now, which has different facilities for mental health and trauma needs; she wants to ensure the City is leveraging current assets; tweaking or more fully utilizing what the City currently has should be seamless and is her preference; she is not sure if Alameda Family Services could be included and be of value; in regards to who to call, staff can disseminate information; however, most of the numbers are Monday through Friday, 8 am to 5 pm; staff can continue to work on who to call without returning to Council; she wants to hear from the City Manager on how calls will be prioritized; the City Manager's job is to make recommendations; at this point, her go to would be to find out how to leverage the Paramedicine program; discussed the program; stated that she supports the City Manager working with both the Fire and

Police Departments to better serve the community going forward.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she is interested in how the City operationalizes something imminently; if it is as easy as changing the priority of who is dispatched, she would like to see Community Paramedicine and Fire dispatched on calls for service for crisis intervention and mental health response, rather than sending an armed response; the 90 hours of County training should be done to give additional tools to people already being dispatched on calls; she would like to hear more about who Paramedics work with on the calls; she would like to understand the current system and how work is done in conjunction with each other; questioned what would it look like to have Clinicians working in conjunction with EMTs similar to other cities; stated that she wants to understand integration with the current dispatch system; discussed types of crisis calls; stated that she cosigns what has been said; the City needs to ensure that conversations are not just continued; instruction has been given; she wants to understand what the work plan will look like and the timeline; her preference is as soon as possible and before the end of the Fiscal Year.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she agrees with almost everything everyone else has said; discussed the Community Paramedicine program; stated AHS picking up the cost of one person is \$250,000; moving forward she would want to look at Clinicians already trained in mental health response similar to the Berkeley model; the City should get the most skilled, appropriate people; transport should be expanded beyond John George and emergency departments; there are other facilities that the City may be able to tap into in San Leandro and Oakland; she agrees with what Vice Mayor Vella and Councilmember Knox White have said; who handles the calls should be reprioritized and response should be unarmed whenever possible, which should be done within the next eight weeks.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he was pleased to be part of historic reforms on March 16th; the reforms were not implemented in time to prevent the tragic death of Mr. Gonzales; his death occurring one month after the Council vote underscores the need to redouble efforts to implement the reforms; expressed support for the meeting and accelerating the reforms; joined the community and City Council in expressing his heartfelt grief over the death.

Councilmember Knox White acknowledged Councilmember Daysog's comments; stated the success of the pilot program should be based on removing as many interactions as possible; unarmed response is not needed; mental health officials are going to be needed at some point; the City does not have any on staff and would need to bring in consultants or staff at some point in time.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that she was wondering if the City could tap into Alameda Family Services or some mental health clinical professionals to provide coverage after hours when the Community Paramedic is not available.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she wants to hear from the City Manager about whether he has a timeline; she would like an update in regards to the Council requests, which were the same issues raised March 16th.

The City Manager stated staff is preparing to bring back a report based on the March 16th

direction, which will return in June with the discussion today helping to inform the report even more; three critical areas for a mental health program that need to be brought together are: 1) authorization of 5150, which is currently limited law enforcement, 2) ability to transport and 3) connecting to services; the Community Paramedicine and County health teams currently do not have 24/7 response; staff can determine how to put the elements together to reach 24/7; the one Community Paramedic does follow up and do proactive work on individual cases, but does not respond to 911 calls; more full implementation would require additional resources in the Fire Department; staff will bring back a more full Community Paramedicine program versus a community based response or model similar to CAHOOTS, which would be more long term; the interim approach would be to move as many responses out of Police to an alternative sources, which would come back in June; then, bring back a more long term approach later.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired about Fire Department staffing.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated, as a point of clarification, the matter on the agenda has to do with alternative Police response; the Council is not talking about sending Firefighters on Police calls; inquired whether the question stays within the agenda subject matter.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the connection is Community Paramedics are under the Fire Department; knowing how many Firefighters are in the City is relevant.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated in order not to confuse the public, there is one Community Paramedic.

The Interim Fire Chief stated there is a minimum of 25 people on duty per day, including the one shift manager, which is a Battalion Chief; three shifts make it 24/7; the one Community Paramedic works 40 hours per week; others with a Community Paramedic background work on shifts, but are not working in said capacity; three ambulance companies have six people.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry, the Interim Fire Chief stated the Community Paramedic works days; a day assignment differs from a 48 hour shift.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether others are trained, but not acting in the capacity of a Community Paramedic, to which the Interim Fire Chief responded in the affirmative; stated they can be assigned in as needed if the current employee left.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired how difficult it would be to expand the Community Paramedicine program to 24/7.

The Interim Fire Chief responded it would have to be expanded to an around-the-clock squad with three shifts of at least one person; a conversation with the Fire union would be required; the position would change from 40 to 56 hours.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer inquired whether the Community Paramedics could support the Department if not responding to calls; stated that she thinks it could be a flexible program.

The Interim Fire Chief responded the Fire Department would recommend adding two Firefighters per shift, which would be a 24/7, 365 days squad; the Paramedics or EMTs would have special training and additional certifications; outlined equipment the Department currently has that could be used; stated the Department goes on mental health calls daily; of the over 5,000 EMS calls a year, 500 are 5150 transports; the Department would like the calls to go to alternate destinations, which the County has said it would authorize.

The City Manager stated the Interim Fire Chief's comments summarize what would be used on an interim basis prior to implementing a long term approach.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the City Manager will also be considering the budget implications; review of what the City could get for the cost of a Community Paramedic should be considered; noted Berkeley sends out a Clinician with an EMT; there are options; she appreciates that the City Manager will look at what can be done in the short term; inquired whether Council is prepared to move forward with the recommendations accepting the additional clarifications about acting in the immediate term to move calls away from Police, bringing a report back and having the changes implemented before the end of the Fiscal Year; stated Councilmember Herrera Spencer asked about continuing the meeting; inquired whether the City Manager would return at the first June meeting.

The City Manager stated that he does not have the specific date yet; it could be the first or second June meeting.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated that her sense is the Council wants the matter to return sooner rather than later; inquired whether the City Manager could respond sooner if the meeting was continued or if more time is needed.

Councilmember Knox White stated Councilmember Herrera Spencer seemed to be reacting to his comments asking the City Manager to implement things right now before coming back with a pilot program; if said direction is not moving forward, continuing the meeting might not be necessary.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated direction was already given on a lot of things the City Manager can continue working on; if the City Manager thinks he needs additional direction, it is appropriate for him to come back and check in with Council; discussed the purview of the City Manager and what can be done without additional Council direction; stated if the City Manager wants to return, she would like an update on the March 16th direction; she would like to continue to move along as Council and staff have been doing; she is not sure whether the City Manager could return sooner; if so, she wants to make the option available; discussed community concerns; stated if the City Manager would like to come back June 1st, the meeting does not need to be continued.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he would be happy to propose a motion on Referral Item 5: create a mental health-oriented response model.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of asking the City Manager, within his discretion, to move as many responses as he can with existing resources and return no later than the end June, but as early as practicable, with a pilot program proposal and

budget that incorporates all of the feedback heard about how people would like to see it developed.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether Councilmember Knox White would consider amending the motion to include Referral Item 2: a compendium of all mental health resources and direct protocols for their use, which comes under the theme of mental health response.

Councilmember Knox White agreed to include Item 2 in the motion.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog stated that he is confused; the City Manager said leading up to the March 16th vote, a lot of analysis had been done in terms of different models; rather than saying the preferred model, the Council provided parameters, such as 24/7 and preferably in-house; his sense is that the City Manager is ready to move forward in terms of recommendations; questioned why wait eight weeks if the City Manager is ready; stated his goal was to come out of today with a work plan identifying the tasks required to get the program going; if June 1st was way too ambitious, he must have misheard the City Manager; inquired whether the City Manager could present a program June 1st, along with the associated budget and staffing and an alternative program outlining the look of an expanded Community Paramedicine program.

The City Manager responded a conceptual budget and program could be provided June 1st; stated in the region and other areas, programs, such as MACRO, will take at least a year to implement; he does not think there is an easy solution; he has committed to moving services that can be moved from Police to other responses when possible; one of the issues is 5150 calls; currently, Police is the only agency that can respond to 5150 calls, which cannot be resolved in the next 10 days; even an interim approach with a pilot program will take some time; he can bring the concepts by June 1st.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the Interim Fire Chief said Fire currently handles 500 5150 transports a year; inquired whether Fire gets the calls from the Police Department.

The City Manager responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether there is a way the City Manager could have APD direct 5150 transports to AFD, which is currently done for some calls.

The City Attorney responded if the question is whether Firefighters could start making 5150 determinations, State law does not give Firefighters permission.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether direction could be given that once Police makes a 5150 assessment, transport of the person could be referred to AFD.

The City Attorney responded that he believes that is the existing practice.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether it is already happening for all 5150 determinations.

The City Manager responded that is primarily occurring; stated if the ambulance is busy, they may go to a second source.

Councilmember Knox White stated the motion asks for something different than what the City Manager planned on bringing, which is why he extended the deadline; the motion directs bringing a pilot program with a budget, instead of bringing concepts for Council to discuss further.

In response to Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft's inquiry about when the matter would return, Councilmember Knox White stated by the end of June.

The City Manager stated having a pilot program with Community Paramedicine doing 5150 is one of the concepts staff has been working on.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated as it now stands, a 5150 transport by Fire has a Police presence that goes with them.

The City Manager responded the Police have to define it as a 5150 prior to Fire being able to transport.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether or not it is a joint transport situation.

The City Manager responded Police do transport at times.

The Assistant City Manager stated the way the system works depends on the nature of the person being 5150ed; a Fire transport or ambulance EMT transport is done if that is what is necessary or the Police can do it; the details need to be worked out; he and the City Manager have been in conversations with the Interim Fire Chief and other members of the Fire Department; the dispatch training and clinician training for Firefighters have been identified; there have been discussions with the Oakland Fire Chief regarding the MACRO program; the desire for a quick and efficient transition is understood; there are a lot of moving parts; staff wants to ensure it is being done in a way that meets the community's quality and safety expectations; staff is working with AFD labor groups as well; staff wants to bring a pilot that can be successful; the timing for launch will involve steps to ensure the program is set up for success.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated the City Manager said he would come back with an update on these issues June 1st and he has come up with a way to determine when Police and when Paramedics could be called; she wants to see if the City Manager needs other direction from Council; the City Manager could have done updates and sought direction.

Councilmember Knox White called the question.

On the call for the question the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; Daysog: No; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 2.

Councilmember Knox White stated that he has a couple of other comments; on Referral Item 3 [work with City Council to revise APD use of force policies, and establish protocols for requesting non-police response, backup, and/or interventions], instead of working with the City Council, he would like to ask staff to return with a proposed revision; on civilian oversight [Referral Item 7], the process needs to end up on the ballot; it will take a while for it to change; he would like to direct the City Manager to implement policies to review the use of force and random body camera videos via his office; it could be the City Manager or his designee until such time that the City Manager returns with a proposed budget for a position of Public Safety Auditor, which would report to either the City Attorney or City Clerk's Office, and would help to set up a civilian oversight commission that would report to the position; something would be brought back as a part of the budget discussion; there are a lot of examples of well-functioning City Boards and Commissions; there is not a lot of examples of other civilian police commissions functioning or successfully addressing the issues they were set up to deal with; a hybrid model should be considered; there should be a position that could report directly to Council following a 2022 ballot initiative; the City Manager should be given direction to have civilian oversight of body camera and use of force right now; secondly, come back with short term options while something is considered to be put on the 2022 ballot, which includes an option for considering a staff position outside the Human Resources chain of command.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether it is Item 7, to which Councilmember Knox White responded in the affirmative; stated it would be civilian oversight; it would not be somebody within the Department; it would actually be someone outside of the City Manager's office.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired how the matter relates to Item 3 [work with City Council to revise APD use of force policies, and establish protocols for requesting non-police response, backup, and/or interventions]; inquired whether staff would return to Council with revised APD use of force policies and establish protocols for requesting non-Police response backup and/or other interventions.

Councilmember Knox White stated it would be bringing back a proposal.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated the language would be changed to direct the City Manager to provide revised APD use of policies, to which Councilmember Knox White responded in the affirmative; stated it does not have to be the City Manager, it could also be the City Attorney.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated it would be to direct staff.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he is fine with five of the remaining six items; he did not support Item 7 back on March 16th even though he voted for the omnibus motion; he still does not support Charter reform with regard to a Police accountability board; for a small town, it unnecessarily politicizes the situation and will make the work environment for the Police very difficult; there are different ways to achieve it; his request would be to separate out Item 7 since he would support the other five remaining items.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted Councilmember Knox White modified Item 7.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of the City Manager implementing policies, in the next two weeks, to develop review of all use of force and random body camera video checks via the City Manager's office; it does not have to be the City Manager personally; as a part of the budget discussion, return with an item to identify a Public Safety Auditor, who would be housed in the City Clerk or City Attorney's office, to begin some civilian oversight and help develop what the Commission would look like, with the intent to move through a process to put something on the ballot by 2022 that may involve moving the position as a fourth reporting to City Council, as well as an oversight body that would work with the position, which is a concept that is not a done deal, and come back with ideas on what oversight could look like so that Council could discuss it, rather than just saying it is a civilian oversight board.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the motion does not specifically include Charter amendments, to which Councilmember Knox White responded the motion is to work towards putting something on the ballot in 2022; the Council would need to know what is proposed before the measure is placed on the ballot.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the motion could only address Item 7 and another motion could address everything that has not been touched on yet.

Councilmember Knox White stated the motion is only on Item 7 due to Councilmember Daysog's concerns; then, Council could address the balance.

The City Manager noted there are certain legal and procedural issues related to use of force; bringing something back in two weeks might not be able to be done logistically; by June 1st, he was planning on bringing back where the City is moving forward; bringing specific things back might not be procedurally doable.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the City Manager has a more feasible date.

Councilmember Knox White stated use of force is not a part of his motion.

In response to the City Clerk's inquiry regarding use of force being in the motion, Councilmember Knox White stated it relates to oversight of body camera review for use of force, but is not part of Item 3, which is bringing back proposed changes in the use of force policy.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated it is use of force review.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog request the motion be restated.

The City Clerk restated the motion.

Councilmember Knox White stated the motion is review of body camera video use of force.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated it is to review all use of force body camera videos; inquired

about the budget including the position.

Councilmember Knox White responded the direction is to return with an option for a potential budget position that is not under the City Manager.

Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she believes Council has already given direction; she will be waiting to hear from the City Manager; she will not be supporting the motion.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: No; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 3. Noes: 2.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of the balance of the list, Items: 1 [order immediate training for all APD dispatchers on assessing and responding to 911 calls, including alternatives to dispatching police officers]; 3 [work with City Council to revise APD use of force policies, and establish protocols for requesting non-police response, backup, and/or interventions]; 4 [order immediate training for all APD officers on topics identified in paragraphs 2) and 3)]; and 6 [initiate a public education campaign to provide easily accessible alternatives to calling 911], with the one minor change [to Item 3] to return to City Council with a revised APD use of force policy.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the motion is to direct staff to return to the City Council, to which Councilmember Knox White responded in the affirmative.

Councilmember Daysog seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Herrera Spencer stated that she will not be supporting the motion; Council has already given direction.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

Vice Mayor Vella requested all of the motion be restated.

The City Clerk repeated the motions.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether the first motion included all the direction given, to which Councilmember Knox White responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated Council comments were included.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether direction is to come back with different models, including building on what the City already has and any work that is already done, to which Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft responded in the affirmative; stated it includes how to extend response to 24/7.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether the City Manager will be making presentations along with any other supporting presentations when the matter returns.

Councilmember Knox White stated it would be great to have people from County EMS, public health as necessary or anybody that has a role, so that Council can ask questions and get answers from the people who will be making decisions once the City has a pilot program.

In response to Vice Mayor Vella's inquiry about whether the City's own department should be present, Councilmember Knox White stated of course.

Councilmember Daysog stated that he would supported the first motion, but he does not understand why Council has to wait until June 30th; it sounds like it was going to be ready for June 1st; that is the reason he voted no.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft inquired whether the City Manager would return earlier than June 30th if the Pilot Program is ready.

The City Manager responded that he does not think the full pilot program would be ready earlier than June 30th; he was trying to bring something by June 1st to make sure Council is in line with it.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether the matter and any others will be part of the budget.

The City Manager stated the budget would return on June 15th; the budget study session materials have already been sent out.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she does not want to be in a position of the pilot proposal being presented after budget decisions have been made; she would prefer having combined conversations.

Councilmember Knox White stated the Subcommittee reports included budgets for similar programs; the budget discussions could include a placeholder of a certain amount of funding without having the specific program.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated part of the direction on March 16th was for the City Manager to identify funding sources and bring it back in May.

Vice Mayor Vella stated that she is happy to reconsider the first motion; requested Councilmember Knox White to clarify the budget proposals for the pilot program and whether the recommendation is an in-house City program.

Councilmember Knox White responded in the affirmative; stated that was the general direction of the Council; the motion was no later than June 30th, so it could be earlier; the direction is for a more detailed proposal to come back than what was coming back on June 1st, so an extra four weeks is being given; Council can approve the pilot at the end of June and start the work that will take some time.

Vice Mayor Vella inquired whether Councilmember Daysog would like to vote again now that is clarified that Council wants the matter to return as soon as possible.

Councilmember Daysog responded in the affirmative.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft stated one of the majority voters needs to make a motion to reconsider.

Councilmember Knox White moved approval of reconsidering the first motion.

Vice Mayor Vella seconded the motion.

Under discussion, Councilmember Daysog expressed his appreciation for the clarification.

On the call for the question, the motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

The reconsidered fist motion carried by the following roll call vote: Councilmembers Daysog: Aye; Herrera Spencer: No; Knox White: Aye; Vella: Aye; and Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft: Aye. Ayes: 4. Noes: 1.

Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft noted the topic is important and there is sense of urgency, commitment and dedication; it is time to translate words into action; expressed her appreciation.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, Mayor Ezzy Ashcraft adjourned the meeting at 7:09 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Lara Weisiger
City Clerk

The agenda for this meeting was posted in accordance with the Sunshine Ordinance.